1971

An Historical Study of the Professions and Professional Education in the United States

John J. Ahern

Loyola University Chicago

Recommended Citation

http://ecommons.luc.edu/luc_diss/1158

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Theses and Dissertations at Loyola eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Loyola eCommons. For more information, please contact ecommons@luc.edu.

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 3.0 License.
Copyright © 1971 John J. Ahern
AN HISTORICAL STUDY OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL
EDUCATION IN THE UNITED STATES

by

Reverend John J. Ahern

A Dissertation Submitted to the Faculty of the
Graduate School of Loyola University
in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree
of Doctor of Philosophy

Chicago, Illinois
June, 1970
AN HISTORICAL STUDY OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION IN THE UNITED STATES

John J. Ahern, Reverend, Ph.D.
Loyola University, Chicago, Illinois, 1971.
Advisor: Dr. Gerald L. Gutek

Purpose:

After indicating the religious, economic, social, and political significance of this study, this dissertation proposes 1) to demonstrate that the European concept and definition of the professions and professional education have transferred to and have continued in essence in the United States, and 2) to trace and describe historically the American origins and growth, the internal and external moulding forces, the profile studies of the six leading American professions, an analysis of the ideal education of the professional American man, the present and future status and the problems of the American professions and professional education. Finally, conclusions and implications from the study for general and professional education are made.

Procedure:

The demonstration of the dissertation's two-fold purpose was made according to the method of historical research. The purpose or thesis was asserted; terminology was clarified. In Chapter I, the writings of two English and eleven American educators, historians, and sociologists were collected, isolated, and analyzed to demonstrate the European and American concept and definition of, and to establish the historical transference and continuance of that concept and definition of the professions and professional education from Europe to America. In Chapter II, a concise history of the evolution of the professions and professional education is traced from the Greco-Roman Period, through the Medieval, English, the American Colonial; the Eighteenth, Nineteenth, and
Twentieth Century periods in the United States. In Chapter III, the internal and external forces moulding American professions, such as the student-image of self and of professions, professional licensure, certification, accreditation, and finally society itself are analyzed. In Chapter IV, profile studies of the leading American professions and professional education of medicine, law, ministry, teaching, dentistry, and engineering are presented. In Chapter V, as a sequence to the profile studies, the ideal education of the American professional man is proposed. In Chapter IV, the present status and dimensions, the continuing problems and the future of American professions and professional education are researched. Some problems studied are those of professional objectives, professional standards, recruitment, and the relationship between the professional school and the university.

Conclusions:

At the end of each chapter specific conclusions on the chapter-study are made. The general or over-all conclusions and implications of the dissertation for professional education are stated in Chapter VII, such being the necessity of professional men becoming involved in the historical research of their profession, the careless use of the term, "profession," the need of a more in-depth participation in their profession by teachers, the need of a more objective study of the internal and external problems of the American ministry, and the relationship between the professional school and the university. A precise bibliography of over two-hundred works has been isolated and presented as most pertinent to the study of the dissertation.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. THE CONCEPT AND DEFINITION OF PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION IN THE UNITED STATES</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sir Alexander M. Carr-Saunders and P.A. Wilson</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morris L. Cogan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Myron Lieberman</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Earl J. McGrath</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>William J. Goode</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howard S. Becker</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bernard Barber</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Everett C. Hughes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ernest Greenwood</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Howard M. Vollmer and Donald L. Mills</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nina Toren</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of Conclusions and Implications for Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. HISTORICAL EVOLUTION OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION FROM THE GREEK PERIOD TO THE TWENTIETH CENTURY</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>European Professions and Professional Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Professions and Professional Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. THE MOLDING FORCES OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Moulding Force of the Student</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Moulding Force of Licensure, Certification, and Accreditation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Moulding Force of Society</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusions and Implications for Education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter

IV. PROFILE STUDIES OF THE LEADING PROFESSIONS IN THE UNITED STATES ........................................... 166

Profile Study of the Profession of American Medicine
Profile Study of the Profession of American Law
Profile Study of the Profession of American Ministry
Profile Study of the Profession of American Teaching
Profile Study of the Profession of American Dentistry
Profile Study of the Profession of American Engineering

V. THE IDEAL EDUCATION OF THE PROFESSIONAL AMERICAN MAN ... 260

Conclusions and Implications for the Ideal Education of the Professional American Man

VI. PRESENT STATUS AND CONTINUING PROBLEMS OF PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION: THE FUTURE OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION ........................................... 272

Conclusions and Implications for the Present Status, Continuing Problems, and Future of the Professions and Professional Education in the United States

VII. CONCLUSIONS OF THE DISSERTATION ON THE HISTORY OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION IN THE UNITED STATES .................................................. 284

BIBLIOGRAPHY ................................................................. 293
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Comparison of Characteristics of Students in Four Professions</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Comparison of Characteristics of Doctor of Philosophy, Law, and Medical Candidates</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
INTRODUCTION

The purpose of this dissertation is to depict the history of the professions and professional education in the United States by demonstrating that the European concept, definition, and reality of a profession and professional education have continued since profession's migration from Europe via England to the American colonies, later the new "United States," and that the professions have developed their own history, problems, present and future growth. From the very beginning let the reader be advised that the terms, "profession," and "professional education," refer to profession as a group and not to any one profession and its specific educational or academic program. Fortunately for this dissertation the concept and definition, the history of ancient professions and professional education in continental Europe and then England had been researched in 1933, and have been acknowledged by historians, educators, men in profession, and sociologists in the excellent work of Sir A.M. Carr-Saunders and P.A. Wilson, under the title of The Professions, the publication statistics of which appear in the bibliography of this dissertation. Since the professions and professional education, historically and naturally, if somewhat slowly, were transferred by the English to their new American colonies, later to become the United States, it was necessary to investigate the European concept and definition of the professions and professional education and to trace the professions and professional education in their history and development in the United States. Any
characteristics of the professions and professional education that might be peculiar to America are noted. Research of over two hundred books, monographs, and periodicals pertinent to the purpose of the dissertation indicated that no such history in the vein of the Carr-Saunders and Wilson work has been written concerning the professions and professional education in the United States.

It is important, here, that certain basic terms be understood by the reader as they are specifically used in this dissertation. Such terms are "profession," "professional education," "semi-profession." "graduate school," "professional school." At first it was determined by the dissertation to give an immediate definition of these terms in the Introduction, but it seemed more natural, logical, and time-saving to simply define the terms as they appeared in the textual content.

The subject of the study of this dissertation is significant. Wherever possible, the religious, economical, social, and political significance of a profession to society are emphasized. The religious significance of this dissertation can be concluded from the need of religion in society. Since the beginning of recorded history, the relationship between man and his God has been vital. Some of the history, the role, the need of the profession of ministry in American society, the characteristics, and problems will be researched.

The economic significance of the professions and professional education will be seen after considering that the 1970 Census predicts that of 81.2 million people in the United States, 10.2 million will be
practicing or preparing to enter the professions. Education in the United States is this country's second largest gross national product, the war being the first. The cost of educating a professional group of 10.2 million out of 81.2 and its effect on the return of national living and income is staggering. Thus, for economy's sake, the professions must know their objectives, their costs, their means and hoped for service to the national community. This is especially significant in the 1970's when the escalation of education and national education programs such as medicare and socialized medicine will be of prime concern. The significance of the profession of teaching and medicine and their special educational programs is noted immediately.

The democratic processes of the nation, the struggle for law and order, the increased knowledge and applications of the rights of individuals and minority groups, racial discrimination, etc., have focused the nation's attention on the profession of law, its strengths and weaknesses, and its future needs. Thus, there is significance to this dissertation's study of the profession of law, which study may in some small way contribute to the updating and clarification of the role of the legal profession in society.

Population growth, industry's expansion, the automobile industry outgrowing all proportion, urban renewal, new communities, space programs, and military projects are just a few of the national needs demanding focus on the excellent profession of engineering, whose basic concepts, origin, characteristics, education, problems, and the future, will be studied.
Contemporary society in all facets of its activities and needs is making more demands on the professions. New professions are emerging. All these factors confirm this dissertation's claim that its study is significant to national welfare.

The hypothesis or purpose of the dissertation is to demonstrate that the concept and definition, the history of European professions and professional education have continued essentially the same in their transfer from Europe via England to the United States and to describe American professions and professional education in their history, their external and internal problems, in their present and future development.

Each chapter will include an introduction and conclusions on the chapter theme. The work of this dissertation was to assiduously and exhaustively isolate, present, and analyze the writings, conclusions, suggestions of reputed educators, historians, men in profession, and sociologists on each chapter theme. In Chapter I the European concept and definition of the professions and professional education as concluded by the research of Carr-Saunders and Wilson is presented. The conclusions of eleven American educators, men in education, historians, and sociologists on the American concept and definition of the professions and professional education reveal that the professions and professional education in the United States will continue in the core-characteristics of the European concept and definition of the professions and professional education.

Having established the fact of the transference of the concept and
definition of the professions and professional education from Europe to America, it is wise and useful to present Chapter II, the evolution and the history of the professions and professional education beginning with the Greek Period through the Roman, Medieval, English, and finally the early American Colonial, the American National, the Nineteenth-Twentieth Century periods in the United States. Such a history is necessary for the understanding of the ancient origins of American professions and professional education.

Chapter III of this dissertation presents an historical, somewhat psychological study of the forces moulding and motivating men and women in the choice of a profession. The first such moulding force researched by this dissertation was the student - the very fabric of profession. The student of a profession is described in his self-concept as a potential member of the profession, in his estimation of the profession which he chooses, and in contrast to other students choosing the professions of medicine, law, dentistry, and engineering. This contrast is made in terms of parental occupation, student academic aptitude, life values, and personality traits. The students pursuing membership in the professions of ministry and teaching are not so contrasted, since these two professions are in such a state of internal change, that any stable study of statistics, at this time, would be unreliable and unrealistic.

The second moulding force of a profession and professional education researched in Chapter III is the force exercised by a profession itself,
i.e., the procedures of licensure, certification, and accreditation for membership whose origins, meaning, and effect are explained in detail. The last moulding force of the professions researched by this dissertation is the influence of society, which the professions serve. Society seeks from profession quality of service, quantity of service, and cost of service. How society reacts to positive or negative service from the professions is observed.

Chapter IV of this dissertation is a profile study of the professions of medicine, law, ministry, teaching, dentistry, and engineering - the six most popular professions in the United States. The profiles of each of these professions describe the weaknesses and strengths of the core-characteristics of the profession, and presents as complete a history, as is available, of the particular profession in the United States, its problems, present and future, and conclusions and implications for the specific profession and its professional education.

The ideal education for the professional American man has been researched and is presented in Chapter V of this dissertation. Briefly, the ideal education of profession in general has four points, viz., broad, theoretical instruction basic to proficient practice of the profession, specialized knowledge and skills characteristic of each profession, general education outside the specific professional field, and a program of education continuing after entrance to a profession and specific to professional practice and general living.

The present status, continuing problems, and some predictions for the
future of the professions and professional education in the United States are presented in Chapter VI. This chapter attempts to provide some knowledge of the dimensions of professional service, i.e., how many persons in the United States are rendering the service of a profession, to describe the character of institutions providing professional education, and to present some of the current and continuing problems of the professions and professional education in the United States. Such problems are the finding of objectives, especially for the newly emerging professions, the problem of attaining and maintaining uniqueness of service, the problem of achieving professional recognition and prestige. Other problems are those of maintaining and adjusting standards for the professions, the problem of recruiting personnel, the problem of achieving reform, the problem of specialization within a specific profession, the problem of relationships between the professions and the university wherein members of the professions study, the problem of autonomy of a profession within the university complex, and the problem of the relationship of the professions and the liberal arts schools. The opinions, solutions, suggestions among educators, men in the professions, sociologists, and historians concerning these problems have been researched. At present, the focus of these authors has been to isolate the afore-mentioned problems, but they have made very little in-depth study for solutions. Certainly, these problems are areas for future research.

This Introduction has, therefore, presented the main points of a significant study. A table of contents will give the pagination of each
of these chapters for specific study. A relevant bibliography is presented. Thus, from the research points presented in the Introduction, the conceptual framework of this dissertation can be outlined as follows:

1. **Assertion of the hypothesis or purpose of the dissertation.**

2. **Definition of terms used in the dissertation.**

3. **Significance of the dissertation.**

4. **Presentation and development by chapters of the hypothesis of the dissertation.** i.e., a history of the professions and professional education in the United States is presented, wherein may be demonstrated that the European concept and definition of the professions and professional education have been transferred and continue in the professions and professional education in the United States, as may be seen in the American history of the professions, in their moulding forces, such as the student, licensure, certification, accreditation, society's control, in the profile study of several professions, in the ideal education for the professions, and in the future of the profession and professional education.

Each chapter of the dissertation will present an introduction
of what the dissertation will do in the particular chapters and what conclusions with educational implications are to be made.
CHAPTER I

THE CONCEPT AND DEFINITION OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION IN THE UNITED STATES

In its Introduction the dissertation proposed to demonstrate that the concept and definition of the professions and professional education have transferred and have continued in essence in the United States. The bibliography of the dissertation lists some two hundred and three books and articles pertinent to these points; no count was kept of bibliography rejected because of failure to at least treat the concept and definition of the professions and professional education which their titles and purpose seemed to promise. Only eleven American authors focused on the concept and definition of the professions and professional education. The eleven American authors are thus listed along with two English authors in the chronological order of their publications.


1956 - Myron Lieberman, Education as a Profession.

1959 - Earl J. McGrath, "Liberal Education in the Professions." The Institute of Higher Education.


- Everett C. Hughes, "Professions," The Professions in America.


- Howard Vollmer and Donald Mills, Professionalization


The chronology of publications confirms the hope that through the years one author after another has added to the research of his predecessors. The European concept and definition based on the research of Carr-Saunders and Wilson have been accepted by the eleven American authors who use the core-characteristics of a profession proposed by Carr-Saunders and Wilson. These authors demonstrate that the European concept and definition of
the professions and professional education have continued in essence in their transference from Europe and, where possible, point out the emergence of American characteristics or qualities.

The historical, European concept and definition of the professions by Carr-Saunders and Wilson is researched first. The American concept and definition by the eleven specific American authors follows; where possible, conclusions and implications for professional education are made.
Historical Definition

Sir Alexander M. Carr-Saunders and P. A. Wilson

In 1933 Carr-Saunders and Wilson wrote the classic study, The Professions, which most researchers use as a beginning in their efforts to define the nature of profession. Painstakingly, these English authors studied and analyzed the nature of man's occupations through history and list the following as coming close in greater or lesser degree to being a profession:

- Lawyers
- Patent Agents
- Doctors
- Dentists
- Nurses
- Mid-wives
- Pharmacists
- Opticians
- Masseurs
- The Merchant Navy
- Mine Managers
- Engineers
- Chemists
- Physicists
- Architects
- Surveyors
- Accountants
- Actuaries
- Public Administrators
- Teachers
- Journalists
- Authors
- Artists
- Brokers

Carr-Saunders and Wilson quite definitely state that these occupations have exhibited, since their emergence into public service of society, the same certain characteristics, the same pattern, found in their origins, nature, and activity. This complex of characteristics is their definition.

of a profession. The characteristics that make up a profession for Carr-Saunders and Wilson are:

1. A prolonged, specialized, intellectual training.
   This training, at least in the higher ranks of profession, is intellectual, prolonged, based on the exploration of recognized fields of study.

2. A technique, either scientific or institutional, i.e., based on the study of natural science or on the study of human institutions. This technique is the essence of a profession, because it gives rise to certain attitudes and activities on the part of a profession and clientele. The more fully developed this technique, the more professional is the occupation.

3. Remuneration for professional service in the form of fee and not salary. The authors prefer the use of the term, "fee," for the receiving of a fee makes the professional man responsible to the client, but in no way dependent on the client, which dependency is implied by reception of a salary. A true profession has the rule that the amount of the fee be well known to the client for services and not as for profit.

4. A sense of responsibility to the client, which is called upon when the practice of a profession involves the practitioner's

---

personal judgment. The degree of responsibility is determined by the nature of the professional service rendered. Thus, a doctor's responsibility would be greater in quantity and quality than the journalist's.

5. Formation of associations to test competence and maintain ethical codes. Such associations govern the professional group from within and may be imposed from without by state regulations. An example of the former for the physician would be the medical association or for the latter, state, national, or local, rules for mutual protection of physician and patient.

Carr-Saunders and Wilson based their list of professions, indicated on the preceding page, on the complex of characteristics which they compiled from the studies of all occupations. The listed occupations exhibited the same patterns to a lesser or greater degree as the ancient, learned, and certainly accepted professions of medicine, law, and the ministry and university teaching which the authors called the center of the complex. Like the pendulum of a clock, the closer to the complex of characteristics of medicine, law, the ministry and university teaching that an occupation came, the more it became a profession.
Educational Definition - 1953

Morris L. Cogan

Perhaps the first educator after Saunders and Wilson to synthesize attempts at a concept and definition of the professions was Morris L. Cogan, a member of the faculty of the Graduate School of Education, Harvard University. Cogan considered his study significant because the "education boom" occurring in the 1950's was so great, that education became America's fastest growing national product. Cogan believed that the term and title, "profession," were being carelessly defined and used to the confusion of the professional schools and the graduate schools, whose role in profession must be clarified; many occupations were incorrectly, consciously or unconsciously, assuming their field of work to be truly professional. Lest the public be cheated in seeking what was in reality not professional service and care, lest the student seeking a profession be deluded, lest the tax-payer be cheated, Cogan researched this study of a true definition of a profession, drawing on the disciplines of law, history, philosophy, government, and sociology. He has isolated characteristics, attitudes of authors on the concept of a profession and a variety of theories concerning the role of a profession.

Cogan's analysis is first outlined by this study and then explained as follows:

I. Definitions of profession - negative use

16
II. Positive use

A. dictionaries
B. legal dictionaries
C. arbitrary and applied definitions of various authors

III. List of characteristics of profession

IV. Conclusions - Cogan's

V. Cogan's definition

As Carr-Saunders and Wilson, Cogan deplored the lack of any serious study of the concept of a profession. Most authors researched by Cogan were too complex, shying away from a specific concept and definition, thus evading the problem or merely giving their shallow opinions and then launching into their specific works, based on an unauthoritative definition of a profession.

Concerning the Carr-Saunders and Wilson concept and definition, Cogan concluded that they gave the characteristics of an authoritative definition. Cogan cited Frances P. Delancy and Oliver Garceau to show that he was not alone in his criticism of careless scholarship. Delancy in her thesis deplored the careless, cavalier manner in which the twentieth century educators, historians, and sociologists simply ignored even the traditional, authoritative characteristics of a profession. Delancy stated that it was impossible to formulate a true concept and definition and suggested that authors be simply allowed to use arbitrary definitions.

---

tailored to meet the requirements of their specific endeavors. Delancy formulated her own definition of a profession which placed emphasis on licensure, technical training preceded by liberal education in a professional school as proof of intellectual ability, and a socio-ethical emphasis produced by a practitioner's association. 4

Oliver Garceau stated his agreement with Delancy - that the general perception of a profession is in such a state of flux that any concept and definition of a profession is dependent upon individual interpretation. The best Garceau could say of the professions today is that they are all eulogistic titles, titles of prestige. 5

For a more positive study of the definition of a profession, Cogan first opened dictionaries and found that most authors, in defining a profession, began with dictionaries as the first and last authority for clarification, and thus all authors had a basic theme upon which they improvised. The New English Dictionary began with the common idea that "profession" was first used in the sense of consecration made by one entering a religious order of the fourteenth century. The "profession" really was the declaration of the novices' sins. The dictionary concluded that a profession was an occupation in which one professed to be skilled, or a vocation in which professional knowledge of some department of

learning or science was used in application to the affairs of others or in the practice of an art.6

Webster's New International Dictionary, after the usual description of a profession, excluded commercial, mechanical, and agricultural work. Carter V. Good's edition of the Dictionary of Education, emphasized long, specialized training obtained through higher education and governed by a special code of ethics; this definition, of course, applied mainly to education.7 All dictionary definitions, then, seem to emphasize the same point - that the professions deal with the practical affairs of men, specifically the three learned professions of ministry, law, and medicine, which mediate man's relationship with God, man in relation to the state, and man in relation to his biological environment. From this concept is established the value, status, privileges, and power accruing to a profession.8 Ballentine's Law Dictionary differentiated and distinguished between the mere study and the specialized knowledge of a profession, between the manual skill of a vocation and intellectual activity of a profession.9 From these dictionaries Cogan cited several common points

---


8 Cogan, "Toward a Definition of Profession," 36.

found in a profession, viz., a profession's service to man's practical affairs, a specific, specialized, intellectual knowledge, and the characteristic of altruism or service without seeking profit. Cogan also discovered certain legal decisions which denied that a profession had the element of commercialism or salary seeking, denied the legality of licensure and mandatory examination, and denied that the law could define a profession. 10

Cogan's next step was to analyze positive, arbitrary, and applied concepts and definitions of a profession as used by political theorists, research workers, census statisticians, and occupational consultants. These theoreticians were intent on listing categories of the professions or occupations. Charles Benoist working on the principle of government representation by the professions failed in an attempt to differentiate a profession from occupation. 11 The United States Department of Commerce failed in efforts at definition, because it neglected to differentiate the intellectually skilled from the technically skilled. In one section the report was so confused as to claim professional status for student nurses and deny it to surveyors and dancers. 12 An attempt at concept and

---

10 State Ex Rel. Steiner V. Yille, 25 p. 2d. 91, 174 Washington, 402 (1933); State V. Cohn, 165 so. 449, 450, 180, La. 53 (1936).


definition of a profession was also made by the United States Department of Labor's *Dictionary of Occupational Titles* which was similar to that of the Department of Commerce. Both seem to bear a rather "ad hoc" relationship to their classifications.\(^{13}\) The English educators, Sidney and Beatrice Webb, based their concept and definition on the assumption that a profession was a corporate phenomenon, an echo of the guild system of the Middle Ages. Thus, they drew up the following arbitrary list of professions in a descending order depending on their origin in the history of corporation:

1. The learned professions of law, medicine, teaching.
2. Technicians of industry as engineers, architects, chemists, surveyors.
3. Technicians of the office as clerks and accountants.
4. Manipulators of men as managers, foremen, canvassers.
5. Professional artists as painters, musicians, actors and writers.\(^{14}\)

Cogan concluded that the Webbs erroneously assumed that essence of a profession was corporateness.

Cogan then listed his own characteristics of a profession. This study notes the almost identical criteria drawn by Carr-Saunders and Wilson. Cogan recorded the following criteria:

1. Prolonged, theoretical knowledge.


2. **A sense of responsibility** more to the individual client than to society.

3. **Altruism** or reception of a fee for services rendered.

4. **Formation of professional associations.**

Cogan also commented on each criteria which he listed. His thought on the prolonged, theoretical knowledge was that new professions are emerging, while occupations and vocations multiply at the same rate. Society more and more is dependent on specialists. The distinction between a profession and a vocation and an occupation can be made by emphasis on the point of the prolonged, theoretical knowledge demanded. Cogan cited James Bryant Conant's comment on the fact that new occupational groups and new skills have enlarged university enrollment and diversity of training. The best title which can be given these groups is "semi-profession," due to their deficiency in the characteristics of a true profession. The best definition of a profession with emphasis on the intellectual basis is that of A. N. Whitehead, who stated that the term, "profession," means an avocation whose activities are subjected to theoretical analysis and are modified by theoretical conclusions derived from that analysis. Such criteria must be grounded upon some understanding of the nature of the ideas involved in these activities, so that the result of action can be

---

foreseen. Thus, foresight based upon theory and theory based upon understanding of the nature of things are essential to a profession. 16

Concerning the sense of responsibility required for a profession Cogan again agrees with Carr-Saunders and Wilson. Responsibility is to the client through professional secrecy. This responsibility is personal and does not mean an indebtedness to the general public as suggested by Edward A. Ross in his book, *Principles of Sociology*, a work demanding the ethics of a profession be open and available to the public who has prior claim to the professional's loyalty. Thus, Ross hopes incompetent doctors, lawyers, etc., be exposed to the public and not merely to the profession. 17

Altruism, for Cogan, meant the professional received a fee, not a salary, for his is a dedicated and redemptive role in society. 18 John Dewey is cited by Cogan for his distinction between the terms, "professional" and "amateur" educators. The distinction reveals the altruism of a profession. Dewey stated that in education, as in sports, the amateur ranks above the professional, because the latter is concerned with rewards extrinsic to the activity pursued. The amateur preaches

---

activity for the love of his work.\textsuperscript{19} Very few educators or authors agree with Dewey. Such a dissenting educator is C.F. Taeusch, who claims profession means greater skill in an activity. For society to be better served the amateur must be excluded; the lover of an art may not be the best skilled in utilizing the art for the public welfare.\textsuperscript{20}

Carr-Saunders and Wilson concluded that the formation of professional associations is inherent in any profession. To this Cogan agreed and cited the demand of Carr-Saunders and Wilson that a profession be defined and exist as the bond between practitioners. This bond is formal organization.\textsuperscript{21} Such association develops and deepens group consciousness and integration. This solidarity increases regard with which the profession is held by the associate members and the general public. Most professions have a written code or constitution which is negative as it controls the member by censure, suspension, or expulsion, and positive by protection of the individual from the selfishness of other professional members and by maintaining and raising standards of admission and guarantee of protection. Associations of the professions develop their own techniques of internal regulation and political protection against


\textsuperscript{21}Carr-Saunders and Wilson, \textit{The Professions}, p. 298.
interference from government agencies. In justice to the opposition Cogan cited J. A. C. Grant's article, "The Guild Returns to America," in Journal of Politics. This author claimed that associations of the professions are nothing more than the return of the guild system control of the professions at the expense of society. 22

Cogan openly proclaimed his positive appreciation of professional associations as agents conducive to greater scientific advancement. The science of a profession refines a profession; wisdom corrects science or knowledge. The result is success, and success differentiates the professional from the "quack." 23

Cogan finally makes conclusions from his analysis. His purpose in this investigative study of the concept and definition of a profession was to identify patterns or characteristics of the professions to establish an acceptable, authoritative definition. His conclusions were that no authoritative definition was found among many authors, that most definitions he analyzed began in dictionaries, that most definitions were more symbolic than realistic, that definitions of profession are not impossible, though difficult because of the inability to measure the degree of the core-characteristics in a profession, that legal definitions are not applicable because they are shackled by the conditions of litigation, that the patterns

23Cogan, "Definition of Profession," p. 47.
or core-characteristics of profession established by Carr-Saunders and Wilson, which Cogan accepts as authoritative, are implicit, but confused in the many definitions Cogan studied, and that confusion of the concept and definition of a profession has arisen because the occupations, vocations, and emerging professions too eagerly assume the title of a profession without qualifying by the core-characteristics; the public values professional titles for prestige and power and thus, confuses a profession with occupation and vocational work.

Finally, as the result of his analytic study, Cogan concluded with this definition of a profession:

"A profession is a vocation whose practice is founded on an understanding of the theoretical structure of some department of learning or science and upon the abilities accompanying such understanding. This understanding and these abilities are applied to the vital, practical affairs of man. The practices of the profession are modified by knowledge of a general nature and by the accumulated wisdom and experience of mankind, which serve to correct errors of specialization. The profession serving the vital needs of man considers its first ethical imperative to be academic service of the client."\(^{24}\)

Conclusions

Cogan's concept and definition of a profession, his core-characteristics of a profession based on the Carr-Saunders and Wilson definition is accepted by this dissertation. After research by this dissertation it is concluded with Cogan that authors shy away from the concept and definition of a profession in their eagerness to get on with

\(^{24}\) Cogan, "Definition of Profession," p. 48.
their own specific purposes, that, although most definitions of a profession are symbolic, the reality is possible, though difficult to achieve, that professional associations are essential to the identity, success, the freedom of a profession, the safety and welfare of the public, and that the public must be reeducated to the difference between a profession, a vocation, an occupation and must rearrange its value systems concerning a profession. From this dissertation's research it again can be concluded that the European concept and definition, of the professions as historically summarized by Carr-Saunders and Wilson, have transferred and have continued in the United States.
Educational Definition - 1956

Myron Lieberman

Lieberman, Department of Education at the University of Oklahoma, researched the definition of a profession as the basis for his book, *Education as a Profession*. In his preface Lieberman suggests that the members of the teaching profession use the characteristics of the established professions of medicine, law, and the ministry as a framework for strengthening their professional status. He advises that teachers as a group participate in the profession, but first they must understand what their profession really is, and be aware of its problems. Teachers must not assume they are an established profession; they must guarantee their professional status. Lieberman then presents a definition and criteria for a profession, admitting that it is difficult to establish an authoritative set of criteria which will clearly distinguish a profession from an occupation.

A profession, according to Lieberman, is an occupation that exhibits the following characteristics:

1. A unique, definite, essential, social service. By "unique," the author means that the occupational service is the only

---


26 Ibid., pp. 2-8.
one of its kind. By "essential," Lieberman means the service is so important that it must be made available to the public, regardless of their ability to pay money or not.

2. **An emphasis on intellectual techniques in service performance.** By this Lieberman means a skill to define problems, a searching-out of relevant data founded on formulas for problem solutions.

3. **A long period of specialization.** Besides general education the professional must spend a period of specialization in the study of his profession, with emphasis on intellectual endeavor.

4. **A broad range of autonomy for the individual practitioner and the occupational group as a whole.** For Lieberman, autonomy means freedom of the individual professional man to make his own best decision, a freedom to judge how the individual may use his professional judgment. For the group, this autonomy means the group is free to decide who enters the ranks of the profession, to determine qualifications for suspension or exclusion, and the freedom to determine what is ethical or unethical in conduct.

5. **The acceptance on the part of the professional individual of responsibility for his own judgment.**
6. Emphasis on service to be rendered rather than on economical gain. Service is not a reward; service is not motivation; service means public obligation over private obligations.

7. A comprehensive self-governing organization of practitioners large and powerful enough to set standards of entry and exclusion, to promote high standards of practice, to raise the social and economic status of the professional group, to promote or demote some practice essential to the group or the public, and to keep any active minority in its place if it jeopardizes the interests of the inactive majority of a profession.

8. A code of ethics clarified and interpreted by concrete cases. This upholds the high standards of performance and conduct.

This is Lieberman's view, his concept and definition of a profession, with specific reference to the teaching profession. Lieberman takes great pains to explain autonomy, that ability of the professional to decide what is best in a situation. Lieberman points out that the teaching profession has allowed school boards, the P.T.A., and various civic groups to dominate their decisions.27 Lieberman warns that the public is well-meaning, but ignorant of the teaching profession and its need to render its own professional decisions. Pity, then, the poor school or district-

27Lieberman, *Education a Profession*, pp. 66-68.
superintendent who must accede, and lend his professional skill to the ignorance and emotion of the benevolent groups cited above. Lieberman deplores the self-inflicted blindness of such superintendents who make believe that the reality of the usurpation of their authority is really democracy. Thus, a political power-structure stands in the path of teaching becoming the profession it has the right to be. Lieberman cannot understand the satisfaction teachers accept in being told that they are professional, while in their intellects they know they are subordinate, under-powered, underestimated, under-paid, and tragically sub-professional.

Conclusions

The conclusion of this dissertation agrees with Lieberman that teachers know the objectivity of their profession, but for some emotional or psychological reason cannot rise to declare their autonomy, the ancient strength of their profession. Until they do so, teachers will be labelled as that group which prefers salary, a pat-on-the-back, and a weak inference to the service of the public. Let the profession of teachers police themselves or perish is the conclusion of both Lieberman and this dissertation.

Lieberman's concept and definition of a profession and professional education does demonstrate the continuance of the European concept and definition. Lieberman comes to grips with some of the problems of the American teaching profession and professional education, viz., the autonomy and self-governing associations. These two core-characteristics are
weakest in the profession of teaching and seem to be at the seat of troubles, internal and external, of the teaching profession at primary and secondary levels. Lieberman has begun what is a much needed research for the profession of teaching.
Educational Definition - 1959

Earl J. McGrath

McGrath's overall study of the liberal arts and professional school programs concluded that the sharp dichotomy which prevailed for centuries in higher education between liberal and professional studies is no longer useful for advancing higher education, nor consistent with the facts of contemporary and academic life in this country. The time has passed when invidious and footless distinctions between liberal education and professional education can serve any purpose other than to obscure issues which urgently need to be clarified and intelligently solved. Now is the time to consider the myriad colleges and universities as integrated wholes, united to prepare citizens for their life's work and for the more comprehensive activities of daily life. McGrath diligently researched the concept and definition of liberal education and a profession, so that the rest of his plan for integrated higher education might not proceed with confused terms. McGrath's analysis and conclusions for higher education by the juncture of liberal and professional education is studied later in Chapter V of this dissertation.

This history of professional education is as arresting and as changing as that of liberal education. Before dealing with the history and the

future of professional education, McGrath made his study of the meaning of
the phrase, "a profession." McGrath cited the exhaustive analysis of
Carr-Saunders and Wilson. McGrath definitely agreed with the British
scholars that no attempt should be made to define a profession, rather let
it be concluded that many vocations, possessing certain characteristics
in a greater or lesser degree, approach more or less closely to the
characteristics of a profession. McGrath then cited and accepted as his
criteria the characteristics of a profession established by Carr-Saunders
and Wilson. McGrath asserted that the eight professions he analyzed in
his study, besides the traditional professions of law, medicine, the
ministry, and teaching, involved essentially intellectual operations with
large individual responsibility; all derive raw material from science and
learning in smaller or larger amounts. They apply their learning to
practical ends; with a variety of quality they all possess an educationally
communicable technique; self-organization is their tendency and they vary
in altruistic motivation.29 The eight professions analyzed by McGrath are
agriculture, business-administration, education, engineering, journalism,
music, nursing, and pharmacy. For McGrath these eight professions, some
moving slowly, some rapidly, will gain their goal through a careful
selection of their members, through the precise statement of a code of
ethical conduct, and through the reprobation and exclusion of members
whose behavior lowers public esteem.

29 McGrath, "Liberal Education in the Professions," p. 27.
McGrath has refused to give an authoritative, ideal definition of a profession. He strongly agreed with Carr-Saunders and Wilson on a goal of certain fixed criteria or characteristics for an occupation seeking the status of a profession. He concluded that the meaning of a profession is not entirely clear and at present not precisely possible, since the economic, educational, and social factors influencing professional status in the public's estimation are too complex, interrelated, and unstable.

