Loyola University Chicago

Loyola eCommons

Master's Theses

Theses and Dissertations

2016

Global Human Trafficking: New Insights on an Old Crime

Joanna Surma
Loyola University Chicago

LOYOLA UNIVERSITY CHICAGO

GLOBAL HUMAN TRAFFICKING:

NEW INSIGHTS ON AN OLD CRIME

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO

THE FACULTY OF THE GRADUATE SCHOOL

IN CANDIDACY FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF ARTS

PROGRAM IN POLITICAL SCIENCE

BY

JOANNA SURMA

CHICAGO, IL

DECEMBER 2016

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

To my mother and late father, without whom none of this would be possible.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES

ABSTRACT

Thousands of men, women, and children become victims to human trafficking each year. Almost every country in the world is affected by this heinous crime. Human trafficking exists in many different forms including sexual exploitation, slavery, forced labor or servitude, the removal of organs, child soldiers, etc. Despite the age-old practice being traced back to the 13th century, it continues to exist and even grow today. Unfortunately, not much research is available on the topic. Combating human trafficking is a growing priority for many governments; however, certain obstacles to data collection and analysis continue to exist. Recently, a new study was published by Richard Frank (2013), which offers a comprehensive look at different patterns of human trafficking and government efforts to counter it. The study focuses on different types of human trafficking as well as government prosecution, prevention efforts, and protective services in 179 countries from 2000 to 2011. This thesis utilizes Frank's (2013) data on human trafficking while testing new variables to determine whether certain conditions affect government responsiveness to the crime. Results show that a nation's Human Development Index score, level of unemployment, extent of democracy, and percentage of women in national parliaments are significant in affecting a nation's responsiveness to human trafficking. The study is mostly quantitative in nature and contributes to the growing literature on a topic that deserves more global attention.

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

The UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons,

Especially Women and Children defines trafficking as:

> The recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring, or receipt of Persons, by
> means of threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of
> fraud, deception, of the abuse of power, or of a position of vulnerability or of
> the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a
> person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.
> Exploitation shall include, at a minimum, the exploitation of the prostitution
> of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services,
> slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs.
> (UN Protocol, Article 3 (a))

Human trafficking is a heinous crime involving the exploitation of humans in a

variety of different ways, ranging from sexual exploitation to forced labor and organ

removal. In addition to violating human rights, it likewise poses a serious threat to

national security and affects the national economies of countries by increasing

organized crime and shadow economies (Belser 2005). It is a global issue, affecting

all geographical regions to some extent. While the international arena has created a

legal framework to combat this offense, not all states are compliant. It is unclear,

however, which factors contribute to states' enforcement of anti-trafficking

agreements. One of the greatest challenges in studying human trafficking until

recent years was the lack of reliable data. The subject of interest is, after all, a crime

in which victims and perpetrators are difficult to identify, depriving scholars of

being able to create accurate samples and studies. While data is acknowledged as not being completely reliable, scholars have continuously strived toward better estimation and understanding of the phenomenon. Given how widespread and severe this problem is, it is vital that progress is made towards more accurate research so as to increase understanding of the trend and consequently allow nations to create more effective strategies in combating it.

Human trafficking is not by any means a "new" problem. Its existence could be traced back to the ancient Greeks and Romans, throughout medieval times, during the white slave trade in the 1400-1600s, and up until the present day. , Human trafficking is one of the darker sides of globalization, as the crime appears to be increasing due to the ease of travel and lower transportation costs. Transnational criminals take advantage of these increased migration flows, hiding illicit trade within the significant movement of people across the globe. In addition to aiding traffickers with easy travel, globalization also resulted in increasing the disparity between the developing and developed world, the feminization of poverty, and the marginalization of rural communities (Shelley 2010, 3-4). This made certain populations more vulnerable to becoming victims of human trafficking.

According to the International Labour Organization, nearly 21 million people are victims of human trafficking across the globe. Sixty-eight percent of them are victims of forced labor. Industries with the largest number of forced laborers include agriculture, domestic work, manufacturing, and construction. Fifty-five percent are women and girls, while twenty-six are children. It is estimated that human trafficking and forced labor is a $150 billion global industry. The largest

number of forced laborers is found in the Asia-Pacific region with 11.7 million

(fifty-six percent) of the global total. Africa comes in second with 3.7 million

(eighteen percent), followed by Latin America with 1.8 million (nine percent) and

Central and Eastern European countries with 1.6 million (seven percent) (ILO

2016). In the United States, 136 goods from 74 countries worldwide were made by

forced and child labor according to the Department of Labor (Polaris Project 2016).

Sex trafficking is likewise a very widespread form of trafficking. It is not a

new phenomenon. One of the most significant examples of sex trafficking in the

twentieth century is Japanese "comfort stations" set up all over Asia in the 1930s by

the Imperial Japanese Army during World War II. Over 200,000 women from

various countries were sold as prostitutes to Japanese soldiers so as to provide

comfort during the war and ensure that they would not betray military secrets

(Whitman and Gray 2015, 12-3). Although examples of sex trafficking exist

throughout history, transnational sex trafficking was only acknowledged as a

serious problem within the last few decades. Sex trafficking is currently the most

prominent in Asian and European countries with approximately 600,000 to 800,000

people being trafficked every year. The biggest source countries for European sex

trafficking include Russia, Ukraine, and Estonia, while Norway, Germany, Finland,

the Netherlands, Ireland, and other affluent countries tend to be destination

countries. After the fall of the Soviet Union, unemployment and poverty ran rampart

throughout the region, resulting in a pool of young women as vulnerable targets for

sex traffickers, who made promises of high-paying jobs abroad (Whitman and Gray

2015, 13-4). However, the problem is not just confined to the east as it also poses a

serious threat in countries like the United States. In fact, an estimated one out of five endangered runaways in the U.S. is a victim of child sex trafficking according to the National Center for Missing and Exploited Children (Polaris Project 2016).

The problem of human trafficking was first addressed at the beginning of the twentieth century when the International Agreement for the Suppression of "White Slave Traffic" was signed and enforced in 1904. Its purpose was to protect white females from being forced or deceived into prostitution (Kangaspunta 2011). In 1927, the League of Nations changed the term "White Slave Traffic" to "Traffic in Women and Children" (Whitman and Gray 2015). Additionally, two major studies were conducted to measure the prevalence of prostitution and the criminals responsible for trafficking (Kangaspunta 2011). This was a significant step toward addressing the problem and gaining more knowledge on the issue. However, despite these efforts, numerous other crises took precedence on the global stage during World War I, World War II, and the Cold War. As human trafficking was mostly concentrated in Asia, it was reduced to a regional problem at the time. However, with the collapse of the Soviet Union, human trafficking from formerly socialist countries spread to other nations, thus becoming a global issue (Shelley 2007, 117). As a result, increased international efforts became visible in combating the problem.

With increased recognition of the severity of human trafficking, significant global responses became possible. In 1995, the United Nations held the fourth World Conference in hopes of bringing more attention to the crime and setting up programs and institutions to address it (Whitman and Gray 2015, 12). In 2000, the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime (the Convention)

adopted two supplemental protocols: the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish

Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children (the Trafficking Protocol)

and the Protocol against the Smuggling of Migrants by Land, Sea, and Air. Signed in

Palermo, these protocols were the first legally binding international documents,

which allowed ratifying states to adopt measures against transnational organized

crime (Avdeyeva 2012, 298). Recognizing human trafficking as a transnational

crime rather than a human rights, migration, or security issue allowed for law

enforcement institutions to play a role in combating it (Shelley 2007, 116-7). In

addition to clearly defining human trafficking, the protocols also created domestic

criminal codes, adopted legal frameworks for interstate assistance, extradition, law

enforcement, and technical assistance/ training (Avdeyeva 298). In 2001, the United

States State Department created the Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in

Persons, which releases an annual report (TIP Report) focused on assessing

international efforts to combat trafficking. European nations also took positive

action towards anti-trafficking with the largest European Union (EU) conference on

Preventing and Combating Trafficking in Human Beings held in 2002 in Brussels.

