Using Texts as Mirrors: The Power of Readers Seeing Themselves

Amy J. Heineke
*Loyola University Chicago*, aheineke@luc.edu

Aimee Papola-Ellis
*Loyola University Chicago*, apapola@luc.edu

Joseph Elliott
*Elmhurst University*, joseph.elliott@elmhurst.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://ecommons.luc.edu/education_facpubs

Part of the Educational Methods Commons, and the Language and Literacy Education Commons

**Recommended Citation**

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Publications and Other Works by Department at Loyola eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Education: School of Education Faculty Publications and Other Works by an authorized administrator of Loyola eCommons. For more information, please contact ecommons@luc.edu.

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License. © The Author(s), 2022.
Using Texts as Mirrors: The Power of Readers Seeing Themselves

Amy J. Heineke, Aimee Papola-Ellis, Joseph Elliott

Using texts as mirrors is a powerful practice that can harness children’s identities to build community, enhance engagement, develop literacy skills, and engage families.

All children deserve to see themselves in texts. Sims Bishop (1990) describes a mirror text as one that “transforms human experience and reflects it back to us, and in that reflection we can see our own lives and experiences as part of the larger human experience” (p. x). In other words, a text serves as a mirror if the reader sees some aspect of themselves reflected. These reflections can be physical, cultural, or emotional (Johnson et al., 2018). Physical reflections prompt students to see themselves in the illustrations of a picture book or narrative of a novel. Cultural reflections invite connections between readers’ experiences, families, communities, values, traditions, languages, and religions. Emotional reflections inspire readers to connect with characters and classmates in various ways as texts provoke similar emotional responses. These reflections support engagement and efficacy in reading, learning, and understanding.

Children and adolescents who are part of dominant cultures and social groups have a long history of being represented within the texts they encounter, with many mirrors in their reading (Sims Bishop, 1990). Students of color and those whose experiences are not part of the so-called mainstream often find a lack of mirrors in their textual lives (Al-Hazza & Bucher, 2008). If children do not see themselves represented in texts, or if “the images they see are distorted, negative, or laughable, they learn a powerful lesson about how they are devalued in the society of which they are a part” (Sims Bishop, 1990, p. ix). This bolsters the need for texts that provide mirrors for students to see themselves, reinforce their identities, validate lived experiences, and tap into funds of knowledge to promote learning and literacy development (Al-Hazza & Bucher, 2008; López-Robertson, 2012; Medina & Martínez-Roldán, 2011). As schools grow increasingly diverse, teachers need to select and use texts that reflect and include all learners.

Incorporating Inclusive Texts in Classrooms

The focus on diversity in school text collections is not new. For decades, publishers and curriculum designers have sought to include multicultural texts to represent voices missing from the canon to develop awareness of cultural groups other than one’s own (Atkinson Smolen et al., 2011). But with surface-level explorations of cultural difference that center Whiteness as the norm, multicultural texts can be dichotomized with the so-called regular texts, further marginalizing persons and communities of color (Glazier & Seo, 2005). In recent years, the terms culturally relevant literature and diverse texts have become common in educational circles with stakeholders seeking to elevate texts by and about individuals whose experiences have been silenced or omitted in literary collections. The prior term emphasizes relevant stories that connect texts and readers, whereas the latter includes portrayals of people, places, and themes that reflect societal diversity in race, culture, and language (Boyd et al., 2015).

We use the term inclusive texts (IT) to capture both relevancy and diversity of portrayals spanning backgrounds, identities, experiences, and perspectives (Page, 2017; Pennell et al., 2017; Tschida & Buchanan, 2017). In schools,
inclusion refers to classrooms where all students, regardless of institutional labels like multilingual learners and students with disabilities, receive high-quality, grade-level instruction with scaffolds to support learning and access (Bui et al., 2010). When applied to children’s literature, inclusion means all learners have access to texts and materials that reflect their unique, complex, and dynamic lives. These textual mirrors do not stem from static demographic (e.g., Puerto Rican) or institutional labels (e.g., English- dominant peers) but rather children’s multifaceted identities with intersecting lenses on race, ethnicity, culture, language, ability, class, gender, orientation, family, and community. In this way, texts include relevant and authentic portrayals of a multitude of identities and experiences.