Conclusions

After this dissertation's research it was concluded that McGrath agreed with the concept and definition of Carr-Saunders and Wilson. McGrath's thesis was that liberal education and professional education must blend in an academic marriage, though for the sake of terminology, retaining their title of liberal arts education and professional education. For McGrath no authoritative, limited definition can be given of a profession because of the internal and external changes taking place as various occupations emerge. McGrath insists that liberal arts colleges, universities, and professional schools should have a distinct curriculum designed to educate for intelligent living, professional practice, or vocational skill. Such a curriculum must leave no doubt in the mind of the students or public as to the precise nature of the education given. Thus, carelessness, greed, etc., will no longer contaminate the occupations specified.30 These conclusions

30 McGrath, "Liberal Education in the Professions," p. 61.
of McGrath are in agreement with those of this dissertation which will further analyze his plan in Chapter V on the ideal education of a professional man and the future of the liberal arts and professional schools.

McGrath's study has certainly focused on the concept and definition of a profession and professional education in the United States and demonstrates the transference and continuance of the European concept and definition of the professions. He is singular among authors in noticing that Carr-Saunders and Wilson specifically recommend that no rigid definition be stated, but rather a set of core-characteristics be used to measure whether an occupation comes close to or drifts away from the ideal characteristics of a profession and professional education. This work of McGrath concentrates more on concept and nature of profession and professional education than on the relationship between liberal arts education and professional education, which he originally planned for his study.
Sociological Definition - 1960

William J. Goode

Goode's study, "The Theoretical Limits of Professionalization," was an examination of limitations in America's labor forces or occupations which prevent them from ever being and becoming a true profession.\(^1\)

Social theorists have stated and attempted to explain why an industrial society is a professionalizing one. Professionalization is the process of an occupation assuming the characteristics of a profession. Goode explored the theoretical limits of an occupation in becoming professionalized, i.e., how a profession comes into being and how society facilitates or impedes the development of professions. Goode concluded that many occupations and semi-professions will never become professions in the usual sense, that they will never reach the levels of knowledge and dedication to service which society considers necessary for a profession. Such occupations include teaching, nursing, librarianship, pharmacy, stockbroking, advertising, and business management. Those occupations which do rise to high levels will continue to be viewed as qualitatively different from the four great "Person Professions," as law, medicine, the ministry, and university teaching. In social reality these occupations will be less

professional in such important traits as cohesion, commitment to norms of service, percentage of numbers remaining in profession throughout their lifetime, homogeneity of membership, and control over professional violations. Goode concluded that despite higher prestige ranking and income, the occupations of an industrial society may call themselves "professional," but are not achieving the qualities of the "Person Professions;" they are their own worst obstacles to becoming professionalized by continuance of competition among occupations in the form of power, money, prestige, either as a group or as an individual, and by monopoly. Occupations calling themselves profession seek autonomy but really practice monopoly; they either oust or absorb other like occupations. Professional autonomy means freedom to make decisions and judgments based on knowledge for the service of the client and not mere growth in power, prestige, or money through monopoly. Another obstacle to professionalization is the fact of one individual occupation overlapping the others, i.e., claiming the role of profession, but in reality only doing one part of service for the public, e.g., the veterinary as a surgeon, a mere farrier, a farmer-blacksmith, a blacksmith-armorer. Such lack the essential homogeneity of membership and type of work, a definite characteristic of a profession.

Goode severely rebuked the sociologist, Harold Wilensky, who established steps for a semi-profession to become a recognized profession. Wilensky


33 Ibid., p. 271.
offered these measures of professionalization:

1. Full-time activity at the task.
2. Establishment of university training.
3. National professional association.
4. Redefinition of the core task giving "dirty work" to subordinates.
5. Conflict between the old timers and the new men who seek to upgrade the job.
6. Competition between the new occupations and neighboring ones.
7. Political agitation in order to gain legal protection.
8. A code of ethics.

Not only are these statements empirically incorrect and theoretically unconvincing, according to Goode, but they miss the essential elements of professionalization, i.e., they do not separate the core or "generating" traits from the derivative ones. Many occupations have tried and failed in these steps. Goode estimated that over one hundred occupations were claiming professional status, yet of these only forty are worthy of the title. Most have characteristics or attempt to achieve similarities with those core-characteristics of the ancient "Person Professions" of law, medicine, the ministry, and university teaching. All forty have the similar characteristics of high income, prestige, high educational requirements, professional autonomy, licensure, commitment to service, desire to remain in service for life, a code of ethics, cohesion of professional community, and a monopoly over a task. These are good characteristics, but Goode explored them to deduce what he thinks is the

---

essence of a profession, viz., two generating life-giving, life-sustaining qualities which are a basic body of abstract knowledge, and the ideal of service; these two characteristics are the origin and life-pulse of all others. Goode then explained these two generating qualities of a profession. Concerning abstract professional knowledge, Goode meant a series of seven characteristics for acceptance as professional knowledge, viz., an abstract, codified body of principles, their application to concrete facts of life, a belief that this knowledge can solve problems, a knowledge which can be given and shared by group occupation for problem solution, the creation, organization, and transmission of knowledge, the role of a profession as the final arbiter of disputes of technical solutions, and knowledge and skills possessing a kind of mystery not given the ordinary man or acquired by his own efforts. 35

The ideal of service, the second of qualities generating life to a profession, according to Goode, is often called "collectivity orientation," which means that the technical solutions which the professional attains should be based on the objective need of the client, not on the subjective interests or needs of the professional man himself, or of society. The ideal of service then means that the professional decides according to objective need, that the professional can be called upon to sacrifice time, safety, health, even life, that society actually believes that the

profession not only accepts, but follows these ideals to some extent, that the profession constantly improves knowledge and high quality recruitment of candidates, and that the professional community sets forth its own system of rewards and punishments. 36

Without declaring it as such, Goode in the previous thoughts on "generating qualities" of a profession has given and explained his concept and definition of a profession as an occupation based on a body of abstract knowledge and the ideal of service. From the analyses of the other authors' definition of profession cited in this chapter, it may be seen that Goode founded his concept and definition on the basic principles of Carr-Saunders and Wilson.

Perhaps, better than Morris L. Cogan, Goode has succeeded in stating what is a profession, what is a semi-profession, what are the generating qualities necessary for occupation to become professionalized. With some daring and a firm stand on his own requirements for professional status Goode listed those occupations which have aspired to and have achieved professional status, viz., dentistry, certified public accountancy, clinical psychology, and scientific engineering, which will achieve profession status in time. Those occupations which will not achieve professional status are osteopathy, nursing, chiropracty, pharmacy, school-teaching, and librarianship; these are destined to remain semi-professions. 37

Conclusions

Goode's ingenuity in exploring a two-point concept and definition based on the Carr-Saunders and Wilson core of characteristics are to be applauded. Goode is strong enough to say there is a real, not only a symbolic definition, which Carr-Saunders and Wilson abandoned. Goode had only the interests of occupations and semi-professions in mind when he warned them of self-delusion, and instructed them in the qualities which could generate a true status of profession.

The author has provided a deep, dynamic perspective in his observations that yesterday's non-professions may be tomorrow's professions, that semi-professions of today may stop short of becoming full professions or may be in a transitional stage, which moves away from or toward a professional status.

That the European concept and definition of a profession and professional education have transferred and continued in essence to the United States is evident in the study by William J. Goode. Goode goes beyond Cogan, Lieberman, or McGrath in his application of the concept and definition of a profession in its American setting by stating the core-characteristics of a profession and then bluntly stating which American occupations he judges to be, never to be, and which are presently emerging to professional status.
Sociological Definition - 1962

Howard S. Becker

A profession, to be understood and pursued, must have a defined meaning. Definitions of a profession have been proposed by students of a profession, members of a profession, interested laymen, and social scientists. Each using the term, "profession" in his own way, as was witnessed in the study of specific authors.

Howard Becker, the author of the article, "The Nature of a Profession," cited several definitions, the best of which he stated was that of Abraham Flexner, who established six criteria for distinguishing professions from other kinds of work.38 For Flexner professional activity was:

1. Intellectual, carrying with it great personal responsibility.
2. Learned, being based on great knowledge and not merely routine.
3. Practical, rather than academic and theoretic.
4. Technical, capable of being taught - this being the basis of professional education.
5. Strongly organized internally.
6. Motivated by altruism, i.e., the professionals viewing themselves as working for some aspect of the good of society.39


To avoid the accusation of subjectivism in his choice of a working definition of a profession, Becker also cited the Carr-Saunders and Wilson definition of a profession:

"The application of an intellectual technique to the ordinary business of life, acquired as the result of prolonged and specialized training, is the chief distinguishing characteristic of a true profession."40

Ralph W. Tyler was also cited by Becker for his definition, as having found the two essential characteristics of a true profession to be the existence of a generally recognized code of ethics supported by group discipline and the basing of technical operations on general principles, rather than on rule-of-thumb or routine skills.41

Despite the overabundance of similarities rather than differences in the various definitions of a profession proposed, the debate on what is a profession still goes on with proponents stating that the essential point making an occupation a profession is the presence or absence of a "genuine professional spirit."

Becker claimed that the ambiguity of the true nature of a profession was due to the use of one term to describe two or more different concepts of a profession. The social scientist used his definition for his study, while the member of a profession had his meaning. The layman used his own definition of a profession as it portrayed a morally desirable work

40 Carr-Saunders and Wilson, The Professions, p. 491.

of work. How, then, to find a way out of the dilemma of the definition of a profession, a way that is objective and still accurately includes the layman's sense of "a morally desirable kind of work?" Becker suggested that a sociological view could be taken which regards the professions simply as those occupations which have been fortunate enough, in the politics of today's work-world, to gain and maintain possession of that honorific title.42

His conclusion, then, was that there is no such thing as a "true profession," and no set of characteristics necessarily associated with the title. If accepted, Becker's proposal means that "profession" is an honorific title, a term of approbation, a highly valued collective symbol, a part of the apparatus of the society studied, a "folk concept" of a profession.43

Becker did try, however, to settle the definition of a profession by including the objective characteristics of a profession and conventional beliefs of what these characteristics ought to be. The author then developed the symbol, as well as the reality of a profession.

The symbol of a profession, for Becker, means simply those characteristics of a profession which one thinks of in connection with

---


an occupation as a profession. Beneath surface disagreements there are interconnected characteristics which symbolize a morally praiseworthy kind of occupational organization. This symbol of the ideal profession consists of a set of ideas about the kind of work done by a real profession, its relationship to its own members, its relationship with clients and the general public, and the characteristics of its own members' motivations.

The symbol of profession, as Becker stated, means that a profession possesses a monopoly of some esoteric and difficult body of knowledge. This special knowledge is necessary for the continued function of society; it involves not only technical skills and the fruits of practical experience, but also principles arrived at by scientific research and logical analysis. As a result of the foregoing principles, the symbol of profession supposes that only the most able people have the mental ability and proper temperament to absorb and use such knowledge. Recruitment of professionals, therefore, must be strictly controlled by weeding out the unfit and by lengthy and difficult educational processes. Entrance into professional practice must be strictly controlled, which control lies in the hands of members of the profession itself. Herein, the police-power of the State might best be utilized to reinforce such

---

decisions. Approval and accreditation of educational institutions and procedures must be done by members of the profession. There must be no layman’s control. To protect the interests of the client from the personal aggrandizement of the professional, the activities of a profession must be governed by a code of ethics emphasizing devotion to service and condemning selfish misuse of professional skills. The members of a profession are to enjoy autonomy from state, religious, and lay pressures as long as the accepted member acts in accordance with professional ethics.

Becker has effectively presented the symbol - the ideal of a profession. Now the question arises, "does the profession achieve such lofty ideals?" The reality of professional work must be compared with the symbol, if one is to understand the nature of a profession and to assess professional education. Becker claimed that two professions, law and medicine, can be used in comparing the reality with symbol. One can discern whether they have achieved the objective reality of their symbol. Becker claims that the realities of medicine and law have really not achieved the ideals proposed.

Viewing the two named professions as possessing a monopoly of some esoteric and difficult body of knowledge, the research done by this dissertation, in agreement with Becker, must deny that reality is the same as the symbol. Neither medicine nor law have this monopoly for parts of their work are done by non-professionals, just as tax consultants, or officers of banks also do legal work. The function of the doctor - to heal the sick - is shared by the non-professionals - osteopaths,
chiropractors, etc. Thus, the reality of a profession differs from the symbol of a profession.

In the dissertation researched another difference noted in the reality of a profession compared to the symbol of a profession is the professional code of ethics. Minor specialists within a profession have differentiating codes of professional conduct. Professionals are forced to give service that is satisfactory within the layman's eyes. Here their autonomy or independence is threatened, for they must depend on lay references and fees. The professionals may insist on autonomy and find it within "inner fraternities," which establish standards for procedure, but then the professionals lose some independence to the "fraternity."

Becker's conclusions are that the symbols of a profession aim at realities that are unattainable. Such symbols of a profession are unrealistic as they ignore so many important features of occupational life. As such, the ideals alone of a profession cannot provide an adequate guide for a profession.

Professional education tends to build curricula and programs in ways suggested by the symbol of profession. Yet, these symbols of a profession must be closely related to the realities of life confronted by practitioners of a profession; let them be first symbols, intelligible and workable, then they can become realistic.

Conclusions

Becker researched various definitions of a profession and favored
those of Flexner and Carr-Saunders and Wilson. Becker praised Flexner's concise definition that a profession is intellectual, learned, practical, technical, strongly organized internally, and motivated by altruism. Yet, Becker tried to please too many people, professional and lay. He was overly concerned with how the layman evaluates profession. In the opinion of this dissertation the quality of altruism in profession will protect the good of society; the layman's attitude toward a profession is one of giving honor and worth; the layman would say, "Why ask me? You are the professional. You know your jobs. I simply ask your service."
The layman agrees with Becker that human nature is weak, that there always will be those who are unprofessional. The layman prefers a profession to set and maintain standards, as he gives his confidence and community authority to profession.

It was disappointing that Becker was not more expansive in his conclusions on the implications of the nature of a profession and professional education. He merely seems to think that a profession sets too high standards of the ideal profession for the real profession. However, in the opinion of this dissertation, Becker must not forget that the ideal uplifts the real, and that the real does not necessarily drag down the ideal. Let the education of a profession insist on the ideal and lift up, even demand from the real, if it be real, to become and remain the ideal or symbol. Such a demand, in the opinion of this dissertation, is not too harsh.

Only the fit and worthy may engage in a profession. Realistic
service to society must be the motive of a profession.

Becker's definition could be considered the framework or dynamic process of the professionalization described by Vollmer and Mills, as well as William Goode. Flexner, Carr-Saunders and Wilson were the backbone of Becker's monograph, and they admitted to a dynamic process, a continuum of professionalization occurring in occupation. Becker should have so described his own hesitancy instead of avoiding the term, "professionalization." Essentially, Becker has accepted the European concept and definition of a profession and demonstrates their transference and continuation in the United States. Becker is not too clear in what he really means by the symbol and reality of a profession. His distinction is good for discussion and generalizations on the subject, but what he really is stating is that the same set of core-characteristics listed by Carr-Saunders and Wilson are to be used in measuring the degree of professionalization towards which or away from which an occupation moves.
Barber's article, "Some Problems in the Sociology of the Professions," was an excellent monograph on the professions in which six distinctive points were studied, viz., a definition of a profession, the role of the university school, the social sources of concern within the professions, the emerging or marginal professions, professional roles and organizational necessities, and the professions and politics. 45

Barber defined a profession from the sociological viewpoint - from the position of social and professional behavior. The author admitted that theoretical and methodological consensus is yet not so great among sociologists, that there can be any absolute agreement on the definition of a profession. Barber tried, however, to summarize into one idea the best qualities of all definitions from the behavioral viewpoint. "Professional behavior" is the key phrase for Barber's definition, which behavior has the four following attributes, which in turn are based on Carr-Saunders and Wilson: 46

1. A high degree of generalized and systematic knowledge.


46 Carr-Saunders and Wilson, The Professions, p. 11.
2. **Primary orientation to community interest rather than to individual self-interest.**

3. **A high degree of self-control of behavior** through codes of ethics internalized in the process of socialization and through voluntary associations organized and operated by the organizations' specialists.

4. **A system of rewards,** monetary and honorary, which are primarily a set of symbols of work achievement and thus ends in themselves, and not means to individual self-interest.

Barber insisted at every opportunity on the term, "professional behavior," a symptom of the sociological viewpoint. The four attributes defined a scale of professionalism to detect to what extent professional status is present in different forms of occupational performance. Barber listed as the most professional occupations, by virtue of their full realization of his four attributes, a justice of the United States Supreme Court, a professor of physics, a Nobel Prize winner in a distinguished university. Thus, a $100,000 a year vice-president in charge of legal affairs for a middle-sized business corporation is less professional, while a $6,000 a year school-teacher is ranked as less professional still.47

---

Barber explained his four attributes of a profession with emphasis on the viewpoint of a definition in terms of social behavior. One can immediately see the author's dependence on the definitions of Carr-Saunders and Wilson, and Morris L. Cogan. Barber, like too many other educators, presented in this study, shied away from an authoritative definition, excusing himself by the use of the usual scale of professionalism to measure the professionalization of an occupation. Barber only differed in the use of the term "professional viewpoint." His definition is good and adds weight to the maypole concept of a profession as presented by Carr-Saunders and Wilson. The transference and continuation of the concept and definition of a profession and professional education from Europe to the United States are evident in Barber's work, which also indicates that thought and research on American qualities in the professions are healthy and growing in American education, sociology, and the occupations.
Sociological Definition - 1965

Everett C. Hughes

Hughes in his monograph, "Professions," came to the point of a definition of a profession immediately by quoting the Oxford Shorter Dictionary's meaning of the adjective, "professed," i.e., one who has taken the vows of a religious order. Hughes stated simply that by 1675 the word no longer was confined to religion, but had the secular meaning of an occupation which one professes to be duly qualified in, to be skilled in, and to follow, a vocation in which professed knowledge of some branch of learning is used in its application to the affairs of others, such as divinity, law, medicine, and military science which were the learned professions. The essence of a profession is the knowledge or skill better known by some than others concerning the nature of certain matters. Thus, the professional knows better than the client what ails him or his affairs. From this knowledge flows the profession's exclusive right to practice, which is the basis of licensure. This gives the practitioner the right to think objectively and make decisions in his thought and act. He may thus deviate professionally from the layman's opinion because of his expert knowledge. Since he "professes," the

practitioner asks to be trusted. This is "credat emptor" - "let the buyer believe" by giving the professional his trust and protection, both of which are mutually returned. From his knowledge, his trust, the professional bands together with his colleagues for association peculiar in nature, function, and method to the profession specified. Such solidarity naturally leads to commitment for life to the profession.

Conclusions

There is no doubt in the conclusion of this dissertation that Hughes agreed and modeled his definition, or rather his exposition of the core-characteristics of a profession, on the conclusions of Carr-Saunders and Wilson. His study demonstrates the transference and continuation of the European concept and definition of a profession and professional education to the United States and one educator's and sociologist's interpretation of this concept and definition in American professions.
Eleven American and two European authors have been researched and analyzed by this dissertation. The authors have seriously worked for a definition of a profession. The consensus of all the authors ultimately was confined to five attributes or core-characteristics of a profession which distinguish it from other occupations, viz., a basis of systematic, theoretical knowledge, an authority recognized by the clientele of a profession, a broader community sanction and approval, a code of ethics regulating the relationship between professional persons with clients and with colleagues, and a professional culture sustained by formal professional associations. Ernest Greenwood in his monograph, "The Elements of Professionalization," warned the reader that these attributes are not the monopoly of professions for non-professions also possess them, but in lesser degree along the continuum or scale of professionalism. Let the reader keep this concept of continuum in mind and the Greenwood research will appear less a distortion of reality.

For Greenwood, the systematic, theoretical body of knowledge means profession flows from and is supported by a fund of knowledge that has

---

been organized in an internally consistent system called a body of principles, a system of abstract propositions that describe in general terms the classes of phenomena comprising a profession's focus of interest. Preparation for such knowledge is required through the study of treatises. This means formal education in an academic situation, and usually means the presence of a professional school in some way affiliated with a university.

The authority recognized by the clientele of a profession, according to Greenwood, flows from the acquisition of a type of knowledge which the untrained layman does not possess. This knowledge gives the professional an authority by which he decides what is good or evil for the client who has no knowledge in the matter. The client cannot diagnose his need, cannot evaluate the caliber of service he receives. The client of a non-professional occupation, on the other hand, can determine his needs, the type of service he requires, and has freedom of decision. From this situation emerges the business phrase, "The customer is always right."

Professional authority is desired by many occupations attempting professionalization. Professional authority gives the client and the practitioner mutual security and faith. This authority, however, is not limitless; one danger for the professional is abuse of the client's dependency.

The broader community sanctions and approval given to a profession brings power and privileges to a profession, according to Greenwood. This sanction may be formal or enforced by community police-power. The
power given by community-sanction is control over training centers by which a profession gives accreditation from within a profession. Such control determines the number of candidates, location of training and caliber of teacher-faculty. Control over candidates, admission to professional schools or control of a licensing system is enforced by community police-power.

Privileges sanctioned and conferred by community to a profession are based on the confidence for efficient performance by the practitioner. This enables the client to find it easier to give the information needed by a profession. For this, community gives profession legal protection, relative immunity from community judgment in technical matters. Thus, the performance of a professional is judged by his peers based on the existing body of theoretical knowledge.

A code of ethics regulating the relationship between professionals and clients and with colleagues must be employed, lest the dependency and confidence of the professional and the client be abused or be monopolized by one or the other. According to Greenwood, this attribute is the essence of a profession. Usually such codes are formal, explicit, systematic, binding, service-orientated and altruistic. To the client the professional, through the code of ethics, confers emotional neutrality, service to anyone regardless of age, kin, race, sex, or personal feeling. Regarding his colleagues, the code of ethics assists the professional in being cooperative, equalitarian, and supportative. The code of ethics is exercised formally through professional associations with the power to
criticize and censure; the code is informal in exercise through consultation and referral of clients.\textsuperscript{50}

The fifth attribute of a profession in Greenwood's analysis is a professional culture sustained by formal professional associations. Such associations may be organizations of hospitals, clinics, universities, law offices, engineering firms, social agencies, or educational and research centers. These professional associations voice the self-consciousness of group aims and interests. All these combined make up a professional culture which has social values, norms specific to a profession, or symbols laden with the profession's meaning, as insignia, emblems, dress, history, folklore, heroes, and villains.\textsuperscript{51}

Conclusions

This dissertation concludes that the monograph presented the basic points of the core-characteristics, proposed by Carr-Saunders and Wilson, and Morris L. Cogan, of the concept and definition of a profession. The transference and continuation of the European concept and definition of a profession and professional education is evident in Greenwood's study. No other observation can be made except to mention Greenwood's view as a sociologist commenting on social behavior. This is noted in his phraseology, terminology, and viewpoint.

\textsuperscript{50}Arleen Johnson, "Professional Standards and How They Are Attained," \textit{Journal of American Dental Association}, XXXI (September, 1944), 1181-1189.

\textsuperscript{51}Greenwood, "The Elements of Professionalization," p. 17.
Vollmer and Mills in their book, *Professionalization*, have edited some fifty-seven readings focusing attention on twenty-seven different occupations. The authors themselves contributed much to the definition of a profession, while other essayists, educators, and historians in their book concentrated on various aspects of a profession, such as characteristics, antecedents, social consequences, etc. The authors anticipated this study's observance that most of the contributors to their book began with the original formulations on the professions by Carr-Saunders and Wilson. Vollmer and Mills admitted that their reading of the volumes of monographs indicated a certain looseness, or confusion in the use of terminology, and that a considerable degree of flexibility in the definition and use of concepts can be advantageous to the building of a science. The literature researched by them presented definitions of the terms, "professionalization," "professionalism," "professionals," "professional groups," and "professions."

"A profession" is an ideal type of occupational organization which does not exist in reality, but which provides a model for the formation of an occupation that would result if any occupational group became

---

completely professionalized. That dynamic process whereby many occupations can be observed to change crucial characteristics in the direction of a profession is called "professionalization."\[53\]

"Professionalism," for Vollmer and Mills, meant the ideology and those associated activities to which occupational groups aspire. Professionalism may be a necessary constituent of professionalization, but professionalism is not sufficient cause for the entire process of professionalization. "Professionals" are those who are considered by their colleagues to be members of professional groups. "Professional groups" are those associations of colleagues in an occupational context where it is observed that a relatively high degree of professionalization has taken place.

**Conclusions**

The usefulness of Vollmer and Mill's definitions and terminology is acknowledged by this dissertation. That Vollmer and Mills depend on Carr-Saunders and Wilson as well as Cogan's definitions of a profession, and that the European concept and definition of the professions and professional education have transferred and continue in American profession are obvious conclusions of their work. Cogan, Goode, Vollmer and Mills, and Becker all agree that a profession must be thought of in terms of a symbol, an ideal type toward which an occupation may go to or from in

various aspects of professionalization.
Sociological Definition - 1969

Nina Toren

In her monograph, "Semi-Professionalism and Social Work - a Theoretical Perspective," Nina Toren attempted to establish or locate social work along the continuum of professionalization, i.e., to determine whether social work is a semi-profession or a profession. Toren effectively established her belief that a full profession has core-characteristics which have a body of theoretical knowledge, special skills and competence in applying this knowledge, and a professional conduct guided by a code of ethics which focuses on the service of the client. Using these core-characteristics one can determine the degree of professional status achieved by an occupation, i.e., that the occupation is in a process of crystallization, regression, or integration into professional status. Toren cited the work of Carr-Saunders and Wilson, who differentiated four types of professions based on the knowledge a profession possessed. These four types were the established professions such as law, medicine, the ministry, and university teaching, which share two basic attributes - a theoretical study of a department of learning and a feeling of obligation to follow a certain mode of behavior.

professions are based on their own fundamental studies, such professions being engineering, chemistry, accounting, the natural and social sciences; the semi-professions replace theoretical study with acquisition of technical skill, such semi-professions being nursing, pharmacy, optometry, and social work; the would-be professions require neither theoretical study nor the acquisition of technical skill, but a familiarity with modern practices in business-administration and current conventions; such occupations are hospital managers, sales managers, and work managers.55

Toren then borrowed Greenwood's five components or characteristics of a profession which are a basis of systematic, theoretical knowledge, an authority recognized by the clientele of the professional group, a broader community sanction and approval of this authority, a code of ethics regulating relationship of professionals with clients and colleagues, and a professional culture sustained by formal professional associations.56 Toren's objective was to locate the place of semi-professions and place them somewhere in the continuum of a profession and an occupation; she then proceeded to examine the semi-profession of social work in the light of the five core-characteristics cited.


Conclusions

It is the conclusion of this dissertation that Toren depended on Carr-Saunders and Wilson and Greenwood for her five components for a full profession. The author never deliberately stated the definition of a profession, but equivocally defined it in her treatment of the five components of a profession. Toren is splendid and clear in showing the transfer and continuance of the European concept and definition of the professions and professional education in the United States. Of the eleven American authors researched by this dissertation Toren was the most contributive as she distinguished a profession, a semi-profession, and an occupation, and indicated how an occupation moves closer to the reality of full professional status.
Summary of Conclusions and Implications for Education

Early in this research it was indicated that the term "education," was to be understood as the education of all persons in the professions, not just some practitioners such as school-teachers in the classroom. Over two hundred books, monographs, general and particular essays, and journals have been assiduously researched by this dissertation for the historical study of a profession and professional education in the United States. The term, "assiduously," is used to indicate the scrupulous analysis given each of these sources. In the two hundred some sources, only eleven American authors indicated in this first chapter showed any concern with stating the definition of a profession and professional education or how the terms, "profession," "professionalization," "professionalism," etc., were used. Howard Vollmer and Donald Mills, and Nina Toren were especially excellent on these definitions. Therefore, using these eleven American authors as authorities, a mosaic was assembled to present a picture of the definition of a profession and professional education. The chapters to follow will subsequently embellish this mosaic, so that a truer meaning of a profession and professional education in the United States may be established.

The historical study of a profession and professional education by Ellwood P. Cubberley was long, but, if the reader persevered through the pages of the centuries, he would recognize some of the characteristics of a profession and professional education that later emerged from the
minds, pens, and pages of such works by Carr-Saunders and Wilson, a work concluded by this study to be the genesis for others working on the concept and definition of a profession and professional education. The Carr-Saunders and Wilson educational, historical, and sociological study did not give a final and definitive definition, but wisely stated, after research of some twenty prominent English occupations, that not a definition but core-characteristics determine the status of an occupation or vocation as "professional," when such occupations come closer or move away from these characteristics. This pendulum leaves room for the emergence of new professions. The other studies analyzed definitely take origin form the Carr-Saunders and Wilson report.

Of unusual excellence in depth was the study of Morris L. Cogan, who analyzed the need of such a study to be educational, economical, and sociological. Cogan studied definitions, negative and positive, of a profession and professional education, indicating what studies, as Whitehead's, he thought most worthy. Cogan noted that all authors analyzed by his study based or included the core-characteristics of Carr-Saunders and Wilson in their investigations of a profession. Cogan then gave his own, but not authoritative definition, which is a delineation of the core-characteristics of a profession.

Myron Lieberman, ever the professional educator of the teaching profession, aimed at the true meaning of an educator and teacher and devised a schema of characteristics toward which the teaching profession must aim if it desired to proceed from semi-professional to professional status.
William Goode progressed a step deeper into the educational study of a profession and professional education. He knew what the core-characteristics of a mature profession and professional education were, but wanted primarily to study the traits of a human occupation which, when mingled, conceive and generate these core-characteristics. In his conclusions he listed the occupations which have, will, and will not become professions.

Nina Toren made a signal contribution to the study of profession by analyzing what a semi-profession and semi-professional education were.

A different tack was taken by Bernard Barber, who aimed at analyzing the university, the rightful academic home of a profession and professional education, but Barber was sidetracked and only emphasized the definition of a profession.

Following the Barber report in chronology, Earl McGrath depicted an educational study of the tighter, more intimate relationship that does and must exist between the liberal arts curriculum and professional education. McGrath gave three challenging steps for education to use in closing the unnecessary gap between liberal arts and professional studies.

Howard Becker's sociological study was based on the explanation of the Flexner Report, as well as the Carr-Saunders and Wilson study. The ideal and the reality of a profession and professional education were honestly compared, and the opinions of educators, professionals, and laymen were contrasted to conclude that no ideal ever existed that could
not become the real. Becker concluded that the core-characteristics of Carr-Saunders and Wilson were the most realistic approach and description of what a profession ought to be.

One sociological implication learned from this entire chapter was that some educators were concerned with the growing emphasis by the public on the prestige and income supposedly derived from a profession. They worried that so little regard is given to that sociological characteristic of a profession called, "altruism" or responsibility to the public by a highly skilled service which must necessarily include a complex code of ethics, the observance of which many people are not capable. Ernest Greenwood analyzed these responsibilities in greater detail.

Some educational implications to be drawn from these writings of the many educators discussed are that never before have the professions and professional education and the university had need one for the other at undergraduate and graduate levels for curriculum, and for mutual faculty harmony instead of the traditional rivalry. McGrath emphasized this point, as did Barber, both trying to explain the functions of the university, a profession, and the professional school. It will be noted in a subsequent chapter on medicine that seventy-five of one hundred and fifty professional schools of medicine, following the Flexner Report on medicine, closed their doors, while others scurried to become, if not already so, university affiliated. The university seems to be the natural home of the professions and their schools. In the same chapter
on medicine the tremendous power exerted by the university and professional associations on a profession will be studied. The educational team-work between the university and a profession can be mutual, as faculty and a profession exchange curriculum content, facilities, and a spirit of inquiry to initiate the young candidate into his society as a professional man. Becker in his monograph on the nature of a profession hoped to show that a profession in strictly "professional schools" has the tendency to allow its symbol to become unrealistic, out of proportion, if professional education in its own schools monopolized the curricula and programs constituted to prepare the student for the world in which he will live and work. Educators must use the symbols to provide intelligible, workable, and moral guides in problematic situations. Let all - university, faculty, and profession - pay little attention to the social traps of prestige, income, etc., and provide a true profession. Otherwise, the foolishness of the men counting chickens before they are hatched, and little knowing the farmer's intent to sell the eggs, could be a homely allegory applied to professional education.

In a subsequent chapter it will be revealed that in the 1970 United States Census, 10.2 million out of 81.4 million workers will be professional. Education is the second highest of our nation's products in cost, as billions of dollars are spent on education. Professional men and educators in general, then, must be clear on what type of education they must promote. They must not delude self or student that all
occupations are professions. Toren indicated this idea in her article on semi-professions. All occupation is noble, not deceptive. Let education know the qualifications, characteristics, as well as the hardships of a profession, but never let education relax in its aim at upgrading a profession. The public and the professional, then, would both suffer the consequences if these aims were ever forgotten.

The study of relevant authors cited in this dissertation has demonstrated that the European concept and definition of a profession and professional education have been transferred to and continue in essence in the United States. It is a conclusion of this dissertation that only sociologists and educators have seriously researched the concept and definition of the American professions and that historians and men in the profession have contributed little.

Many authors simply assume the words "profession" and "professional education" and seem to shy away from stating a definition. Authors cited may, depending on their philosophical reference, emphasize one point or another of the concept of a profession, yet they all essentially draw on the European concept of a profession and professional education, and thus demonstrate the transference and continuance of the European concept and definition of profession and professional education in the United States. All eleven American authors use the concept and definition, the core-characteristics of profession concluded by Carr-Saunders and Wilson and all wisely employ the core-characteristics not as a rigid yardstick, but as a measure of occupations having already achieved or
aspiring to the status of a profession.
CHAPTER II

HISTORICAL EVOLUTION OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION FROM THE GREEK PERIOD TO THE TWENTIETH CENTURY

The second chapter of this dissertation, *A History of Professions and Professional Education in the United States*, bears the title, "Historical Evolution of the Professions and Professional Education from the Greek Period to the Twentieth Century." The outline of the chapter-study is scheduled as follows:

Introduction - some preliminary statements to the chapter's study.