The Conference drew together representatives from a variety of European

institutions, non-governmental organizations, and international organizations

resulting in the passing of the Brussels Declaration. Adopted by the EU Council on

May 8, 2003, the declaration outlines policy recommendations in the area of human

trafficking (Laczko 2005). Other nations have likewise followed suit and

strengthened or created their own domestic laws against human trafficking

(Amahazion 2015, 167).

The Trafficking Protocol went into force in 2003 with a significant number of countries adopting the legislation. However, enforcement of the legislation brings forth a different reality as the number of convictions continues to be very low. While some states chose to comply with the UN Protocol, others have largely ignored it despite their official ratification of the documents. It is unclear, however, which factors contributed to these varying levels of state compliance. Although many reasons for this exist, it is inevitable that the low response rate is somehow correlated with the complicated and hidden nature of human trafficking. Investigation of such cases is very time-consuming and requires countless resources. For some counties, it is not a top priority and therefore does not receive a high level of attention (Kangaspunta 2015). Surely, more explanations exist for the lack of enforcement in some countries.

The guiding research question for this study is which factors predict states' response to anti-trafficking. The study makes important contributions to the growing literature on human trafficking. It uses the newly compiled HTI dataset published in 2013 by Richard W. Frank, which compiles data on human trafficking flows between 179 countries from 2001 to 2011. The data for the dependent variables in this study – prosecution of perpetrators, protection of victims, prevention of trafficking, and an aggregate state response score measuring the prior three – is taken from the HTI dataset. Frank (2013) primarily relies on the U.S. State Department's annual *Trafficking in Persons* (TIP) reports along with other sources for robustness checks and analysis to compile this data. Avdeyeva (2012) uses these TIP reports as sources for her dependent variables (prosecution, protection,

prevention) in investigating state compliance with the UN Trafficking Protocol. However, her study focuses on the Eastern European and Central Asian states. Amahazion (2015) expands this study to a global scale, using the new HTI dataset; however he only focuses on states' enforcement scores as the dependent variable.

New explanatory variables are incorporated in this investigation, which were not prevalent in previous human trafficking literature. For example, in previous studies, economic factors were typically measured as GDP per capita or state openness. Neither of these variables yielded any significant results, however. This project, on the other hand, incorporates national unemployment rates as an explanatory variable, yielding much more significant results. Likewise, to the best of my knowledge, social factors measured by the Human Development Index were not accounted for in previous literature. This also turned out to be a significant explanatory variable.

The following section will present the most relevant literature review on the topic, followed by the methodology section, results, and final concluding thoughts. The appendixes contain supplementary information.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

Despite human trafficking being such a widespread issue, there is admittedly very limited data on the topic with few studies conducted on this problem (in comparison to other issues in international relations). Research on human trafficking is correlated with international awareness and concern of the issue. Studies only started getting published in 1995 and have been on the rise since then, with most being published after 2000. Studies on trafficking have been conducted in every region of the world with the bulk focusing on Europe and Asia. Most of the work on human trafficking was theoretical until recent years when the literature started including statistical analysis (Laczko 2005).

Dearth of Data

The reason for a lack of statistical analysis in this area of study is the dearth of data on human trafficking. However, collection of better data is essential to combating trafficking effectively. Relatively few states have systematically collected data on the crime, especially before the acceptance of an international definition on trafficking by the United Nations in late 2000. Prior to this, it was very common for nations to combine data on smuggling, irregular migration and trafficking, making trafficking data much less reliable. Given the lack of consistency, many earlier studies were considered guesswork. However, that did not pass without criticism

from scholars: the U.S. State Department received much critique for guessing the size of trafficked populations worldwide at the International Organization for Migration's Research Division Conference in Rome in 2004 without explaining the methodology used to arrive at such results (Laczko 2005, 11-2). The United States' TIP Reports have also been questioned for their accuracy and criticized as being ideologically and politically motivated (Amahazion 2015, 170). However, although data is acknowledged as not being completely accurate, the TIP reports are especially helpful since they provide comprehensive annual data on almost every nation in the world. Additionally, TIP reports became more accurate over the years with rigorous methodology, data collection, and analysis procedures (Gallagher 2011).

Trafficking is a clandestine activity with most cases going unreported, as victims are oftentimes reluctant of going to authorities. Law enforcement usually places low priority on human trafficking. Likewise, if a nation does not have any laws against human trafficking, the crime might get recorded under a different name. Additionally, as mentioned above, many countries may have unreliable data collection methods, resulting in more guesswork than fact (Laczko 2005, 12). However, this field of study is relatively new, therefore it may take some time to develop more accurate forms of data collection/ analysis. In the meantime, it is vital to continue developing new, innovative ideas as better studies may result in more effective combating efforts. As data collection started becoming more prevalent on human trafficking, scholars conducted studies, which lent some more clarity to the topic.

Tridimensional Approach

The international arena (namely, the Anti-Trafficking Protocol) promotes a tridimensional approach to combating human trafficking – prosecution of perpetrators, protection of victims, and prevention of future crime. As a result, TIP Reports, the HTI dataset, and a dataset developed by Cho, Dreher, and Neumayer (2011) measure state responsiveness in each of the three policy dimensions. However, states have not been equally responsive in each of these criteria, often focusing more energy on prosecution above all else. This results from states' restrictive immigration policies. Prosecution is usually a high priority for many nations as national security, illegal immigration, and the integrity of borders became more of a concern during the advent of globalization and industrialization. As a result, states favor the prosecution approach to human trafficking and neglect the protection and prevention dimensions (Amahazion 2015, 168).

Studies have confirmed that on average, compliance with prosecution policies tended to be the highest for all years worldwide. In their study, Cho et al. (2011) discovered that in 2000 the worldwide average score for prosecution of human trafficking was 2.9 and increased to 4.26 in 2009. Meanwhile, the average prevention score went from 2.53 (2000) to 3.67 (2009) and protection scored the lowest with 2.26 (2000) and 2.97 (2009) (10). Cho and Vadlamannatin (2012) confirm this finding in their study of state response to the Anti-Trafficking Protocol. They discover that prosecution demonstrated the greatest improvement over the

decade, however they also confirm the theory that prevention seems to be the first choice for states to comply with the Protocol.

Women and Gender Studies

Human trafficking severely victimizes women (Polaris Project). Therefore, the topic became an important issue in women's and gender studies literature, often pointing out how females become the "losers" in a globalized world, especially in third-world countries where gender inequality, poverty, and discrimination are prevalent (Lindio-McGovern and Wallimann 2009).

Liberal theories of states' compliance with international human rights laws focus on the importance of representation of interests in government. An argument exists that a government should have substantive representation from all groups within a society – including gender representation. Therefore, more women present within branches of government would lead to better communication of women's needs/concerns and result in more policies that would benefit women (Pateman 1998; Ross 2002; Avdeyeva 2012). Some scholars have attempted to test this theory. Lovenduski and Norris (1994) discover that the election of women into parliament typically results in significant differences, as females tend to have more leftist values. Bochel and Briggs (2000) likewise support this theory and reveal that female parliamentarians are more likely to bring up women's issues for consideration in parliament. Avdeyeva (2012) (2015) finds a correlation exists between more female parliamentarians and higher compliance with EU gender equality requirements in EU accession states.