To harness their power and potential in classrooms, texts should serve as vehicles for students’ learning in daily classroom practice. In this way, texts do not simply occupy the shelves of the classroom library for an occasional read-aloud or independent reading. Instead, texts reflective of children’s identities and experiences mediate daily learning, literacy engagement, identity development, social–emotional well-being, classroom community, and more. But this approach requires teachers to find, select, and use an array of texts in response to their unique and diverse learners. To support this work, we have designed the IT framework (Heineke & Papola-Ellis, 2022). Drawing from our work with teachers in Chicago-area schools over the past decade, the framework provides ways for practitioners to thoughtfully select and use texts in classroom instruction that prioritizes students’ backgrounds and funds of knowledge as rich resources for learning (González et al., 2005).

The IT approach emerges from two key theoretical frameworks. Culturally sustaining pedagogy emphasizes the strengths, languages, and cultural practices of learners who have been historically situated as deficient from White, English-dominant peers (Alim & Paris, 2018; Ladson-Billings, 2018). This framework prompts educators to embrace children as unique and holistic individuals with strengths and cultural practices that are sustained and harnessed rather than erased and ignored in classrooms. In this way, teachers not only leverage students’ identities to reach predefined learning goals, but also seek to sustain them through purposeful pedagogy (Alim & Paris, 2018). Critical literacy seeks to disrupt the status quo in traditional schooling and promote social action, with learners delving into multiple perspectives to grapple with complex issues beyond the White voices traditionally prioritized in curricula (Morrell, 2009). This framework centers on teachers actively selecting and using texts and instructional materials that offer multiple perspectives on topics, investigate sociopolitical issues, disrupt the status quo, and lead to social action inside and outside of the classroom (Vasquez et al., 2019).

Drawing from these integral orientations to conceptualize and change educational practice for traditionally marginalized students, the IT framework involves four steps that can be flexibly used within any approach to instructional planning. The first step involves starting with students by getting to know children’s multifaceted identities and lived experiences beyond the static labels that often guide classroom practice. The second step probes learning goals to ensure that texts occupy a central role in the promotion of learning and literacy development. The third step is to select appropriate texts in response to both students and learning goals, prioritizing relevant and authentic portrayals that capture multifaceted identities and experiences. The fourth step is to thoughtfully integrate texts into classroom instruction with purposeful strategies and extensions for children to connect and make meaning. The IT framework guides the selection and incorporation of texts in ways that tap into students’ identities and experiences to springboard learning and progress toward curricular goals.

Using Mirror Texts to Support Children’s Learning

Texts can provide readers with mirrors to see themselves and windows to look into the lives of others (Sims Bishop, 1990). In this article, we focus on using texts as mirrors in culturally and linguistically diverse classrooms, recognizing the central importance of all children having reflections of their identities and experiences in texts. At the same time, mirrors for some students provide windows for others, which can lead to rich discussion, deeper understandings, and enhanced empathy in classrooms. Drawing from our research with teachers, the following subsections detail actionable classroom practices to enhance students’ learning and development. In each subsection, we (a) outline research supporting inclusion of materials that reflect readers and (b) introduce Chicago-area teachers who have incorporated textual mirrors in their classrooms using the four-part IT framework.

**PAUSE AND PONDER**

- How can texts reflect the unique identities and experiences of readers?
- How can texts as mirrors support readers and learners?
- In what ways can teachers strategically select and use mirror texts in instruction?
Building community
Textual mirrors can be used to build classroom communities where all students feel validation and a sense of belonging. In this way, a common text facilitates students’ reflections and sharing of their identities and experiences to begin to forge connections with one another. López-Robertson and Haney (2017) documented one primary teacher’s success in building classroom community using the text *The Best Part of Me* (Ewald, 2002) for students to explore, share, and value their peers’ different backgrounds and experiences. Glazier and Seo (2005) shared findings from a similar study with older students, centered on the memoir *The Way to Rainy Mountain* (Momaday, 2019). The book, which chronicles the author’s self-exploration into his cultural identity, prompted students to reveal their own identities and voices with their peers, particularly students of color who used the text as a mirror to share their own cultural backgrounds and stories. In both projects, teachers selected and used texts where students saw themselves and then used these self-reflections to build rapport and respect in the classroom.