I. European Professions and Professional Education
   A. The Greek Period
   B. The Roman and Early Christian Period
   C. The Medieval Period
   D. Professions and Professional Education in England

II. American Professions and Professional Education

   Introduction

   This study does not propose an in-depth analysis of ancient systems of education, or philosophies of education, but rather will concentrate on the origin, nature, growth of the professions and professional education, their place and relationships to such systems and philosophies. This investigation has attempted to deftly adhere to this point, despite the difficulties of locating historical source-materials comprehending
the history of western education in general and the absence of a
distinction by authors of history between the science of the study of
theology, medicine, law, university teaching, and the same sciences at
the professional stage. The disputed point of whether the professions
actually began in the ancient Persian, Greek, Roman, or Medieval periods
of education is not the concern of this study. There is enough evidence
of the professions and professional education among the Greeks and Romans
to assume their existence and evolution to modern professions and
professional education. The term, "profession," however, is not to be
found in the Greek or Latin languages. The term, "profession," first
appeared in the Sixteenth Century; theology, law, medicine, university
teaching until this time were described as sciences or studies. 57

Ellwood P. Cubberley, John Brubacher, and Henri Marrou were the only
modern authors to make this distinction. The reader must also constantly
be aware that historians anachronistically use the term, "profession,"
to describe the studies in ancient periods. This study assumes that the
authors presume that the reader, student, scholar need not be reminded of
the rather recent origin of the word.

This study will now make some comments on the authors chosen as
sources for this chapter. The research focuses on the history of

57 John S. Brubacher, "The Evolution of Professional Education,"
Education for the Professions, Chapter III, The Sixty-First Yearbook
of the National Society for the Study of Education, Part II (Chicago:
professions and professional education as they evolved in Europe and immigrated to the United States. For this reason, this inquiry selected historians representing European thought, i.e., Marrou, Carr-Saunders and Wilson, and Rashdall, along with the Americans, Cubberley, Brubacher, and Monroe. The classic scholarship of these American and European writers as well as their educational expertese and historical skill will be the steadying influence of this study.

Besides the authors already indicated, Nakosteen, Eby, Arrowood, and Butts were also researched. Nakosteen dissatisfied this dissertation because of an obvious bias for the influence of Persian, Indian, and Islamic education. This made the inquiry wary of his objectivity. Butts was good, but seemed to echo the work of Cubberley and Monroe. One comment concerning Eby and Arrowood is that they indicate a point in their index which by pagination number does not correspond in the textual body. For example, a "list of professions" is ordered in the index as


being found on page 463 of the text. Yet, no such list appears.60 This study opines, then, that it has the right to be selective in source material.

One further comment is made on the use of the term, "university." All authors indicated were researched; Cubberley's meaning was chosen as best for this chapter. The definition of a profession (Chapter 1), for memory-aid is repeated in the meaning of Carr-Saunders and Wilson, viz., a profession consists of a complex of characteristics, i.e., prolonged, specialized, intellectual training, a technique, either scientific or institutional, based on natural science or study of human institutions, remuneration for professional service in the form of fee and not salary, a sense of responsibility to the client, formation of associations to test competence and maintain ethical codes.61

This segment of the dissertation of the evolution of profession and professional education, then, will research the history of education not for its comprehension, but for the historical facts and conclusions pertinent to the study's purpose. This inquiry proposes to investigate most economically and, pointedly, the history of the concept of a profession and professional education through the Greek, Roman, Medieval, periods in Europe, especially in the English period until the Colonial period in America. These preceding periods are studied with special

60 Eby and Arrowood, History and Philosophy of Education, p. 463.
emphasis on the professions and professional education in England, for from this educational pattern American professions and professional education have had their geneology. The history and growth of the American professions and professional education is then presented.
European Profession and Professional Education

The Greek Period

By the year 350 B.C., Greek education had developed an educational pattern of primary, secondary, and higher, even university education. 62 Building on the work of his father, Philip of Macedonia, Alexander the Great rendered the signal service to mankind of uniting Western, Oriental, and Eastern Mediterranean cultures into a common world-empire of seventy cities. The Hellenistic genius of learning followed like seeds after the plow of Alexander, viz., schools, baths, theaters, institutions, and especially Greek learning and language. The Hellenistic harvest of the best philosophers, scientists, artists, and merchants blossomed. Greek learning, methods and philosophy of education, aided by the now dominant Greek language were hall-marks of the great cities, where the Greek universities flourished. The word, "university," meant to group many into one. The Greek university was the grouping of students and teachers into a "brotherhood" for the pursuit of learning or science. Gradually around this brotherhood grew the cluster of library, museum, supervision by the state assembly, state financial support, the co-existence of various departments, and the cohabitation of teachers and students. 63


This pattern of university established by the prototype of the University of Athens, gradually spread throughout the empire of the seventy cities. Seven universities towered over the others; the University of Athens, of Byzantium, of Pergamum, of Rhodes, of Tarsus, of Antioch in Syria, and of Alexandria in Egypt, all were known as the "Greek University World." The University of Athens was sapped of its prestige and title of the greatest university by that of Alexandria in Egypt. Alexandria, with departments of study in mathematics, geography, and Aristotelian science characterized by empirical observations and experiments, was the home for centuries of the world's greatest library, which housed seven hundred thousand volumes of Greek, Jewish, Egyptian, and Oriental works. Cubberley compared this library to the British Museum and the Bibliothèque Nationale of modern times. 64 Alexandria, however, enduring the successive changes in culture, government, and languages of the Greeks, Romans, Christians, and Saracens was to survive as a university center for centuries. The empirical pedagogical system of Aristotle was predominant in the university. Great thinkers and teachers, such as Euclid in geometry, Archimedes in mechanics and physics, Eratosthenes in librarianship, astronomy, and geology, Hipparchus, "The Greek Isaac Newton," were but a few of the famous teachers. Hippocrates of Cos (460-307 B.C.), though not a teacher at Alexandria, but a contemporary of Plato at the

University of Athens, was called the "Father of Medicine," as he based his medical practice and research on observation and scientific principles. Even today few medical specialists have equalled the diagnostic talent of Hippocrates. His written and oral medical treatises began the embryonic curriculum of modern medical schools and became the tools of medical educators down through the centuries. The "oath of Hippocrates" was the first, formal, recognized step toward a code of ethics in the medical profession.65 The University of Pergamum, home of another famous library, gave the world the medical scientist, Galen (131-201 A.D.). Galen, physician to the Roman emperor Marcus Aurelius, taught medicine at Alexandria and Pergamum, and wrote over five hundred medical texts, of which one hundred and eighteen survive today, on subjects as anatomy, physiology, surgery, hygenics.

Pergamum and Alexandria, under Greek instruction, became the very first schools established for professional education, wherein the future physician received his theoretical and academic instruction before assuming the master-apprentice relationship so necessary for licensure. This study points out such relationship as the beginning of medical internship required of doctors today.66 This investigation does not allow the reader to conclude that medicine alone was pursued as a profession

66Brubacher, Ibid., p. 50.
during this period. The names of the famous teachers, as mentioned, are but a few of the great minds that explored other sciences, arts, etc., with equal success. Medicine is singled out because of its importance to this research. As mentioned in the Introduction, the pure Greek and Latin languages had no single word for profession; the word, "profession," appeared for the first time in the Latin of the Sixteenth Century. 67 The great minds of the past, then, laid the foundations of the professions and professional education. For example, Aristotle, the great philosopher, advised young students of physic to "learn by doing," to join the military campaigns for "on the spot" experience, to study the world of nature, for disease was to be out of harmony with nature. His medical pedagogy was empirical and lecture but fundamentally formed the rudimentary pattern of modern premedical curriculum. Aristotle divided or classified his medical students into the craftsman, who studied medicine empirically and learned the profession by daily experience, the diagnostician, who studied by diagnosis, and the theorist, who studied the combination of numbers one and two. To Aristotle's mind the theorist was the best trained of medics. 68


68 Ibid., p. 49.
The Roman Period

Rome conquered Greece with politics and the sword, yet Greek learning, culture, and education, all parts of Hellenism, in turn subdued the Romans. Emphasis on university work now switched from Alexandria to the new Roman city of Constantinople or Byzantium. Greek scholars settled here in 330 A.D., and for the next ten centuries Greek science, literature, and philosophy flourished at Constantinople. Alexandria, after the dreadful destruction by the Mohammedans in 640 A.D., ceased almost to exist. Somehow remnants of the University of Alexandria survived. The Saracen, Avicenna (980-1037 A.D.) rebuilt the medical school, and as late as 1543, Alexandria was known as the home of the famous physician, Visalius.

Rome adapted and adopted the great Greek cities; this was the Roman political genius. Greece, however, supplied the genius of learning. The Hellenization of Rome began in 146 B.C., and well did Horace somewhere sing that captive Greece took her rude conqueror and brought the arts to Latium. At first, the Greek educational system met only the needs of growing Rome; gradually national pride and practical sense led the Romans to open "cultural schools" modeled on the Greek schools. The Latin language, however, supplanted the Greek as the single language vehicle for the vast empire. A Roman educational pattern gradually grew, consisting of the "ludus" or primary, then the secondary school, and finally, a higher, professional and university level developed to train youth in rhetoric and
oratory, preparatory learning for the great professions of law and public life. 69 A Roman youth seeking further learning went east to Asia Minor to attend the Greek city universities. The Universities of Athens and Rhodes were the favorites. The Romans, Brutus, Horace, and Cicero attended Athens; Caesar studied at Rhodes. Cicero and Quintilius were already writing educational tracts extolling the merits of the Greek universities for Roman youth; law, medicine, architecture, mathematics, grammar and rhetoric were essential to the ambitious man in the Roman professions.

The reader must be reminded that the study of the educational history of Greece and Rome could be an entire research in itself. In this dissertation there is a focus on the professions and professional education through the centuries and not on educational history as a whole.

The Romans built upon the learned arts of the Greeks, but their prime achievements were politics, government organization, and law. As the Greeks contributed to the future of medicine, among other modern professions, so the Romans concentrated on law. This was the one feature of Roman education which distinguished it from Greek higher education - the study of law. The appearance of a whole new form of culture, a new type of mind and education, not imagined by the Greeks is here noted. Thus, in Rome existed a science, not yet a profession of law. Cicero and Quintilian were to lay the foundations of the profession and professional

education for law. In his curriculum for proficiency in oratory, Cicero included and even wrote a legal work making full use of Greek logic, a body of legal doctrine, a system of legal principles, legal divisions and classifications, and a defined terminology. By the middle of the Third Century, A.D., Rome and Beirut were the outstanding schools of law.

Marcus Fabius Quintilianus, however, was the first Roman educator to begin the profession and professional education of lawyers. Prior to Quintilian, if a citizen conflicted with the vast network of Roman laws already extant, he appealed to some educated friend to appear in a "peer-court," to represent and to defend his rights. What, then, "qualified" the friend? Studies show Quintilian was quite aware of the need of some qualification for law; his book, Institutes of Oratory, was an early educational classic for legal professional education. Quintilian considered a man qualified to represent clients in court, if he possessed the following:

1. **knowledge of Roman Civil Law.** The representative in court must have studied and mastered the code of Roman law, its ambiguities, its spirit, prior decisions of Roman courts, the type and use of various kinds of legal evidence.

2. **knowledge of the then modern demands of law,** especially

---

70 Marrou, *Education in Antiquity*, p. 254.
the customs of state religion so enmeshed in the
Roman Code.

3. knowledge of incidentals, such as what cases to
represent, what fees to charge, what style of speech to
use in instructing, persuading, and delighting the jury.
Here one can see the idea of an ethical code for law.

4. knowledge and command of the spoken word. This quality,
obviously, belonged to the liberal arts curriculum
necessary even for the Roman "professions" of senator,
military general, and provincial governor. Yet,
Quintilian emphasized "oratory," not law study, which
was considered only a part of the orator's knowledge-content.
This last point indicates to this study the relationship between the
professions and the liberal arts. An in-depth research is suggested for
this relationship.

The evolution of a profession and professional education moved on.
Greece taught Rome. Rome was the great unifying factor paving the way for
the structure of the next contribution to the foundation and organization
of modern civilization. That contribution came from Christianity, which
owed so much of its success, as modern civilization does, to the
Romanization of northern European tribes, and to the universal Latin

71 Marcus Fabius Quintilianus, Institutes of Oratory,
Book XII, Chapter III; Marrou, Education in Antiquity, pp. 191, 285.
language - the speech of civilized people. Roman law and order, courts of common rights and security, Roman political government, Roman free trade, agriculture, creative arts, coinage, and road networks\textsuperscript{72} were ready-made vehicles for the spread of Christianity and Christian education.

\textsuperscript{72}Cubberley, History of Education, p. 78.
The Early Christian Period

A Christian Rome succeeded the republican, imperial Rome. Where Greeks and Romans thrived on the aesthetical and practical, new Christian Rome became introverted, concentrating on the things of the next world, the world after death. In 529 A.D., the Emperor Justinian closed all pagan schools, including the University of Athens. Historians referred to the classical Greek and Roman learning as "pagan." Yet, it is important to note that early Christianity was not destructive; it simply focused on one idea - that all things, including learning, must be evaluated in the light of the world after death. Learning, research, or learning centers of the times simply fell into disuse and disfavor. Law, medicine, and higher learning were pursued in some minor degree as the ultramundane Christian attitude, the fall of Rome to barbarian invasion, the horrors of war, famine, pestilence, darkened and weakened the human spirit. Early Christianity in the west made a moral and emotional rather than an intellectual appeal.

The great foundations of western education did not come to success directly and over the smoothly paved roads of history. The educational story of western Europe was one of a thousand ignorances; a thousand years of pain and effort were needed, yet, schools again became possible as learning was once more demanded. Thus, the Middle Ages began again educationally and intellectually to come alive. The historical tracing of the schools is included in this study to indicate the needle, as it
were, by which the professions and professional education could thread their way into the fabric of human intellectual achievement.

Classical learning, now removed from use by imperial edict in the eastern part of the Empire, became christianized, and grew strong while waiting for the day of return to the west, to give new rationale and schema to Christian dogma in western centers of learning. Ancient Alexandria, rising like a phoenix, became one of the great catechetical schools for early Christian theology. Antioch, Edessa, Caesarea, and Alexandria were first established as catechetical schools and later as eastern universities. Though denying Hellenism, western Christianity could not help but absorb and nurture three great contributions for the next five hundred years until the revival of learning. These three legacies came from the Greeks, who contributed art, philosophy, literature, beauty, advanced aesthetical and intellectual ideas, the Romans, who established law, order, government, the ability to make real the ideals of other people, and the Hebrews, who endowed Western Civilization with the loftiest conceptions of God, religious faith, the dignity of the human person, and moral responsibility.73

73 Cubberley, History of Education, p. 94; Marrou, Education in Antiquity, pp. 326-327.
The Medieval Period

By the Tenth Century, the monastic schools gave formal education, such as it was, to those intending to embrace the religious life and to those not. Religious students studied in buildings inside monastic walls; the layman studied in buildings outside the walls. Instruction in both schools was meager - reading, writing, music, some arithmetic, rules of religion and conduct being the usual educational curriculum. Schools established during the early Middle Ages before the revival of learning, were monastic schools, presbytery schools, and schools of chivalry - thriving on feudalism as noblemen began to educate themselves and their sons for their noble stations in schools for knightly training. These schools were encouraged by the Church to stamp out the lawlessness rampant in Europe at this time. Cubberley claimed that this was the first secular form of education in western Europe since the days of Rome. Cathedral schools were also established for more advanced instruction. Cathedral and monastic schools became celebrated in medieval France and England for the caliber of teacher and instruction. For almost six hundred years these cathedral and monastic schools were the only advanced schools in western Europe. The impetus given advanced study by cathedral schools gradually developed many of the medieval universities. The seven liberal

74 Cubberley, History of Education, p. 166.
arts of the Trivium and Quadrivium had been unfortunately carefully cleansed of pagan influence and preserved by the Church to become the basic curriculum for Christian schools.

Enough has been indicated concerning general education and educational systems in Europe from the fall of Rome. The reader must not be led to believe that the division of Rome into east and west was a simple razor cut. Higher learning did remain, to a degree, in the west. The focus of this study, however, is centered on law, medicine, theology, higher learning (also named philosophy, the arts, or dialectics), first as sciences and later as professions. These four studies, often called the "Great Four Faculties," have been singled out as the ultimate peaks of man's learning in body (medicine), spirit (law), and soul (theology and philosophy). These four are the main concern of this study.

Medicine, law, theology, philosophy continued to survive, even matured until the impetus of the Middle Ages. This study can best depict the "Four Faculties" individually and from their base of origin.

Medicine

Medicine has its origin directly from the imperial Roman days at Salerno. The healing arts of the Romans, based on the Greek medical arts, were not extinguished by the fall of Rome or the ravages of the barbarians. Imperial Rome recognized Salerno ("Psaleritana" was the Latin name) and gave it the special name of "Civitas Hippocratica." Documents are available even from the Sixth Century A.D., showing the influence of the
medical arts of Galen and Hippocrates, of their "humorism," the method used in the treatment of respiratory, urinary, and dietary diseases. By 1040 A.D., Salerno was again a famous medical school, not because of Islamic influence, but because of the energetic study of pure Roman medicine. The question is asked, "Why Salerno?" The simple answer for the revival of the Roman medical school and faculty is that this western Roman medical school had ever kept contact with the eastern Roman medicine at Constantinople, the translations of more Greek medical studies, the mildness of the climate and the curative power of its bath waters, and that the translation of Arabic medical treatises by Constantinus Africanus of Monte Cassino monastery. Africanus gave a tongue to the medical school at Salerno, especially through his compilation of the medical canon, "Ars Medicinae." In 1099 A.D., Robert of Normandy, the Crusader, publicized northern Salerno as a medical center. Though possessing medical school and faculty, Salerno did not achieve any university status; official recognition came in 1231 A.D., when King Frederic II of Sicily gave exclusive control of license and medical examination for all prospective physicians in his kingdom to the medical masters of Salerno. Salerno never rose to medical university fame as did Montepellier, Bologna, or Paris. 75 By 1258 A.D., the importance of Salerno was passing away, due, in part, to the spread of the popularity of Arabic medicine.

75 Rashdall, Universities of Europe, pp. 75-82.
and the rise of medical faculties elsewhere. A note must be added concerning the phrase, "arabic medicine," which was really based on Islamic, Greek, and Christian systems.

Medical science now flourished throughout Italy; Venice, Bologna, and Padua were centers of medical learning as well as seats of speculative philosophy. Avarroes, the Mohammedan philosopher, was given intellectual authority equal to that of Aristotle and Albert the Great. Italian physicians were skeptical, superstitious, and independent of ecclesiastical authority or opinion, and most progressive in the positive sciences, thus, making free-way for the scientific inquiry of Galileo and Galvani.76

Medicine was also studied at Bologna. The Bolognese medical school was good, but not as prestigious as its law faculty. This medical school used Aristotelian medical science more than the Arabic employed at Salerno. The medical school of Bologna was a full grown scientific school by 1260 A.D., with an independent faculty by 1316 A.D. Surgery, by 1300 A.D., was the focus of the Bologna medical school. Anatomical dissection was first introduced at Bologna, as well as the concept of medical internship.

The University of Paris had a faculty of medicine at the time of Salerno and Bologna, however, the curriculum was one of Aristotelian theory and lecture with no anatomy laboratory work for the student.77 Physicians

76 Rashdall, Universities of Europe, pp. 262-264; Cubberley, History of Education, pp. 387-388.

77 Ibid., p. 435; Ibid., p. 227.
in Paris were wealthy, influential, usually drawn from the aristocratic class. The medical curriculum at Paris was similar to Salerno, using the medical treatises of Africanus, Islamic authors, and the works of Hippocrates and Galen, the Greeks.

It is not the purpose of this study to focus on the fascinating topic of the rise of the medieval universities; its intent has been to show the European origins of the professions of law, medicine, theology, and philosophy. Contrary to historical opinions or legends, it is seen that western medicine began with the Greeks, was sustained by the Romans, continued by the Italian medical schools up to the time of the universities, advancing through the Renaissance to modern times. From the above study can be detected the curriculum, the method, the internship-training, the independent medical associations, especially in Venice, Padua, Bologna, all of which later will contribute to the characteristics of the profession of medicine indicated by the Carr-Saunders and Wilson study.

Law

Bologna, in historical texts, is signaled as the seat of law. Briefly, Bologna possessed a medical and philosophy faculty, but not that of theology, a point which will be explained in later context. The science of law in southern Europe was academically pure in its descendancy from Roman origins. Northern European law was a conglomerate of native law, Roman municipal law, and church law; it was used successfully by the
Church to control, in its favor, the academic studies of the universities as well as the socio-political situations of northern Italian kingdoms. The patterns of the old Roman municipal law system were activated in the Eleventh Century by the Lombard cities, and blossomed in the Twelfth Century. This Italian political renaissance brought about a realization that disputes over power and territories with the Papacy could be settled by laws instead of swords. A new class of professional men, the lawyers, answered the need for legal and political knowledge. Such men flocked to the law school of Bologna for the study of ancient Roman law with modern implications.

Before Bologna, the lawyer-class-judges, advocates, and notaries learned the law by tradition and practice, based upon some legal literature. In the Ninth Century, there were no professional law schools such as Bologna; Ravenna and Paris, in the early Eleventh Century, made some attempts at a law school. Bologna as late as 1158 A.D., was still a liberal arts school; gradually the rhetoric studied in the arts became popular for its usefulness in law-pleading. "Dictamen," or the art of composition, especially useful for copying legal documents, was added to rhetoric as a preparatory study for law. Bologna shifted from liberal arts to law as the result of Irnerius; from 1100 to 1130 A.D., Irnerius was the right man, in the right place, at the right time, doing the right thing. He was a magnetic teacher, viz., his glosses, his power as a teacher, his arrangement of Justinian Law, all built his reputation.
Bologna was central to the geographic intersections of Lombardy, Venice, Rome, Tuscany, all within distance of the university site. The growing preeminence throughout Europe of the "Digest," a section of the Corpus Juris Civilis Justiniani, glamorized by Irnerius, increased the pursuit of law. A new class of student, eager and ambitious for total legal studies, now used law as the avenue to political position. Liberal arts students thus moved to universities not so concentrated on law.  

Bologna almost immediately, as with civil law, became the university for church or Canon Law. Canon Law always existed since the Church came to Rome. Only in the Twelfth Century was any attempt made to put order into the huge accumulation of Church concordats, papal rescripts, patristic "dicta," and enactments of Christian emperors. The task was accomplished by Gratian, who did for Church law what Irnerius did for civil law, in his Decretum of 1142 A.D., which was a text and not a code of Church law. The significance of the Decretum and its special "Digest," is found in the parallel study of civil and church law now afforded to disputes between Church and State. Thus, Bologna with a dual view of law was able to attract clerical and lay students for the study of the civil law of ancient Rome, the laws of Christian emperors, and the laws of the Catholic Church, and to establish the judicial format.

---


79 Rashdall, Universities of Europe, pp. 116-125; 141; Cubberley, History of Education, pp. 226.
of modern court procedure, viz., the use of written law, judicial evidence, written procedures. No longer was a legal trial characterized by brute force, or as a trial by ordeal, but by peace, education, and equal justice.

It is noted by this dissertation that the Bologna of Irnerius and Gratian was not really a full-fledged university; this status was to come during the later university period. However, the science of law, the law faculty, curriculum, legal ethics and procedures were established for the future profession of law. As fascinating as it is, the story of Bologna as a university cannot be the main interest of this study, only the study of law as a profession is its privilege.

Finally, by 1386 A.D., Canon Law was a study at the University of Paris; it was not as scientific as the Church law of Bologna; it ranked below the Canon Law of Orleans, Angers, and Toulouse universities in prestige. Civil law was not studied at Paris.80 A point for future research is the contrast of the purpose of the study of law at Paris - speculative, rather theological and used as a binding force by the Church - and at Bologna - practical and political, social, and geared to cut binding fetters intended by Church or State.

Theology

The purpose of this second chapter is to establish the historical origin and growth of medicine, law, theology, and philosophy in western

---

80 Rashdall, Universities of Europe, p. 435.
education. Thus far, the study has researched medicine and law. This section now deals with theology.

Theology, for four centuries after Christ, was exceedingly simple in belief, as was Church organization. Gradually, a curriculum of Church beliefs began to be established. In 325 A.D., the Nicene Creed was formulated plus twenty canons for clerical government. The required knowledge of the clergy through succeeding centuries increased the body of theological study. The translation of the Bible into Latin, writings of Church Fathers, church canons, "acta" of successive church councils, and pastoral theology accumulated. Yet, the intellectual discipline of theology was very meager. In the Tenth Century clerics began to study a part of the ancient Trivium; theology was still not a science for study. The educational vehicles for preserving and carrying theology to the age of a scientific study in the medieval universities were primarily the monastic and cathedral or episcopal schools. The growth and role of these two types of schools are most fascinating, but not the focus of this study.

Until the Eleventh Century, theology was the only profession. The Eleventh Century saw the Church for the first time turn full-powered attention to the reorganization of doctrine and dogma. For the average citizen, the teachings of the faith were relatively simple, but in the cathedral schools, progenitors of the universities, theology was the concentration of learned men. In England, Canterbury, in France, Paris

and Chartres, all cathedral schools, attracted brilliant teachers and students to the profession of theology. Monastery schools gradually withdrew from the public life of professional study. To the cathedral school of Notre Dame in Paris came the keenest teachers and students to study this cathedral school's famous liberal arts curriculum, particularly dialectics and theology. 82

In the Eleventh Century also appeared the man called Peter Abelard. As a teacher he used reason to explain theology; this is a simple enough method today, but a startling innovation at that time. His method, named "Sic et Non" (yea and nay), became the catch-phrase of the era; the method was simple, viz., a question in theology would be proposed, discussed from the viewpoint of reason; the opinions of both sides, theology and reason, were heard, but no answer was finally concluded. Thus, Abelard opened the door for the spirit of inquiry, even inspiring his pupil Peter Lombard, to write the immortal Book of Sentences, the complete study of faith with the instrument of human reason.

On a smaller scale, what took place at Paris was duplicated in other monastic and cathedral schools throughout western Europe. The profession of theology, called "queen of the sciences," now became organized, systematized, and restated through the spirit of theological inquiry called "Scholasticism," the marked instruction method of the cathedral schools.

82 Cubberley, History of Education, p. 189; Rashdall, Universities of Europe, p. 275.
During the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries, theology flourished, then ceased to be the only profession studied as others—medicine and law—took their places besides theology in the northern universities. Aristotle and his philosophy, his educational system became the measuring rod for theology. This was the work of Scholasticism, characterized not by new dogmas, but by systemization of doctrine into good philosophical form. As Peter Lombard (1100-1160 A.D.) first organized the teaching method of professional theology, so Albert the Great (1193-1280 A.D.) was the schoolman to organize the processes of human thought according to Aristotle's systematic form. Albert's brilliance at the University of Paris absorbed the unique mind of Thomas Aquinas, (1225-1274 A.D.) philosopher, professional theologian and professional educator at Rome, Bologna, and Naples Universities. Under Aquinas Scholasticism as the educational method of professional theology reached its zenith until the Thirteenth Century, when it began to decline as an educational force. 83

Scholasticism organized and systematized théology as a science, yet, theology did little to extend knowledge to the problems of nature and men. The scholastic method of theology, however, did lay principles of training in analysis, comparison, classification, and deduction for the use of the awakened interest of learning in various academic fields so invigorating to the rising universities.

Theology in southern Europe, especially Italy, never reached the scientific, almost professional level as in northern Europe, notably at the University of Paris, for as indicated in this study's treatment of law and medicine, the Italian mind was more practical than speculative, socio-political, dedicated to the study of law, canon and civil, and anti-papal. Any serious study of speculative theology was consigned to clerical friars in their conventual monasteries and schools. Such schools and their students had no official connection with Italian universities; any student seeking an advanced degree in theology went to Paris, where despite the reign of the "queen of the sciences," the atmosphere of learning was bigoted, conservative, and ecclesiastical in contrast to the political independence of the south, especially Italy.84 An interesting research project is suggested by this study, viz., the unique ability of, the practice of, and the profit to the Catholic Church in controlling and manipulating the different temperaments, ideals, interests, and intellectual accomplishments of both northern and southern European universities.

The reader is urged to study Rashdall's treatment of the origin of the University of Paris, the curriculum, the years of study required, the stages involved in a theological degree, its value, the uses, abuses, the humor of university life, and the development of colleges connected with

84 Rashdall, Universities of Europe, pp. 137; 250.
Philosophy (Arts, Higher Learning, Dialectics)

The fourth faculty of higher learning, later to be titled a "profession," was Arts, called equally dialectic and philosophy. Rashdall in his discriminating and documented book gives the best historical account of the higher degree of learning, the Arts. His work describes the type of student, the professor, the life of the student at Paris, his studies, advancement, the strictness, the laxness of the degree requirements.

Speculative theology and Scholasticism introduced the Arts to Paris, for the philosophy of Aristotle became the handmaiden of speculative theology. Thomas Aquinas was quick to discover that the Latinized Aristotelian philosophy, hitherto studied, was only a Latinized translation of the Arabic version of Aristotelian works. The remedy was made to the original. Thus, in theory, the Trivium and Quadrivium were reintroduced, but in a christianized version. These studies became so popular, that they were established as prerequisites for theology and finally became sciences in their own right. 86

85 Rashdall, Universities of Europe, pp. 269-369; 497-536.

86 Ibid., p. 439.
The first arts curriculum at Paris was drawn up by Robert Curzon in 1215 A.D. Rashdall claims this to be the first attempt at an organized curriculum in any area at the University of Paris. The theory invoked by Paris of the Trivium and Quadrivium obviously omitted all the classical poets, historians, and orators of ancient Rome. Latin instruction was minimized to "grammar," logic was the main instruction, followed by the entire "Organon" of Aristotle, some of the "Ars Major" of Donatus, some Aristotelian ethics, the arithmetic, geometry of the "Quadrivium," the newly recovered "metaphysics," and natural philosophy of Aristotle being forbidden. After 1252 A.D., all of Aristotle gradually found its way into the curriculum. Thus, the stages of the Arts consisted of or were constructed over a period of years to be the B.A. - grammar, logic, psychology, natural philosophy, and metaphysics, the M.A. - moral philosophy and natural philosophy. Rashdall's account is most fascinating in historical description of the origin, uses, abuses of these stages of Master of Arts, the value of the Master Degree, the number of years endured to achieve the degree. This study has now historically placed the Faculty of Arts, or the higher degree of learning in the university constellation. Later this degree will be called "university teaching."

The universities continued to grow and by the end of the Twelfth

---

87 Rashdall, Universities of Europe, p. 440.

88 Ibid., p. 444.
Century, "mother universities" became the title of the older, greater universities which served as models for the newer universities now being established. Therefore, from Bologna - seat of law - were born Grenoble and Montepellier in southern France, some Spanish universities, Glasgow in Scotland, Upsala in Holland, Cracow in Poland, and the law faculty of Oxford in England; from the mother university of Paris - seat of liberal arts and theology - stemmed the colleges of arts in Oxford, save the law faculty, Cambridge in England, some northern French universities, Toulouse in France, the universities of Lisbon and Coimbra in Portugal, the universities of Prague, Vienna, Cologne, whence Copenhagen and Heidelberg; from Salerno - seat of medicine - emanated Montepellier medical school and the great medical center of Salamanca in Spain. Thus, the Sixteenth Century saw one hundred and eight universities established on the western European continent. The "new world" would have Harvard in 1636, William and Mary in 1693, Yale in 1702, and Columbia in 1754. By 1810 the famous University of Berlin began; in 1811 Christiana, Sweden; in 1819 St. Petersburg, Russia; in 1834 Brussels in Belgium; London University and the University of Athens in 1836. These latter are mentioned for in these universities American students pursued the professions after undergraduate work before the full rise of professional schools in America.

Without an in-depth study of the growth of the monastic and cathedral schools - York, Canterbury, Jarrow - and the origin of Oxford and Cambridge,
interest now focuses on the next section, the profession and professional education in England. The Universities of Oxford and Cambridge were sources of what was to become professional studies. Suffice it to state that the historical origin of these two universities was founded in the "mother university," Paris.
Professions and Professional Education in England

Professions and professional education in the formative years in Colonial America were naturally English in quantity and quality, for the first lawyers, physicians, ministers, engineers came from Mother England. Gradually, American born students began their professional studies in English schools. Some knowledge of the nature and history of their training must be studied, for the American concept of a profession and professional education were to be modeled on the English system before American personality and needs were to nationalize American professions. Carr-Saunders and Wilson established the best study for the following historical background of English professions and professional education. Their historical outline is briefly synopsized in the five chronological periods of English professions and professional education that follow.

English Professions and Professional Education

in the Pre-Revolutionary Period

From the Sixteenth to the Eighteenth Century, English professions and professional education experienced deep change. The Catholic Church had diminished in England; the layman became the learned man. Thus, with the fragmentation of the medieval church and the rise of the merchant guild

89 Carr-Saunders and Wilson, The Professions, pp. 289; 294; 298; 304; 307; 308.
system of corporations, a student no longer needed to study for clerical minor orders as a "sine qua non" condition for the study of a profession. The benefice system no longer financed the universities; teachers received private incomes. The profession of medicine grouped into the Royal College of Physicians which still remained clerical in attitude since physicians for at least a generation had trained under ecclesiastical supervision.

The Reformation in England saw the layman become free of the Church, now separated from the state in civil administrations. Sir Thomas More is the best example of this, for in 1529 this saint and lawyer, a layman, became Chancellor of England, a post most clerical since the Sixth Century. This development meant more lay control of civil affairs. Lawyers in England de-emphasized the role of Canon or church lawyer, once so dominant in a church-state government. Lay-lawyers now were free to apply their professional talents to politics, business administration, etc. Business itself, free of the guild caste system, grew in importance not only in the open market, but also began its pursuit of full professional status.

Surgeons retained and improved the guild system and strengthened their ranks. Strangely, the English clergy retained tight control over the profession of teaching and professional education of teachers until the Nineteenth Century when laymen were first admitted as head-masters in the primary and secondary or academy levels of education. This retarded the growth of the teaching profession from the stature achieved by other professions and, perhaps, had some influence on the low-prestige status
and salary of later colonial elementary teachers, homespun for the most part, but certainly not on the par with their English brothers in profession.

**English Professions and Professional Education in the Post-Industrial Revolutionary Period**

The "learned" professions of the Eighteenth Century were divinity, law, medicine, and university teaching. Divinity, now fragmentized Christianity because of so many politically warring sects, remained the foundation of the other professions by ancient right of the medieval universities. The English "gentlemen" studied for the professions of ministry, medicine, and law. Those men, unfit for the latter three, studied for the less prestigious professions of surgery and apothecary. The learned professions were for gentleman's occupations, not being financially rewarding, but filled with prestige and social gain. Teachers at the secondary and university levels were at lofty heights in England, because most clergymen were headmasters and rectors at academies and universities. Architecture and civil service, admitted as professions, were still struggling to fully discover themselves. This study notes here that the social values were already in professions and were to migrate and grow in the Americas, and that there was a high priority placed on a body of specialized theory of knowledge, discussed in the study's chapter on the definition of a profession.
By the year 1700, architecture, with its origin as far back as the Greeks, achieved full professional status in England, as other science occupations strove for professional status. Thus, the day of science dawned. Scientific occupations undertook steps toward professional status as early as 1543 with the startling work of Copernicus and Visalius. From the medieval scientist eventually evolved the professions of engineering, business engineering, real estate engineering, government, merchant navy and mining engineering. Engineering, thus, became powerful enough to influence Parliamentary legislation necessary to create conditions for its professional status. In the Nineteenth Century chemistry achieved professional status, while the science of physics arrived as a profession in the Twentieth Century. Partners to science as a profession were scientific research and scientific invention. From the scientific research group veterinary surgery and dentistry have their professional origins.