The literature on female representatives and human trafficking, however, yields mixed reviews with some authors finding support for the argument that more female parliamentarians result in a higher state response rate for human trafficking, while others do not find any support for this argument. Avdeyeva (2012) finds support for this theory in her investigation of state compliance with the UN Trafficking Protocol in Eastern European and Central Asian states. Her results show that female parliamentarians positively influence compliance with the trafficking protocol. Similarly, Wittmer and Bouche (2010) discover that the presence of more female legislators result in an increased amount of human trafficking legislation passed from 2003 to 2008 in U.S. states. However, both of these studies were conducted on a regional scale. When attempted on a global scale, the results were much different. In their study Cho, Dreher, Neumayer (2011) do not find any statistical significance when using the percentage of women in parliament as an explanatory variable in analyzing the spread of international human trafficking policies. In the same way, women in parliament were not statistically significant for Cho and Vadlamannati in their 2012 study. When testing states' enforcement of human trafficking policies, Amahazion (2015) does not find support for the theory either.

Democracy

The level of democracy has often been used in the literature as a predictor of state responsiveness to human trafficking. The theory behind this lies in the idea that democratic governments committed to the rule of law and separation of powers are more likely to comply with international norms. In addition, domestic interest

groups put pressure on the government to comply with certain international legal obligations (Hetfer and Slaughter 1997). Likewise, governments that are more democratic believe in the protection of citizens' political and civil liberties, making them more likely to accept and enforce human rights policies (Simmons 2000). Hafner-Burton and Tsutsui (2005) find the level of democracy to be significant when examining the impact of the international human rights regime on individual states' human rights practices. Englehart (2009) demonstrates that states are not always capable of preventing human rights abuses, especially when a state is weak and failing and is unable to police effectively. His results show that both state failure and the level of democracy are important elements to consider when measuring states' capacity to preserve human rights.

In summary, previous literature has found that democratic governments are more likely to follow international law and protect human rights. However, the results are mixed when considering states' response to human trafficking. Some authors find it to be a significant explanatory variable (Cho et al. 2011; Cho and Vadlamannati 2012). In fact, Cho and Vadlamannati (2012) find it to be statistically significant across all three dimensions of human trafficking policy (prevention, protection, and prosecution). Other studies, however, do not yield any significant relationships (Avdeyeva 2012; Amahazion 2015). This means that states with violations of civil rights and democratic freedoms are still capable of being responsive to human trafficking policies. Given the lack of agreement on this topic, it is important to consider democracy in the current study.

Corruption

The United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime Report (2011) states that

corruption and human trafficking are both crimes that are highly intertwined yet,

the actual impact of corruption on trafficking is neglected in the development of

anti-trafficking policies (3). Previous studies test the relationship between a state's

level of corruption and its commitment to the protection of human rights. Scholars

argue that corruption inhibits human traffickers from being prosecuted and reduces

the rule of law (Avdeyeva 2012, 305). Bartilow (2010) claims that with increased

levels of corruption, the government and bureaucrats are no longer capable of

enforcing sound policies. This idea is further supported in the 2002 report

published by the Council of Europe, which provides an initial analysis of the issue.

Its findings suggest that opportunities for corruption definitely exist in the criminal

justice chain, trafficking chain, and victim support chain. Corrupt actors may include

police, embassies, customs officers, public officials, prosecutors, judges, financial

institutions, etc. Corrupt acts may include passivity (ignoring, tolerating), actively

obstructing investigations or judicial proceedings, revealing and selling information

(Council of Europe 2002).

In a later study, Zhang and Pineda (2008) measure the effects of corruption

on human trafficking with data from the US TIP Reports. Their findings show that

corruption only comes close to statistical significance, but does not cross the 0.05%

threshold. They blame this on a lack of data, however, and remain convinced that

corruption is probably the most important factor aiding human trafficking.

Avdeyeva (2012) tests if corruption has an impact on human trafficking, yet her

results, also prove insignificant. Cho et al. (2011) do find their corruption variable

to be significant, but only under certain conditions. Cho and Vadlamannati (2012)

do not find corruption as a statistically significant explanatory variable; however, an

indicator for the rule of law does prove significant. An increase in the rule of law

results in an improvement of government anti-trafficking policies. Based on

personal accounts shared by victims of human trafficking (UNODC 2011),

corruption is without a doubt, present in the process. However, it seems difficult to

prove in statistical analysis that corruption is a significant indicator of state

response to human trafficking policies. For this reason, the variable will be

incorporated in the present study.

Economic Factors

Previous scholarship has suggested that economic growth is a key factor in

general human development and welfare of a country. Furthermore, strong

economic development was found to have a significant, positive effect on human

rights conditions (Englehart 2009). A nation that is less economically developed

places less priority on human rights policies. A variety of different measures exist

for economic growth, however. Some studies utilize trade openness as a predictor

variable (Hafner-Burton and Tsutsui 2005; Amahazion 2015). Others use GDP per

capita (Hafner-Burton and Tsutsui 2005; Cho et al. 2011; Avdeyeva 2012;

Amahazion 2015). While Hafner-Burton (2005) find GDP per capita to be a

significant explanatory variable, Avdeyeva (2012), Cho et al. (2011) and Amahazion

(2015) do not. Trade openness, however, was not found to be significant in

explaining state response to human trafficking in any of the major studies

(Hafner-Burton 2005; Amahazion 2015).

Other studies took this one step further and split their samples by income

levels (Cho et al. 2011; Cho and Vadlamannati 2012). The results indicate that

upper-middle income countries and member countries of the Organization for

Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) have a higher level of compliance

with human trafficking policies. High-income, non-OECD states show a lower level of

compliance than low-income countries that are members (Cho et al. 2011, 11).

Income only appears to yield significant results when combined with the OECD

membership variable. Cho et. al. also include women's economic factors as an

explanatory variable, which yield significant results. Prevention and prosecution

policies appear to improve with better economic rights for women. Overall, the level

of a country's economic development appears to be a significant predictor, but only

if certain variables are used. It appears that women's economic factors show

significant results, while GDP per capita, does not.

Hypotheses

Studying states' varying levels of responsiveness to human trafficking is

valuable as it demonstrates which factors have an impact on states, thus allowing us

to understand why human trafficking continues to be an ongoing issue. Based on

previous studies, the following hypotheses were developed:

H1: Higher levels of corruption will have a negative effect on state response

(prosecution, protection, prevention) to human trafficking.

H2: Higher levels of human development will result in higher levels of state response (prosecution, protection, prevention) to human trafficking.

H3: Higher levels of unemployment will contribute to lower state response (prosecution, protection, prevention) to human trafficking.

H4: More women in parliament will result in state response (prosecution, protection, prevention) to human trafficking.

H5: Countries that are more democratic will also be more responsive to human trafficking (prosecution, protection, prevention).

These hypotheses will be further explored in the following chapters.

CHAPTER THREE

METHODOLOGY

Data

To empirically test the hypotheses stated in the previous chapter, I utilize a

dataset, which measures state response to human trafficking in 179 countries from

2001 to 2011 and add a variety of different explanatory variables to it. The data

section below describes the dependent variables, explanatory variables, and control

variable, followed by the empirical model section, which describes the statistical

model used for analysis.

Dependent Variables.

Four dependent variables are incorporated in this study, all of which

measure different aspects of state response to human trafficking. The first

dependent variable, state response, is an aggregate variable made up of three sub-

components: prosecution, protection and prevention (the second, third, and fourth

dependent variables, respectively). State response to human trafficking is composed

of different elements, therefore it was felt appropriate to measure the level of

impact the explanatory variables would have on each of these larger net variables.

Each individual country scores for the dependent variables are taken from

the HTI dataset, a new and comprehensive study in the field of human trafficking.

With fifty-five different variables, the study accounts for seven types of trafficking

18

(labor, forced prostitution, debt bondage, domestic servitude, child prostitution,

child labor, and child soldiers) and captures whether countries are source, transit,

destination states, or whether they have internal human trafficking. The main focus

of the study, however, is on state responsiveness to human trafficking. Although it is

acknowledged that state responsiveness many vary by type of trafficking, that

information is not yet available. The study, instead, measures government efforts to

prosecute traffickers, protect victims, and prevent future trafficking for all types of

trafficking (Frank 2013b, 6-14). The main sources for these measures are the U.S.

