



7-2017

Antoine Destemberg, L'honneur des universitaires au Moyen Âge: Étude d'imaginaire social. (Le Nœud Gordien.) Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 2015. Paper. Pp. viii, 389; 47 color and 8 black-and-white figures, 7 tables, and 1 map. €32. ISBN: 978-2-13-059431-1.

Tanya S. Stabler
Loyola University Chicago, tstabler@luc.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://ecommons.luc.edu/history_facpubs

 Part of the [History Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Stabler, Tanya S.. Antoine Destemberg, L'honneur des universitaires au Moyen Âge: Étude d'imaginaire social. (Le Nœud Gordien.) Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 2015. Paper. Pp. viii, 389; 47 color and 8 black-and-white figures, 7 tables, and 1 map. €32. ISBN: 978-2-13-059431-1.. *Speculum*, 92, 3: 809-811, 2017. Retrieved from Loyola eCommons, History: Faculty Publications and Other Works, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/692449>

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Publications and Other Works by Department at Loyola eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in History: Faculty Publications and Other Works by an authorized administrator of Loyola eCommons. For more information, please contact ecommons@luc.edu.



This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-No Derivative Works 3.0 License](#).
© Medieval Academy of America 2017

the support of French clergy and particularly of the University of Paris. Consequently he accepted thousands of requests for benefices, always grouped in long rolls of supplications. William Courtenay and Eric Goddard edited almost *in extenso* these long *rotuli* of the University of Paris, sent to Clement VII in 1378–1379, 1380, 1382, 1385, 1387, 1388, 1389, and 1392, which represent an impressive number of documents published in more than a thousand pages. The editors also mention petitions of Parisian masters or students included in the *rotuli* of their protectors, cardinals, bishops and princes. As in previous volumes, the text of the petition is followed, when possible, by the response found in one of the two series of registers of papal letters (Rome and Avignon). In the footnotes, relevant references are given from other papal documents concerning clerics, and when these clerics are well known, the authors have added biographical details and a bibliography. Some prominent figures appear as petitioners, for instance Pierre d'Ailly and Jean de Montreuil.

The book is preceded by a brief technical introduction on the delicate problem of dating and the editorial choices that have been made, which are quite persuasive. Complemented by impressive indices for names of persons, medieval names of places, and modern names of places, these petitions and letters will allow historians to study recruitment at the University of Paris under Pope Clement VII, a subject that remains poorly known because of the absence of matriculation records. Each petition mentions the name of the cleric, his diocese of origin, his current or past studies, the grades he has earned (or which he is earning at the moment of the petition), in some cases his noble origin, his age, his parents' names and protectors, and, naturally in every case, his precise situation of benefice. As the authors note in the introduction, the few Italian, Flemish, German, and Scandinavian clerics who attended the University of Paris before 1378 joined the Roman party at the beginning of the Great Schism, but most then left the university. The few who were able to remain could not in any case be included in the records of petitions to Clement VII. Clement VII's registers and the Avignon documentation are all the more precious since the records of his Roman rival, Urban VI, have not survived. Because these records do not include friars, who did not send supplications, we can assume that the great majority of secular clerics studying or teaching in Paris from 1378 to 1394 are mentioned in the documentation published in this book (the index of names of persons includes about three thousand entries).

Thanks to Courtenay and Goddard's work in these first three volumes, the prosopographical study of the geographical and social origins, courses of study, income, and ecclesiastical careers of teachers and students at the University of Paris from John XXII's pontificate to that of Clement VII is now possible. More generally, these volumes are also a major source for understanding the papal chancery and the relations between the papacy and the University of Paris.

After this remarkable edition, the scholarly community can only hope for the publication of a fourth volume devoted to the pontificate of Benedict XIII (1394–1409).

NATHALIE GOROCHOV, Université Paris-Est Créteil, Centre de Recherche en
Histoire Européenne Comparée

ANTOINE DESTEMBERG, *L'honneur des universitaires au Moyen Âge: Étude d'imaginaire social*. (Le Nœud Gordien.) Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 2015. Paper. Pp. viii, 389; 47 color and 8 black-and-white figures, 7 tables, and 1 map. €32. ISBN: 978-2-13-059431-1.

doi:10.1086/692449

The publication of Jacques Le Goff's *Les intellectuels au Moyen Âge* in 1957 inspired numerous studies on the social position of the medieval university and the "self-image" of its scholars. Ian Wei and Serge Lusignan, among others, have published influential studies

drawing attention to the tangible aspects of the *universitaires*' claims to influence and recognition, specifically fiscal and judicial privileges and proximity to royal and papal power. Antoine Destemberg takes a new approach to university identity in a study focused on the concept of honor. Based on his doctoral thesis, Destemberg's book seeks to uncover the "semiotics of honor" that both structured and was structured by the university's relationships with powerful authorities and shaped the reputation (*fama*) of the *universitaire*. Starting with the tangible privileges, or "honors," rulers and popes bestowed upon the university, Destemberg borrows from sociological and anthropological theory to analyze the ways in which the possessors of these privileges—the *universitaires*—utilized the concept of honor to develop a distinct professional identity. In this respect, Destemberg's work pairs usefully with Serge Lusignan's "*Vérité garde le roy*": *La construction d'une identité universitaire en France (XIIIe–XVe siècle)*, which covers the same period and some of the same ground but approaches the question of university identity from a legal and institutional perspective.