The Rise and Aims of Professional Associations in England

Professional associations in America also had English ancestry which still influence the American professions today. In the Middle Ages, English barristers and surgeons had already devised independent professional associations. Physicians, civil and canon lawyers, teachers, civil administrators still belonged to the church and university guilds or associations and hence, developed no specific associations. Oddly, dentistry immediately formed its own professional association. After the
Reformation, the Royal College of Physicians was formed to curb the avarice of practitioners; the Royal College possessed powers to over-view the conduct of all physicians in London precinct, and to control the quality and use of medicine. By 1546 A.D., the Royal College became an organ of the state. At the end of the Sixteenth Century most professions, save theology, had formed independent organizations for their own purposes as they emerged from and cast off the decaying cocoon of the guild organizations and other obstacles such as internal evils, patronage, discrimination by specialists within their group. The Inns of Court, 1739 A.D., became the independent professional association for lawyers which later evolved into the "Law Society for Gentlemen Practicers of Court and Law Equity." One of the English legal profession's greatest opponents was the novelist, Charles Dickens, whose description of the low qualities and vices of lawyers was responsible for much reform in English law. The legal profession in England to this day still suffers from his opinions. Civil engineers followed suit, beginning as a dining club - an informal association getting together for conviviality during which time they discussed the serious aspects and problems of their profession. From the dining club motif England's law profession changed to formal meetings with learned papers prepared, read, and discussed. Thus grew the legal professional associations with the aims of eliminating badly trained lawyers, of membership achieved by competence and experience, and

90 Carr-Saunders and Wilson, The Professions, p. 300.
of intensification of qualifications for legal studies such as passing law school examinations for public security and common welfare.

The Role of the State in English Profession and Professional Education

English professions in the Middle Ages were protected by the Crown which gave privileges, duties to the professions, as to any other guild. The professions guarded competency, honesty, discipline and supervision within their professional groups. By the end of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Centuries this intramural supervision had died within many professions. England's Parliament reluctantly and very slowly for the commonwealth of many professions and society had to intervene through legislation and a posted list of regulated, recognized professions. The list included service professions which rendered vital service, viz., medicine, dentistry, veterinary surgery, pharmacy, nursing, services fiduciary from professions, as the legal groups of barristers, sollicitors, and patent agents, professions of public safety, such as the professions of the merchant navy and mining engineers, professions state-employed through competency tests, and registered civil servants and teachers. The state did not wish anything but freedom and privilege for a profession, but by governing admission and expulsion from the government list, a prerogative essential to a healthy profession, the state made a profession its own organ.
English Professional Training and Competency for Profession

During England's medieval period the emphasis on the intellectual training of a profession was intense and, if not obtained at home, was imported to English universities from Europe. Medicine definitely was a part of the demanding university pattern. Law was partially studied at the universities and at the Inns of Court. During the civil wars of the fourteen hundreds and the first half of the Sixteenth Century, intellectual demands for the medical and law professions lapsed. During the Elizabethan Period standards for a profession were low despite the aesthetic renaissance. Roger Bacon complained that there were too many universities for the professions, all of them poor, and too few universities for the serious study of the arts. Interests, now, of the learned concentrated on the liberal and aesthetic arts; the professions and professional education became low in prestige. The Royal College of Physicians and the Inns of Court ceased all interest in learning and competency in the Eighteenth Century. Yet, curiously, the surgeons and apothecaries, members of a profession not fit for "gentlemen," seriously continued to study, improve, strengthen, and finally achieve professional status even in the public's opinion. By 1850, Oxford ceased to be a professional school of medicine, having abandoned long before its Faculty of Law. The University of Oxford concentrated on theology and the "gentlemanly" arts program; the University of Scotland, however, raised the standards for law and medicine. The
universities of England had ceased to be part of the picture of the profession.

The Nineteenth Century witnessed a new system of training and testing. The professions had abandoned the training of their own, hence, in professional schools the rise and new interest in university education, the recapture of part of the field of a profession and professional education by universities, and most important of all, the use of the device of the modern university examination system that still exists for the most part in American and English universities.

The modern examination system had two origins, one, in the English universities to raise standards of education and to improve the diligence of students; the other, in the use of the examination device outside the universities for those services and employments that sought competency in their officers and members.

While standards were gradually slipping, forces within the universities were at work to improve these conditions. In 1747, Cambridge began the examination device; in 1807, several colleges of the Oxford cluster such as Oriel, Christ-Church, and Balliol began the Honors System. Six examiners, impartial to any school, were appointed as Public Examiners. In 1825, due to the great numbers of candidates each year, British universities agreed on paper or written examinations for all candidates. By 1828, a two hour, pre-printed, impartial, and unknown to teachers and student examination was standard procedure. Professions, those being part
of the university and those having their own professional school, followed the same procedure. Part of the trial of Warren Hastings of the East India Company fiasco concerned itself with civil service training and examinations for the profession of civil administration. Interestingly, Prime Minister Gladstone, and Macauley, the author and moulder of public opinion, were Honors winners at Cambridge. In 1800 Lord Wellesley started the intense training of civil administrators, not only through extensive examinations, but also through a special professional college called Haileybury. The result of this examination device eventually led to the establishment of the British Civil Service Commission in 1855.\(^{91}\) By 1850, British military professional schools gave entrance and graduate examinations to naval, army, and merchant marine candidates, and by the latter part of the 1800's all professions and professional schools in England had adopted the civil service plan. The difficult examinations for entrance, during training, and for graduation were the assumed risk for the student. Most older universities revised and resumed the functions of professional education. Cambridge became the bastion of the professions of law and medicine, and in 1879 established the Cambridge Teacher Training Syndicate. Oxford, faced with opposition from members of the Board Commission, almost remained in obscurity regarding the professions and professional training. From 1900 to 1919, Oxford caught up with Cambridge in the professional education of engineering and teacher-training.

\(^{91}\) Carr-Saunders and Wilson, The Professions, p. 312.
New English universities adopted quickly and vigorously professional education toward the latter years of the Eighteenth Century. In 1800, Leeds was just an infirmary; by 1831 it was an independent medical school. The year 1876 saw Leeds Medical College and the University of Yorkshire, a professional school for civil and mechanical engineering, amalgamate their professional departments and become part of Victoria University. In 1910, the name, "Victoria University," was changed to the University of Leeds. Professional associations never lost their right to examine candidates for their profession, regardless of the university, which by the Nineteenth Century governed English professional training along with the professional association.

The purpose of this brief history of English professions and professional education, as mentioned before, is important to this study, for it was to England, mainly, that colonial professional men went for professional education; eventually, on their return, they introduced the English patterns of education into American professional schools and universities. The analysis of the origin, nature, maturation of the professions and professional education in the United States are the next to be studied by this dissertation.
England colonized America, especially the northern and southern colonies of the eastern seaboard. As mentioned, the transition from England of the professions and professional education was accomplished in several unorganized, inter-lapping stages. The early colonies depended on European, English trained professionals, lawyers, doctors, and ministers. Gradually, sons of colonists went back to European and English universities, to return as European trained professional men. These men, then, cooperated with the colonial government to establish American colleges whose standards naturally were low. The imported English-European apprenticeship eventually made room for a lecture system. Apprenticeship dominated, however, since early colonial colleges lacked professional faculties of law or medicine. Schools of ministry were of the apprenticeship variety as young Americans, some without benefit of a college background, learned theology from these ministers. Two aspects or characteristics of early colonial apprenticeship were the actual performance of professional duties., viz., medical apprentices did everything from washing medicine bottles, mixing drugs to assisting at surgery, and the reading of the doctor's medical library. Lawyer apprentices did much the same, doing legal clerical work and reading what law books were available, participating in legal debates, or drawing up research papers for the master. Apprentices to the ministry followed the same pattern as well, but with some emphasis on classical languages.
Standards and education for the professions, then, were indeed low, for this was the new frontier of the world, where men were acclaimed in the true Jacksonian democratic tradition for the feats of physical prowess, efficiency, and versatility. Men of learning were held suspect. The profession of teaching at primary and secondary levels in vernacular schools was at a low ebb in training and prestige. Yet, professions were not unaware of their low standards, ideals, and realities in the colonial new world. The New York City Bar Association in 1754 demanded four years of college education plus a five year apprenticeship before licensing the young lawyer. In 1767, the New York Supreme Court licensed lawyers having a B.A. degree from college and three years of clerkship. Yet, the apprenticeship method of professional education dominated.

In the Nineteenth Century forces for a more formal professional education moved in two directions. First, "chairs," or positions on faculty for a distinguished lecturer in his professional field, were established, especially in law and theology. Modeled on the Oxford "chair" were the theology and law "chairs" at Harvard (1636), William and Mary (1693), Yale (1701), University of Pennsylvania (1740), and Columbia (1754). Such professional "chairs" at universities were, of course, not as professional as those of this day. Theology remained the key-stone of liberal arts colleges, giving unity and direction to the rest of the college program.92

The second direction taken by the professions and professional education was that of the apprenticeship itself, which enlarged its effect by "doing" and by deep study. By the end of the Eighteenth to the Nineteenth Centuries, lawyers and clergymen usually took two apprentices into their professional care. A certain Judge Topping Reeves, whose legal practice was destroyed by the Revolutionary War, began to train legal apprentices in his home. His apprenticeships led to the founding of the Litchfield Law School of Connecticut.

Theology in colonial America was not Roman Catholic. As witness the history of education, Roman Catholic priests were usually trained in Rome, were of Catholic English or Irish descent and followed the migration of Catholics from the old countries to America. Not until after the Council of Baltimore did the catholic profession of theology in America enter its own seminaries. This, however, is a research study in itself. The ministry, as understood in this dissertation, means the Protestant ministry, having its professional schools at Harvard and Yale.

Medicine, in this same period, saw several physicians banded together to teach large classes of apprentices; each physician taught his specialized field. Thus, apprenticeship took on the aspect of formal instruction, becoming more didactic, less empirical through lectures. These groups of apprentices gradually became proprietary schools, the private property of medical faculties, yet they had no clinic with hospital connections.

The Civil War in America nearly destroyed any professional progress
of these schools. In 1826, the American legal profession had reached a level so low that any American, with age majority and never having been convicted of a crime, was entitled to practice law, if he so desired. President Lindsly in his inauguration address at the University of Nashville (1826) complained that it was easier to qualify for law practice than it was to become a master blacksmith.

Reaction to such low standards set in, and by the first quarter of the eighteen hundreds, Andover Theological Seminary in Massachusetts demanded a B.A. degree from a recognized college, and a three year course of instruction in theology from a full-time teaching faculty. Harvard and Columbia immediately adopted the same requirements for the theological and legal professions. Still low standards prevailed. In 1850, Harvard was ashamed of qualifying physicians who could pass only five of nine examinations.

After the Civil War, professional standards, as we know them today, began vigorous and steadfast demands to achieve the level of European universities and European professional schools. By 1895, Harvard Law School and Johns-Hopkins Medical School reached the European professional school qualifications by lifting the standards of theoretical, intellectual curricula. By the end of the Nineteenth Century, medicine insisted on research and practice, drawing on the sciences of biology, chemistry, and

93 Frederich Paulsen, German Universities: Their Character and Development (New York: Macmillan Company, 1895), 0. 25.
psychology. Law schools brought in the allied professions of economics, political science, sociology, and philosophy. Theological schools, however, never reached out to allied sciences, especially the historical method of scripture study. This was to stunt the growth of the profession of theology in America.

Johns-Hopkins University of medical science updated apprenticeship to the status of modern internship, yet always identified with the university organization. Under Charles Eliot, Harvard demanded a B.A. degree plus higher tuition to pay more qualified faculty; so superior in professional results did Harvard become, that other universities began to imitate, but not produce the high caliber of professional man. In 1910, Abraham Flexner, at the request of the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, made a study of medicine and law in universities and professional schools. So devastating was his report that seventy-five of the one hundred and fifty medical schools voluntarily closed their doors. The profession and professional education of law submitted to the same Flexner scrutiny and emerged in better condition.

The teaching occupation at primary and secondary levels received a boost in status when John Dewey (educational philosophy) and Edward Thorndike (educational psychology) applied pressure for professional status. Unfortunately, the pragmatism of the Dewey philosophy and the psychology of Thorndike were under constant suspicion of the more academic humanists of the universities and faculties. This study will research and make
Conclusions in a succeeding section devoted to the profession of teaching.

Chapters I and II are a concentration on the European and American concept and definition of and some history of the professions and professional education as they originated, grew in Europe and transferred from Europe to continue in essence in the United States. The succeeding chapters will study the moulding forces, American qualities and problems of the professions and professional education.
CHAPTER III

THE MOULDING FORCES OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION

Introduction

Chapters I and II have presented the European concept and definition of and the history of the professions and professional education and through the study of informed American educators, historians, and sociologists have demonstrated that the European concept and definition have transferred to the United States without any substantial change. Chapter III will make an in-depth study of and some conclusions concerning the moulding forces that have and do presently influence the concept of and the development of the professions and professional education in the United States. These moulding forces are the student, licensure, certification, accreditation, and society itself.94 The outline of Chapter III is as follows:

I. The student of a profession - his concept of a profession, his concept of self, characteristics of the student of the major professions of medicine, engineering, dentistry and law and some comments thereon, a summary of conclusions and implications on the moulding force of the student on a

---


II. Licensure, certification, accreditation - their nature, effect, methods and agencies, and some conclusions and implications thereon.

III. Society - the nature of its control of the profession.

IV. Summary of conclusions and implications for education concerning the moulding forces of the professions and professional education.

Since World War II, there has been a trend toward the recognition, understanding, and concern for the student of the professions through the extended use of improved psychological measurements.\footnote{Ibid.} The increased numbers of students seeking admission to the professional schools have forced educators into viewing the importance of the measurable differences among students, as well as the forecasting of scholastic achievement. Briefly then, the research framework on student achievement focuses on intellelctive criteria plus, and/or, non-intellelctive predictions based on motivation and personality. This double framework improves not only the selection but also the education of students.\footnote{Joshua A. Fishman, "Nonintellective Factors as Predictors, as Criteria, and as Contingencies in Selection and Guidance of College Students: A Socio-Psychological Analysis," Selection and Educational Differentiation (Washington: American Educational Research, 1960), p. 72.}
Data from studies of students of the professions are now extensive enough to describe, compare, and differentiate the professions, particularly the leading four professions of medicine, engineering, dentistry, and law. The observations made can be used to understand other professions. Data for the teaching profession are so complex, that teaching was not included in the comparative table of professions. A special segment in Chapter IV on the nature, history, and problems of the teaching profession has been researched and will be presented.

The Moulding Force of the Student

The Student's Concept of a Profession and Self

In American culture, not only image but the prestige of a profession or an occupation have been the object of much research. Prestige is measured by the financial earning-power of a profession, or for that matter, of an occupation.99 American youth is quite conscious of this prestige in selecting vocations. In this materialistic, success-orientated society, more students seek the prestige of status-professions than eventually gain acceptance to programs of professional preparation.

The O'Dowd and Beardslee Study concluded that students hold different concepts of a specific profession, but all agree on the attractiveness of high-status professions.100 Medicine and law are highly attractive, while engineering is the most desirable of the applied sciences.

In another study, Knapp and Greenbaum sought reasons why some students decide on a high-status profession, while others of equal ability enter professions with a less attractive "public" image. Some conclusions


100 Donald D. O'Dowd and David C. Beardslee, College Student Images of a Selected Group of Professions and Occupations, Cooperative Research Project No. 562 (8142), (Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University, 1960), p. 17.
of this study indicated that those students seeking a certain profession came from specific socio-economic levels, came from parents of different educational levels, or were graduated from certain colleges, and significantly, possessed distinguishing, similar patterns of attitudes and personality traits. This study does caution against general conclusions on the question, since the study is based on groups and not individual persons making the selection of a particular profession. 101

One conclusive fact of the Knapp-Greenbaum Study was that the student's decision to enter a particular profession was the student's concept of self. The image of a profession chosen must be coordinated with the person's self-concept. The concept of self is a synthesis, at the moment of choosing a profession, of the student's past experiences and learning. Hence, the study draws the conclusion that, though students generally have similar images of the various professions, their self-concept is the major determinant in the decision to enter a profession of higher or lower status. The profession finally selected reflects both the image of the profession chosen and the concept of self. 102


Characteristics of Students in Four Professions

For facility of comparison, a table has been established on the following pages. These are hinged together for an over-all view. The four leading American professions are compared according to:

1. Occupation of father.
2. Academic aptitude.
3. Study of values.
4. Personality traits.\textsuperscript{103}

\textsuperscript{103}Heist, "The Student," p. 215.
### Father's Occupation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Medicine</th>
<th>Engineering</th>
<th>Dentistry</th>
<th>Law</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Of a group of 2,306 students in 1/4 of American medical colleges</td>
<td>professional</td>
<td>dentists</td>
<td>professional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1/3 professional fathers</td>
<td>managerial-proprietor</td>
<td>physicians</td>
<td>managerial-proprietor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1/3 clerical-sales, skilled-unskilled</td>
<td>skilled-unskilled</td>
<td>other professionals</td>
<td>managerial-proprietor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1/3 farmer, clerical-sales, skilled-unskilled</td>
<td>farmer</td>
<td>semi-professionals (technical)</td>
<td>farmer</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Academic Aptitude

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Medicine</th>
<th>Engineering</th>
<th>Dentistry</th>
<th>Law</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACE test (American Council of Education)</td>
<td>Score - 124</td>
<td>Score - 128</td>
<td>Score - 122.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Score - 128</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MEDICINE</th>
<th>ENGINEERING</th>
<th>DENTISTRY</th>
<th>LAW</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scale of Values</strong>&lt;sup&gt;c&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td><strong>Scale of Values</strong></td>
<td><strong>Scale of Values</strong></td>
<td><strong>Scale of Values</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>theoretical</td>
<td>theoretical</td>
<td>theoretical</td>
<td>economical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>political</td>
<td>economical</td>
<td>political</td>
<td>social</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>religious</td>
<td>political</td>
<td>religious</td>
<td>political</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>aesthetic</td>
<td>religious</td>
<td>aesthetic</td>
<td>religious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>economical</td>
<td>aesthetic</td>
<td>social</td>
<td>aesthetic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>social</td>
<td>social</td>
<td>theoretical</td>
<td>theoretical</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| **Scale of Personality**<sup>d</sup> | **Scale of Personality** | **Scale of Personality** | **Scale of Personality** |
| Test | Test | Test | Test |
| (The Edwards Personal Preference Schedule) | --less theoretical | --persistent | --great anxiety |
| | --less interested in | --goal-oriented | --cynicism |
| | abstract ideas | and autonomous | --humanitarian |
| | --less socially | --not easily distracted | --certain |
| | mature | | --rational legal |
| | --need to be original | --organized and | activity |
| | | | high motivation |
| | --need for exhibition | | to material |
| | | | rewards |


<sup>d</sup>Ibid., p. 146.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MEDICINE</th>
<th>ENGINEERING</th>
<th>DENTISTRY</th>
<th>LAW</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scale of Personality Test (cont'd)</strong></td>
<td><strong>Scale of Personality Test</strong></td>
<td><strong>Scale of Personality Test</strong></td>
<td><strong>Scale of Personality Test</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--need for change</td>
<td>--adequate motivation to succeed</td>
<td>--no need for change</td>
<td>--authoritarian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--autonomy</td>
<td>--anchored in creative thinking</td>
<td>--conformity</td>
<td>--need for power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--need of conformity</td>
<td>--lack of aesthetic sensitivity and appreciation</td>
<td>--least socially mobile</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--need to accept &quot;status quo&quot; of training</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--need to be disruptive and independent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--lower degree of anxiety and cynicism than lawyers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments on the Characteristics of Students

Medicine

There is an amazing diversity among the parental occupations of students entering medicine. The values and needs of medical students are known from actual measurements and are clues to student personality. Professional education must realize that the needs and values of students will set the tone of academic activity. There are forces external to faculty and curricula which must be considered as major determinants in the transition from applicant to physician. 104

Another diversity is noted in that group of medical students whose parents are "professional" in occupation. Due to these "professional" parents, this student group receives more support financially and psychologically, and has obstacles such as time, privacy, and money removed. The students from non-professional families, however, are noteworthy for aggressively overcoming obstacles. Students with parents in a profession usually are more successful in a profession; students with parents not in a profession still wrestle with obstacles such as ethnic and social background consciousness. 105 Professional education plus professional associations must break down this second rate concept

104 Heist, "The Student," p. 220.

of self and eliminate hard-core discrimination in hospital assignments and in the attitudes of inner-fraternities of specialists and general practitioners. In the professional school the uplifting or lowering of a group's self-concept can be modified and thus dissolve, at its headwaters, this growing caste system within the medical profession. 106

Another problem detected by this study in the monograph by Josephine J. Williams was the place of women in medicine. To be determined by future research are the questions of whether women really want to enter medicine, how have they been discouraged, will the National Health Insurance Commission continue to encourage women to enter medicine, is the Women's Liberation movement in America inimical or otherwise to the woman in medicine, is the fact that more women in medicine are specialists significant in comparison to their relative absence in the general practice of medicine? 107 Racial discrimination in each of the professions, especially the major four of medicine, law, ministry, and college teaching, needs to be researched. Some such research has been initiated by Stanley Lieberson's study concerning the student of medicine as a Negro, a Jew,
a White Anglo-Saxon Protestant, and as a Catholic. From the observance of the bibliography on this subject, it may be noted that the majority of writers researching these questions are educators and sociologists of the graduate schools of education. Study of racial and religious discrimination must be made first by the professions themselves. More and more professional schools are being integrated into larger universities. This study suggests that the sociological, educational, professional problems and questions that are growing year by year can then be researched and solved by joint collaboration of these three departments. These questions can only be answered by research, not by procrastination, for whatever reason, by the professions or the universities.

Bernard Berelson made some interesting conclusions by comparing law and medicine with other professional doctorates. Like other educators and sociologists, Berelson proved that law and medical students emerged from a higher socio-economical stratum. Other doctoral candidates usually start at a later age, have more drop-outs, study as part-time students, are financially supported by family, personal work, and loans. Families of medical and legal students feel that the financial support of their offspring's education is a family obligation; other doctoral candidate families feel no such obligation and feel that society, since it needs

his services, should finance the education of the student for a profession. Conclusions for education are that such familial attitudes do in some measure continue to influence the self-concept of these two groups of students striving for the same goal, and that members of the professions, the professional schools, and universities with departments for professional education can discourage a dual student-concept of self by cooperative resolution of racial and socio-economic discrimination.

An interesting table for comparison between law, medicine, and other doctoral candidates has been constructed by Bernard Berelson. 109

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Origin</th>
<th>PH.D. Candidate</th>
<th>Law Candidate</th>
<th>Medical Candidate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professional family</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>75%</td>
<td>67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married and/or with children</td>
<td>50-70%</td>
<td>No % indicated</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.Q.</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Admission Age</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>19 - 20</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study full time</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>66%</td>
<td>Almost 100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Finances</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>By family</td>
<td>10-15%</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By fellowship</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By loans</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>No % indicated</td>
<td>15 - 20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salary expected</td>
<td>$7-9,000</td>
<td>$10-12,000</td>
<td>$18-20,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Engineering

Engineering students rank highest in both verbal and mathematical ability. Engineering has enjoyed an abundance of capable students at any level, especially when compared to other professions. From a study of the value scales already charted, engineering students, as a group, have the most consistent values. Note that the priority given to theoretical values by engineers are somewhat like those of medicine. By this is meant that along with dentistry and law, engineering continually ranks higher than medicine in economic values, because the goal of medicine is more remote and mediate, visible only in patient convalescence.110 Engineering students in comparison with students of these other three professions have constricted capabilities, i.e., their potential for thinking, learning, experimentation, seldom approach realization. Paul Heist cautions that this conclusion evolves from a study of the group and not of the individual.111 Heist perhaps means the group to be restricted by the laws of physics and experimental sciences, but not that the individual in constricted in the use of his individual imagination or experimentation.

Dentistry

Questionnaires to some 3,500 dental students showed the reasons for entering dentistry were motives of self-serving factors, which could

111 Ibid., p. 225.
account for economic values rating second highest on the value scale for dentistry. Medicine was always selected prior to dentistry in questionnaires. All students agreed that medicine was prior to dentistry in prestige, financial gain, and status.

For some other interesting conclusions and implications for education, More and Kohn have made a helpful study of motivating factors leading students to dentistry as a profession. The motives of students studying for a profession certainly carry over and perpetuate themselves in the profession, thus showing the moulding force the student can exert in his chosen field despite the professional image being uplifted by present practitioners. This can be seen in the diversity of function in the teaching profession, which grows with each teacher entering professional areas. The ministry is going through the same diversification. The traditional ministerial structure is still demanded, yet each ordained class initiates its own ideas which the student and the professional minister establish in their own professional work.

More and Kohn were very informative in discussing the moulding force exerted by dental students on their profession. Their study asked

112 Heist, "The Student," p. 228.
113 Ibid.
three questions: First, what attracted the student to the profession of dentistry? The answers in sequence were autonomy, independence from any form of managerial control. The consensus of students revealed that they would seek, if not in dentistry, then in an equivalent occupation giving them the autonomy they sought. Prestige, financial position, service of humanity, and use of their special skills were next in attraction. These conclusions agree with Heist's comparative scale made on dentistry's motivation.

The second question asked by More and Kohn was how would one advise a young man concerning study for the profession of dentistry? The answer in sequence was an emphasis first on autonomy, then prestige, money, service, and skill. The third question proposed by the More-Kohn study asked, if not dentistry, what alternative field of occupation would one prefer? The ultimate preference after dentistry indicated medicine, teaching, and engineering chosen in this order primarily because of the autonomy factor.

The emphasis of the dental student on autonomy indicates his desire for independence, to be his own master in his work, a man capable of performing the entire professional service from beginning to end and not allied or dependent on the cooperation of some other professional.

Law

A very limited amount of research has been conducted on students of law. Law students do not compare favorably with medical students in
personal adjustments. The concept of self and the image of the legal profession are stronger in comparison to those of students of medicine.\footnote{115} Among the four major professions, home environment is the strongest determinant for law students where father or close relatives were lawyers. Students choosing law are vividly aware of conflict and competition in their field, which contributes to the apparently high rate of anxiety and cynicism concerning human conduct.\footnote{116}

In this study of the student as a moulding force of profession the study of Dan C. Lortie, who researched the self-image or concept of self among law students is cited.\footnote{117} The development of a self-image in law is very complicated. Gone is the professional law school apprenticeship, which contributed to the law student in a manner similar to internship in hospital clinics, or to classroom and church service experience for teachers and ministry students. The preparation from layman to law-man is lecture-wise; most courts in law schools are not real. There is need for professional legal education to reintroduce a species of apprenticeship in "living courts." This has been recommended by lawyers who feel that

\footnote{115}{George L. Gropper and Robert Fitzpatrick, \textit{Who Goes to Graduate School? A research report on college seniors and graduate students (Pittsburgh: American Institute of Research, 1959)}, p. 12.}

\footnote{116}{Heist, "The Student," pp. 232-233.}

training and experience in the powers of persuasion and personal interaction with others are necessary in forging the professional identity of the lawyer. This accounts for the fact that the lawyer, coming late to his concept of self, is so aggressive, cynical, and anxiety-ridden, as suggested earlier. The present-day law student has no illusions or fantasies of being a hero for right in court and is realistic concerning the routine and taxing efforts required in the legal arena. He can only fantasize the legal image since he has no gradual realization of his legal identity. Professional education must introduce the student to these politics as he matures. Some valuable future research which this study suggests would involve examining the role of the law student in the professional institution and in "live" court situations, improving the recruitment practices of the legal profession which mould the "green" graduate to its image and likeness, the realism and usefulness in the public image demanded by legal associations, the relationships between the legal and other professions, such as medicine, whose medical members are perplexed by the unethical prosecution of physicians under the "Good Samaritan Law," and the absence of incentive to legal leadership which is stifled by the prestige of cases won.


Of further notice was James Davis' research which listed the reasons why students for the professions prematurely terminated their professional pursuits. Among the reasons cited by the Davis Study were finances, fatigue, family, marriage preferred, military service, low college grades, desire for some experience in legal work before profession, preference for law firm training, lack of confidence and too many prerequisite courses. Professional education must be aware of this great talent loss due to the afore-mentioned reasons. The Davis Study made no indication that these reasons for termination of the pursuit of law were peculiar to the student of law. That all professional students experience the same problems is a logical deduction, yet Davis made no attempt at resolution of the problems. These problems are familiar to all students of profession; all students should be made aware of the dangers through individual or group counselling. Let professional associations, families of students, universities, and professional schools unite to reduce the impact of these problems on the student.

Summary of Conclusions and Implications on the Moulding Force of the Student

Every study has limitations. However, from the research conducted and cited, the following conclusions are drawn by this dissertation:

1. All major social strata are represented in the study on parental background.

2. The study shows no one of the four professions has a priority on intellectual ability. Medicine, dentistry, and engineering exhibited a slightly higher intellectual ability than law.

3. Students of dentistry and engineering appeared to be most alike in personality inventories. These students were the most materialistic and utilitarian of the four groups.

From these conclusions the following implications, hypothetical, not conclusive, are made:

1. The image of a profession and concept of self varies depending on the student's socio-economic level.

2. The diversity of persons entering and completing training in a profession suggests that greater attention be given to the approach and procedures in classroom and laboratory for uniform intellectual foundation.
3. Care in the understanding of the individual student's characteristics and culture is fundamental to the education of the individual student.

4. The characteristics of the students of the four leading professions are not necessarily centered on their scholarship, but on their future position and status. Therefore, let professional education aim at implanting a spirit of scholarship early in the student's training.

5. Let professional education recognize that the relative stability of basic personality patterns and that fundamental attitudes of students should preclude, but not exclude any changes in attitudes and orientations of the student.

It is important for a profession and professional education to realize that American students be not thought of as objects of education, but as influential factors to be understood for the welfare and the productive direction and work of schools and colleges. The usual way of conceiving educational systems is the transformation of the unsocialized child into a responsible, mature, and fully socialized adult. The student, however, is not raw material to be processed into finished products. Students are not passive, inert, individuals someway identified with a scholastic regime. They actively participate in learning and as a group do exert influence in determining what is learned in the selection of
courses, and in the setting of work standards. Group attitudes and customs set quantitative and qualitative standards for study and behavior, for repelling or attracting teachers. This conclusion is not determined by the recent campus unrest but by research of this study into the conclusions and opinions of educators and sociologists studying the student as a moulding force over a period of many generations.\footnote{121}

To fully appreciate the power of the student-moulding force on a profession, the student of four particular professions has been studied from the viewpoint of questions as, what does the student like to do, what has he the capacity to do, what does he try to do, what does he actually do in first choosing and then pursuing his profession?\footnote{122}

Some conclusions, not necessarily definitive answers, of the preceding questions are that more students choose professional and technical fields than agricultural and domestic occupations. From 53% to 70% of students have chosen a particular vocation before entering college; one-third of these had even pre-selected the college to attend.\footnote{123} More


\footnote{122}{Anne Roe, The Psychology of Occupations (New York: John Wiley and Sons, Incorporated, 1959), pp. 252-254.}

\footnote{123}{G. Caudell, "Vocational Choices of College Students," Personality Bulletin, Number 19 (1937), 20.
students tend to choose the professions for which there are fewer openings; this is particularly true of Negroes. Veterans from military service also tend to choose a profession, rather than an occupation.

A study of motivation of students entering a profession has revealed that subjectively, the student-motives in sequence are self-expression, status, association and working with people, money, security, and variety in work. Objectively, the students were motivated by family and school influence, the availability of finances, and desire of contact with people. Outstanding was the factor of family influence, already discussed. Simply and briefly, the lower socio-economic level family de-emphasized the desire for entrance to a profession.

The greatest factor in the student's choice of a profession is the concept of self. The conclusion, therefore, is that students differ in self-concept according to age, intent, personality, that students qualify for certain occupations or professions, that each occupation and profession has certain characteristics demanding specific ability-patterns, and that the concept of self is always in a process of change as the


student grows from personal fantasy of a profession to tentative objectives, to a final realistic concept of self and of a profession. Education, whether university or professional school situated, must clearly understand this growth and gauge and advise students of these self-concept growths as well as of the realities of the profession to which he aspire.

The Moulding Forces of Licensure, Certification, and Accreditation

Professional history and tradition have been, and still are, powerful moulding forces of a profession and professional education. Intra-institutional moulding forces such as analysis, study, and research within a profession and professional schools bring about change. Extra-institutional moulding forces conducted by a variety of professional associations also form and reform a profession and professional education. Such extra-institutional forces, as licensure, certification, and accreditation of a profession and professional education are the emphasis of this segment of Chapter III which will now examine extra-institutional moulding forces of a profession and professional education. These moulding forces are as follows:

1. The nature of licensure and certification.
2. The effects of licensure and certification on professional education programs.
3. Accreditation - its nature, its effect on a profession and professional education.

The Nature of Licensure and Certification

Licensure is that procedure designed to screen candidates for admission to the profession, to review qualifications of existing practitioners, to attempt to establish ethical standards, to enhance professional standards, and to insure fair dealing with the public. Although certification is similar to licensure, certification is often limited to assuring minimum competence for professional practice with less attention devoted to the aspects of ethical standards or regulations of practice.

Today, the term, "licensing," is thought of in connection with the healing arts, as medicine, dentistry, osteopathy, nursing, and others. The term, "certification," is applied to teachers, accountants, architects, engineers, land-surveyors, etc. Lawyers are not licensed or certified, but "admitted to the bar" by the controlling courts of each state. 128

In licensing and certifying, state powers regulate professional admissions. Professional associations usually establish standards and regulations for the profession to guide state licensure and certification.