State Department's TIP reports, the United Nations' Office for Drugs and Crime

(UNODC) *Trafficking in Persons: Global Patterns* and *Global Report on Trafficking in*

Persons, and country reports from the Protection Project. Inter-coder agreement

among scholars and analysts who compiled and coded the data was 93.2% (Frank

2013a).

State response. State response is an aggregate measure of prosecution,

protection, and prevention scores collected from the HTI dataset (Frank 2013b).

Prosecution is an aggregate variable of domestic laws and enforcement score.

Protection is an aggregate measure of four variables: protection progress, formal

procedures to identify victims, victim protective services, and whether or not

victims are punished for acts committed. One variable is used to measure

prevention: minimal progress in preventing. Coding and reasons for selecting sub-

variables from the original dataset to create overall net variables are described in

further detail below. The overall State Response score is calculated as an average of

the three net variables.

Prosecution. Prosecution is composed of two variables: domestic laws and enforcement score. The first variable, domestic laws, is coded as 2 for "yes" if comprehensive laws prohibiting all forms of trafficking have been passed and came into force. (A country is still coded as 2 if laws were passed, but not enforced.) If a country report demonstrates that it has a law prohibiting one or more types of trafficking, yet lacks a comprehensive law prohibiting all forms of trafficking, the country is coded as 1 for "some." A 0 means that there is no mention of any laws related to human trafficking in a country report. A -1 is used to represent countries whose reports explicitly state that no laws exist which prohibit trafficking. (Frank 2013b) A significant trend is visible over the past decade of countries passing comprehensive laws against human trafficking. In 2001 only three states were acknowledged as having comprehensive anti-trafficking laws. By 2011, eighty-eight countries were listed (Frank 2013a).

The existence of domestic laws is vital for any country combating human trafficking. However, this indicator alone is not enough to capture whether or not a state takes the necessary steps to prosecute perpetrators of the crime. Oftentimes domestic laws exist, however, they are never enforced as they are considered a lower priority (U.S. Department of State). For this reason, the enforcement score is incorporated in the Prosecution variable so as to ensure that the variable is valid and properly captures a country's efforts to prosecute perpetrators of human trafficking, Nations are coded as 2 if the report shows that cases of human trafficking are fully investigated and prosecuted. 1 indicates that a country's enforcement is limited and weak. In other words, the country does not fully

investigate and prosecute cases of human trafficking. A 0 means that there is no

mention of law enforcement efforts against human trafficking in the country report.

-1 is used for countries that do not enforce domestic human trafficking laws.

The original HTI dataset also includes two more variables that indicate a

country's prosecution efforts: conviction information and people prosecuted.

Conviction information measures a country's transparency in reporting trafficking

prosecutions or convictions while the second reveals the number of people

prosecuted for violations of human trafficking laws (Frank 2013a). However,

conviction information is not always a very reliable measure as it is difficult to

gather information on nations who actively hide it or do not report on it. Likewise,

the number of people prosecuted in a nation does not necessarily mean the nation is

being more responsive to enforcing human rights protocols. Human trafficking

might simply be more prevalent in some nations than others. For this reason, only

the domestic laws and enforcement variables are incorporated in the aggregate

variable. Omitting the two above variables does not compromise the validity of the

aggregate Prosecution variable as the presence of domestic laws and their

enforcement are considered vital in capturing a nation's prosecution efforts,

whereas the other two variables, although informative, are not considered crucial.

Protection. Protection is an aggregate variable, which measures state efforts

at caring for victims of human trafficking. This indicator is vital for measuring state

response to human trafficking as it demonstrates a nation's dedication to preventing

future human trafficking of the people most susceptible: former victims. Caring for

victims of human trafficking prevents the crime from reoccurring by offering them

resources, which they may have lacked before becoming victims. The variable is

comprised of four sub-variables: minimal protection progress, formal procedures to

identify victims, victim protective services, and whether victims are punished.

Responses for all variables are coded as 1 meaning "yes", 0 meaning "no mention",

and -1 meaning "no'. The minimal protection progress variable measures if a

government has made any progress in protecting trafficking victims – this also

includes sustaining previous efforts. Protection progress involves rehabilitation and

reintegration government services for victims. The second variable measures if a

nation has formal, systematic procedures for identifying victims of human

trafficking. An example of this is a telephone hotline, which victims could call for

assistance. The third variable, victim protective services, refers to government-

sponsored programs for victims of human trafficking including, but not limited to:

medical and psychological services, shelters, work training, etc. In order for a

country to be coded as 1, the program must be funded, staffed, and operated by the

government, not a nongovernment or non-profit organization. However, a country is

still considered to be providing these services to victims of human trafficking if they

are through a non-trafficking-oriented, yet still a government-run institution (Frank

2013b). A positive trend is visible for victim protective services across the globe

with the number of countries in the world being coded as 1 rising from seventeen in

2001 to eighty-one in 2011. This trend, however, reversed in 2010 and 2011 with

fewer countries providing victim services (Frank 2013a). Lastly, this study identifies

that certain governments may punish victims of human trafficking for the acts

committed rather than the traffickers, themselves. If a country report demonstrates

that victims are arrested, imprisoned, fined, or deported by government or local officials, the country is coded as 1. All four of these variables describe different facets of victim protection – all of which are considered to be vital in providing comprehensive service for victims. Therefore, it was felt necessary to incorporate all four variables in the aggregate variable measuring government response to human trafficking via protection for victims.

Prevention. The prevention variable measures a government's effort at preventing future cases of human trafficking by working towards reducing both the supply and demand for trafficking. These efforts involve new educational and public awareness campaigns and programs. Most of these efforts must take place within a nation's borders in order for the country to be considered as making progress towards prevention (coded as 2). If a nation is found to be making limited or some progress, it is coded as 1. A 0 means no mention in a country report of any progress being made towards prevention of human trafficking. A -1 shows that a country report indicates absolutely no progress being made in efforts to reduce the supply and demand of human trafficking (Frank 2013a). Overall, from 2001 to 2011 a significant number of states made substantial efforts in this area. The number of countries coded as 2 increased from sixteen in 2001 to sixty-seven in 2011 (Frank 2013b). This is an important variable to incorporate in the study as it indicates how seriously a nation views this crime. If a nation is truly responsive to a certain issue, not only will it address the current situation, but will also make significant strides and dedicate resources towards future prevention efforts. The variable demonstrates each nation's commitment to the problem.

Independent Variables.

The following section introduces the explanatory variables of this study. They focus on political, social, and economic factors, which may play a role in state responsiveness to human trafficking. While some of these variables may have been used in previous studies, none of them were tested against the new HTI dataset and on a global scale.

Corruption Perceptions Index (CPI) score. Data for this variable is taken from Transparency International's Corruption Perceptions Index. The scores range from 0 to 10, with 10 indicating the highest level of corruption. Based on the previous studies and personal accounts shared by victims (UNODC 2011), one might conclude that corruption does play a significant role in global human trafficking; however, the results are not always borne out in statistical analysis. Nevertheless, corruption was not measured against the new HTI dataset and some studies use different data for their measure of corruption (Cho et al. 2011; Cho and Vadlamannati 2012). Based on the general agreement among scholars that corruption is an important indicator, yet lack of statistical evidence, the CPI score is chosen as an explanatory variable to be included in the study.

Unemployment. Previous scholarship concludes that a nation's economic development plays a significant role in its responsiveness to human trafficking. The logic is as simple as a nation with serious economic issues places less priority and resources into limiting human trafficking. Different predictor variables are used across scholarship to measure economic development. While some prove significant, others do not. To my knowledge, however, unemployment is not used as

an explanatory variable in measuring state response to human trafficking in previous studies. For this reason, it is incorporated in the present study. Unemployment may be a more appropriate explanatory variable, as it is a direct measure of how a nation's economy affects its citizens. GDP per capita accounts for both exports and imports; it measures consumer spending, business investment, and government spending. It is a measure consistently used in international studies, as it is a good indicator of economic development. However, a high national GDP does not necessarily mean low unemployment rate. When unemployment levels in a country rise, people become more desperate for work and therefore more vulnerable to falling victim to sexual trafficking and labor trafficking, whether that is internal or transnational. Likewise, when a nation faces domestic turmoil caused by high unemployment rates, they are less likely to focus energy and resources on protecting human rights violations, which are not a top priority. Data for unemployment is taken from the World Bank and calculated as a percentage of total labor force.