The dialectical nature of honor is an important theme running through Destemberg's book. Honor as a tangible possession—lands, titles, judicial privileges—reflected claims to important intangibles, such as virtue, social standing, and influence. Those claims, however, required the recognition of others. Consequently, honor had to be continually communicated, fed with exterior signs (clothing and material possessions), rituals, and behavior, and discursively broadcast and defended. As such, honor was the collective responsibility of university members, who were both its beneficiaries and guardians.

Drawing on a range of written sources, from exempla to chronicles, as well as visual evidence and accounts of rituals and processions, Destemberg's aim is to uncover the social dynamics of honor and the creation of a new social identity through an analysis of the discourses and symbolic manifestations of academic honor. This aim dictates the author's choice of evidence, as well as the organization of the book, which eschews a chronological approach in favor of a thematic one. While Destemberg's study covers the twelfth through the fifteenth centuries, the nature of his sources results in a tilt towards the later Middle Ages, with some discussion of how the university's collective sense of honor broke down in the wake of significant political change in the fifteenth century.

Part 1 examines how medieval people conceptualized and expressed honor. Chapter 1 explores the relationship between the University of Paris and the royal and papal authorities its members sought to influence through an analysis of the well-known struggle between the French king Philip IV and Pope Boniface VIII in the early fourteenth century. Here, Destemberg aims to probe beyond the privileges popes and kings competitively bestowed upon the university, exploring instead the importance of the emotional relationships these privileges signified. The university, calling itself "Daughter of the King," claimed not just material privileges but a privileged relationship; specifically, university scholars expected to be called upon to give counsel to the king and to be able to petition the king personally when wronged. Chapter 2 considers the importance of the city of Paris—royal capital and center of learning—to academic claims to honor and as the physical space in which scholars communicated, particularly in the context of royal processions, their sense of their own distinct status and privileged relationship with the king. Chapter 3 employs a wide range of sources (exempla, sermons, and chronicles) to sketch a complex, contradictory picture of academic reputation, or *fama*. Of particular interest is the author's analysis of a sample of 122 published exempla featuring academics, most of which expressed harsh criticism of scholarly pride in their learning. As Destemberg shows, medieval *universitaires* were conscious of a widely held (and notably persistent) perception of scholars as overly prideful of their learning. The charge of vainglory, however, was hard to avoid when claims to political influence depended on claims to intellectual expertise.

Part 2 turns to the formation of an academic identity based on honor. Honor was not conferred simply through membership, since the protection and promotion of academic

honor required constant communication and negotiation. University members, then, needed to appear and behave in ways that enhanced the honor of the group. New students were immersed in a university *habitus* in order to properly manage behavior in ways that accorded with community identity and public perception. Chapter 4 focuses on the integration of the *béjaunes*—or freshmen—into university life, describing the rituals that marked the candidate’s movement from one stage to the next in an academic *cursus honorum*. These initiation rituals, which centered on the humiliation of the initiate, marked the *béjaune*’s transition from a rustic, uneducated “nobody” into a learned, honorable man. Chapter 5 describes the *cursus honorum* and its significance to the university’s self-image and reputation, as well as the role of exams and oaths in determining membership and cultivating loyalty to the community. Chapter 6 examines discourses of inclusion, namely the sermons and collations defining and celebrating the virtues the university claimed to embody. Chapter 7 turns to the significance of processions as a means of communicating the honorability that went along with academic rank. Chapter 8 rounds out this rich section, examining the role of memory in creating a common identity centered on honor.

Part 3 examines the ways in which competition and conflict shaped the expression and cultivation of honor, highlighting the tense relationship between the university and other powerful bodies as well as tensions internal to the community, particularly as individual scholars sought personal honor and became less invested in the collective. Chapter 9 demonstrates that attacks on university honor led to public demonstrations of the university’s dominance over social space and the demand for exemplary reparations. Of particular interest in this chapter is the author’s discussion of strikes as responses to attacks on university honor. Chapters 10 and 11 examine visual representations of scholars in manuscripts and seals, exposing tensions between representing the scholar as a “type” and representing the scholar as a distinct individual. Chapter 12 builds on the work of historians of gender, pointing to the importance of honor in expressions of masculinity.

The conclusion offers a chronological overview that the nonspecialist will find helpful, given the book’s thematic approach. Overall, Destemberg’s book is a thought-provoking and welcome addition to studies on the medieval university that adds considerably to our understanding of scholarly identity.

TANYA STABLER MILLER, Loyola University Chicago

JOHN DRENDEL, ed., *Crisis in the Later Middle Ages: Beyond the Postan-Duby Paradigm*. (The Medieval Countryside 13.) Turnhout: Brepols, 2015. Pp. xii, 368; 11 black-and-white figures and 23 tables. €90. ISBN: 978-2-503-54742-8. doi:10.1086/692445

The “Postan-Duby paradigm” is a shorthand term for a Malthusian interpretation of the crisis in the later Middle Ages proposed by Michael Postan and Georges Duby, which gained wide currency among economic historians in England and the European Continent from the early 1960s onwards. Postan was in fact slightly more Malthusian than Duby, as several authors in this volume point out. While Postan stressed the overriding importance of the tension between growing population pressure and the finiteness of agrarian resources, Duby was prepared to take account of the growth of trade and the role of towns as relevant (and to some extent alleviating) factors as well. Both authors agreed that an analysis of the relation between population and resources was key to understanding economic development in late medieval Europe.

The volume under review contains thirteen articles by English, French, Flemish, and Canadian historians that reflect on the state of the Postan-Duby paradigm at the turn of the twenty-first century and explore or suggest directions for new research. They do so in very