In addition to licensure and certification, there is a third significant moulding force which is called "professional membership," by which the associations set standards for membership and practice within the specific professional association. 129

Licensure in a profession originated in the craft-guilds of the Middle Ages. Admission to the craft-guild was the equivalent of modern licensure and was the monopoly of the specific guild. The terminology and stages of modern professional training follow much the organizational skeleton of medieval professions and guilds. Today, the announced purpose of licensure - protection of the public through assurance of minimum level of competence - seems to have the effect of recreating a medieval monopoly, but for good, in its avowed purpose. 130

For the past sixty years in America, various state legislatures, backed by members of profession, have increased, by law, minimum levels of competency. This legislation in America began as far back as the English in the state of Virginia, which began its licensure laws for medicine in 1639. In 1729, New York City established a law association which granted the equivalent of licensure. In the early eighteen hundreds, some states granted medical societies absolute power over examining and licensing candidates. From 1820 to the post Civil War period, state

129 Anderson and Ertell, "Extra-Institutional Forces," p. 239.
130 Ibid., p. 236.
interest waned. After the Civil War, professional associations developed in numbers and began to uplift ethical standards, thus protecting the profession and securing representation on state licensing bodies. After 1850 and the growth of public education, the licensing or certifying of teachers passed from local to state levels of control. 131

**Effects of Licensure and Certification on the Professions and Professional Education**

Licensure and certification demanded by a profession and state law have forced professional education in universities, colleges, and professional schools to design curricula which meet the demands for qualification. The danger, here, to professional education is that licensure introduces a use of requirements by professional associations so rigid, that there is fear of inhibiting the growth and development of a profession by reducing possibilities for change within professional education. Such rigid limitations place no incentive on opportunities to experiment, on attitudes toward educational programs as professional curriculum, teaching, and learning, and constitute serious problems to faculties, students, and to schools of professional education. 132 Professions exalt higher education for candidates, yet the threat from

---


examination, from outside agencies for admission and continued practice within profession, forces school programs to be determined and limited by the requirements of licensing laws and boards.¹³³

A profession's power over its field and professional schools is uncontested by the community, which power ultimately is derived from the state in the area of licensure. Accreditation is another matter and will be discussed later in this segment of the study. Community has given profession sanction and authority even to the degree of police-power, i.e., the community or state will judicially prosecute and punish professional practitioners or pretenders on indictment by the profession.¹³⁴ Thus, the number admitted to a profession, the location of professional schools, the curriculum and caliber of instruction are left in the hands of the profession. Society, theoretically, is protected, but what protects the student from incompetent professional schools and universities? The explosive Flexner Report on American medical schools in 1910 has been noted. After the report, half of the medical schools closed their doors as confessedly incompetent; the other half either affiliated with accredited universities or upgraded professional standards in all areas


of endeavor, within the school and within the professional practice. Most professions, fearful of Flexner's, "this professional school's catalogue is a tissue of misrepresentation from cover to cover," epitaph, followed the recovery actions of the medical profession immediately. Today, licensure and certification, or "admitting to the bar" for the legal profession, are much controlled by the professions; the greater emphasis and over-all control, however, is accreditation.

Accreditation: Its Nature and Effect on the Professions and Professional Education

Accreditation is the process whereby an organization or agency recognizes a college or university as having met certain predetermined qualifications or standards. Accreditation, a moulding force of the professions and professional education, takes two forms: Accreditation of institutions and accreditation of programs. The former is accomplished by six regional associations made up of accredited institutions of a given area. The latter is accomplished by associations, not necessarily made up of institutions, which generally are interested in a unit or a program of an institution.

It is of considerable significance for institutions of higher education to be accredited to a regional association and for its eligible

---

schools or programs to be listed by appropriate accrediting agencies. This significance is both symbolic and real - symbolic, for prestige value - real, for better employment or admission to higher schools of learning. Failure to gain such accreditation is utter destruction for institution and student.

The moulding force of accreditation is very influential as evidenced in the resistance universities or professional schools may offer to the demands of professional associations in return for accreditation. The chief objections are:

1. Professional associations make self-interested demands. 136

2. The accrediting agencies are too numerous. They invade the rights of institutions, destroy institutional freedom, encourage uniformity, restrict experimentation, assess excessive costs, and demand too much duplication of effort. 137

Yet, all institutions, universities, and professional schools agree that agencies or professional associations do prod and stimulate both weak and strong institutions to become better, stronger, and even excellent. Though resented thus, these agencies do discipline institutions. Unfortunately, even today, not all universities have sufficient integrity

---


137 Ibid., p. 72.
to maintain the quality of their degrees. Most professions are located in or have professional schools affiliated with, or recruit from universities. American universities are largely autonomous, chartered by the state, and under the control of their own boards of trustees. The state exercises little control over universities other than state schools except for granting charters.

Three groups need to constantly assure themselves that the universities meet standards and performance giving value to academic degrees, i.e., students, the professions, and society. Such assurance and protection through some external review to recognize merit and expose fraud are needed, as the Flexner Report blatantly indicated. The state could be such a reviewing agent, publishing lists of accredited universities, yet the inevitable result would be too great a control by the state, a power the national government has to grant. State by state accrediting would lead to many variable standards which eventually would necessitate national government interference and a nationalized system of higher education. 138

Of the many educators and historians researching the professions and professionalization whom this study has analyzed, William J. McGlothlin was very truly the only one who took pains to give some history and development of accreditation. According to McGlothlin, the need of

accrediting was obvious as early as the end of the Nineteenth Century. Less the government be forced to interfere with its own governmental accrediting, institutions of higher education and the professions themselves accepted the responsibility of accrediting and reviewing the quality of higher education. Colleges and universities banded together to define and sanction standards which protected them from the possibility of governmental control demanded by society and from the effects of inadequate institutions which might exploit students by pretense. Thus, the integrity of academic degrees and university autonomy were insured. The process of accreditation was accomplished by regional associations of universities and colleges. The term, "regional," was to distinguish the accrediting associations from identity with state and more comprehensive national control. The term, "association," was used to give strength of numbers to their accrediting decisions.

Regional associations uplifted the standards of colleges and universities, but did little to strengthen professional schools which were not accredited by regional associations, thus leaving an open door for students to enter poor professional schools which might be affiliated, on or off campus with an accredited university.

Non-governmental bodies struggled with this problem. Led by the American Medical Association which began to accredit medical schools in 1905, other professions initiated their own accreditation to supplement institution-accreditation performed by the regional associations. Today
each profession is accredited twice, once by the university, and once by the profession itself. For example, the engineering profession is so strict, that it goes so far as to demand each engineering school be accredited in the very pronouncements of curricula appearing in catalogues; thus, there can be no blanket approval of the whole school, unless each part of the whole be accredited.

The American Medical Association continued to lead in accreditation with its model procedure. Other professions followed and conducted their own reviews, published their own lists of approved schools. For professional schools, not university affiliated, the problem of accreditation was thus solved; for the greater universities to which some professional schools were affiliated, accreditation became a nightmare, i.e., the universities, at their own expense, had to redefine and reshape their own policies on accreditation to suit each specific profession. The administrative prerogative of the university and its legal authority of trustee boards were reduced to being servants rather than masters of decision. Through the formation of the National Commission on Accrediting, the universities attempted to regain their freedom. They unsuccessfullly attempted to reduce the amount of accrediting demanded by the professions. A more reasonable escape from exclusive associational domination came from the joint efforts of regional associations with the professions and vice-versa. Gradually, this academic inter-web is being untangled although the bulk of accreditation for professional schools continues to be
conducted by each professional school itself.

Methods and Agencies of Accreditation Used by the Professions

McGlothlin studied the ten most prominent professions and has summarized their methods and agencies of accreditation. He divided them into these three general types, professional associations of practitioners, associations of professional schools, and joint councils of practitioners and schools. In parallel pattern, McGlothlin has pictured the ten professions in the following columns:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Professional Associations</th>
<th>Professional Schools</th>
<th>Joint Councils</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Law</td>
<td>1. Law</td>
<td>1. Architecture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4. Social work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5. Teaching</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In general, the professions tend to move away from the associations as accrediting agencies. Nursing, social work, and teaching have been accredited by agencies of professional associations. In 1952, social work established the Council on Social Work Education for accrediting.

139 McGlothlin, Professional Education, p. 189.

In that same year (1952), nursing received accreditation from the Accrediting Service of the National League for Nursing. The teaching profession followed suit in 1954 with the National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education.141

Professional associations do the bulk of accrediting alone, as in clinical psychology and veterinary medicine. In 1948, the Committee on Evaluation of the American Psychological Association was formed for accrediting clinical psychology programs, giving accreditation only to clinical and counseling psychology; eight representatives of clinical and counseling psychology aided in accrediting experimental psychology. Veterinary medicine in 1946 established the Council on Education of the American Veterinary Medical Association. Law accredits through the Association of American Law Schools and the American Bar Association; medicine accredits through the Association of American Medical Colleges and the American Medical Association. Business administration joined the agency of accreditation by professional schools, and now accredits under the title of the American Association of Collegiate Schools of Business.142

Joint councils of accreditation, as seen in the comparative table,


142 Standards for Membership, The American Association of Collegiate Schools of Business (April 18, 1956), Section #5.
control the professions of architecture, engineering, nursing, social work, and teaching. The joint councils are represented by school-members and practitioners. The National Architectural Accrediting Board, established in 1940, was composed of two representatives each of the American Institute of Architects, the Association of Collegiate Schools of Architecture, and the National Council of Architectural Registration Boards. The Engineers' Council for Professional Development, established in 1932, consists of three representatives each from six professional engineering groups, i.e., the American Society of Civil Engineers, the American Institute of Mining Engineers and Metallurgical Engineers, the American Society of Mechanical Engineers, the American Institute of Electrical Engineers, and the American Institute of Chemical Engineers. With these six groups work the American Society for Engineering Education and the National Council of State Boards of Engineering Examiners.

Accreditation of nursing schools has been conducted by the Accrediting Service of the National League for Nursing, consisting of educators, practitioners, and lay persons since 1952. The Council on Social Work Education (1952), composed of social work practitioners, who are selected through national organizations, employment agencies, undergraduate and graduate schools of social work, and interested lay persons, is the accrediting council for social work. The Council operates through a commission of fifteen, nine faculty members of graduate schools of social work, three members of the National Association of Social Workers,
and three members at large, one of whom is selected from the general field of higher education.

The National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education (1954) consists of nineteen members; seven selected by the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education; one selected by the Council of Chief State School Officers; one by the National Association of State Directors of Teacher Education and Certification; six appointed by the National Commission on Teacher Education and Professional Standards of the National Education Association (NEA); one by the National School Boards Association; and three by an "ad hoc" committee designated by the National Commission on Accrediting.

Areas for accreditation, which is the concern of all professions, are, in general, organization, aims, curriculum, faculty, students, facilities, and financing. Briefly, organization means that the professions insist on autonomy within the university organization; aims of each profession are educational, stated usually in general terms, but determined at the upgrading of personal, academic standards. Curriculum standards frequently emphasize length rather than content. Without exception each profession sets specific standards of academic years, semesters, quarters, and hours. Content of curriculum is stated in general terms. Faculty standards aim at faculty qualification and numerical faculty-student ratio. Law, architecture, and engineering set

143 McGlothlin, Professional Education, pp. 194-197.
no exact standards for degrees held by faculty members. Social work asks that all members have appropriate social work education as evidenced by professional graduate degrees.\(^{144}\) **Student-faculty ratio** is precisely stated. The Association of American Law Schools requires one teacher for each seventy-five students; the Council of Medical Education demands one full-time teacher for each twenty-five students. The American Psychological Association suggests the ratio of one to twelve; the National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education demands the same standard of a faculty equal in numbers to the number of students.\(^{145}\) Business administration and social work adopt general provisions for the numerical ratio. **Students** are admitted to most professions by selection. The standards of the American Bar Association admit only students who have completed at least three years of college work before entrance to law school. Business administration makes no mention of student admission. The National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education demands colleges attended to use selective admission. Social work specifically requires health, emotional stability, intelligence, and a previous education qualifying for graduate-level studies.\(^{146}\)
The Council of Medical Education goes so far as to publish the booklet, "Essentials of an Acceptable Medical School." Facilities, as an area of accreditation, mean that the profession demands schools with facilities sufficient for their programs. Thus, accreditation in architecture, engineering, law, medicine, social work, teaching, and veterinary medicine have special concerns for the size and qualities of libraries. The American Bar Association demands "adequate and available libraries," which interpreted equals seventy-five hundred well-selected, usable volumes as a minimum. Medicine requires certain, specific categories of material as reference books, catalogues, indexes, current medical journals. Finances, the final area of accreditation, does not mean profession demands a certain amount of funds be available to the professional school each year, but does mean adequate finances for the programs and purposes of the professional schools be available, at least, in source.

147 American Bar Association, Law Schools and Bar Admission Requirements, 1957, p. 27.
The Moulding Force of Society

The power and authority given the professions have been researched. The thoughts and writings of the few historians and educators sufficiently aware of the powerful, vast moulding social force of the public on the professions and professional education are now presented. The public has given or delegated a large measure of autonomy to the professions. Society has very great tolerance for the professions and any controls they exercise within their programs. This patience, however, is not limited. If a situation goes awry, society often withdraws some of a profession's autonomy and works its own will through law or public opinion and investigation.

Just how does society affect a profession? Three factors of professional service determine whether or not the larger public will invade, at times, the authority of a profession. These factors are:

1. Quality of service.
2. Quantity of service.
3. Cost of service.148

In each of the three areas of service, society ultimately reaches its own conclusions, for if society concludes a profession is wanting, it will, in various ways, attempt to restore or develop a professional

service to provide what it lacks. An example of general society insisting on its will and need was the demand for change in education "after Sputnik I," seen particularly in the state of New York, where society pressured for changes in teacher-preparation, in solid academic subjects, and in reducing time demanded for "professional" studies by teachers.¹⁴⁹ Thus, society will be served and is an important moulding force for a profession and professional education.

The above ideas are the significant substance of research of various authors on society as a moulding force in profession and professional education. Further comment will be made in the conclusions and implications for education at the end of this chapter.

Conclusions and Implications for Education

Most professions shy away from defining objective measures for their standards of accreditation, preferring qualitative rather than quantitative uniformity, for they realize that significant study and research thrive on a variety of conditions. Social work and architecture are most specific in the avoidance of standardization of education. Engineering, teaching, nursing, psychology, medicine, and law have withstood attacks on their standards as lacking specific conditions and the use of terms as "adequate, sufficient, reasonable," to protect the variables needed by their profession for study and research. Only business administration and veterinary medicine stand apart from such arrangements, even being so specific as to name subjects, fields of basic instruction, credit hours, degrees for faculty holders, number of hours a faculty member may teach, etc.

Medicine began and still leads the process of accreditation and has found that the role of policing and exposing inadequate schools, etc., is becoming less important than the general quality of professional education, and hence, is revamping standards to allow and encourage more experimentation for quality.150 In the light of past experience other professions will follow the example of medicine. Accrediting will soon

be more consultation than condemnation or consecration of standards, but with an ever alert eye to fraud, incompetence, and poor standards.

Another conclusion of this dissertation and a suggested topic for in-depth research is the subject of which is the better accrediting agency - the practitioners or the professional schools? The practitioners seem sincere in their recommendations for curriculum, selection, etc., based on the needs met in the field of endeavor. Practitioners worry that professional schools, which need students to survive, may be tempted to lower standards. The schools themselves counter-object with the accusation that practitioners tend to be too rigid, too narrow in vision of research, and too "ad hoc" in practice. The see-saw debate between these two groups certainly keeps each alert to personal strengths and weaknesses. This study suggests that the growing "consultation" method presently employed by practitioners, professional schools, and joint councils seems to be the best means for accreditation, for safety, for the insurance of profession, the student, and the public.

The lack of researched history, i.e., dates, etc., for licensure, certification, accreditation and society's influence as moulding forces of various professions is noted by this dissertation. Most writers researched were educators writing on the profession of teaching and about teacher certification. Yet, the evidence has been presented by historians and educators that teaching is not a profession in the true sense, but at best a semi-profession still lacking the core-characteristics of the true
professions demonstrated in Chapter I of this dissertation. Myron Lieberman and Archibald W. Anderson both have worked diligently in proving the semi-professional condition and reasons thereto concerning teaching and education. Yet, the majority of other authors just assume teaching to be a full profession. This study alerts the reader to the fact that university teaching, one of the learned professions, is not the teaching occupation studied. This investigation in the chapter on the present situation of teaching has researched and made conclusions on the semi-profession of elementary and secondary teaching. Society's influence as a moulding force, has received scant research. Let members of all professions, especially those in medicine, law, and dentistry depend not on educators, sociologists, and historians to write the history, the inner fabric and workings of their particular profession; these historians, etc., skilled as they be can only observe the external and not internal life-activity of a profession. The man in profession, schools of a profession, and professional associations, sooner or later, can well afford, for the vitality of their profession, to encourage students of the profession to specialize in teaching, writing, and administration as full time pursuits. Until now, such activities have been considered extra-curricular activities for men in profession so inclined and so concerned.
CHAPTER IV

PROFILE STUDIES OF THE LEADING PROFESSIONS
IN THE UNITED STATES

Introduction

Chapters I and II of this dissertation have carefully researched the European concept, definition, the history, the transference, the continuation of this European concept and definition, and the Americanization of the professions and professional education in the United States. Chapter III analyzed and presented the inner fabric and nature, the moulding forces shaping American professions and professional education. Chapter IV will examine and describe, through brief profile studies, the leading American professions, their structure, problems, and educational programs. Chapter IV will not compare these leading American professions of medicine, law, ministry, teaching, engineering, and dentistry with their European counterparts, although the presence of the original European concept, definition, and history will be obvious in the profiles. The amount and quality of research, history, and bibliography extant for this profile research was very meager.
Profile Study of the Profession of American Medicine

The behavior patterns of any profession do not develop overnight. Chapter II has historically traced the growth, the European concept of medicine, then the historical development of the medical profession in the United States. In its transference from Europe to America the medical profession has suffered. For one reason, what established physician of the Old World would come to the "new frontier?" Fortunately, however, many of the Puritan pioneering clergy also took the precaution of obtaining a medical education, thus equipping themselves to be physicians of souls and bodies. Their method of practice was highly empirical, based on elementary but adequate knowledge of anatomy, physiology, materia medica, drugs, and the few technical gadgets available. Pricking, sweating, purging, and especially bleeding the sick were the usual procedures. Aided by these traditional remedies and ancient herbs these medics and pastors relieved symptoms and consoled their patients.

The medical history of the early colonies was one of a series of devastating epidemics such as scarlet fever, typhus, smallpox, and diphtheria. By 1800, Dr. Benjamin Waterhouse introduced vaccination and emphasized quarantine periods before immigration-landings. Quarantine,

Interestingly enough, was begun by the Massachusetts Bay Colony Assembly as early as 1648. Medical historians cite this restriction as the first government health program in America. Few European doctors, however, came to colonial America. Between 1620 and 1650, 25,000 English settlers came to the New World. Suddenly, immigration stopped and with it the flow of European doctors. Statistics show that after 1650, the population doubled every twenty-five years. To supply doctors, the colonists trained their own by the apprenticeship system or sent men of promise to European medical centers, such as Vienna, after the usual apprenticeship at home. This was the educational pattern of the American medical profession until the late Nineteenth Century.

Physicians of Seventeenth Century America founded the "horse and buggy" doctor tradition of the Eighteenth Century. Going abroad for studies in ever increasing numbers, they returned to practice over a wide geographical range and yet managed to teach their apprentices the then most up-to-date methods of European medicine.

American medicine broke its dependence on European medicine and education with the rise of American medical schools. The first medical school was founded in Philadelphia at the University of Pennsylvania (1765), where Dr. John Morgan, a hundred years ahead of his time, in an inaugural address to the medical college, called for a broad, benevolent conception medical knowledge. In 1776, New York City King's College Medical School

was established. This later was named Columbia University Medical School. Harvard Medical School began its colonial existence in 1783. Dartmouth Medical School in New Hampshire initiated a meager two year program of medical education in 1798; Yale followed Harvard with its medical school in 1813.

Early American medical schools suffered the agonizing frustration of the lecture system without benefit of Aristotle's "learn by doing." Benjamin Franklin attempted to unite the lecture, apprenticeship, and observation of medicine in Pennsylvania Hospital (1756). Another hospital, New York Hospital, tried the same plan in 1791. Massachusetts General Hospital in Boston began this triple educational system as late as 1821. Medical historians concede that these three hospitals started the primitive beginnings of professional medical education in the United States.153 A research-study could be launched at this point to determine the origin, history, and any influence or exchange between American medical education and the European, French, and Spanish systems already established and functioning in such institutions as Mexico City's hospital established by Cortez in 1524, and the French hospital, the Hotel Dieu in Montreal, founded in 1644.

In the latter part of the Eighteenth Century, another core-characteristic of a profession - the professional society - grew almost

---

overnight with the avowed purpose of keeping physicians alert to new and better medical knowledge techniques through meetings as well as through journals. So avid was the physicians' response to the idea of a professional society, that in 1848, the American Medical Association, a democratic society in original intent, was organized as a super-structure coordinating local, county, and state medical associations. The A.M.A.'s avowed purpose was to begin reforms to correct the deplorable condition of medical education. The A.M.A. was the beginning of organized medicine.

To understand the profession of American medicine is to understand the A.M.A. and vice versa. Through the centuries, the A.M.A. has grown into one of the most powerful national and political powers, for through collective action it can exert great pressure on national or local politics and legislation. This study notes here the guild power of the Middle Ages in the A.M.A.

The teaching hospitals slowly grew strong and developed into the multi-million dollar medical centers which we have today. The entry to America of European trained medical faculties began with invitations to Scottish, English, and French doctors. In the Nineteenth Century, France, Germany, and Britain made great medical and technological advancements in physiology, biochemistry, histology, pathology, and pharmacology. William Beaumont pioneered in American medicine in the physiology of digestion, while Oliver Wendell Holmes, the physician, isolated the nature of child bed-fever. American medicine soon began making its contribution to
international medicine.

The latter part of the Nineteenth Century saw the general practitioner in his fullest glory. This, too, was the age of the medical fee, considered by many historians as another characteristic of profession. Physicians were now categorized into country, general practitioners, and family doctors, all men of great confidence and abilities. Problems they could not handle meant consultation with one another. Educationally, these physicians learned more on the job as the majority were graduates of proprietary schools and not medical universities. As indicated proprietary schools were the banding together of several general practitioners calling themselves faculty, giving lectures and collecting fees for tuition.

The unique quality of the Nineteenth Century physician was not his broad, theoretical knowledge, but his familial ministration. He responded to family calls, knew his family clientele intimately, and cared for them in their homes. Rarely did he send his "family" to a hospital. He gave his patients confidence in his availability in time of sickness. "Home calls" enabled him to know the patient in the patient's physical, social, and emotional surroundings - all factors useable in diagnosing and curing illness. Modern doctors, some of whom lament the disappearance of the "house call," are limited to a "doctors-office" relationship, devoid of the social and emotional knowledge of patients, so useful in diagnosis.

Mid-Nineteenth Century became the important age of specialization.
Specialists usually trained in the specialist schools of Vienna and returned home to become distinguished from general practitioners. The specialist did most of his work in an office; the general practitioner still worked in the homes. Originally, general practitioners of note and specialists offered their skills to professional medical schools without fee. Thus arose the custom of the specialists making hospital rounds, observing patients, and teaching medical students who stood at their elbows. The technique was observation, taking the medical history of the patients, and physical examinations as we have them today.

Hospital care of a century ago was limited to the care of needy patients. Private hospitals were few in number and poor in quality in 1900. Home care, however, was the generally preferred procedure, now aided by private nurses. The automobile revolutionized the medical profession in the area of mobility. Distances by auto became shorter; the night calls more frequent and successful.

Thus was the brief history of the American medical profession until the turn of the Twentieth Century. At this point three momentous events stirred American medicine. The first such event was the opening of Johns-Hopkins Hospital (1889), in Baltimore. Four men were the pillars of this new medical phenomenon. The first important figure was Doctor John Shaw Billings, who planned and built Johns-Hopkins Hospital and selected

\[\text{Means, "Medicus Americanus," p. 54.}\]
its staff. William Henry Welch was first professor of pathology, while Daniel Coit Gilman was elected president of the hospital at the request of Harvard's president, Charles Eliot. Welch was German university hospital trained and brought his knowledge and techniques to Baltimore. The fourth pillar of modern American medicine was William Osler, first medical chief of Johns-Hopkins, where he revolutionized the clinical training of medical students, whom he brought ever closer to the bed-side of the patient, not to hear a distinguished physician give his opinion, but to assume the responsible role of physician. The best of German medical science and British genius for clinical teaching were blended by Osler and Welch into the American medical life-stream. This was the birth of scientific medicine in the United States.

The second momentous event in the new life of American medicine was the founding in 1903 of Rockefeller Institute for Medical Research which established the fact that without research in medicine there can be no progress. Effective research requires specially skilled people who must be financially supported in all facilities. This was the beginning of the unbelievable medical research organization with which the United States leads the world.

The celebrated Flexner Report on the quality of medical schools and affiliated hospitals was the rocking, shocking, third event of the century to revolutionize the American medical profession. 155 Flexner, 155Abraham Flexner, Medical Education in the United States and Canada, Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, Bulletin No. 4 (New York: Carnegie Foundation, 1910).
an educator, was employed by the Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching to evaluate every American medical school. In 1910 he published his explosive evaluation which named Johns-Hopkins Hospital and Medical School as the only one in America worthy of the name and status of being truly professional. Within the year seventy-five of one hundred and fifty medical schools closed. The remaining seventy-five scurried to become university affiliated in order to upgrade qualifications and academic content. In 1910 Flexner evaluated the medical schools as no better than trade schools. Within two years and up to the present medical schools have been constantly struggling to upgrade the quality of medical education. The process is slow and often at a standstill. 156

Professional Education for Medicine

Today there are eighty-six professional medical schools in America, nearly half of which receive major financial support from private sources; the remainder are public tax-supported. Private schools, undeservedly, have the edge in prestige value, yet both schools are more similar than dissimilar. Each school is free and independent, yet willingly belonging to the A.M.A.M.C., the American Medical Association of Medical Colleges. Almost all are part of a university organization. Alarmingly, only a handful of these professional schools for medicine have remained true to the high ideals of the Flexner Report of 1910. The others have reverted to the old basic formulas of training and education.157 Yet, demands for medical professional education have grown in depth. The educational pattern, then, of the world of the physician begins with pre-medical training. Seventy-seven medical schools (most affiliated with a university organization) demand three years of college; six schools demand a B.A.; all demand completed undergraduate courses in biology, chemistry, physics, and mathematics. In the humanities, English alone is required plus a modern or classical language. Recommended, but not as yet demanded, are undergraduate courses in behavioral and social

Emerging from college, the student enters the professional medical school as an extension of pre-medical studies. The next two years are orderly, logical, and scientific in the detailed study of first year biology, taught by specialists, not physicians; anatomy, gross and microscopic in content, and physiology must be mastered. The second year concentrates on diseases, pathology, micro-biology, pharmacology, patient attendance in hospital and clinic, and the art of taking the health history of the patient. Personal discipline and resourcefullness are highly emphasized. The third and fourth years in professional medical school direct the medical student to internal medicine, surgery, pediatrics, gynecology, and psychology. The mind and body skills of the student now work as hand in glove.

Graduate school for the profession of medicine begins with internship. In 1900, the medical school terminated the physician's education. Today, his physicianship begins in the graduate division of internship. The professional medical school graduate enters the finest of professional graduate departments in American hospitals, university affiliated. Internship is the personal relationship and experience with patients wherein the intern is strictly, completely responsible for his materia medica, surgery, and mid-wifery. During this period the student's

inclination and talent for specialization will usually manifest itself. An interesting point in history occurred in 1914 when six hundred and three hospitals gave 3,095 internships to 3,594 medical school graduates. The competition was keen. By 1959, 815 hospitals offered 12,580 internships to 7,081 students. The competition now rested with the hospitals and not the interns, who, more and more with increased knowledge and skills improved the quality of hospital service. Internship was designed for the hospital education and experience of the physician; today, the internship is losing its place in the hospital to the neighborhood clinic residency where the intern is doing in the neighborhood clinic, what he did in the hospital wards.

The professional educational pattern of medical training after internship moves to residency. The intern, now a full-fledged M.D., usually becomes resident physician in a hospital, or clinic, mainly for the purpose of pursuing medical specialization. In 1941, there were only 5,256 resident physicians in the United States; by 1959, 31,733 residencies were extant. In the late 1960's residents were as numerous as interns. The residency completes the circle of the student's science education begun in pre-medical school. Normally, he specializes and produces a research project in his specialized area.

The professional educational pattern of medicine recently added

one more step to the complete education of the M.D., i.e., post-graduate studies, whereby already practicing medics may return to the professional school and university to "brush-up," to modernize self in latest medical techniques and methods. So great is the growing depth of knowledge and theory of the profession that such post-graduate study programs are encouraged by hospitals, professional medical societies, and the U.S. Department of Health. An excellent example of this popularization of post-graduate study occurred in 1958-59 when the American Heart Association made available post-graduate courses for cardiac medicine. Twenty-nine thousand physicians traveled to study in schools not more than 50 to 200 miles from their homes.

New Directions in Professional Education of Medicine

The most important new direction in medicine's professional education is the emphasis placed on medical research, an impetus begun in 1920 by Yale Medical School. As a student and later as a practicing physician the doctor never had time to respond to the spirit of inquiry. The Yale plan reduced these frustrations by shifting the responsibility of performing free-lance inquiry and elective courses to the student in his precious free time. The students have responded to the plan as is

evident from the productivity of research pouring from Yale since 1920.\textsuperscript{161}

Since World War II, many professional schools of medicine, university affiliated, have followed the Yale plan with new developments. Western Reserve University in the 1950's opened all academic departments and courses to the researching medical student. The faculty expressed their belief that the prime purpose of medical education was to produce well-rounded physicians to whom all knowledge should be available.\textsuperscript{162}

In Pennsylvania, this method of medical education is called the Family Health Plan of Pennsylvania Medical School; Cornell and the University of Colorado have similar programs called Comprehensive Care clinics.

Control of Medical Education - The Problems

Outside the university, Doctor John Morgan's dream of 1765 - that the profession of medicine be based on a broad, theoretical body of knowledge - is a reality, but one spiny with obstacles. Medical education desires to be university-based, but the vast knowledge demanded, years of study required, and growth in population have over-burdened the medical profession with too many interns, residents, and pre-medical students, and too few medical schools in the universities. The danger


\textsuperscript{162}John L. Caughey, Jr., "Clinical Teaching During Four Years," \textit{Journal of Medical Education}, XXXI (August, 1956), 530-534.
worrying the medical profession is that the simple medical apprenticeship may re-appear; without university supervision this can become mere training for a job - to the detriment of public health and the quality of professional service. The Council on Medical Education of the American Medical Association tries desperately to enforce the warnings and suggestions of the Flexner Report. The issue is one of medical education, whose concern is professional competence. Unlike business transactions, medicine cannot depend on the law of supply and demand. Another growing danger is the self-appointed competency boards in medicine, who, without any authority from the profession of medical associations, proclaim and accomplish their aim of certifying practitioners. The boards of examiners may include medical specialists but they are a committee without authorization, with no university affiliation. Thus, the medical profession fears that university certification of the student may be weakened. 163

Within the university, the control of professional medical education is an uneasy stability between university faculty and extra-university societies. The "Hippocratic Oath" commands the physician to teach his art. For centuries, and during these past fifty years, in American medical schools, almost ninety percent of full-time faculty has been

made up, not of physicians, but of specialists, Ph.D.'s, in one specific area of medical sciences. Medical societies fear that the predelection of the specialists may sway the medical student away from the broad, theoretical knowledge of medicine, so necessary for the physician, toward a narrow, more specialized knowledge in fewer areas of study. The Ph.D. specialists point to the results of their teaching - the continued growth in medical competency, research, and increased national health.

European medicine, once the teacher, now looks to American medicine for knowledge and leadership. The student has surpassed the teacher, as it were, for the American profession of medicine has the unique quality of open self-criticism and self-appraisal which constantly increases the quality of American medicine. Beginning nationally in the 1960's, medical schools have met annually to solve common problems of medical education, to exchange medical research, and to support and inspire one another by united knowledge and action. At present, three medical schools - the University of Illinois, Western Reserve University, and the University of Virginia - have joined forces and resources to specialize in the research of medical education itself.164

164 George Packer Berry, "Medical Education in Transitions," Medical Education Today (Chicago: Association of American Medical Colleges, 1953), pp. 98-123.
harassed by never ending new materia medica as is the general practitioner, whose number is dwindling. As with self-appointed certification committees, specialization also has bred its own speciality boards, in no way university connected for knowledge control. These committees have now achieved some prestige and are able to give accreditation to a new specialist without benefit of university certification. This does not necessarily mean the certified specialist is not qualified, but the university is more objective, impersonal in its pass or fail rating; the committee perhaps is just as objective. The result can be disastrous to public health, and to the medical profession. At this date, specialists are ethical and wise enough to take only patients referred by the general practitioner. The only solution to avoid a future conflict has taken the form of several doctors, both general practitioners and specialists, working as an integrated team with their own offices, schedules, and routines of program for patients. Medical education in the universities arbitrated this system which seems beneficial to both patient and doctor. Thus, both still have some quality of the "live" consultation; the harassed general practitioner saves "face" in areas where he is not too well acquainted; the specialist depends on the general practitioner in the general areas where he has not concentrated through routine experience. 165 This wise plan of medical schools, university affiliated,

has lessened the hostility and fear of the general practitioner of the psychiatric branches of medicine, of the use of para-medical people, viz., social workers, visiting nurses, occupational therapists. Thus, para-medical occupations are given the opportunity to emerge as a profession.

This segment of the study of the medical profession and professional medical education has examined historically and analyzed the growth of the broad, theoretical knowledge required for the profession of American medicine. It has traced the development of the medical profession from European origins through apprenticeship to the great university medical school. Responsibility to the patient has been researched, which is a core-characteristic of profession - a code of ethics - so much in the public news this day, and being tested by legislation, moral opinions, etc., concerning birth-control, abortion, and euthanasia. In accord with the "Hippocratic Oath" and after twenty-three hundred years of tradition the doctor saves life. Abortion and euthanasia, etc., are repugnant to most human beings. The code of ethics is the doctor's guide, not his escape. Most professional associations of physicians have stated their negative ethical policy, even as the public-legislates positively for euthanasia and abortion. The professional associations state bluntly that they will provide means for population control and no more. Just this year the controversy over abortion, now legalized in some states,

166 Means, "Medicus Americanus," p. 64.
was a controversy at the American Medical Association annual convention in Chicago. Despite newspaper distortion, the political gesture of the A.M.A. was to hear papers, discourses, and opinions. Conclusions on policy will be researched after further study. This study has queried doctors from Holy Family Hospital, Des Plaines, Illinois, on the conclusions. Professionally, no plan is available. Personally, most doctors indicated that the public has frenzied emotions, and forgets the physician is first a human being, who, when he acts intelligently, has life as his first value. The A.M.A., the professional medical association, has assured its members that the attempt to make the physician a "whipping boy" for an unstable society will not be allowed. The A.M.A. is strong enough in politics, government, and public opinion to be a loud, threatening, yet soothing voice in public life.