Human Development Index (HDI) score. A nation's HDI score is a significant indicator of its social development. It is a composite variable with three dimensions: a long and healthy life, knowledge, and a decent standard of living. The health dimension is measured using life expectancy at birth. Knowledge is calculated as the mean years of schooling for adults 25 years and older and the expected number of years of schooling for children of school entering age. Standard of living is computed using a logarithm of income (GNI per capita (PPP, US$).

Countries are ranked on a 0 to 1 scale with higher numbers meaning very high

human development.

It is hypothesized that countries with low levels of human development have

more vulnerable populations. Humans with low qualities of life and low levels of

education may not be aware of their rights and thus fall victim to traffickers more

easily. For this reason, HDI is chosen as the appropriate measure of social

development for this study. Data is used from the *United Nations Development*

Programme's Human Development Data. However, data for this variable (within

2001-2011) is only available for years 2005, 2010, and 2011. Omitting missing

values proved unfeasible since there were too many missing observations.

Therefore, missing data for years 2001-2004 was calculated as the average of 2000

and 2010. Since HDI data does not vary much from year to year, interpolation an

extrapolation is not that suspect.

Women in parliament. This variable measures the percentage of seats held

by female legislators in national parliaments. Mostly women are affected by human

trafficking, though certainly men are affected too. Some previous literature alluded

to the idea that the presence of females in parliament would result in more positive

legislation towards women. In other words, it is likely that the presence of more

female legislators will result in the adoption and enforcement of domestic laws

created to combat human trafficking. This variable yielded mixed results in previous

literature, however. Although not on a global scale, Avdeyeva (2012) finds that more

female representatives result in higher compliance with international protocols on

human trafficking. Likewise, Wittmer and Bouche (2010) have similar findings

when conducting a study in the United States. Other studies, however, found

insignificant results (Cho et al. 2011; Amahazion 2015). Data for this variable is

taken from the *World Bank's Development Indicators* (World Bank 2016).

Democracy. The democracy level in states has been used in previous

literature as a predictor of state response to human trafficking. Data for this variable

is pulled from the *Polity IV Project,* which creates an index ranging from -10

(autocratic government) to 10 (democratic government). I use the Polity2 index,

which is a revised version of the original Polity score that makes it more useful for

time-series analyses. This variable is widely used in political science and

international comparative studies. Again, this variable received mixed results in

previous studies. While some authors find it insignificant (Avdeyeva 2012)

(Amahazion 2015), others do not (Cho et al. 2011).

Control Variable.

Region. Certain regions in the world have a more advanced human

trafficking problem than others. Likewise, significant cultural differences exist

among different regions. . For instance, Muslim countries have fewer protections for

women in society while post-industrial societies have greater protections for

females. Previous literature states that poorer, less developed nations are more

likely to be source countries while more developed nations are typically

destinations (Laczko 2007). HTI data suggests that Sub-Saharan Africa and Asian

countries are more likely to be source counties than Europe or the Middle East -

which are typically destination countries (Frank 2013a). This variable is included in

the study to measure if there is any regional variation in responsiveness to human

trafficking. Since it has been determined that certain regions face higher levels of human trafficking, it would be logical for them to be more responsive to the crime. Or, on the other hand, the crime is more prevalent because they are less responsive. Likewise, poorer regions with lower HDI scores may place less priority on human trafficking since they are already dealing with more critical economic and social issues. Either way, this variable is incorporated to determine if any type of relationship exists between geographical region and state responsiveness.

Dummy variables are created for different geographical regions. They are coded as follows: Sub-Saharan Africa =1; Middle East and North Africa =2; South and East Europe =3; North and West Europe =4; Oceania =5; South and Southeast Asia =6; Central and East Asia =7; North America and Caribbean =8; Central and South America =9. North and West Europe is used as the indicator variable and therefore not presented in the results.

Empirical Model

A Random Effects model is used for analysis of the panel data, with the unit of analysis being county-year. The model employed is the following:

$$Y_{it} = \beta X_{it} + \alpha + u_{it} + \varepsilon_{it}$$

Where Y is the level of state response to human trafficking (measured as state response, prosecution, protection, and prevention in separate models). X is the independent variables that predict state response. U_{it} is the between-entity error and ε_{it} is the within-entity error. Two models would be appropriate in panel data analysis: the fixed effects model and random effects model. The rationale behind

choosing the random effects model is that variation across entities is assumed to be random, with no correlation between the dependent or explanatory variables in the model. In a random effect model, it is assumed that the differences across entities have some influence on the dependent variable.

The results are presented in two tables with four models in each. Each model in Table 1 represents a different dependent variable: overall state response, prosecution, prevention, and protection. Likewise, in Table 2, Models 4-8 represent the same four dependent variables used in Table 1: state response, prosecution, prevention, and protection. State response is an aggregate variable of the latter three variables. Prosecution, prevention, and protection are all very different elements that make up state response to human trafficking. I believe it would be beneficial to analyze the relationship between the explanatory variables and each different element that makes up state response in order to better understand the relationship if there is any. Table 1 contains all of the independent and control variables. Table 2, on the other hand, contains all of the explanatory variables and control variables besides region. Instead, it incorporates dummy variables for all geographical regions.

CHAPTER FOUR

RESULTS

The data analysis indicate some expected findings, but likewise some

surprising ones as well. Models 1 and 2 in Table 1 yield some highly significant

findings. In Table 1, Model 1 with the dependent variable being state response (the

aggregate variable for all three types of state response), unemployment, women in

parliament, and democracy are all significant. In Model 2 HDI becomes highly

significant at the p<0.001 level, along with unemployment, women in parliament,

and democracy. Region is even significant at the p<0.005 level. In Model 3

unemployment, HDI, and region are no longer significant variables, as only women

in parliament and level of democracy maintain their significance. In Model 4 the

only explanatory variable of significance is CPI. Even women in parliament and

democracy are no longer significant variables in this model, despite a consistently

strong in the previous three models.

It was predicted that more corruption would result in a state being less

responsive to human trafficking. CPI is significant at the p<0.01 level in Model 4 it is

questionable, however, why there would be a positive relationship between

corruption and the protection of victims of trafficking. With every one-unit increase

in corruption, there is a .0449065 increase in protection services. This trend also

exists in Models 1 to 3, however it is not significant. HDI only has a positive

correlation with prosecution (Model 2), which is what was expected – that as the level of human development increases prosecution of human trafficking also increases. However, this same trend was expected for Models 1, 3 and 4, but was not borne out.

A negative relationship also exists in all models between unemployment and state response, prosecution, prevention, and protection. The relationship is in the direction that was expected; with every one-unit increase in unemployment, there is a -.0091136 decrease in state response in Model 1 and -.0156803 decrease in prosecution in Model 2. Unemployment is not a significant explanatory variable for prevention and protection, however. Women in parliament is a highly significant explanatory variable for state response, prosecution, and prevention - not for protection. With every one-unit increase in female parliamentarians, there is an increase in state response, prosecution, and prevention of human trafficking. Democracy is likewise a significant variable for Models 1-3. As democracy increases, so does state response, prosecution, and prevention.