In our research, we observed Claudia (all names are pseudonyms) use texts to build community in her fifth-grade classroom in suburban Chicago, which welcomed children from diverse racial, ethnic, and linguistic backgrounds. Claudia and her colleagues designed units with books for interactive read-aloud, as well as texts for students to independently read and engage with one another through book clubs. To begin their identity-focused unit early in the school year, they wanted a mirror text where all students could see themselves and connect with one another. They selected *Save Me a Seat* (Weeks & Varadarajan, 2018), a novel told in alternating voices between the protagonists who have different backgrounds but more in common than they first realize.

Claudia sought to build community by encouraging interpersonal connections with one another via the structure and plot of the text. To accomplish this goal, she asked students to bring in something that represented their identities in some way. Claudia first modeled this reflection and connection with her own identity, and then used the text as a springboard for students to discuss backgrounds and identities. As students shared, they found numerous connections to one another and excitedly discussed and expounded upon their common experiences with one another. This text and extension paved the way for exploration and sharing throughout the identity-focused language arts unit.

Enhancing Comprehension
The use of texts with relevance to students’ identities can enhance reading motivation, engagement, and comprehension. Cartledge et al. (2016) revealed that first and second graders preferred culturally relevant texts mirroring their racial and cultural backgrounds over non-culturally relevant ones due largely to the personal connections they made to the texts. Pilonieta and Hancock (2012) found enhanced comprehension when primary teachers read aloud texts reflecting African American students’ lived experiences. By evaluating the types of connections that students made to texts, they discovered that connecting the text to direct or related personal experiences comprehended at higher levels. Glass (2019) discovered that disengaged middle-grade readers had positive experiences reading relevant texts; in this study, students connected the text *Chess Rumble* with their experiences with home, community, and schooling to make meaning and engage with the text. With over half of the US student population comprised of students of color, these findings indicated that schools should prioritize high-quality mirror texts in classrooms to bolster literacy instruction.

Down the road from Claudia’s school, Flora facilitated a guided reading group with three fourth-grade girls from Filipino, Korean, and Puerto Rican families. Drawing from formative assessment data, Flora sought to nurture readers’ ability to tap into their own schema and background knowledge to make meaning of texts. She selected *The Year of the Dog* by Grace Lin (2007), a chapter book based on the author’s experiences as a young girl maneuvering Taiwanese and American traditions. Known as Pacy at home and Grace at school, the protagonist recounted stories about experiences inside and outside of school. Flora selected focal stories as stopping points for readers to connect with their own family traditions, cultures, languages, school experiences, and feelings. At one point in the story, a girl at Pacy’s school informed her that she could not be Dorothy in the Wizard of Oz play because of her ethnicity. After gasping out loud at the occurrence, Flora’s students shared that they also did not see themselves in texts or media, thus reinforcing the need for textual mirrors in her classroom. Noticing a marked increase in both comprehension and engagement, Flora continued using textual mirror texts for guided reading to tap into children’s connections and engagement to enhance reading comprehension.

Mediating Discussions
Mirror texts can also promote meaningful interaction. Research on literature discussions in primary bilingual classrooms has provided insight into how strategically selected texts mediate authentic reading, meaning
making, and talk. Drawing from two studies on literature discussions mediated by texts relevant to students from Latinx backgrounds, Medina and Martínez-Roldán (2011) described the “richly imaginative ways” (p. 259) in which children connect with texts via their myriad experiences, cultural ways of knowing, and language competencies. In collaborative groups, students used texts to make sense of their identities, as well as understand and connect with those of their classmates. In a study by López-Robertson (2012), findings showed how second graders used stories about their life experiences to connect and make meaning of texts, as well as make sense of their own and others’ experiences. Studies have converged to confirm that children should have regular opportunities to authentically engage with texts, allowing them to transact and connect with the text, as well as discuss these transactions and connections in flexible, collaborative, and multilingual classroom settings.