The professional medical society, at local, national, international levels, has never been stronger or more influential. The A.M.A., the doctor's guild has as a purpose the constant upgrading of medical education and medical care. It has accomplished and will continue to do so without contravening the physician. For one hundred and fifteen years the A.M.A. has steadfastly kept the government out of medicine. The A.M.A. has the money, the political power, and pressure-tactics of big unions, much to the benefit of doctor and patient. Accusations of fear, or monopoly make some of the professional members feel threatened, but the stability, maturity of the A.M.A. keeps reminding society that its
members are not an employee of the public, not a political organization, but a group of professional men with a service to render society, which service society cannot find anywhere else. 167

A critique of the American Medical Association is worthy of a special research. Many accusations of monopoly and discrimination have been made against the A.M.A., yet the association has kept its purposes and members true to their professional oath. At this writing individual doctors and hospitals are accepting the newly legalized abortion operations. The A.M.A. has made no definitive, comprehensive judgement, but studies all aspects of the situation in order to make the correct decision. This maturity and patience in vital decisions is probably the main unifying strength of the A.M.A.


The modern physician has retained professional status by adaptation to his changing world, by somehow keeping abreast in medicine in a quickly changing technological field, and by observing the changing relationships with his patients. The change in the doctor-patient relationship disturbs the modern physician without end. Physician prestige, omniscience, and mystique are challenged by the necessary use of technological machines which substitute for his personal diagnostic presence with the patient. The most significant and far-reaching change the physician resents is the pressures put on his time. Busier than he wants to be, busier than is good for him, the modern doctor is in such a hurry, that despite his efforts, he is less communicative and accessible to his patients. His dilemma is either to confine himself strictly to medical matters or continue to be family friend, counselor, and physician. Responsibility to patients with long, perhaps terminal illness nags constantly at the doctor whose time is spent in giving only comfort and not cure. Such visits can irk him; thus, he finds himself torn between viable and inviable patients. What suffers is his compassion until finally and reluctantly he forces himself to withdraw from the case. His code of ethics prescribes this. Thus, the modern physician is a professional man caught in a changing world. Whether this dilemma can ever be solved is a matter for future investigation.
Conclusions and Implications for Professional Education of Medicine

The portrayal of the modern professional man of medicine has been researched by this dissertation. The result is the picture of a man clinging to his necessary individualism, a man who is part of a vast network of services which collectively function to preserve, promote, and restore American health, a man of much learning, altruism, responsibility, a man with no time for himself, a man whose professional organization is thus far a national power, a man who more and more deals with a socialized, community-minded public seeking to reduce his autonomy, and desiring his controllable employ, a man who is pressed hard from too many sides, deluged daily with new knowledge to learn, a man under constant pressure from the A.M.A. to conform professionally and personally, a man who is frustrated, but visibly does not show it, a man who, despite all, will never regret or cease to be "homo medicus Americanus," the American doctor.
Profile Study of the Profession of American Law

The modern American profession of law is divided into the three distinct segments of the practicing bar, the judiciary, and the academic. European law is further subdivided into what seems to be a seamless web, i.e., the practicing bar is divided as "avoue" and "avocat" in France, proctor and advocate in Scotland, solicitor and barrister in England. American law has by custom no such specialization, the lawyer assimilating all European roles into one.

This study has gained knowledge of the American legal profession by a study of the English legal profession, the progenitor of American law. This investigation gives special commendation to Paul A. Freund's monograph on the present status of the American legal profession as it provides some history and some analysis of the peculiar personality and problems of the American legal profession. 168

The American legal profession has a unique specialization system somewhat like medical groups, viz., the law firm of partners, each member a specialist in some legal field. A trend in American law is away from the solo-practitioner and into the group firm. 169 Solo-practitioners find


themselves dealing with trial cases, bill collecting, and ethnic-group legal problems which are often rejected by the legal firm. The barrister, the solo-practitioner in England, possesses the highest of prestige and power. The barrister never deals directly with clients; he uses the solicitor as intermediary, yet his income is the highest in the profession. There are only three thousand such barristers in England, each attached to one of the four Inn Courts of London. This number, when totaled with the number of solicitors, concludes to twenty-five thousand lawyers in England or one lawyer per twenty-two thousand citizens; in the United States there is one lawyer per nine hundred citizens. The concept of the English legal profession enjoys a high fee system and there is great independence of the barrister from the client. Such aloofness has created an atmosphere which frees the barrister from public opinion and has enabled the English legal profession to resist outside influences, which has on the one hand kept the law pure, but on the other has somewhat lost the sense of compassion for the needs of the ordinary citizen.

This is not as true in the United States where judges and lawyers, with less independence, are more responsive to public opinion, especially since they are more involved in economical, social, and political systems. The


American lawyer has much more mobility; he is not confined to only one branch of law, i.e., the bar, the judiciary, or academic; he moves in all three areas with more ease, knowledge, and experience. This study observes, however, that English lawyers in the academic area are really more influential, since they control the development of legal doctrine, as well as the revision of legal codes. English lawyers, so trained, are much more case-oriented, and as a result much better versed in their field of specialization than their more mobile American peers, who, however, are free from the barriers created by the English barrister-solicitor relationship. In England mobility is so restricted, that the lawyer moving from the judiciary to the academic, or to the practicing bar, must rebuild his practice all over again. The group practice of law-firms allows the American lawyer greater ease in such moves. American mobility is tremendously advantageous as it provides the mobile lawyer with more economic choice, an independent spirit, and a growing knowledge of the three branches of activity.

This study learned much by the comparison of the legal with other professions. Lawyers in America are more parochial; their expertise ceases at the edge of law; other professions can move into the fields of related professions, viz., the English lawyer would need to be retrained if he moved to America and vice versa. The American doctor, lawyer, dentist, engineer, etc., need no such re-education, except for recognition of license and adjustments to foreign living. A second barrier to
geographic mobility for the legal profession is socio-economical. Medical, social, engineering, dental problems are the same world-wide; law is dependent on a particular country's economic, social, cultural and legal peculiarities. This can easily be observed, for example, even in clinical work. A medical clinic gives medical education to the doctor and aid to the patient over as wide a range as there are physical ailments. Legal clinics are limited to the scope of the young lawyer's specific background and experience.

In comparison to other professions the law has wider areas of human activity in which to work. The doctor is limited to the parts of the human body which can have only so many deviations from the physical laws of nature. The law, dealing with human behavior, intellect, will, vice and virtue, has as many variables as there are clients. The lawyer uses a palette of legal colors as he creates a modicum of order out of the disorder, complexity, and spontaneity of men's aspirations. This variability of human nature is the basic reason why the history of the legal profession is yet to be written.

**Function and Standards of the Legal Profession**

Law considers its basic function to be public service, measured by the three standards of independence, availability and learning. The independence of the bar is a many faceted concept concerning the relationship of lawyer to the client, to government law, and to legal associations. The lawyer owes complete loyalty to the client but with the bounds set by
the legal profession itself. Thus, the judge has one loyalty, the advocate another, the defending lawyer a third. This could be constricting save for the mobility of the American lawyer with his vast range of experience, and his broader view. Yet, threats do exist to his independence, for the client somehow looks upon him as an employee. The lawyer's best approach is one of immersion and withdrawal - immersion into a case saving him from being pedantic and unfeeling, withdrawal saving him from too much sentiment.

The independence of the bar is also concerned with the lawyer's relationship to government law. The lawyer's role is to counsel and advocate for the citizen without fear, threat, and subservience to government. Thus, the unpopular client can be objectively and justly prosecuted or defended. Today this is becoming a complicated matter as seen in trials of those defendants who with tactical maneuvers and public statements can so twist proceedings that a mistrial can be declared, based on government laws of fairness and justice. Though repugnant to the average lawyer, the organized bar insists that its members execute zealous representation on terms that do not pervert litigation processes.

The final aspect of the independence of the bar is the authority over professional standards and discipline of members. This is the typical function of the bar associations which insist on power to employ ethics, set standards and programs of greater learning. For such objectives, the legal profession in 1900 established the Association of American Law
Schools, a part of the American Bar Association. Today these are separate entities, yet both have a common power to accredit law schools. The oldest bar association is the Bar of the City of New York, established in 1840 in response to the Boss Tweed scandal in New York State. The American Bar Association, formed in 1878, has had three growth periods, i.e., the Saratoga period to 1902, so named because meetings were held in that New York city, the expansion period from 1902 to 1936, and the period of federation which united delegates of lawyers' associations from all parts of the country. 172

The availability of service is the second standard by which the American legal profession controls itself. The numbers of lawyers "admitted to the bar" every year in America is not the problem of availability of service. The problem is to assemble willing public defenders to defend American indigent and minority groups who by constitutional right must be defended or represented. Judges, community lawyer-groups, the public defender department, and legal aid societies usually designate some of the public defenders. 173 The legal profession taking the example of medicine is now on a campaign of preventive legal aid, educating the public to its rights and indicating danger signs of legal troubles and advertising its


availability for such education. This, as in medicine, is two-edged, i.e., both the public and violators of public laws are becoming more and more informed on how to use the law to their own advantage.

The third standard measuring the American legal profession is learning and its advancement. The obvious obstacle to knowledge of law is the amassed volumes of legal data to be assimilated. As of 1963, graduates of law schools were reputedly knowledgable of almost three million court decisions. Statute books and over three hundred legal periodicals have kept pace with the complexities of administrative law, labor laws, income tax laws, securities laws, workmen's compensation laws, and social security laws.

To aid law students and lawyers, legal institutes have been established in major cities much in the same manner as done by the medical profession, and with the view not of specialization but of a general view of legal knowledge, new and old. Judges who head such legal institutes have been aided immeasurably by the use of leading law school graduates as legal clerks and advisers on the latest legal data. Thus, both judge and law graduate exchange their knowledge, old and new, of law.

No profession is more conscious of its curricula and teaching methods than law. Much of the burden of massive knowledge has been organized and efficiently reported by the Journal of Legal Education and the monographs and reports of the conventions published by the American Bar Association. The numbers of documents to be assimilated have forged
the motto of the legal schools - to produce minds trained for law, not to produce lawyers. There is no doubt that the first core-characteristics of a profession - a broad, theoretical body of knowledge - is uppermost in the mind of the legal profession. Steps are being taken to encourage lawyers to devote their energies to full-time research of law. Law schools are beginning to co-operate with other professional schools for research facilities and materials. Colleges, such as Columbia, at undergraduate levels now are meaningfully contributing to the law student's liberal arts background, but with his legal future in mind. A seven year program has been initiated for students willing to add some years to their legal knowledge-training, based on three years of liberal arts and pre-law curricula, and two years of law and social sciences.

Conclusions and Implications for the Professional Education of Law

As stated previously in this profile-study, the history of law is yet to be written. At present, law schools are strengthening the most neglected phases of their liberal arts programs. To be judged for effectiveness, lawyer and layman must be taught some legal history, the knowledge of the profession's role, and the relationship between lawyer and citizen. General education requires that a view from the inside of the legal profession should be provided both for law and other professions. One example of this need can be found in the bitter misunderstanding
between medicine and law concerning the debated "Good Samaritan Law."
Doctors on the scene of accidents or emergencies perform their service
with the materials at hand. Sometimes, after the emergency, a law suit
may be filed against them for malpractice. Doctors are angered by lawyers,
and vice versa, each not aware of the responsibility to public service
required by the other. Liberal arts curriculum could save much time and
litigation if it included some knowledge for the student and the pro­
fessional concerning the nature and function of various professions.

An interesting research project would be one on the motivation of
the modern law-student who prefers not solo-practice but firm practice.
This logically calls for the study of trial practices and service to ethnic
and minority groups which service is avoided and left open to the solo­
practitioner.

Another research area is the value, if any, to American law of
the privilege of the English barrister, insulated and aloof from public
opinion; is such better for politics, for the public, for the profession?
A study on the relative merits of lawyer mobility in the United States and
the stereotyping to the judiciary, academic, or bar in England might be
investigated. This is a vast area, but a beginning can be made in such a
comparative study of American law profession still rooted in English law.
It is the conclusion of this dissertation that a comparative study of
domestic and international law be made in law schools, for with the foreign
monetary expansion of this nation and others, the word, "foreign," is
disappearing. For example, there is the need for the study by American lawyers of Japanese and German corporate law; these two nations in the automobile production area are here to stay, with legal and economic repercussions still to be felt in American business and courts. This investigation has already pointed out another problem of an American lawyer trying to set up a practice in European courts and vice versa. Comparative law courses could aid in the personal transition.

This examination has stated that the history of law is yet to be written. General education and legal education could become the impetus for such an important task by encouraging specific curricula in liberal arts and professional law schools.
Profile Study of the Profession of American Ministry

The American clergy is the most heterogeneous group of any profession in the United States. The profession of the ministry renders spiritual service to members of many religions - Roman Catholic, Protestant, Jewish, Eastern Greek Orthodox sects being predominant in the United States. The American clergyman, in educational background, may range from the high school level to the rank of a Ph.D. The services he renders to the public may vary from the office of administrator in an ecclesiastical bureaucracy, or faculty member in a theology school, a pastor responsible for the old and young, associate pastor, chaplain to the aged, the retarded, prisoners, military personnel, orphans and the poor. Diversity in the American profession of ministry is as evident as American religious life itself.

From Roman times the "profession" of theology, as historically studied in Chapter II of this dissertation, was Roman Catholic. Diversification came with the Protestant Reformation of the Sixteenth Century. The Catholic priesthood, Protestant ministry, Jewish rabbinate or Greek Orthodox priesthood, as equal, integral parts of the profession of American ministry is the concern of this study. Whenever the term "American ministry" is used in this profile study, it refers to the specific ministry of the religious sect or denomination under consideration. This concept applies also to the use of the term, "professional school
of ministry" as the generic term. Any reference to a particular
denominational school of ministry will be so specified. The study of
the nature and professional education given by a specific sect to its
candidates is not the purpose of this study.

James Gustafson, professor of Christian Ethics at Yale University
Divinity School, has written a clear, modern, sociotheological account
of the professional ministry in a thesis which described the increasing
number, variety, and activity of the American clergy. Such variety and
activity reside in three areas, viz., the voluntary character of American
ministry which makes the clergy responsive to the needs of the American
people, the breakdown of the sense of independent authority in the clergy,
and the efforts of the American clergy to find new ways to make religious
faith relevant to the changing cultural and social patterns of the
American congregation. The result of these three activities is
affecting a change in the profession of the American ministry; the
European ministry feels somewhat the same changes, with an obvious
difference in cultural and social needs. The American ministry seems
to welcome the change, but has serious doubts as to whether or not it
can survive as a modern profession within the light of its historical
and professional traditions.

The tradition of the professional ministry in the United States

174 Gerald L. Gutek, Jr., An Historical Introduction to
pp. 18-19.
began with the clergy trained at Harvard and Yale to keep the Puritan faithful within the fold and to evangelize New England, the New Chanaan. 175

The proliferation of activities in no way seems to have changed the responsibilities of the American clergyman. Traditionally, he was responsible for the religious life of his congregational or parish members, for the propagation of religious tradition, for the administration of the means of Divine Grace, for the application of moral and religious laws, for the growth of his religion's organization, and for the moral well-being of the group or individual. He was and is the traditional preacher, scholar, teacher, priest at the altar, moral and spiritual counselor. The American clergyman today is also responsible for youth, for financial campaigns, for public relations, for effectiveness of ministerial associations, for mitigation between conflicting groups in the community, and for counseling of many problems. This study sees that all four types of American clergy function in the same general areas and need much the same skills. Objectively, their roles are interchangeable; their traditional functions at the altar, desk, or pulpit are the same; their ministerial office is dominant, yet, the Jewish Rabbi can no longer function as a scholar-saint; he must use his Jewish tradition and scholarship, but now must preach about social problems,

175 Gutek, An Historical Introduction to American Education, pp. 18-19.
the latest movie, play, psychiatry, philosophy, issues of civil rights, civil delinquencies, political and international situations. New activities are added to the old. The congregation needs and expects this.

Basic theological and canonical functions are the pivot of the Roman Catholic priest, who also has new responsibilities. Primarily mediating between God and man, he is father, shepherd, dispenser of the grace, and the flow of Divine Life. But more is required formally and informally as he is the spiritual, family, social, cultural, economic coordinator of his parish; his is the communal life, as a member of all his families, but intimate member of none.176

Within the Protestant ministry, proliferation of activity takes place in specialized ministries for which particular skill and training is required in addition to functions of the parish. Such chaplaincies are for the ministries of hospitals, industry, and military service. All ministries, save the Eastern Orthodox, this study has noted, have been carefully analyzed by educators, historians, sociologists, and theologians. Eastern Orthodoxy and its ministers with their peculiar ethnic reluctance to commingle completely with other groups could be a specialized research study.

The weight of their new pastoral proliferation has been felt by the American clergy. What is their mind? Which activities appeal to them more than others? Samuel Blizzard made the following study among the Protestant ministry and found their normative ordering of these activities were preacher, pastor, priest, teacher, organizer, and administrator. The order in which they felt they were most effective indicated the roles of preacher, pastor, teacher, priest, administrator, organizer. They enjoyed their roles in the following order: pastor, preacher, teacher, priest, organizer, and administrator. The amount of time they spent in each activity ranged in a different order, as administrator, pastor, preacher, priest, organizer, and teacher.\textsuperscript{177} The opinion of all interviewed was that administration consumed most of their time. Other studies have revealed the Roman Catholic priest is now not as satisfied with being a "rectory priest, or sacristy priest," but prefers to be all things to all men. American clergy are "other person oriented" rather than inner-directed in spiritual matters as are European clergy whose activities are not as socialized as American.\textsuperscript{178} This socialization is becoming a core-characteristic for the concept of the profession of American ministry.


Religious voluntarism, or free choice of religious creed, is characteristic of American religious freedom and has made the American clergy responsive to the desires and needs of the laity and changes in American culture. Ministry's traditional functions have adapted to the needs of laity. New roles are created to respond to these needs. All religions are free of government interference. Voluntarism in religion is by law to be the consent of the people. Thus, legal establishment lends no support or interference to American clergy, but supports the consensus of the people, which is the basis of the rise of denominationalism and diversification of Catholicism, Protestantism, Judaism, and Eastern Orthodoxism in the United States. The lack of state taxes for religious denominations gives the laity freedom to criticize their denomination. American clergy are not in civil service as in some European nations. This freedom has allowed American ministry to pattern its own professional personality.

Denominalization or freedom of any religious sect to coexist with other sects has influenced American clergy of all denominations to organize for a common service to men through professional clergy associations. Such freedom for clergy has built a healthy competition of all ministers for the support of the laity who have a free buyers' market in religion, and who, free from government interference in their choice of creed, believe the churches belong to them. This is called Laicism, which has the following effects on professional American ministry:
1. The clergy seek the favor of people of their denomination in order to assume new responsibilities.

2. The clergy feel the need to be useful in the eyes of the faithful.

3. The clergy, in turn, then seek ways to influence the laity in church and world life such as adult, male and female organizations, and youth groups.

4. The clergy of America have become more versatile and adaptable than their counterparts in Europe.

Yet, the profession of American ministry wrestles with the problem of to whom are they responsible? God? The Laity? Superiors? In the opinion of this dissertation the time is premature to comment objectively on any solution for this problem.

Despite the extension of its areas of responsibilities, the American ministry as a profession is no longer certain of its unique function. Ministry retains traditional religious activities, but operates in a society so secular and modern that God seems remote to most men in His Providence and hatred of sin. The dilemma for the profession of ministry is twofold, viz., to retain the symbol of traditional theology and yet to somehow adapt to the age of technology.

Just exactly what is his authority? To whom is he responsible - to God - to man - to self? The result is that American ministry scrambles to legitimize its professional activity and improve its image which still must be God-centered. The clergyman knows his authority is from God, but what are his responsibilities? The Roman Catholic clergyman is the most certain of the three clergy groups of American ministry. He has adapted less; he is more God, more superior, and more peer conscious than the others. He is assured that his efficacy as a clergyman is independent of his personal, moral, and spiritual life. Canon Law and Dogma define to whom and for what he is responsible.

The Jewish rabbi is better conditioned for his dilemma regarding his authority, stemming from the Jewish community, which functions in a traditional manner, provides the rabbi with a specific position in the community. Yet, the professional rabbi knows his effectiveness depends on his personal ability to make an ancient religion acceptable and relevant to his people. The Catholic priest does not depend on personal effectiveness for efficacy. The Protestant minister has three authority problems which cause internal stress, viz., his God, the laity, and his denominational officials. He lacks concise delineation in his relationship with these authorities. The voice of the congregation is not the voice of God. Little supports him if he speaks for God contrary to the will of the people. The modern Protestant clergyman has less clear functions of office than do his Roman and Jewish brothers. Denominational officials
cannot authoritatively back him in any contest with the congregation, for his bishops and officials are, in the majority, also dependent for authority on the laity. This profession of the Protestant minister lacks the thousand or more years of tradition which the Jew and Catholic clergyman possess. He then must rely on his own personality and political skills as the basis of his authority and profession.

The result for all three members of American ministry has the individual priest, minister, or rabbi in an agony of crisis, as they seek ways of work which will overcome the radical separation of religious life from the main stream of a nervous, value-disoriented, economically worried, racially disturbed, war-weary, suspicious, and often violent American society. These same upsetting qualities in the client have brought many similar problems to the American professions of medicine and law.

Overcoming the irrelevance of religion to modern life is a third problem which is forcing the revising of clerical activities and requiring the clergy to escape the isolation of religious faith and to move more professional life. Many American clergy oppose the confinement of the segregated Sunday worship-hour. With ingenuity, especially among the younger clergy, they seek to make religion a strong basis in cultural, social, and political life. Some seek a complete reorganization of

denominational and congregational structures which they consider prime impediments to religious faith. Some American clerics have gone to extremes in their efforts to overcome irrelevancy. Some clerics, who feel the institutional church has outlived its usefulness, believe that the laity is the real ministry in daily life rather than the clergy at their altars or pulpits. Other clergy tenaciously cling to the other extreme of the tradition and authority of a defined ministry.

Professional theological education must unify the attitudes of a divided ministry. The active ministry in its tension reflects, at present, the same moods and emotional discontent of the professional school, or the theological seminary. The professional school of ministry on the one hand perpetuates religious dogma and tradition, yet, on the other hand attempts to train men for a religious leadership responsive to the needs of the people. Roman Catholic training, despite unrest, defection, controversy, and division into groups of the "old breed and the new breed" has been somewhat more faithful to traditional modes. Protestant professional schools of ministry have great variations, as do the Reform, Conservative, and Orthodox Jewish institutions. Despite variations among Protestant groups, there has been a trend in professional education of ministry back to biblical study; this in turn has stimulated interest and curriculum in the classical languages, Greek and Latin, interest in history, and in the liberal arts. Protestant professional schools of ministry through this revised curriculum have advanced beyond
Roman Catholic seminaries which are rooted deeply in the centuries-old traditions of scholasticism. Tension between "content" disciplines and "practical" disciplines still exists in professional theological schools. Experiments of "internship" and "residencies" are being made for the unordained, while there are post-graduate education programs for ordained alumni, who have expressed their need for further education in biblical, theological, historical disciplines, and liberal arts. Yet, the tension mounts among faculty and ordained alumni, with rumors that seminary training, whether Protestant, Catholic, Jewish, or Greek Orthodox produces unfit ministers. Thus, resentment and misunderstanding of objectives between the professional school faculty and the men in the field of ministry grow.

One significant development in the profession of American ministry is the rise of Negro education and ministry. Negro clergy in professional schools of ministry are nine times more numerous than the self-styled Negro minister who received a self-imposed "call." The religious life of the Negro church is bound to the social and cultural status of the Negro community. A better educated Negro clergy is growing apart from the less educated member of the community. This is a serious problem for the poorly educated Negro layman who looks suspiciously at

this education which may infect his minister with the white man's ways.

Many unfounded statements are made that the decline in number of candidates for the ministry is causing a poorer quality of clergyman. Never before has there been a more intense recruitment program in the American Catholic Church. By comparison, the Protestant recruitment program is unorganized and competitive. The over-all picture in the Jewish community is that the rabbinate is not as highly regarded as other professions. As a result of recruitment problems, secular agencies have become concerned about the profession of American ministry. The Rockefeller Brothers Fund has, for ten years, sponsored fellowships for those persons considering ministry as a profession. Sixty per cent of candidates aided by the fellowships and attending theological schools have survived their foundation study.

Another observation made on the profession of the American ministry is that the seminary, theological school, school of ministry, name it whatever, now serves two functions, viz., as a professional school for training men for the profession of ministry and as a center for the cultivation of religious life, and that men already established in an occupation tend more and more to engage in theological study with the hope of becoming part-time ministers, rabbis, or Catholic deacons. These programs are still too new for this dissertation to make any kind of

182 Fitchter, Religion as an Occupation, pp. 9-10.
An area still unresearched seriously has been the role of women in the profession of ministry. Catholicism has institutionalized the status of women in the religious vocations of the Sisterhood; the trend of accepting women as well-trained, theological students and eventually doctors of theology is now well established. Protestantism has no clear consensus on the role of women in the profession of ministry. Some few Protestant denominations do ordain women, but most do not, and confine women to auxiliary activities. The Rockefeller Fund encouraged the recruitment of women for ministry, but finally gave up because so few engaged in the profession of ministry.

Conclusions and Implications for the Professional Education of American Ministry

The following conclusions and implications for education of the profession of ministry in the United States can be made by this dissertation. The tensions, conflicts, emotions of the profession of American ministry are the normal reactions of a profession adapting to the needs of a culture itself in change. A study of the history and purpose of the professional schools of ministry in America should be made, as objectively as possible. Since most denominations have a personal bias, such a study would acquaint one denomination with the other and aid religion for the community. Research study can be made
of the ethnic Eastern Orthodox religions. These groups have lagged behind, bound by ethnic traditions, but still are a force in the professional ministry of America. An unbiased evaluation and research of the Roman Catholic priesthood should be made by non-clerical, professional educators, sociologists, and historians. This study boldly questions the energetic, scholarly works and research of Catholic clergymen, fine sociologists as Reverends Greeley and Fichter, and disqualifies them for lack of objectivity on the basis of bias. Educators and sociologists as Gustafson, Blizzard, and Sklares have not spared emotions and feelings of their own denominations in their research of the American ministry. This dissertation is guided by a Catholic priest, often biased, conservative, but willing to allow unbiased historians, educators, and sociologists to study and report the condition of the Catholic ministry, the misguidance of Catholic laity, and if true, the "ostrich with head in sand" attitude of Catholic hierarchy, who have been accused of following the premise that, if ignored, a painful situation may go away.

Research should be made by educators, sociologists, and historians of professional ministry schools. They should truthfully determine the value of curricula which may be teaching "guilt feelings" to the clergy. This fact, if true, is a betrayal of the trust of the commonweal on the part of the clergy, who must be reminded long before they become professionals, that just as a doctor, lawyer, teacher, engineer, they too have a special skill, a service to be rendered, that they do not
seek out, but await the needs of the public. This may seem harsh, but ministry could learn from the other professions, especially medicine, that people feel their needs and seek professional skill without the doctor's advertising and intrusion. Some of the so-called "professional aloofness" of medicine can be applied to ministry. Research should be made to inform the profession of American ministry that its objectives are of the spirit, not of the body or material things which, for the other professions, are essential. Let the members of the profession of American ministry learn to be mature enough to realize that very often "relevancy" is of their own making, and that in their pursuing it their congregation becomes confused. Members of American ministry work in the field of the human spirit, human emotions which change through the years. The clergy must adapt, but the clergy must also be as objective as the doctor in prescribing what is best for the people. Let American ministry know its objective - the spirit of man. Since the ministry consists, in fabric, of men taken from among men ordained for men in the affairs between God and man, the professional education of American ministry must clearly know the cultural, economic, sociological background of the laity through the in-depth study of the humanities and a deeper study of theology and psychology. This is being accomplished to some degree in professional schools of Catholic seminaries. An example is the Society of Jesus, with its basic theology department at the Theological Union School at the University of Chicago, Illinois, and with its humanities,
education, and liberal arts departments of the graduate and undergraduate schools located and available at the greater Loyola University of Chicago. The archdiocesan seminary, chartered at Loyola in the late 1800's, is building a similar program geared to educate men for the priesthood who now serve a better educated laity. Ministry students of all denominations are more and more being exposed and educated by the professional men of graduate schools whose professional wisdom, maturity, and experience can help clergy make their ideals become realities. More and more the graduate school and university must be part of the professional education of American ministry. At present, professional schools of ministry still tend to breed provincialism, to be staffed by well-meaning but poorly qualified faculty. Post-ordination dilemmas, confusion, bitterness among clergy of all denominations would cease if professional school faculty, university faculty, and university departments became one organization with "two eyes," that of the faculty and that the student for objectives and means. Qualification for theological faculties should be strictly based on university qualification and experience in the field of endeavor.

The core-cluster of the characteristics of a profession is still intact in the American profession of ministry. The pains of ministry are found often in the overworked and misunderstood word, "relevancy"; the judging of the ancient in the light of the conditions of modern is often misused. The clergy are making the mistake of judging all
conditions and areas of activity by modern standards and needs. This type of judgement for the profession of ministry can lead to a loss of identity with the traditions which are as unchangeable as human nature itself. Sidney Mead stated concisely that adaptation has been thrust upon ministers since the beginning of the profession of American clergy in the Seventeenth Century, and this thrust will continue until the end of time. Modernity and relevancy are ever-changing accidents in the traditional substance of the profession of ministry as well as in the other professions. Studies on the adaptation of the profession of ministry concerning its theoretical, broad body of knowledge, its professional ethics, and its professional associations would be too premature and valueless at this time. An objective research can be made as soon as the crisis in the profession grows a little older and familiar.

A research should be made of the function, direction, objectives, and present qualifications of women in the profession of American ministry. The Society of Jesus, the Union Theological Center at the University of Chicago, has encouraged laymen, and especially women to pursue the M.A. degree in theology and the doctorate in Sacred Theology. Research could be made on the history and qualifications of the teacher-nun

---

in American private schools. In modern times legal conflict continues for state-aid to the parochial school systems; research is being conducted on the rights of the state, for if financial aid be so granted, the state has the right to examine the credentials, license, etc. of nuns and even lay-teachers working in the parochial system. Education makes more and more demands for teachers' higher scholastic accreditation. More and more the role of the university organization becomes clear, particularly in its departments of professional education which is on the brink of being the dominant force in the nation's second highest national product - general education and teacher preparation.
Profile Study of the Profession of American Teaching

Chapter II of this dissertation has researched the history of European and American professions and professional education from the Greek to the Colonial, National, Eighteenth, Nineteenth, and Twentieth Century periods in the United States. That historical evolution concentrated on the four major professions of medicine, law, theology and university teaching.

Nowhere was there found any doubt concerning the professional status of university teaching. In Colonial America, before American universities began, this status of the profession of university teaching remained intact as young Colonial candidates for university teaching and the other three professions went to European universities for professional degrees and returned home to America to practice their respective professions. The profession of university teaching and its professional education continued to be European-trained until the inauguration of one Ph.D. pilot program in university teaching at Johns-Hopkins University in 1896. As indicated in Chapter II other universities followed Johns-Hopkins in continuing and upholding the professional status of university teaching and other professions, but certainly not without difficulties. However, the professional status of university teaching has remained intact.

The thrust, then, of this profile study of profession of American teaching is an analysis of the teaching profession in America at the
primary and secondary level. Colonial professional teachers at the university level returned from Europe to enjoy full professional status and to teach in the early American colleges. Very often to provide teachers at the lower levels, but without professional status, these professional teachers trained candidates by the apprentice system or in proprietary schools, i.e., one professional university teacher would, for tuition, privately train small groups of candidates. In some degree this proprietary system foreshadowed the teacher-training schools to come. The Flexner Report on the professions in 1910 clearly made the distinction between the profession of university teaching and the occupation of teaching at the primary and secondary levels. The profile study of the profession of American teaching and its professional education concentrates in this dissertation on the profession at the primary and secondary levels. This profile study does not intend an in-depth research on the history of the profession of teacher-education, or of teacher associations, but will mention these specific points and observations. The opinions and demonstrations of historians and educators researching the subject will be compared. The substance of each of their works will be presented with a final segment on conclusions and implications for the education of the profession of teaching at the primary and secondary levels. The substance of Doctor Archibald Anderson's monograph, "The Teaching Profession: An Example of Diversity in Training and Function," is presented. Anderson was reluctant to distinguish between the two
levels of teaching, i.e., teaching at the university and at primary and secondary levels. His appeal was not to two distinct groups of a profession to become one, but rather to the efforts of the teaching profession, as one whole, to achieve full professional status. Myron Lieberman, another distinguished educator, will also be used in extensive reference. Alma S. Wittlin will be studied in the section dealing with secondary and elementary teaching.

**Brief History of Teacher-Professionalization in the United States**

The traditional professions, as indicated, have been law, medicine, ministry, and university teaching. With the tremendous expansion of science in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries the old crafts or vocational occupations, as they were called - engineering, business, teaching at primary and secondary levels, architecture, and their like - began clamoring for professional status. As the learned, ancient professions of law, medicine, ministry, and university teaching, so these new professions evolved through the three following stages:

1. **Apprenticeship**, during which learning and training were "ad hoc" and empirical.

2. **An early form of school for professional training in the new professions.** Rensselaer Polytechnical Institute, established in New York in 1824, was
one such example. The Morrill Act of 1862 provided theoretically for the formation of professional schools such as those for engineering.

3. Clamor for professional recognition on the part of these new professions. This struggle for recognition still goes on today. 184

Teaching at primary and secondary levels was one of the new crafts seeking recognition as a profession. This study now considers the history of teaching at the primary and secondary levels.