Table 1: State Response to Human Trafficking, 2001-2011

	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 4
Variable	State Response	Prosecution	Prevention	Protection
CPI	.0237458 (.0172845)	-.0278063 (.0210303)	.0516622 (.0310481)	.0449065 ** (.0151813)
HDI	.3966758 (.231462)	1.270738 *** (.2848566)	-.0247997 (.4064609)	-.0524186 (.2008055)
Unemployment	-.0091136 ** (.0037013)	-.0156803*** (.0044834)	-.0102679 (.0067135)	-.0007506 (.0032673)
Women in Parliament	.0079369*** (.0020251)	.0096721*** (.0024375)	.0118109 ** (.003726)	.0007511 (.0018012)
Democracy	.0140608*** (.0041646)	.0214564 *** (.005143)	.0185911** (.0073278)	.0046088 (.0036258)
Region	-.0151889 (.0104573)	-.032126 ** (.0130869)	-.00605 (.0177401)	-.0075125 (.0089061)
Constant	.3915326*** (.1141199)	.4577295*** (.1417676)	.8576457*** (.1968802)	-.1170454 (.0980346)
Observations	1310	1310	1310	1310
R2	0.1350	0.1534	0.0640	0.0612

*= p<0.05,   **=p<0.01,   ***=p<0.001
Coefficients with standard errors in parentheses

In Table 2, Models 4-8 incorporate regional dummy variables. The results for CPI are more significant in this table than in Table 1. A positive relationship exists between corruption and state response across Models 4-8. It is only significant, however, with state response, prevention, and protection as the dependent variables –this is not true for prosecution. Likewise, HDI also has a positive relationship with state response across all models. This time it is significant in

Models 5 and 6 with state response and prosecution as the dependent variables. As expected, a negative relationship exists between unemployment and all dependent variables. Again, it is significant with state response and prosecution as the dependent variables in Models 5 and 6. As in Table 1, women in parliament and democracy also prove to have a positive relationship across all models and are significant in Models 5, 6 and 7 with state response, prosecution, and prevention as the dependent variables. This time democracy is also a significant explanatory variable in Model 8 (protection).

As for region, it was hypothesized that states with a higher level of human trafficking, namely Sub-Saharan Africa and Asian countries would be more responsive to the crime. This is partially true, as Sub-Saharan Africa is significant across models 5, 6, and 7. South and Southeast Asia is also significant at the $p<0.05$ level in Model 5 (state response). South and South Europe is significant in Model 6. It is also worth noting that geographical regions that do not have a high level of human trafficking, namely North America and the Caribbean and the Middle East and North Africa, do not have any significant results. Oceania also yielded some significant results in Models 5 and 6 (state response and prosecution).

Table 2: State Response to Human Trafficking, 2001-2011

	Model 5	Model 6	Model 7	Model 8
Variable	State Response	Prosecution	Prevention	Protection
CPI	.0438883* (.019742)	.0017054 (.0237058)	.0767568 * (.0359196)	.0464324** (.0182022)
HDI	.6775097* (.3170852)	1.431104*** (.383748)	.8095467 (.5660145)	-.1630377 (.2912118)
Unemployment	-.0087649* (.0035979)	-.0149196*** (.0043329)	-.0110301 (.0065022)	.0004766 (.0033125)
Women in Parliament	.0070803*** (.0020773)	.0079302 *** (.0024858)	.0103957** (.0038177)	.001598 (.0019189)
Democracy	.0138144** (.0046414)	.0171856** (.0056255	.0186094 * (.0082365)	.0088511** (.0042586)
Sub-Saharan Africa	.3438833** (.1381235)	.3609592 * (.1702712)	.6777517 ** (.2353696)	-.0144778 (.1256764)
Middle East & North Africa	.0702829 (.1375687)	-.0579665 (.169242)	.1254289 (.2357272)	.1365104 (.1253057)
South & East Europe	.1860439 (.1188532)	.2950994* (.1467619)	.2544162 (.2014287)	-.0310313 (.1080427)
Oceania	-.3516856* (.1821551)	-.5130844* (.2251435)	-.4291902 (.3093675)	-.0882884 (.1655578)
South & Southeast Asia	.3225735* (.1353294)	.2864218 (.1675519)	.493034* (.2277493)	.1728394 (.1228506)
Central & East Asia	.2358616 (.138474)	.1496193 (.1707356)	.5691941* (.2353967)	-.0074177 (.1259657)
North America & Caribbean	-.1847699 (.1447206)	-.305106 (.1795914)	-.1859351 (.2422192)	-.0808995 (.1312272)
Central & South America	.1340725 (.1224863)	.0620206 (.1514228)	.3969147 (.2070139)	-.0907031 (.1112801)
Constant	-.1004138 (.2278225)	-.0101988 (.2790509)	-.1464598 (.3949416)	-.1273884 (.2079803)
Observations	1310	1310	1310	1310
R2	0.1801	0.1980	0.1071	0.0869

*= p<0.05,   **=p<0.01,   ***=p<0.001
Coefficients with standard errors in parentheses

Overall, the results show some expected results. CPI score was predicted to be a significant indicator of state responsiveness to human trafficking based on survivor accounts and logic. However, the variable's significance was difficult to prove in previous studies. It does show significant results in some models of this study, but not in the expected direction. HDI score and unemployment showed to be significant variables in state response and prosecution (only prosecution for HDI in Model 2) in the expected direction. They may not appear significant for prevention and protection as most countries default to prosecution when responding to human trafficking based on national security and immigration issues as mentioned above. The variables democracy and women in parliament are consistently significant variables across most models in both tables. This finding adds to the debate among scholars on the significance of these variables, determining that both are in fact significant predictors of state responsiveness to human trafficking.

CHAPTER FIVE

CONCLUSION

This study explores a fairly new research topic in the political science field. Although the crime in itself was prevalent throughout history, data on human trafficking was mostly unavailable until recent decades. There is still no guarantee that the data utilized in recent studies, including this one, is valid or reliable; however, it is the best that is available. Given the extent of the crime, it is imperative that research in the field continues so that nations may combat human trafficking more effectively. This study utilizes a newly compiled dataset, the Human Trafficking Index, in addition to new explanatory variables in measuring state response to human trafficking.

Corruption level was utilized as an explanatory variable of state response. It was predicted that as a nation's corruption level increases, its capacity to respond to human trafficking would diminish. This was difficult to prove in previous studies and is likewise, difficult to prove in this study. Although, the variable shows to be a significant indicator, it is not in the expected direction. Results indicate that as corruption level increases, state responsiveness to human trafficking (overall state response, prevention efforts, and protection efforts) also increases. These surprising results may be due to insufficient data. After all, since both corruption and human trafficking are crimes, no one truly knows or understands their extent. However, it

goes without saying that a state is much more capable of protecting its citizens against human rights violations without corruption in the mix. Given the difficulty of statistically proving corruption's significance in human trafficking, it would be beneficial for future research to further explore the complexities and underground nature of the variable, ultimately leading to a more efficient method of measuring the relationship between the two crimes. It is understood that the two go hand-in-hand, however, the extent and depth of it is unknown. Perhaps, combating corruption is the key to more effectively combating human trafficking.

Unemployment rate also presented statistical significance in the expected direction, confirming the working hypothesis. Different economic factors were used in previous studies on human trafficking. The most common one, GDP per capita, almost always proved insignificant. For this reason, unemployment rate was chosen as a more suitable measure for the study, given the likelihood that unemployed people would become easier targets for perpetrators as they make promises of income. Likewise, as the unemployment rate in a nation rises, economic recovery becomes a much more prominent domestic issue. Legislators become concerned with keeping the peace among disgruntled citizens and improving the state's economy, rather than spending extra resources on an issue that can wait. Overall, the results show that nations with better economies, marked by low unemployment rates, are more responsive to human trafficking.

The Human Development Index was likewise incorporated in this study. To my knowledge, it has not been tested as an explanatory variable against state response to human trafficking before. This was surprising since it is a very common

measure of human development in political science. As predicted, the variable was significant in the expected direction. As the HDI score increased, state responsiveness also increased. Theoretically, this makes sense since nations which are not as developed, most likely do not have the resources available to combat human trafficking. Development is a higher priority than human rights. Although human rights may increase as human development increases. This would also be an interesting topic to explore in future research.

Women in parliament and democracy both showed to be steadily significant variables in the expected direction. Both variables are significant in influencing overall state response, prosecution efforts, and prevention efforts. This shows that with more women in parliament, the state tends to be more responsive to human trafficking policies. In previous literature, this alludes to the idea that since more women are victims of human trafficking, females in parliament are better able to express these concerns in parliament, resulting in more efforts from the state. Democracy yields significant results across all elements of state response: aggregate state response, prosecution, prevention, and protection. Since democracies are generally more responsive to protecting human rights than authoritarian regimes, this theoretically makes sense. Overall, women in parliament and democracy prove to be highly significant explanatory variables of state response to human trafficking, putting debate in previous literature to rest.

As for the control variable, certain regions appear more significant than others, however, overall no region yielded any consistently significant results. The hypothesis that regions with a higher level of human trafficking would be more

responsive to the crime, was partially borne out as Sub-Saharan Africa, South and

Southeast Asia, and South and East Europe all yielded significant results. However,

they were not consistently significant across all variables.

Most variables (besides women in parliament and democracy) are only

significant with overall state response and prosecution as the dependent variables.

This is most likely due to the fact that states are generally unwilling to spend extra

resources unless it proves to be highly necessary or beneficial. In cases of human

trafficking, the crime poses a national security threat and border control issues.

States are more willing to respond to higher threats and therefore, are more likely

to default to prosecution efforts of perpetrators, as it is a straightforward and

relatively quick fix to the problem. Prevention and protection efforts take more time

and require extra resources. Since the lack of prevention or protective services for

victims of human trafficking do not pose a threat to the state, they will most likely be

ignored or postponed for later.

Human trafficking only gained extensive recognition in recent decades. It

appears that due to globalization and ease of travel, the crime is increasing.

Unfortunately, it will continue to do so unless states take appropriate action in

enforcing domestic anti-trafficking laws, prevention efforts, and protection efforts.

However, some states are more responsive than others. Scholars have been

attempting to determine which factors result in these differences; however, some

debate and inconsistencies continue to exist on the topic, largely due to the lack of

data. This study suggests that unemployment rates, HDI scores, the number of

women in parliaments, and the democracy levels of nations matter when

determining a nation's responsiveness. However, it is likely that other factors also

exist, which may have more significant impact on states. Ultimately, it is important

that new research continues to be conducted on this topic, which will hopefully lead

to higher state response and lower levels of innocent lives being abused.

APPENDIX A

VARIABLE DESCRIPTIONS AND SOURCES

Variable	Description	Source
State Response	Aggregate measure of prosecution, prevention, and protection scores.	Frank (2013)
Prosecution	Average of two variables measuring a country's prosecution efforts against trafficking: domestic laws against human trafficking and enforcement of those domestic laws. Both measures range from 2 (yes) to -1 (no).	Frank (2013)
Prevention	Measure of a government's efforts at preventing future cases of human trafficking. Scores range from 2 (progress is being made) to -1 (absolutely no progress).	Frank (2013)
Protection	Aggregate measure of four variables measuring a nation's protection efforts towards victims of human trafficking. The four variables include: minimal protection progress, formal procedures to identify victims, victim protective services, and whether victims are punished. Scores range from 1 (yes) to -1 (no).	Frank (2013)
CPI	The Corruption Perception Index (CPI) is a measure of national corruption ranging from 0 (least corrupt) to 10 (most corrupt).	Transparency International (2016)
HDI	The Human Development Index (HDI) is a composite variable measuring: life expectancy, education, and standard of living. Scores range from 0 (very low) to 1 (very high).	United Nations Development Programme (2016)
Unemployment	Measure of unemployment as a percentage of total labor force.	World Bank (2016)
Women in Parliament	Percentage of seats held by female legislators in national parliaments.	World Bank (2016)
Democracy	Scores measuring political systems ranging from 10 (highly democratic) to -10 (highly autocratic).	Marshall, Gurr, and Jaggers (2016)
Region	All nations are divided into geographical regions using the following codes: Sub-Saharan Africa =1; Middle East and North Africa =2; South and East Europe =3; North and West Europe =4; Oceania =5; South and Southeast Asia =6; Central and East Asia =7; North America and Caribbean =8; Central and South America =9.	-

APPENDIX B

DESCRIPTIVE STATISTICS

Variable Dev.	Obs.	Mean	Std. Deviation	Min.	Max.
State Response	1,587	.7581916	.5316234	-.9166667	1.666667
Prosecution	1,587	1.137996	.635131	-1	2
Prevention	1,587	1.121613	.9852406	-1	2
Protection	1,587	.0149653	.441186	-1	1
CPI	1,440	4.018896	2.141421	.4	9.7
HDI	1,859	.6579008	.1657487	.273	.941
Unemployment	1,534	8.378292	6.04127	.1	37.6
Women in Parliament	1,497	16.76359	10.4761	0	56.3
Democracy	1,493	3.735432	6.364198	-10	10
Region	1,587	4.15879	2.79862	1	9
Sub-Saharan Africa	1,587	.2470069	.4314067	0	1
Middle East & North Africa	1,587	.1178324	.3225112	0	1
South & East Europe	1,587	.1556396	.3626276	0	1
North & West Europe	1,587	.0951481	.2935118	0	1
Oceania	1,587	.0233144	.1509478	0	1
South & Southeast Asia	1,587	.1020794	.3028481	0	1
Central & East Asia	1,587	.0907372	.2873256	0	1
North America & Caribbean	1,587	.0516698	.2214293	0	1
Central & South America	1,587	.1172023	.3217625	0	1

APPENDIX C

COUNTRY BY REGION

Sub-Saharan Africa
Angola
Benin
Botswana
Burkina Faso
Burundi
Cameroon
Central African Republic
Chad
Comoros
Congo, Democratic Republic
Congo, Republic
Cote d'Ivoire
Djibouti
Equatorial Guinea
Eritrea
Ethiopia
Gabon
Gambia, The
Ghana
Guinea
Guinea-Bissau
Kenya
Lesotho
Liberia
Madagascar
Malawi
Mali
Mauritania
Mauritius
Mozambique
Namibia
Niger
Nigeria
Rwanda
Senegal
Seychelles
Sierra Leone
Somalia
South Africa
Sudan
Swaziland
Tanzania

Togo
Uganda
Zambia
Zimbabwe
Middle East & North Africa
Afghanistan
Algeria
Bahrain
Egypt
Iran
Iraq
Israel
Jordan
Kuwait
Lebanon
Libya
Morocco
Oman
Pakistan
Qatar
Saudi Arabia
Syria
Tunisia
United Arab Emirates
Yemen
South & East Europe
Albania
Belarus
Bosnia
Bulgaria
Croatia
Cyprus
Czech Republic
Estonia
Greece
Hungary
Italy
Kosovo
Latvia
Lithuania
Macedonia
Malta
Moldova
Montenegro

Poland
Romania
Russia
Serbia and Montenegro
Slovak Republic
Slovenia
Ukraine
North & West Europe
Austria
Belgium
Denmark
Finland
France
Germany
Iceland
Ireland
Luxembourg
Netherlands, The
Norway
Portugal
Spain
Sweden
Switzerland
United Kingdom
Oceania
Australia
Fiji
Micronesia
New Zealand
Palau
Papua New Guinea
Solomon Island
Tonga
Kiribati
South & Southeast Asia
Bangladesh
Brunei
Cambodia
India
Indonesia
Laos
Malaysia
Maldives
Myanmar

Nepal
Philippines
Singapore
Sri Lanka
St. Lucia
Thailand
Timor-Leste
Vietnam
Central & East Asia
Armenia
Azerbaijan
China
Georgia
Japan
Kazakhstan
Korea, North
Korea, South
Kyrgyzstan
Mongolia
Taiwan
Tajikistan
Turkey
Turkmenistan
Uzbekistan
North America & Caribbean
Antigua and Barbuda
Bahamas, The
Barbados
Canada
Cuba
Dominican Republic
Haiti
Jamaica
St. Vincent and the Grenadines
Trinidad and Tobago
United States
Central & South America
Argentina
Belize
Bolivia
Brazil
Chile

Colombia
Costa Rica
Ecuador
El Salvador
Guatemala
Guyana
Honduras
Mexico
Nicaragua
Panama
Paraguay
Peru
Suriname
Uruguay
Venezuela

REFERENCES

Amahazion, FikreJesus. 2015. "Human Trafficking: the need for human rights and government effectiveness in enforcing anti-trafficking." *Global Crime* 16 (3): 167-196.