During the Colonial period teachers varied in their personal and academic qualifications. The profession of university teaching concentrated on training colonial leaders in the Latin Grammar School and Colonial colleges. The vernacular school, geared for the education of the masses, was conducted by teachers poorly educated and often barely capable of the rudimentary skills of reading, writing, and arithmetic. The selection of such teachers ranged in social stratum from bond servants to students of ministry or law seeking stipendiary for tuition at the colleges. Certification and selection of such teachers varied from colony to colony. Such teachers were dependent on the good will of local school

committees, town ministers, church societies, and individual families. Religious and political orthodoxy were the chief qualifications rather than academic skills. The status of the vernacular school teacher was lowly, indeed.

This bifurcation of the teaching level continued until well after the Revolutionary War, until the early Nineteenth Century, and the emergence of the Common School System when the training of teachers became the interest of national education.

The second period of the history of teaching at the primary and secondary levels began during the later half of the Nineteenth Century, when the national effort to establish the Common School System revealed the need of qualified teachers and the poor condition of teacher-education. The writings of Horace Mann, Henry Barnard, and Samuel Hall, exposed weaknesses of teaching at the primary and secondary levels, i.e., political, religious, financial divisions within the school districts, low qualification standards for teachers, and poor school government. Due to the writings and suggestions of the above-mentioned authors, state-legislation, proposed by Governor DeWitt Clinton of New York, James G. Carter, and Edward Everett of Massachusetts, was enacted for establishing normal schools for teacher-education at Lexington, Barre, and Bridgewater. Other states followed Massachusetts. New York State Normal School at Albany, New York began in 1844. Midwestern and Western states soon established normal schools; by 1875 the normal school for
teacher-education was the accepted pattern. The significance of the normal school was the advancement of the concept of professional preparation for teachers at the primary and secondary levels and in the subsequent development of the teacher's college.

In the post-Civil War period colleges and universities began to give recognition to the education and preparation of teachers at the primary and secondary levels. The development of the common school, the high school, increased enrollment, and the gradual development of the two-year course of the normal school to a four-year term soon forced universities and colleges to establish their own chairs of pedagogy in the departments of philosophy and psychology. By 1873 teacher-education was granted the status of an independent department in many colleges and universities. By 1900, colleges and universities had assumed the responsibility of teacher-preparation at the primary and secondary levels.

The third period in the striving of teaching at the primary and secondary levels to achieve full professional status approximately began after 1900. The upgrading of normal schools to teacher-colleges had failed to bring unquestioned professional status to teaching at the primary and secondary levels. The literary efforts of Andrew Draper, the emergence of a body of professional literature on the methods of the German educator, Johann Herbart by Frank and Charles McMurry, Charles DeGarmo, C.C. VanLiew, and Elmer Brown, and the impact of the educational psychology of Edward Thorndike and the educational philosophy of
John Dewey immeasurably elevated the professional status of teachers.

The National Education Association through its Commission on Reorganization of Secondary Education, its Committee of Ten on Secondary Education, and its Committee on College Entrance Requirements has immeasurably highlighted the progress and needs of the professionalization of teaching at the primary and secondary levels. Another spearhead of the N.E.A. elevating this professionalization has been the establishment of the TEP's Commission or the National Commission on Teacher Education and Professional Standards which re-examines teacher selection, recruitment, preparation, certification, in-service training, and general advancement of educational standards. The N.E.A. also established the N.C.A.T.E., the National Council of Accreditation of Teacher Education, in 1952, which on invitation will evaluate teacher programs of colleges and universities. By 1965 twenty-four states had accepted the N.C.A.T.E. program. The American Federation of Teachers has made and continues to make available to members of the profession all progress, program news, etc., of the various commissions. The upward struggle still progresses for professionalization of teachers at the primary and secondary level, despite the rejection of Thorndike's Naturalism and Dewey's Pragmatism and despite the chronic shortage of excellent teachers. Speed in getting teachers into the classroom still tends to undermine quality of standards. 185

In an article, "The Teaching Profession: An Example of Diversity in Training and Function," Doctor Anderson of the University of Illinois made the following observations for the slowness of teaching in achieving full professional status. According to Anderson, teaching, at the primary and secondary levels, in its advance toward professional status, has moved in a piecemeal and sporadic fashion. Because of its slow evolution, teaching has remained relatively unstructured and loosely defined. As yet, it lacks the symmetry and precision of older professions. Sadly enough, many teachers themselves do not agree on a true definition of their practice. Yet, one characteristic of teaching is certain – its diversity of function. Where there is diversity of function there will be diversity of training programs, hence, these are not coordinated, over-all accepted plans to maintain standards of the profession. This diversity of functions and training programs has led to all sorts of specialized work within the teaching profession. Thus, adjustments in training programs, dependent on local situations and needs, have varied and multiplied. In the United States, there are about twelve hundred teacher-training institutions; one hundred and twenty-five are called teacher-colleges; others are called junior colleges, four year state colleges, liberal arts colleges, or universities.186

The chief conducive factor of this diversity of function and training has been the national shortage of excellent teachers, and the resulting disastrous effects on training standards. The result is that teaching is not yet a unitary profession, but a composite of many functions and allied works, all lumped under the umbrella of one profession. Two over-all assumptions of teachers and institutions are that they have one adhesive quality, i.e., common concern for the advancement of education and the education of the pupil, and that regardless of whatever training programs are offered, all members have a sufficient, common degree of knowledge and experience in the pedagogy for the profession.

In 1961, these two assumptions by members of the profession were critically analyzed in a special report of the N.E.A., entitled, "New Horizons in Teacher-Education and Professional Standards." The basic analysis of the study was "who or what is profession?" The concluding directive of this study indicated that the teaching profession assume a major responsibility for the professional quality of its own personnel. The study revealed that the teaching profession at present has five major segments:

1. Those teaching in the classroom or carrying out professional activities of higher education.

2. Those teaching in the classroom or carrying out professional activities in pre-school programs and in elementary or
secondary schools.

3. Professional personnel in professional organizations directly related to teaching at any level.

4. Professional personnel in state departments of education and other governmental agencies.

5. Professional personnel in voluntary accrediting agencies for general and specific purposes.¹⁸⁷

The project further revealed that each of these segments has further divisions. The report concluded that at present the profession of teaching is not a unitary entity.

Another elaborate analysis of the varied roles of teachers was also made by Brubacher from the "Fourteenth Yearbook of the John Dewey Society" in 1957. The categories of roles indicated are:

1. **The teacher as director of learning.** This role demands the teacher to be judge of achievement, disciplinarian, creator of a moral atmosphere, counselor, member of an institution.

2. **The teacher as mediator of culture.** In this role the teacher is expected to be a member of the middle-class society, model for the young, an idealist pioneering in the world of ideas, a person of culture.

a participant in community affairs, and yet a stranger in the community, a person enroute, a public servant. 188

The result is that the teacher's roles provide him with a bewildering assortment of possible behavior patterns. The teacher, thus, is at once a disciplinarian and counselor, which is a role-conflict. He is to be a pioneer in ideas which may conflict with the role of a creator of a moral atmosphere. His ideas of the teacher's role may contradict with the ideas which the community maintains of the teacher.

Evident, also, is the fact that multiple teacher-training programs, at present, no matter how they dart hither and thither, cannot satisfy the community and/or the profession; thus the confusion of the ideal and the real activity of the teaching profession multiplies. The result, then, of the "lumping together" of teacher groups, professional, non-professional, semi-professional is not only diversity in function, but also an ever-growing confusion for members of the profession, a progressive deterioration of quality in standards, a lowering of academic and economic standards for the profession.

Some Directions toward Professionalization

Myron Lieberman, in his Education as a Profession, believed that the first step in achieving professionalization at the present time is to cease treating all groups as if they were united as members of the same profession.

profession. This would stop the superficial and self-defeating unity which teachers think binds them into one profession. Rather, let teachers, in whatever classroom level, be regarded as officially professional and all other specialists as members of a cluster of related but different professions. Even such "clustering" will not erase the dominant characteristics of diversity and guarantee the development of adequate programs of teacher-education.

Lieberman believed the teaching profession itself must play the decisive role in shaping the entrance to and the training programs of the profession. His report suggested legal, professional sanctions as necessary for the advancement of teaching's professional standards. Archibald Anderson similarly suggested that state certification of teachers could be a more powerful instrument for control than at present. Gradually, similarity in requisites in various states could become national standards for professional education. This certification-control has proven successful for other professions. Lieberman pointed out the current haphazard control of certification, divided in parts in one state among state legislature, board of education, departments of education, superintendents, teacher-training institutions. These groups should be unified.

This situation of haphazard-control of certification can be helped

immeasurably by the decisive participation of teaching itself in certification regulation. The teaching profession appears to be the profession with the least voice in licensing its own members. In 1952, in the then forty-eight states of America, all certification or state licensing-boards for medicine, law, and dentistry were made up of members of each specific profession. Only five states in that same year required the majority of the board of teacher-certification to be members of the teaching profession.

Such proposed member-participation and control by no means is meant to be a criticism of the efforts of the N.E.A. and its National Commission on Teacher Education and Professional Standards and similar groups, such as the National Council for Accreditation of Teacher-Education. However, the effect of these groups advising state boards on education, has, as yet, not been clearly seen.

The efforts of the teaching profession to achieve full professional status still remains a struggle similar to the situation ascertained by Draper in 1890, i.e., that there is too great a facility in obtaining the right to teach plus the laxity of national, state, local, and church groups in requisites for teacher-qualifications. 190

Anderson evaluated recent efforts of the programs to improve teacher-education to be little more than literature describing methods

and practices of programs for teacher-education, but hardly to the crucial point of solving the essential problem of the teaching profession, i.e., teachers too eagerly presuming to be professionals. Anderson further described this teacher presumption of the professional status of the teaching profession as an "Alice in Wonderland" activity, viz., running very hard to stay in the same place. Yet, hope is evident in what is the present stumbling-block of the teaching profession - diversity. Diversity can be inducive, can encourage experimentation, and can afford new opportunities for research on the professionalization of teaching.

Lieberman approached the question of teaching and education as a profession with a clever obliqueness. The author did not say "yea" or "nay" to the question of whether or not teaching is a profession; he obliquely stated that to be a profession teaching must insure that it wears the habitments, the clothing of the core-characteristics of a profession. The established professions, according to the author, have the schema or skeleton from which occupations striving for professional status can take procedure. The closest Lieberman came to openly stating that teaching is still an occupation on the way to professional status is in the preface of his work where he stated that an occupation, such as teaching, must as a group, participate in the movement to achieve profession. 191 Such participation cannot be accomplished until all

members understand the nature of profession and its problems; it is here that Lieberman began hammering his repeated cry that teachers must not assume they are full professionals.

Lieberman, before illustrating a definition or core-cluster of characteristics of a profession for teachers to pursue, indicated a correct distinction made by so few of the authors whom this study has researched, viz., an educator is the title given to many, such as an administrator, a member of education-personnel, such as principal, or a school librarian; a teacher simply does not belong to administrative personnel; he is only the qualified person behind the desk in the classroom. What makes an occupation become a profession is a complex of eight characteristics. For Lieberman, an occupation has become a profession when it exhibits the following characteristics: 192

1. A unique, definite social service. By uniqueness is meant one of a kind; it is definite and clear cut in its work area; it is a service essential to the need of society, i.e., this rendered service is so important to society's need that it is made available by practitioners to everyman regardless to ability to pay, racial or social rank. Such services had been given by the clergy in medieval, theocentric times. This enhanced the clergy's greatly organized profession. Today, education has a similar position based

192 Lieberman, Education as Profession, pp. 1-6.
on the belief that every child has the right to an education which must be made available.

2. **An emphasis on intellectual techniques in performing its service.** By techniques Lieberman meant the defining of a problem, the search for relevant data and the formalization of possible solutions. Most professions such as medicine demand physical techniques which are guided by intellectual techniques.

3. **A long period of specialization.** This means the study for years, after the B.A. degree; this general education becomes the basis of a specialized area which is primarily intellectual in practice. Many occupations demand years of physical training but little intellectual training.

4. **A broad range of autonomy for both the individual practitioner and the occupational group as a whole.** For Lieberman, the autonomy of the individual practitioner meant freedom to make one's own best decisions, i.e., not depending on someone else for decisions or directions, but free, personal skill, and judgment in a given situation. Group autonomy is freedom for the group to decide who enters the profession's ranks, the qualifications, the grounds for suspension and exclusion, the distinctions between ethical and unethical conduct. Occupations are regulated by external lay agencies rather
than by their own members.

5. An acceptance, by practitioners, of responsibility for judgments made and actions performed within the scope of professional autonomy. The professional individual and the professional group have this responsibility.

6. An emphasis on the service to be rendered rather than economical gain of practitioners. This is the work for the professional organization - the performance of the social service delegated to the occupational group. Service, not reward is the emphasis; service does not mean motives for practice; service means the practitioner cannot avoid certain obligations which take precedence over obligations in his personal life.

7. A comprehensive self-governing organization of practitioners. By this characteristic the profession is large enough numerically to set standards and to raise the economic and social level of practitioners. The organization, then, becomes a bumper between the demands of the public and the amount of compensation the practitioner might seek; the organization, thus, is essential as a lever to move an agency or the government on a point essential to the public welfare. Keeping a minority group in place in the interest of the less active majority is also an essential role of the self-governing group.
8. **A code of ethics clarified and interpreted by concrete cases.** The professional organization, by a code of ethics, can aim, control higher standards of performance and of conduct.

Lieberman's oblique thesis was a variation on the same theme of core-characteristics as suggested for profession by A.M. Carr-Saunders and P.A. Wilson. Lieberman was more reluctant than Anderson to state that teaching has much to achieve on the individual level for full professional status. His basic thrust definitely was that as individuals and as a group the teaching profession must be autonomous. Anderson and Lieberman are similar in not making a definite distinction between university teaching as a profession and secondary and primary teaching as a semi-profession.

**The Semi-Professional Status of Secondary and Elementary Teaching**

Anderson and Lieberman considered the teaching profession as one profession certainly in need of reform. The following authors, no more realistic than Lieberman and Anderson, saw the same reforms needed and presented their solutions.

Alma S. Wittlin, scholar of the Radcliffe Institute for Independent Study and Consultant of Educational Services, Incorporated, came right to her plan for reforming the torn professional fabric of teaching. She
indicated that Luther considered teaching as next in lofty service to mankind to the ministry. Great educators as Pestalozzi, John Amos Comenius, Johann Herbart, Johann Fichte, Frederich Frobel, naming only a few, who were inspirations and key-stones of the great Eighteenth and Nineteenth Century educational movement in Europe, certainly considered as professional the status of teaching at the primary and secondary level. Yet, as Wittlin historically proved, there was a "drag," a "club foot," something that kept teaching from enjoying the unquestioned professional position possessed by medicine, ministry, and law. Even today in the wonderous educational world of America the so-called teaching profession at primary and secondary levels is constantly the object of national criticisms. Wittlin pricked the heart of the matter, asking and answering why teachers have had low professional status in American society. She quickly distinguished that university teaching is not included in this century-old, base opinion. Wittlin, then, went back through the centuries seeking precedent causes for the present low conditions of secondary and primary teaching and discovered three causes - economic, political, and ambivalent human attitudes. In ancient Greece, for example, the Sophists were the equivalent of university teachers, professional, irreproachable, revered, although the term, "professional,"

did not exist at the time. Yet, the teachers who began the young student's early academic learning were considered so low in status that they were no more than custodians, walking the student from home to the school of the Sophists, and providing lunch and other comforts for the student and his professional Sophist. The ancient Chinese considered the teacher at the lower levels a man who failed intellectually in civil examinations and was thus qualified to teach. Russia considered the secondary and elementary teacher as a social misfit, or an expelled theological student. Prussia, site of so many great educational successes, dipped into the ranks of pensioned, invalid army men for teachers at the lower levels.

Immigrants from Europe, therefore, brought these attitudes to the new world. The bonded servant fetched just a little more money in colonial America than the less manually, physically skilled teacher. In Eighteenth Century America teachers barely earned enough to exist. Doctor Gerald L. Gutek in his work, An Historical Introduction to American Education, simply, but concisely delineates the plight of the lowly teacher living on alms, running Dame schools, victim of town and district school boards. In this early era the teacher, to qualify for a teaching position, had to be female, possessed of winning manners, showing patience in spirit, and incidentally possessing "tolerable"

194 Gutek, Historical Introduction to American Education, p. 12.
knowledge. The Nineteenth Century gave birth, briefly, to the monitorial schools, whose supervisors considered the teacher worthy of the wage of $1.00 per year. The advent of the Industrial Revolution of the Nineteenth Century in America, however, demanded more teachers numerically and academically. School and training centers grew, and, at last, the teacher of primary and secondary schools began to raise his status in society.

Thus, having established the low-status of teachers in history, Wittlin stitched the torn fabric of the professional cloak of secondary and primary teaching by asking and answering questions, such as Why did and still do people choose secondary and primary teaching as a way of life? Her answer was that for the vast number in the lower middle-class, teaching at the primary and secondary levels offered a socio-economic escape, advancement, higher wages, short-term preparation in comparison to teaching at the professional university level. Yet, wages were so low, status so wanting, that men could not, with personal dignity, finance a family. Thus, more and more women went into teaching. Wittlin's next question was, What discourages teachers from remaining and novices from entering secondary or primary teaching at the less than professional level? Her answer was that familial attitudes presented this level of teaching as fit for a girl. Naturally, this also implied that the female very often approached her work as teacher with a neutral attitude. More

modern causes of discouragement for teachers entering secondary or primary levels of education are the overloading of class-numbers, clerical duties, and out-of-classroom school projects. Wittlin then asked, How do we then get the best teachers into secondary or primary levels? Wittlin's solution was to extend the training period of teachers, give them more opportunities to research in their special fields, and initiate an entirely new mental health program designed to enhance and up-grade self-confidence and self-criticism. Wittlin was optimistic for the full professional status of teaching, especially for the American Negro, who as a group seem destined for the university levels of teaching, a strange mobility indeed, if contrasted with their mobility in other professions.

This investigation has selected Anderson, Lieberman, and Wittlin as the best sources on this particular point of the full professionalization of teaching. Other authors researched touched on the subject, but seemed to fall unquestionably victims to the old assumption that all teachers are fully professional. Anne Roe's work, The Psychology of Professions, came closest to the above-mentioned authors. Her approach was general, however, as she struck, then faded away from solving the problems. Roe asked a series of questions and gave answers for the choice of an occupation by an individual; such questions were, what does he like to do? What does he have the capacity to do? What does he try to do? What does he actually accomplish? Does his choice change with age, with social values and needs, and especially with a change in his
238

concept of self as a professional?\textsuperscript{196} This study must concede, however, that Roe did not particularize about teaching as a profession, but approached her study from the vantage of the psychology of teachers.

Conclusions and Implications for the Professional Education of Teachers

This study has stated its agreement with Anderson that diversity of function and shortage of excellent teachers are the greatest obstacles to establishing teaching as a full profession and eliminating the distinction of teaching as professional or semi-professional; Lieberman gave us the explanation or interpretation of the core-characteristics of profession seen through the prism of the complexity of teaching. It is the conclusion of this dissertation that autonomy for both the individual and for the group is essential. Candidates for the teaching profession must be fully indoctrinated on core-characteristics, especially in regard to autonomy and power of action as a group to overcome obstacles to full professionalization from within and without, such as the base opinion in history concerning lower echelon teaching, and the high estimation of university teaching. Autonomy, thus particularly emphasized, will clarify the role and relationship between well-meaning Parent-Teacher Associations, American Legion groups, school boards, public opinion and the teaching

profession itself.

Especially to be noted is that distinction between educators and teachers made by Lieberman. Autonomy cannot be overemphasized, as the key, not only to full professionalization, but also to the manipulation of teaching as a power-structure in society, an ideology antedating any other serious endeavor by man, save theology. New and veteran teachers must be educated to this concept, must be informed that professional autonomy is not opposed to, but is actually the basis of every aspect and structure in the whole of society. Teachers as a group and as individuals must not be satisfied with being told they are professionals by schools of education, but must have the personal knowledge of their professional accomplishments. Such satisfaction, such assumptions undermine their natural independence. The public and civic organizations must be educated to a knowledge of teaching at the primary and secondary levels, i.e., that the teacher is well qualified to make decisions with respect to the intellectual, emotional, even physical, and psychological well being of the student. Teaching and professional teaching organizations can best insure their autonomy by the education of and an insistence with Parent Teacher Associations, and other well meaning organizations that the teacher alone teaches, that para-educational employees, as well as school boards must not interfere with decisional autonomy necessary for successful teaching.

Further research on Wittlin's history of the low esteem of teaching at the primary and secondary levels is suggested by this
dissertation. It is the conclusion of this dissertation that diversity of function and excellent teacher-shortage, that break in the professional fence of teaching, are the root of the problem of professional teaching status this day.
Profile Study of the Profession of American Dentistry

In the research of this dissertation for a profile study of the profession of American dentistry hundreds of articles in dental journals on minor aspects of dental history were found. A search of the Stritch Dental College Library, Maywood, Illinois, revealed only five volumes written exclusively on the history of the American dental profession. One of the five histories was a history of Chinese dentistry; another was sketchy biographical material on American dentists. The Foundations of Professional Dentistry, by J. Ben Robinson, D.D.S., The Story of Dentistry, by M.D.K. Bremner, D.D.S., and A History of Dentistry, by Arthur Ward Lufkin, D.D.S. were excellent and, therefore, used as source materials for this study of dentistry.

Beginnings of Colonial Dentistry

Little has been written on the history of the profession and professional education of dentistry. From the authors researched it was learned that a few dentists, physicians, an apothecary, and three barber-surgeons did come to America in 1630 with the Pilgrim Colony from London.

William Denly was the only name of a dentist recorded in 1630. What modern dental historians know of dentistry in America, from 1630 to 1734, was learned solely from the advertisements placed by dentists in primitive American newspapers of the late Sixteenth and early half of the Seventeenth Centuries. Historians do agree that from the Pilgrim landing in 1630 to 1735 only six "tooth-drawers," as they were advertised, arrived from Europe; from 1735 to 1800 seventy-six more came to America, wandering up and down the Atlantic sea-board, as was the custom, staying in no one particular place, and mostly unknown to the other. Interestingly, Peter Hawkins, a black African "tooth-drawer" and preacher, was one of these. Paul Revere, however, was the first American-born "dentist"; he was trained as a metalsmith and through his work for other dentists learned enough dentistry to be accepted as a "tooth-drawer."

The first person of sufficient knowledge to practice dentistry as a profession was the French dentist, Sieur Roquet, in Boston, 1749. Until the advent of Sieur Roquet, American teeth were cared for by metalsmiths, such as Revere, or barber-surgeons.

Other professional dentists soon followed. James Daniel practiced in the New York area; Robert Woofendale from London, in 1766, was the first full-time professional dentist in Boston. John Baker, from England in 1767, commuted in practice between Philadelphia and Williamsburg, Virginia; Michael Poree, from France in 1768, practiced in New York and was the father of the professional dental journals as he began to write
for the New York Gazette, and the Weekly Mercury on December 11, 1769. His articles campaigned against pretenders to dental practice and crusaded for preventive dental hygiene through informative articles for the layman on dental care. Through his instructions on latest dental research and methods, professional dentists were becoming widely known.

The authors of the history of the profession of dentistry in the United States have agreed that Roquet, Daniel, Woofendale, Baker, and Poree brought to America from France and England the learned profession of dentistry, a specialization of medical and oral surgery. With these afore-mentioned men and only through them was the profession, the medical art of dentistry, established in America. All others, as barbers, metalsmiths, etc., cannot be classified as professional. These latter have been great obstacles to the full professional acceptance of dentists by fellow-physicians, surgeons, etc.

Through the writings of dental historians it is known that dentistry was not a haphazard effort in Eighteenth Century America. Yet, the information on the American profession of dentistry is disjuncted and sporadic. The first professional dentists immigrated from France and England, but lacked a professional organization. Thus, the early professional dentist was left with little or no contact as to the whereabouts, the identity, the work of colleagues. The lack of professional journals of dentistry has left little organized information for its history; historical information on the profession, in the Seventeenth,
Eighteenth, and Nineteenth Century comes to the dental historian chiefly through newspaper articles, as mentioned. Dental historians have listed for this early period eighty-eight professional dentists, European trained or trained by fully professional dentists in America; all eighty-eight practiced the art of oral medicine between the years 1639 and 1799, and ranged in location along the Atlantic sea-board, from Massachusetts, New York, The Carolinas, Virginia, Maryland, to Georgia. From reading newspapers and gazettes of this period, historians of dentistry in America have been able to identify the full core-characteristics of the profession and the professional education of dentistry.

Dentistry, originating in Europe among professional physicians and surgeons of the oral cavity, grew in America through the immigration of professionals to major American cities. From 1800 to 1840, dentistry achieved full professional status. Two distinct forces accelerated this growth, viz., the growing number of capable, well-trained, public-spirited dental surgeons, dedicated and conscientious in promoting the science and art of dentistry and the large numbers of charlatans who were ill-prepared and cared only for their own gain. These two forces clashed head-on with the result that the professionals soon grouped together to form the first journal, the first college of dentistry, and the first professional dental association. Dental literature especially concentrated on making the public aware of the presence of charlatans. Dentistry was not afraid to expose charlatans or to admit its own weaknesses. This honesty naturally
led to a raising of standards for aspiring dental students. Leaders in dental journals during this period were Leonard Koecher, Samuel Fitch, B.T. Longbotham. From the very beginning of their writings these men agreed that dentists were not physicians with formal medical training, but rather specialists in an autonomous division of medical service.

By the late 1800's, dentists ceased to be migratory and became residential to their practice, thus consolidating the possibility of professional intercourse, one with the other. In consequence, the resident dentist gave up the practice of advertising in newspapers.

The first literature concerning dentistry was written in 1801 by Richard Skinner of New York. Longbotham wrote the first text-book for dentistry. Between 1800 and 1840 forty-four dental treatises were published. Chapin Harris in 1840 wrote to explain the need of formal dental schools, a state legislated licensure for dental practice, and a professional dental association. As yet, there was no formal journal. By 1839, however, the efforts of the forty-four authors mentioned resulted in the foundation and publication of the American Journal of Dental Science.

Dental Education from 1800 to 1840

Eastern European medicine historically began the discipline of the medical student, which discipline was continued in Western Europe through the Middle Ages, but deteriorated into the master-apprentice relationship of the guild systems. Such a master-apprentice relationship was the
system of dental education employed, but not scrupulously observed by early American professional dentists. In 1787, courses for group instruction were given in anatomy, surgery, dissection, and midwifery by surgeon-dentists of Maryland. This is referred to by dental historians as the first form of dental school in America. The greatest educational factor for dentistry in America, however, was to be the private-tutor system, really a highly developed form of the European apprenticeship system. This system, though producing fine, professionally trained dentists, was a competing obstacle to the development of dental schools. In 1845, the Ohio College of Dental Surgery still gave advanced credit to students having had private tutoring for two years with a reputable practitioner.

Institutional dental training was pioneered by Horace H. Hayden, a former medical school teacher and a dentist. Eventually, the University of Baltimore College of Dental Surgery was founded by Maryland state law on January 30, 1840, after much emotional misunderstandings between the medical school of the University of Maryland and the proponents of the independent professional school of dentistry. The Baltimore College of Dental Surgeons, therefore, officially opened as an autonomous professional school of dental medicine in 1840, with classes beginning on September 22, 1840. This Baltimore college established the pattern of the highly professional dental education of today.

The Ohio College of Dental Surgery (1845) was the first professional
school to open in the Midwest area of steel, railroad, cattle and industrial cities, such as Chicago and St. Louis. Graduates of the Baltimore school opened professional schools of dentistry in Philadelphia, Boston, and New York. By 1870, more professional schools flourished. Thus, briefly, is the history of the formalized education of American dentists.

**Associations of Dentistry**

The state medical society of Maryland was the first to give attention to the licensing of professional dentists. As early as 1805, the medical and surgical faculty of the University of Maryland, using the charter granted by the Maryland legislature, officially declared dentistry as of sufficient importance to be licensed by medical authorities, thus paving the way for the establishment of the first medical school of autonomous dentistry in 1840. Appointed to the new Baltimore College of Dental Surgeons faculty were the highly professional dentists, Benjamin Findall, Thomas Bruff, B.T. Longbotham, Horace Hayden, Oliver W. Holmes, also a physician, and J.J. Comyn, who were to examine credentials of candidates seeking to practice the dental profession in Maryland. Hayden vigorously campaigned for the organization of all approved dentists into the dental association, called the American Society of Dental Surgeons, finally established on August 18, 1840. One by one, through example of the American Society of Dental Surgeons, state after state founded state-
dental-associations under the umbrella of this national society.

The invention of the dental drill in 1890 altered the economic and professional aspects of the profession of dentistry. In 1890, ten American professional dental schools existed. By 1920, eighty schools flourished with intense competition among students to enter the profession, for the dental drill had raised the financial potential of the profession. The vast numbers of students and the demands of the public forced the decline of deep study and preparation. Soon the country was flooded with poorly trained dentists.

World War I demanded the better training of dentists. In 1918, Congress established the U.S. Army Dental Reserve Corps. Candidates were classified by "A" ratings depending on the government examination and critical classification of dental schools attended. The Dental Educational Council was formed by the government to make such classifications. Educational standards of professional dental schools soared after the war since the Council's "A" rating resulted in the life or death of a professional school.

By 1923, it was an accepted fact that professional dental education was on a par with medical professional education. What Abraham Flexner did for medicine was done for dentistry by Doctor William A. Gies, who at the request of the Ford Foundation for Higher Education, studied all professional and private dental schools. Gies amalgamated dental schools, examining boards, and the American Dental Association. Today dental
schools must have financial subsidies which they receive if they become, in time, integral parts of large universities; they must be free from medical school control, for dental autonomy is part of dentistry's essence and existence.

Conclusions and Implications for the Professional Education of Dentistry

Careful research by this dissertation of the card-catalogues and library shelves at the University of Illinois Dental Library and at Loyola Dental College Library revealed that very little research on the history of dentistry in the United States has been written although textbooks on the scientific branches of the profession of dentistry abound. The three histories written by Doctors Bremner, Lufkin, and Robinson were the best. From what has been researched in Chapter II, "The Moulding Forces of the Profession of Dentistry," page 127, of the dissertation, it is noted that most dental data have been researched by sociologists and educators, writing from universities with which the dental schools were affiliated. Except for the three doctors mentioned, no doctor in the dental profession has devoted much time to the background or history of American dentistry. Doctor Edward Chmiel of Loyola-Stritch Dental School, Loyola University, concluded that this is inevitable, since there is a shortage of dentists who, as students, have little time for any but required studies and who, as practitioners, have overcrowded schedules and barely enough time to
keep up with reading the latest progress of the professional techniques summarized in dental journals. Doctor Chmiel, who also works actively in alumni groups, pointed out that in 1969 almost forty dentists and alumni of Stritch Dental School died, while sixteen new dentists were graduated. Such vital statistics from only one school indicate the growing shortage of dentists, the increased demands for professional service, and hence, no time for dentists to become involved in research other than that pertinent to daily practice.

Available literature on dentistry in America mentions the effect of World War I and the formation of the Dental Educational Council, both of which upgraded dentistry and dental schools in their frenzy to obtain the class "A" rating by the government. Unfortunately, little bibliography could be found by this dissertation concerning the real impact of World War I and II on dentistry. The role of the U.S. Army Dental Corps in American dentistry is worthy of fruitful research. The impact of the electric drill on dentistry was noted, but again available literature is scant. As with graduates into the profession of medicine, the graduate into dentistry is required to present an acceptable thesis on dental research. During the research by this dissertation in the dental libraries mentioned no theses could be found. The suspicion of this dissertation is that somewhere these theses abound, for a search of Dental Journals reveals references to the fact that they have been written and enlarged upon by the journals. An organized bibliography and index of such theses
would be a signal help to dental scholarship.

Doctor William A. Gies was hailed as the "Abraham Flexner" of the dental profession and professional education of dentistry. What Flexner's report did for medicine, Geis' study did for dentistry. The study and results of the Geis Report are mentioned and praised by Robinson, Bremner, and Lufkin in their histories of dentistry, but in no great detail. The report was sought but never found by this dissertation at the dental libraries mentioned.

From the comparative chart of professions on page 127 of this dissertation's Chapter III, "The Moulding Forces of Profession and Professional Education," can clearly be seen the highly professional motivation, academic ability, scale of personal values, and personality characteristics of the American dentists. Much of the research was accomplished by sociologists and educators. These studies give the dissertation more insight to the profile of dentistry than the meager writings of the men in the profession. Along with engineering the profession of dentistry exhibits an overall stability during change, social and medical, and an upholding of the core-characteristics of profession.
Profile Study of the Profession of American Engineering

This segment of study concentrates on the profession of engineering in the United States. Carr-Saunders and Wilson began their study of engineering's history in England. No mention did they make, however, of the ancient skill of engineering which always existed, especially among the Egyptians, Greeks, and Romans. The afore-mentioned British authors did give a definition of engineering as "the art of directing the great sources or power in nature for the use and convenience of man."\(^{198}\) This much is known that the ancient craft or profession was learned by the apprenticeship system. The first formal school for engineering appeared in the Eighteenth Century in France, L'Ecole Des Ponts et Chaurses, where first began the relationship between the science and theory of engineering with the practical work of engineering. The French, Ecole Polytechnique of the Nineteenth Century became the model for science and engineering schools in the United States.\(^{199}\)

Early American schools of engineering were separate from universities and demanded preparatory studies in chemistry, physics, 


mathematics, geometry, and practical specialized engineering principles. American engineering schools were either military or civil. The first schools were West Point Military Academy and Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, both founded in the first quarter of the Nineteenth Century. The industrial expansion of the United States accelerated the growth of engineering with demands for railroads, and mining techniques for the opening of the West. The growth of the electrical and steel industries today still push the rapid advancement of engineering. From 1802 to 1872, the number of engineering schools grew from six to seventy, aided immeasurably by the Morrill Land Grand Act of 1862. Naturally, curricula of that day cannot be compared with curricula of today. Much of the engineering of a hundred years ago was by trial and error. But, as technological inventions developed so did the educational processes of the engineering profession. More and more, engineering had to digest the knowledge of physical sciences. So great was the demand for engineers, that despite the growth of American schools of engineering, engineers were also educated in Europe from 1900 to 1925. Until 1935, the trend in engineering schools was to put little emphasis on shop courses, to decrease surveying and drawing, but to make great demands for the study of mathematics and physics. A second trend in the 1940's found engineering moving away from simple handbooks to graduate studies, aided immeasurably by the industrial impetus during and after the Second World War.
Engineering is that occupation in which a knowledge of mathematical and natural sciences gained by study, experience, and practice is applied, with judgment, to develop ways to utilize, economically, the materials and forces of nature for the progressive well-being of mankind. Such a definition leaves the student wondering where engineering, science, and technology begin and end.