Avdeyeva, Olga. 2010. "States' Compliance with International Requirements: Gender Equality in EU Enlargement Countries." *Political Research Quarterly* 63 (1): 203-217.

Avdeyeva, Olga. 2012. "Does reputation matter for states' compliance with international treaties? States enforcement of anti-trafficking norms." *The International Journal of Human Rights* 16 (2): 298-320.

Avdeyeva, Olga. 2015. *Defending Women's Rights in Europe: Gender Equality and EU Enlargement.* State University of New York Press.

Bartilow, Horace. 2010. "Gender Representation and International Compliance Against HumanTrafficking." *International Organizations.*

Belser, Patrick. 2005. "Forced Labour and Human Trafficking: Estimating the Profits, Working Paper (Declaration/WP/42/2005)." I*nternational Labour Office.* Geneva.

Bochel, Catherine and Jacqui Briggs. 2000. "Do Women Make Difference?" *Politics* 20 (2): 63–68.

Cho, Seo Young, Axel Dreher, and Eric Neumayer. 2011. "The Spread of Anti-Trafficking Policies – Evidence from a New Index." *CESinfo Working Paper no. 3376.*

Cho, Seo Young and Krishna Chaitanya Vadlamannati. 2012. " Compliance with the Anti-Trafficking Protocol." *European Journal of Political Economy* 28: 249-265.

Council of Europe. 2002. "Trafficking in Human Beings and Corruption, Council of Europe, 2005." Programme against Corruption and Organized Crime in South-Eastern Europe (PACO). Portoroz, Slovenia.

Englehart, Neil. 2009. "State Capacity, State Failure, and Human Rights." *Journal of Peace Research* 46: 163–180.

Frank, Richard W. 2013a. "Human Trafficking Indications, 2000-2011: A New Dataset." *Harvard Dataverse Network.* [https://dataverse.harvard.edu/dataverse/hti] Accessed June 2016.

Frank, Richard W. 2013b. "Human Trafficking Indications, 2000-2011: Data CodeBook." *Harvard Dataverse Network.* [https://dataverse.harvard.edu/dataverse/hti] Accessed June 2016.

Gallagher, Anne T. 2011. "Improving the Effectiveness of the International Law on Human Trafficking: A Vision for the Future of the US Trafficking in Persons Report." *Human Rights Review* 12 (3): 381-400.

Hafner-Burton, E. and K. Tsutsui. 2005. "Human Rights in a Globalizing World: The Paradox of Empty Promises." *The American Journal of Sociology* 110: 1373–1411.

Hathaway, Oona A. 2002. "Do Human Rights Treaties Make a Difference?" *The Yale Law Journal* 111 (8).

Hetfer, Laurence R. and Anne-Marie Slaughter. 1997. "Toward a Theory of Effective Supranational Adjudication." *Yale Law Journal* 107 (273): 337–66.

International Labour Organization. 2016. "Statistics and Indicators on Forced Labour and Trafficking" [http://www.ilo.org/global/topics/forced-labour/policy-areas/statistics/lang--en/index.htm] (Accessed October 2016)

Kangaspunta, Kristiina. 2011. "A Short History of Trafficking in Persons." *Freedom From Fear Magazine*. UNICRI. [http://f3magazine.unicri.it/?p=281] (Accessed October 2016)

Kangaspunta, Kristiina. 2015. "Was Trafficking in Persons Really Criminalised?" *Anti-Trafficking Review* 4: 80-97. [http://www.antitraffickingreview.org]

Laczko, Frank. 2005. "Data and Research on Human Trafficking." *International Migration* 43 (1/2): 5-16.

Lovenduski, Joni and Pippa Norris. 1994. *Gender and Party Politics.* Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Lindio-McGovern, Ligaya and Isidor Wallimann. 2009. *Globalization and Third World Women: Exploitation, Coping and Resistance.* Ashgate.

Marshall, Gurr, and Jaggers. 2016. "Polity IV Project: Political Regime Characteristics." *Center for Systematic Peace.* [http://www.systemicpeace.org/inscrdata.html] (Accessed June 2016)

Pateman, Carol. 1998. *The Sexual Contract.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Polaris Project. 2016. "The Facts." [https://polarisproject.org/facts] (Accessed October 2016)

Protection Project. "Country Reports." [http://www.protectionproject.org/resources/country-reports/] (Accessed August 2016).

Ross, Karen. 2002. "Women's Place in Male Space: Gender Effect in Parliamentary Contexts." *Parliamentary Affairs* 55: 189–202.

Shelley, Louise. 2007. "Human Trafficking as a Form of Transnational Crime." *Human Trafficking,* ed. Maggy Lee. 116-137. New York: Routedge.

Shelley, Louise. 2010. *Human Trafficking: A Global Perspective.* New York: Cambridge University Press.

Simmons, Beth. 2000. "International Law and State Behavior: Commitment and Compliance in International Monetary Affairs."*American Political Science Review* 94, (4): 819–83.

Transparency International. 2016. Corruption Perceptions Index. [http://www.transparency.org/research/cpi/] (Accessed June 2016)

United Nations. 2000. "The Protocol to Prevent, Suppress, and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, Supplementing the United Nations Convention Against Transnational Organized Crime." [http://www.osce.org/odihr/19223?download=true] (Accessed October 2016)

United Nations Development Programme. "Human Development Data" (1980-2015). [http://hdr.undp.org/en/data] (Accessed June 2016)

United Nations Office for Drugs and Crime. 2009. *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons.* Vienna: UNODC.

United Nations Office for Drugs and Crime. 2006. *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons.* Vienna: UNODC.

United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime. (UNODC) "UNODC report on human trafficking exposes modern form of slavery" [http://www.unodc.org/unodc/en/human-trafficking/global-report-on-trafficking-in-persons.html]. (Accessed May 2016)

United Nations Office on Drug and Crime (UNODC). 2011. "Issue Paper: the Role of Corruption in Trafficking in Persons." Vienna. [https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/2011/Issue_Paper_-_The_Role_of_Corruption_in_Trafficking_in_Persons.pdf] (Accessed October 2016).

Whitman, Amy and David H. Gray. 2015. "Transnational Human Trafficking." *Global Security Studies* 6 (3): 11-18.

Wittmer, Dana and Bouche, Vanessa. 2010. "The Limits of Gendered Leadership: The Public Policy Implications of Female Leadership on Women's Issues - The Limits of Gendered Issues." *APSA 2010 Annual Meeting Paper*. [https://ssrn.com/abstract=1643682] (Accessed October 2016)

World Bank. "Proportion of seats held by women in national parliaments (%)" [http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/] (Accessed June 2016)

World Bank. "Unemployment" [http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/] (Accessed June 2016)

Zhang, Sheldon X. and Samuel P. Pineda 2008. "Corruption as a Causal Factor in Human Trafficking. " *Organized Crime: Culture, Markets, and Policies.* New York: Springer.

VITA

Joanna Surma earned her Bachelor of Arts in Political Science, International Studies, History and minor in Polish Studies from Loyola University Chicago in 2015. She is currently a graduate student in the department of Political Science at Loyola University Chicago. Her concentration is Global Politics and areas of interest include Eastern European politics, gender inequality, and women in politics.