Fields and functions of the American engineering professions are very specialized and have reflections of specialization in the curricula of professional schools of engineering. The oldest fields of the profession are civil, mechanical, electrical, chemical, and metallurgical engineering. The first four mentioned account for three-fourths of all B.A. degrees in engineering, two-thirds of M.A. degrees, and two-thirds of the Ph.D. degrees in engineering. So specialized are the engineering areas that in 1960, thirty-two different curricula were catalogued. Since specialization is a high priority characteristic of engineering, there are multitudes of professional associations, yet all are united through the Engineers Council for Professional Development and the Engineers Joint Council. The University of California at Los Angeles had led a

---


movement to simplify all engineering curricula. The functions of the engineering profession are quite diverse in such general areas as research, development, design, application, manufacturing, operations, maintenance, and business sales. Hence, the educational pattern of engineering is highly sophisticated. The prospective undergraduate must have four years of concentrated studies in English, four years of mathematics, two or more years of science, elective courses in history and social sciences and two years of study in a foreign language to earn the B.A. in engineering. 202

On the graduate level, higher competency in engineering is the aim, with mastery of basic engineering sciences based on analysis, judgment, and research, the ultimate accomplishment. The M.A. in engineering requires one year of full time study; the Ph.D. requires three full years. In 1960, 37,808 B.A. degrees, 6,989 M.A. degrees, and 786 Ph.D. degrees were earned in United States schools of engineering. Only the top half of the B.A. degrees were accepted for the M.A. programs whose best graduates were then admitted into the intense Ph.D. fields of engineering research. 203 Large engineering companies usually compete for graduate recruits by inviting professional schools to use their company facilities

---


for both student education and the research of teachers.

Some mention must be made here of the professional engineering schools. In the 1960's there were two hundred and thirty-eight. Purdue had the largest output with 1,099 B.A. degrees. M.A. degrees were offered in the 1960's by one hundred and forty-nine graduate schools of engineering, while sixty-eight schools awarded the doctorate. The National Science Foundation Survey, in the last half of 1950, noted that 72.8 millions of dollars were spent by the graduate schools on research alone in one year, some seventy per cent of the budget being supplied by the U.S. Government. 204 The Ford Foundation researched that in the 1950's, there were over twelve thousand faculty members in engineering schools, thirty-four per cent of the members were Ph.D. men. 205

The only external control of the American engineering profession is exercised by thorough accreditation and licensure granted by the Engineers' Council for Professional Development for all states. The Council will accredit professional schools only on invitation and each accreditation lasts for five years. Accreditation and licensure by the Council is extremely intense and specified. Internal control is maintained by the schools themselves through the interchange of ideas, projects and


surveys. Much of this is done through the American Society for Engineering Education with its monthly *Journal of Engineering Education*.\(^{206}\)

Despite its apparent productive, neat organization, engineering, as other professions, has problems, the greatest of which is how to adequately prepare the engineer to cope with the so rapid industrial changes. Should the four year program for the engineering B.A. degree be lengthened or should the M.A. be made the minimum degree for the profession - are prime questions. A second problem arises as to how to blend traditional learning and demands with the necessity of research. The changing industrial world also lays a heavy demand on the practitioner who can scarcely help falling behind in continued progress. The graduate schools do not despair but offer the solution that the engineer's training begin as early as the latter years of high school, thus reducing educational costs and gaining more study time for the student.

This profile of engineering is almost too brief, but only a profile study is made by this dissertation to portray the concept, definition, history, internal and external forces, problems, etc. of a highly organized, efficient profession. The comparative chart of various professions contributed by this dissertation presents a study of the motives and abilities of students and practitioners of engineering. A

\(^{206}\)Charles Riborg Mann, *A Study of Engineering*, prepared by the Joint Committee on Engineering Education of the National Engineering Societies, (New York: Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, 1918), Bulletin No. XI.
detailed study of the various fields of engineering - civil, military, business, etc., - although most interesting, is not the purpose of this dissertation.

Conclusions and Implications for the Professional Education of Engineering

As has been evidenced by this dissertation, the engineering profession seems most organized in core-characteristics. Most authors researched have been entranced by the knowledge-content of engineering, but say little, if anything, about engineering ethics. Professional associations control the education of engineering. This appears to be the reason for so little mention of professional ethics, for engineering deals only indirectly, but efficiently with the service of the public through the materials of the bridge, skyscraper, etc., hence it is free from the interpersonal relationships which so often presents ethical problems to other professions.

An implication for engineering education is noted in the peculiar practice of permitting engineering faculties to be made up of teachers who usually have had little field or clinical experience. This is explained, in part, by the fact that engineering deals with material structures, physical principles of science, and not directly with persons. Some future research is suggested regarding the psychology and motivation of the professional engineer. Such a study could be of interest and use
to others in profession who admire the knowledge, enterprise, dedication, ethics, organization, imagination, and efficiency of engineering. Bibliography on the profession of engineering is sufficient, but since this dissertation is historical in purpose it felt the lack of an appropriate history of engineering.
CHAPTER V

THE IDEAL EDUCATION OF THE PROFESSIONAL AMERICAN MAN

In the first four chapters of this research on the professions and professional education, the concept and definition of, the history, the moulding forces - internal and external - and profile studies of a profession and professional education have been expounded. Chapter V studies the ideal education of the professional American man.

The nature of a profession has been examined in the first part of this study. After an analysis of various authors investigating the concept and definition of a profession, Abraham Flexner's six criteria and the Carr-Saunders and Wilson core-characteristics for professions were accepted by this dissertation. Briefly, the six criteria given by Flexner of a profession were these:

1. Basically intellectual, carrying with it a great personal responsibility.

2. Learned, being based on special knowledge.

3. Practical, rather than academic or theoretical.

4. Technical, yet able to be taught.

5. Organized.

6. Motivated by altruism, the professionals viewing themselves as working for some aspect of the good of society.207

---

The core-characteristics as stated by Carr-Saunders and Wilson include the following:

1. Prolonged, specialized, intellectual training.
2. A technique, either scientific or institutional, based on natural science or study of human institutions.
3. Remuneration for professional service in the form of fee and not salary.
4. A sense of responsibility to the client.
5. Formation of associations to test competence and maintain ethical codes. 208

It is not the purpose of this study simply to name various occupations which meet these criteria or core-characteristics. This study will, however, propose the ideal education for the professional American man.

The ideal education of the professional man has been considered and examined throughout the history of the professions and professional education. One incontrovertible historical fact of the professions and professional education is that, through the years, programs for professional education have moved, however slowly, from a narrow, almost exclusive concern with technical and empirical knowledge, to a more theoretical treatment of specialized knowledge and an enlargement of the

prospective practitioner's general education. During this early period of professional education, the candidate learned the essential knowledge and skills through apprenticeship. The average professional man in America, then, during the latter half of the Nineteenth Century, really had no more formal education than that of the secondary school.\footnote{209} A very small minority of these apprentices, however, did attend liberal arts college prior to the professional school. As time passed, more candidates were found to have attended separate proprietary schools or universities. It is noted, though, that these institutions were highly technical and narrowly professional, in comparison to today's professional education.

The professional schools, as a whole, have gradually understood that the professional success of the practitioner cannot be divorced from fruitful and rewarding competency in the other activities of his life, such as civic and personal. The curricula of professional schools have, therefore, slowly developed in content to prepare the prospective practitioner of a profession for the varied activities of adult life. The curricula of the professional school now aims at ideal professional education, and, for the sake of analysis and study, can be categorized into the following four areas of curricula:

1. Broad, theoretical instruction, basic to proficient practice.

2. Specialized knowledge and technical skills which characterize and distinguish one given profession from the others.

3. General education outside the vocational field, needed by all citizens distinct from their chosen work to discharge their civic duties, to lead an informed and effective personal life.

4. Continuing education, both professional and general, to keep the individual intellectually alive and informed after he discontinues his higher, formal education.210

It is clear that such curricula does enrich professional competence. A brief analysis, then, of the four listed categories of education of the professional American man will help in an understanding of the ideal professional education.

**Broad, theoretical instruction**

The broad, theoretical instruction basic to proficient practice consists of two types of instruction. Included herein are, first, subjects which constitute the theoretical foundations of professional practice, such as bacteriology in medicine, materia medica in pharmacy, harmony in music, case work in social work, pedagogical methods in teacher-education, and, second, subject-matter not specifically related to the activities of a given profession, but essential to an understanding of advanced specialized instruction. Such subjects are zoology in medicine, botany in pharmacy, 

210 McGrath, "The Ideal Education," p. 283.
foreign language in music, physics in engineering, sociology in social work, and general psychology in teacher-education. It is noted, then, that the ideal professional education stresses the permanent theory and general principles of a subject rather than the acquisition of great masses of detailed fact which yearly grows. Using the permanent theories and principles basic to a subject, the professional can also learn valuable and lasting habits of self-education, critical analysis, and reflective synthesis.

Some faculties of schools of professional education have established core-programs for all their students regardless of their specialized, vocational goals, with emphasis on liberal arts courses during the freshman and sophomore years. These faculties believe that a program such as this re-orientates the student's thinking away from detailed facts to the comprehension of integrating principles of general utility. These programs help the graduate adapt to the conditions, ever-changing, of professional and daily life. Because core-programs demand greater responsibility from the student for his own education, he is taught habits of learning not from one book, but from many volumes of scholarly literature.

211 McGrath, "The Ideal Education," p. 284.
212 Ibid., p. 285.
Specialized knowledge and technical skills

Specialized knowledge and technical skills which characterize and distinguish one profession from the other are determined by the guiding principle that they are derived and related to the above-mentioned theoretical instruction. This establishes the connection between theory and practice and is accomplished, for example, in the internship years of the doctor.

The amount of such specialized knowledge and technical skills ought to be just enough to illuminate the broad, theoretical skill already learned. This learning must not be involved in the repetitious experiences so characteristic of the old apprenticeship practices. Only enough specialized knowledge and technical skills should be included in an ideal professional education to give meaning to the theories previously learned. In-depth specialization-training can be reserved for post-graduation education and the day-by-day activities of practice.

General education outside vocation

The third area to be considered in the ideal education of the professional American man is the general education outside the vocational field, needed by all citizens, despite their chosen work, to discharge their

civic duties, to live an informed and effective personal life. All higher education contributes to the professional and general education of the student. Some subjects of higher education deal more directly than others with the lives of professionals outside their daily work. These activities include affairs of the local, national, and inter-national scene, the making of a home, a family, and the engaging in recreational activities which enrich and stabilize life.

Various professional schools have already started such liberal or general education programs. Many agricultural schools, for example, devote 17 per cent of curriculum to liberal education; business administration schools allocate 39 per cent to liberal arts studies; 39 per cent of curriculum to teacher-education at the elementary level is devoted to liberal arts; 17 per cent of engineering curriculum is based on liberal arts programs; 36 per cent of secondary teacher-education is comprised of liberal arts programs. Schools of professional education of medicine, law, and dentistry present the best picture with three or four years of liberal arts programs. Students in medical and law schools oppose such a high percentage of their professional program being allocated to liberal arts studies for two reasons. First, the majority of students have a stereotype image of what their profession and professional education demands and have little concept of the ever-changing needs of the society they plan

---

to serve. Second, because of a lack of academic experience and foresight, they fail to see that the fabric of a profession is made up of many necessary threads, a liberal arts education being one of those essential fibers. This situation very often is the result of false motivation by faculty. A study by the Institute of Higher Education revealed that the faculty of nine under-graduate schools favored only liberal arts courses specifically related to specialized studies in the curriculum of higher professional education.216

The result of such restrictive study and motivation is socially significant. Such curricula send graduates out into this world as citizens inadequately prepared for the full discharge of professional, civic, and personal duties; no concept of the place of their profession in society's context, no understanding of the forces - political and social - shaping their professional destinies; no sensitivity to changes in American life marks the graduate into profession and continued practice. This is due chiefly to the ancient apprenticeship system of learning, which taught only the specifics of an occupation. Here, then, can be and often is, the harmful, social lag between educational policy and practice and the ever-emerging needs of society.217


Any program of general or liberal arts study will vary with the profession. Each profession, by means which are peculiar to its vocation, must aim at a minimum of general education for all candidates. The goals of this minimum of general education must be clear. An ideal objective could be the introduction of all students to the basic concepts, intellectual methodologies, and fact-sources in the major branches of modern knowledge, as the social sciences of sociology, economics, political science, history, literature, etc. The key ideas, major generalizations, and methods of these sciences must be presented in understandable form. Professionals, then, would be aware, at least, of key ideas which could help to begin solving problems of their daily lives.

Continuation of education

The fourth part of the ideal education, according to the categories delineated by the beginning of this chapter, is the continuation of education, both professional and general, which keeps the individual intellectually alive and informed after he has been graduated from his higher formal education. To achieve such proficiency in a profession and responsibility of citizenship, the problem of time arises. How much time in studies will this ideal professional education demand? Each year is a witness to one or another professions extending time to its education. Medicine now demands sixteen years after elementary school; dental, ministry, and law schools demand close to the same number of years. Medicine is
alarmed at the few numbers, and the lower incidence in academic ability of those seeking admission to its professional schools. Part of the decline is due to the increasing status and financial income available in other occupations, not requiring so much time for graduation into profession; part of the same decline is due to the soaring, almost prohibitive costs of professional study and to the slow rise of income after professional graduation compared to other occupations. Early marriages have also forced youth into "getting an early start" in an occupation instead of a profession. Such factors oppose extension of the time required for study in a profession. Yet, a profession, to develop the "complete" man and to benefit society and the professional man, must somehow include studies, not explicitly professional or vocational, in the "school years" which will prepare the professional to continue study after practice begins. Thus, there is the dilemma of extending time for the ideal education, or to integrate studies - professional and general.

At this point, persuasive arguments for both programs are being considered by professional education. Yet, the evidence balances in favor of the integrated program.

218 McGrath, "The Ideal Education," p. 298.
219 Ibid., p. 299.
Conclusions and Implications for the Ideal Education of the Professional American Man

The ideal education of the professional American man, as examined on the previous pages, provides the following conclusions:

1. The professional man is to receive basic technical knowledge and elementary skills necessary to enter the initial activities of professional practice. Such education must not leave the student with the belief that he is ready to operate professionally in high level areas.

2. Society has the right to expect those who receive higher professional education to be sufficiently dedicated enough to use their gifts to deal with civic problems of daily life on the local, national, and inter-national level. This expectation demands the programs of a professional education to include any studies necessary for the professional man's responsibility outside his profession. The education for a profession must inculcate the conviction that what is learned in the school is but the stepping-stone to professional competence. Such competence attracts to proficiency which is achieved by continuation of study after graduation. Graduation day must not be the day of intellectual death for the professional.

220 McGrath, "The Ideal Education," p. 300.
3. Professional education must aim at the principle that the man in profession must contribute to himself as an individual and to society. Self-development in all his activities must be the conviction of the professional graduate. Ideals can become realities, difficult to achieve, but enriching in accomplishment.
CHAPTER VI

PRESENT STATUS AND CONTINUING PROBLEMS OF PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION - THE FUTURE OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION

Research has been completed in the five previous chapters on the concept and the definition of, the history, the moulding forces, profile studies of the leading professions, and the ideal professional education of the American man. It was noted that in contemporary society, many men render special service to other men; this is the nature of the world of occupational work. When such knowledge and skills are of a certain order, it is called a profession; the transmission of this special knowledge and skill to succeeding generations is called professional education.

This sixth chapter of the dissertation on the professions and professional education will attempt to provide knowledge on the general dimensions of professional service - how many persons in the United States are rendering professional service to others; this then will indicate some current trends of professional education. The character of those institutions providing this type of professional education will be described, and current and continuing problems of the professions and professional education, as well as some predictions for the future of the professions and professional education will be made.

The accurate results of the U.S. Census of 1970 are still unavailable at this time, therefore, information and data for this study are taken from conclusions, estimations, and predictions made by different authors. That these authors making the effort to study the Census statistics for the
dimensions of professional service in the United States by using statistics of the 1950's and early 1960's were leaving themselves open to severe criticisms from scholars, historians, sociologists, and educators was the immediate reaction of this dissertation. There was a sincere, diligent effort on the part of this investigation to research these statistics, yet, the results were the same - little, if any, information was made available from the Census of the 1960's. Whatever studies and conclusions authors such as G. Lester Anderson, Blauch, Huddleston, and Armstrong have made are presented with the knowledge that they attempt to make estimations and conclusions on the available statistics. It is regrettable that more current statistics were not available for the work of the cited authors and the dissertation itself.

Dimension of Professional Service

Using the Census statistics available from the 1950 U.S. Census, educators in the mid-sixties estimated that 3.8 million out of 60 million persons, by Census definition, were already in professional work. This dated 1950 census cited five per cent of the male working population to be professional, while ten per cent of employed females rendered professional service to the American public. According to the 1950 Census, in technological America, the profession of engineering ranked first with claim on 24 per cent of all male professionals; accountants and auditors made up another 14.9 per cent; teachers, 13.0 per cent; physicians, 8.2
It is evident that the ancient learned professions still retained their time-honored positions. Female teachers in the United States, numbering more than 900,000 and constituting 7 per cent of the American female work force, were the single, largest professional occupational force with a 52.1 percentage. Nursing included 24.0 per cent of all females in a profession; musicians claim 4.9 per cent; accountants, 3.5 per cent; social workers, 3.3 per cent; and librarians, 3.1 per cent of females in profession. Certainly, the 1970 Census will reveal a greater percentage. This study noted that the available statistics from the Census of 1950 concerned themselves with established professions, and made no mention of the emerging semi-professions.

Dimensions of Professional Education

From the preceding segment, this study noted the number of teachers now teaching in colleges and universities to prepare these millions for profession, noted the billions of dollars invested each year in professional education, and noted the quality of professional education as vital to national welfare. It is important to indicate that in 1962, Anderson, using the 1950 Census estimated two thousand institutions of higher education would operate in the United States during the 1960's; one fourth

---

of these would-be two year institutions. The United States Census Office, carefully defining categories of institutions, reported 1,440 four year institutions and divided them as follows: 141 universities; 756 liberal arts colleges; 543 independent professional schools. The U.S. Education Report listed just under two hundred institutions engaged in professional education, yet admitted that many liberal arts colleges are multi-purpose institutions granting degrees in various fields.

The identification of institutions educating teachers is very complex in determining the dimensions of professional education for teachers, viz., of 334 institutions accredited for teacher-education in the 1960's, only one-third of these institutions granted teacher degrees. Thirty-three per cent of elementary and 37.3 per cent of secondary school teachers were university graduates; 23.7 per cent of elementary and 17.6 per cent of secondary school teachers were graduates of teacher's colleges; 43.3 per cent of elementary and 45.1 per cent of secondary school teachers were graduates of general colleges.


Another way of describing the dimensions of professional education would be to investigate enrollments and degrees granted by universities. The following is a table of statistics of Bachelor's and first professional degrees conferred in 1968.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PROFESSIONAL FIELD</th>
<th>NUMBER ENROLLED</th>
<th>PERCENTAGE OF DEGREES RECEIVED</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>82,892</td>
<td>22.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>37,669</td>
<td>15.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>35,332</td>
<td>9.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture and Forestry</td>
<td>9,556</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion - Education and Theology</td>
<td>8,830</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medicine</td>
<td>6,861</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacy</td>
<td>372</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL PROFESSIONAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>204,922</strong></td>
<td><strong>56.0</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NON-PROFESSIONAL FIELD</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Social Sciences (including Psychology)</td>
<td>34,933</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sciences</td>
<td>30,726</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English and Languages</td>
<td>20,576</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music</td>
<td>7,625</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL NON-PROFESSIONAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>93,860</strong></td>
<td><strong>25.7</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL DEGREES CONFERRED**          | **365,748**     |

**UNACCOUNTED FOR ON LIST**          | **66,966**      |

---

The problems of professional education continue to multiply as the needs and demands within a profession and from the general public are made known. The ancient professions of medicine, law, ministry, and teaching, particularly at the primary and secondary levels, are caught up in educational ferment; engineering, business, and the emerging semi-professions have the same problems. This study lists problems of professional education in general terms, and is confident that each profession, knowing its responsibility, is concerned with individual solutions. Each profession must cast a glance at what other professions are doing for new ideas and approaches to solutions specific to its practice. Some of these problems, applicable to all the professions and their areas of education, are the following:

1. **The problem of finding objectives.** The older professions, despite their stability, must be alert to alter their objectives with the change of time and world conditions. Newer professions have at least one major task-objective - the achievement of status and stability to meet the objectives of that profession and the demands of the society which that profession serves.

2. **The problem of attaining uniqueness.** Each profession is unique in so far as it renders a service not rendered by others to

---

society. Uniqueness is attained through educational programs without hints of social withdrawal, or special privilege in society.

3. The problem of winning recognition or prestige. Without this recognition a profession is handicapped in its professional service, in its training of neophytes, in its finding a place of equality among professions and professional schools. This is a special problem of the teaching profession.

4. The problem of standards. Every profession implies service of a special order and quality. Rigorous testings of standards of a profession are rendered by society and other professions.

5. The problem of supply. Increasing demands for professional services require an increasing flow of persons into professions. Human talent is limited. The question arises then of whether the professions can keep pace as society's growing population increases its demands. To meet these demands professions may lower its standards. This is the problem found within the teaching profession today.

6. The problem of achieving reform. Reform is essential from time to time. Reform implies improvement. The history of each profession is a story of reform. Reform must be accomplished with a minimum of disruption and a maximum of achievement.
7. **The problem of specialization.** Herein is a great danger to profession, for specialization can lead to weakened professional structures, to fragmentation and diversity.

8. **The problem of university relationships.** The power of control of the university either by the professional school of the university and other departments is the ever-changing intramural conflict.

9. **The problem of autonomy in a university setting.** Existing as a part of the greater university complex brings conflict to the professional school, so great a part of this university complex. Just wherein such university government lies is the problem at present.

10. **The problem of relationship to liberal arts.** Fundamental knowledge of the liberal arts is necessary for a profession, but the question arises which of the liberal arts should be studied, and to what ends must liberal arts strive?

---

**The Future of the Professions and Professional Education**

The building of an unchallenged status of a profession or strengthening of old status is likened to the erection of any house of steel and concrete. Blueprints and construction materials are available; man-power for construction is specialized and available; all that remains is the problem of construction, to be understood, evaluated, unravelled,
and solved. To facilitate the understanding and evaluation of the problem and materials for the construction of the house of a profession some basic steps of structuring are suggested by this dissertation. The following conclusions can be made for the future of professions and professional education:227

1. Society's demands for profession and professionally educated persons will continue to increase, but these demands can be met without substantial change in professional education programs.

2. The professions, as now organized, will continue to grow, but with such modifications as occur through slow evolution, rather than through cataclysmic change.

3. Knowledge on which the practice of the professions rests will continue to expand.

4. The knowledge for the practice of a profession is too complex to be transmitted by "apprenticeship."

5. Professional people will be leaders in civic affairs.

6. The professions and professional education can satisfy both occupational and general aims as they aid students in obtaining knowledge and skills required by professional practice, and help them modify their personalities to the ends of that

practice. The professions and professional education can either directly or by collaboration with the rest of the university help students to achieve the aims of general education.
Conclusions and Implications for the Present Status, Continuing Problems and the Future of the Professions and Professional Education in the United States

Despite the fact that statistics based only on the 1960 U.S. Census were available at this time, the authors cited by this dissertation did give some prediction of the percentage of people actually practicing or studying for professions. The breakdown of male and females in profession, especially that of teaching at the primary and secondary levels indicated a subject for future research on whether females are barred, or discriminated against in most professions or why they choose teaching, the latter being the subject of much research now is progress.

The section dealing with the dimensions, numbers of professions affiliated with universities verified what this dissertation demonstrated in Chapter IV on profiles of the leading professions, viz., that the professions, the professional schools, and universities are mutually inclusive and beneficial one to the other. Just how beneficial and inclusive is a staggering study in itself! Bibliography indicates that study-results are already being published.

The section of Chapter VI treating present and future problems was most instructive especially the study of G. Lester Anderson. This monograph was well structured according to the concept of core-characteristics ear-marking occupations as worthy of the name of a profession. Comments and solutions by Anderson indicated that the problems submitted are signs
of vitality and growth within a profession, be it old, new, or just emerging into the service of the public. Anderson has a firm grasp of the concept, definition, history, and moulding forces of a profession and professionalization.
CHAPTER VII

CONCLUSIONS OF THE DISSERTATION ON THE HISTORY OF THE PROFESSIONS AND PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION IN THE UNITED STATES

This final chapter summarizes and concludes the research of this dissertation with areas for future investigation into the professions indicated.

The purpose of the dissertation was to depict the history of the professions and professional education in the United States. The significance of such a researched history was based on religious, economical, social, and political reasons, for in these areas, so essential to successful, happy, daily living, man has need of services from other men professed and accepted as qualified to render such services. This service so rendered is called a profession.

The hypothesis of the dissertation was to demonstrate that the European concept and definition of the professions and professional education were transferred to the New World and have continued the same in essence to this day becoming American in profession. The moulding forces of American professions, i.e., the force of the student, his concept of a profession and of self as a professional, the force of academic licensure, certification, and accreditation, and finally the force of society were studied. Profile studies of the professions of medicine, law, ministry, engineering, teaching, and dentistry were presented by the dissertation. These were selected, because they are the most popular and best exhibited the core-characteristics of a profession. The ideal education for the
American professional man was next demonstrated, as were the present status, problems - present and future - of professions and professional education in the United States.

Chapter I of this dissertation focused on the hypothesis that the European concept and definition of the professions and professional education have been transferred and continue in essence in the United States. To demonstrate this, the dissertation presented the research and work most accepted, knowledgeable, and up-to-date of Carr-Saunders and Wilson of England. The work of these English historians is described as "up-to-date," for, although written in 1933, it is the last acknowledged and comprehensive European study on the subject of profession. Only American educators, sociologists, and authors, who specifically researched the concept and definition of the professions and professional education in America were studied. It was immediately evident from these studies that the European concept and definition of the professions have been transferred and still continue in essence in American profession. These American authors did not consciously make a comparative study of the core-characteristics stated by Carr-Saunders and Wilson, yet their own analysis of characteristics in American professions coincided with the core-characteristics concluded by the English authors. It is the observation of this dissertation that no professional in the leading professions has made any study on the subject. The American authors agreed with this dissertation that the terms, "profession," and "professional education," are carelessly used and assumed to be known by the members of the profession and the public.
Chapter II presents the historical evolution of professions and professional education, and is a response to the query that if this is the accepted concept and definition of the professions and professional education, then what is profession's story, its origin, and its growth? Chapter II unravelled the thread of the professions and professional education from the historical fabric of the centuries of man's efforts to learn and his application of learning to the service of his fellows. It was concluded that this dissertation has made a valuable contribution to the professions by assembling authors of ancient and modern educational history and by isolating the concept of the professions in their historical evolution.

After the demonstration of the transference of the essential European concept, the definition of, and the continuance of the professions and professional education in the United States, the nature of the American professions was described. Chapter III analyzed the forces which mould American professions and professional education. Such forces as the student for profession, his concept of a profession and of self in a profession were studies to show the personality, the motivation, and abilities of the future professional American man. The lack of study on professions other than medicine, engineering, dentistry, and law was noted. The studies of moulding forces in the professions actually made by Helen Gee and Paul Heist were praised. Of most value and a future project for deeper research was the scale of the life values of students examined by Gee and Heist.
The moulding forces of American professions and professional education, viz., licensure, certification, and accreditation, were assiduously analyzed and objectively presented by this dissertation for their historical origins and controlling effects on the professions and professional education. The last moulding force analyzed was the control of society on the professions. Wherever possible studies have been made on society's influence on the professions and these studies have been isolated and presented by this dissertation. Very little, however, has been researched on this point and it is suggested for future study.

Chapter IV of this dissertation presented profile studies of the leading and most popular American professions of medicine, law, ministry, teaching, especially at the primary and secondary levels, engineering, and dentistry. As well as possible, the nature, the history, the growth, the problems, the educational programs, and the associations of American professions were isolated and analyzed. The professions of medicine, law, engineering, and dentistry appeared to be the most stable, most adaptive to the American life-style. Teaching, at primary and secondary levels, and ministry in America are obviously in a state of flux, tending to grow more professionally in certain areas and to diminish from a true profession's characteristics in other aspects. The changes, the problems of teaching and the proposed solutions of educators and sociologists were presented by this dissertation.

American ministry, so close and significant to the American life-
style, was the most difficult to present in profile. Almost every one of the core-characteristics of a profession as presented by English and American authors seem to be in a state of change and adaptation in American ministry. The term, "ministry," was used to include Roman Catholic priests, Protestant ministers, Jewish rabbis, and Greek Orthodox priests. The internal nature, the problems, the education of American clergy were scrupulously researched by this dissertation which at first noticed bias on the part of the clergymen analyzing and writing about their specific sects. On second analysis it was concluded that it was not so much bias, but rather an attempt made by these authors to show how the American ministry is adapting to fill the social, political, and religious needs of society. The result of such activity is leading to a more professional unity or brotherhood among clergy of various sects, which unity will strengthen and clarify the sectarian aims of American ministry. Teaching and ministry truly exhibit the American personality making its imprint on the ancient profession of theology.

Chapter V achieved the assembly, the isolation, the analysis, and the presentation of the ideal education of the American professional man. The emphasis of the authors studied and this dissertation's conclusion is that, beside the broad, theoretical instruction, and the specialized knowledge and technical skills necessary for the professions, a general education outside the vocational field and continuing education after entry into profession were vital to the personal and public life of the pro-
fessional American man. Earl J. McGrath, through his study, has opened new vistas of knowledge of the ideal education and the relationship between the professions and the university for this education.

Chapter VI researched the present and continuing problems of American professions and professional education. The presentation of the dimension of professions in the American life-style, the characterization of the educational institutions providing training, and then the current and future problems were carefully examined and evaluated, especially the list of problems, present and future, for professions as described by the study of G. Lester Anderson.

Finally, a careful and relevant bibliography has been assembled. As noted, bibliography for the concept and definition of American professions was limited to eleven authors who specifically focused on that concept and definition. Other authors cited throughout the text of the chapters indirectly indicated the transfer and continuance of the European concept and definition of the professions to America, as they pursued the main thrust of their individual themes concerning the professions or professional education.

Hopefully, a valuable contribution has been made by this dissertation, for no such comprehensive study since Carr-Saunders and Wilson has been initiated on the professions and professional education in the United States. True it is that many authors have studied various aspects of profession and professional education, but not for a comprehensive overview.
The research of this dissertation has assembled, isolated, and presented the essential and available facts of the American professions and professional education and a specific bibliography.

At the end of each of the six chapters of this dissertation specific conclusions and implications for American professional education have been made. Some suggestions for future research and some general conclusions of the dissertation are:

1. That the study has significance to American profession.
2. That the European concept and definition of the professions and professional education have transferred and continued in essence in the United States.
3. That eleven American authors cited in Chapter I are the best for the study of the nature of the American professions, and that men in the professions must become involved in the printed research of the history of and the nature of their professions and not be confined only to subject matter or the practice of their specific professions.
4. That many authors carelessly and inaccurately use the term, "profession." Let members of the professions, especially those of the teaching profession, be wary of such careless authors; let them know more of the history, the nature, the workings of their profession through study and knowledge of the forces moulding their professional life. The up-grading of standards
of the profession through accreditation, licensure, certification should be of prime concern to the members of the teaching profession.

5. That, although meager, the profile studies of the popular professions are valuable to the professional man himself and to other professions for emulation.

6. That much more research must be done on the history of ministry and dentistry. This dissertation was appalled at the lack of bibliography in the libraries of dental and ministry schools. For example, no history of the Roman Catholic Archdiocese is, at this writing, satisfactory. This dissertation concluded that a common knowledge of the history of the diocese, its past aims, and projects might be an aid in healing the misunderstandings between older and younger priests as both groups attempt to adapt their profession and professional education to the changing religious needs of society.

7. That the work and conclusions of Earl J. McGrath on the relationship of the professions, the professional schools, and the universities are not only most relevant, but certainly most conducive to future, in-depth research. Along with Becker and McConnell, McGrath has organized thoughts and plans vital to the over-all life of the professional man in America who can easily become the "complete" man in every sense.
8. That the outline of present and future problems of American professions deserve commendation and serious study by American professionals. To what G. Lester Anderson has concluded little can be added at present.

This dissertation has tried to make an initial contribution to the study of the professions and professional education in the United States. It has, at least, indicated the need for more investigation in the areas of various professions, so that both the professions and society might have mutual benefit.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


297


McGrath, Earl J. "The Ideal Education for the Professional Man." 
Education for the Professions. The Sixty-first Yearbook of the 
National Society for the Study of Education, Part II, edited by 

McGrath, Earl J., and Russell, C.H. "Are Liberal Arts Colleges Becoming 
Professional Schools?" Liberal Education in Professions. New York: 

Mead, G.H. Mind, Self, and Society. Chicago: University of Chicago 
Press, 1946.

Mead, Sidney. "The Rise of the Evangelical Conception of the Ministry 
for America - 1607-1850." The Advancement of Theological Education. 

Means, John Howard. "Homo Medicus Americanus." The Professions in 
America, edited by Kenneth S. Lynn. Cambridge, Massachusetts: 

Merton, Robert K., Reader, George G., and Kendall, Patricia L. The Student- 
Physician: Introductory Studies in the Sociology of Medical Edu-

Müller, George E. "Evolution of Medical Education in the United States." 
Education for the Professions. The Sixty-first Yearbook of the 
National Society for the Study of Education, Part II, edited by 

MacMillan Company, 1911.

Morgan, John. A Discourse Upon the Institution of Medical Schools in 
America. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1937. Reprinted from the 

Press, 1909.

Nakosteen, Mehdi. The History and Philosophy of Education. New York: 

Niebush, H.R., and Williams, D.D., with Gustafson, James M. The Advancement 
of Theological Education. Cooper Appendix, "The Theological Education 


Quintilianus, Marcus Fabius. Institutes of Oratory, Book XII, Chapter III.


Departmental Government Documents


The research dissertation submitted by Reverend John J. Ahern has been read and approved by three members of the Department of Education. The final copies have been examined by the director of the research dissertation, and the signature which appears below verifies the fact that any necessary changes have been incorporated, and that the research dissertation is now given final approval with reference to content, form, and mechanical accuracy.

The research dissertation is therefore accepted in fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Foundations of Education.

May 6, 1971

Signature of Advisor