In a nearby Chicago suburb, Gina taught fourth grade in the building that housed all fourth and fifth graders in the district, where children from an array of cultural and linguistic backgrounds were just starting at their new school. She wanted to engage students in meaningful conversation around their identities and experiences, setting the stage for her interactive approach to literature discussions throughout the school year. Gina subsequently selected The First Rule of Punk (Pérez, 2017), a text that followed the 12-year-old protagonist navigating a new school, friendships, family issues, and self-discovery.

Gina saw the text serving as a mirror to all students, but in various ways: All students connected to Malú as the new student maneuvering her identity, some connected to the family separation between Malú and her father, and one connected to her Cuban and Mexican heritage. Since most students were multilingual, she called attention to the use of Spanish dialogue in the text, which students enjoyed discussing in the context of their families and home languages. Otherwise, Gina left meaning making open, allowing students’ varied connections and questions to emerge. These discussions continued in whole- and small-group settings across the school year to develop children’s reading and oral language by tapping into their nuanced lived experiences through texts.

**Encouraging Translanguaging**

Texts can also reflect students’ translanguaging abilities and identities. **Translanguaging** is both a theory of bilingualism and an instructional scaffold used to capitalize on the linguistic competencies of multilingual students. Teachers can incorporate bilingual and transliterary texts to enhance readers’ meaning making and foster inclusion around fluid and flexible language practices (García & Kleifgen, 2020). Research by Pacheco et al. (2019) revealed how one monolingual third-grade teacher implemented transliterary and transliteracy practices to enhance multilingual learners’ reading comprehension. Students from Arabic, Spanish, and English backgrounds flexibly negotiated meaning and grew their multilingual identities through their language resources during small-group and partner reading and whole-class interactive read-alouds. Flores’ (2019) research with multilingual second graders showed similar findings when students studied author’s craft through transliterary word choice using Abuela (Dorros, 1997), a mentor text written mostly in English with Spanish strategically added throughout the story.

In another Chicago suburb, Robert taught third-grade dual-language education to English- and Spanish-dominant students developing bilingualism and biliteracy. Recognizing that Spanish and English were often compartmentalized in schools, he wanted to create flexible spaces for students to negotiate ideas, incorporating translation as valid practice for enhancing holistic language and literacy abilities. With this goal in mind for his Spanish–English bilingual students, he selected Pepita Talks Twice/Pepita habla dos veces (Lachtman, 1995) to use as an interactive read-aloud and prompt reflections on children’s dynamic language practices.

Before reading, students used both languages to brainstorm the benefits of bilingualism and the role of language brokering in bilingual families and communities. During reading, Robert stopped to ask questions for students to deliberate in both languages. After reading, Robert led a shared writing activity using a strategy called Así se dice (That’s how you say it; Escamilla et al., 2014), where the teacher and students translated words and phrases in the story from Spanish to English (and vice versa). During this activity, students negotiated the meanings and nuances of translated language and explored similarities and differences across Spanish and English, thereby bolstering their metalinguistic knowledge and bilingual identities.

**Scaffolding Writing**

Textual mirrors can bolster students’ writing by drawing from funds of knowledge and providing seed ideas and structures for original texts. Méndez-Newman (2012) described how strategically selected mentor texts prompted students to tap into family and community funds of knowledge and subsequently promote creative writing “to find their voices, share their stories, and participate meaningfully in culturally diverse classrooms” (p. 25). In this way, writers simultaneously learned about writing skills while centering traditionally marginalized identities in...
mentor texts (Beschorner & Hall, 2021). Martínez-Álvarez and Ghiso (2017) explored how multilingual learners critically inquired into their lives by taking photos and writing about their communities; teachers used multilingual mentor texts to promote translanguaging in documenting multicultural stories and histories. By deliberately selecting multilingual mentor texts and encouraging students to write in multiple languages and language varieties, teachers reinforced cultural and linguistic diversity as valuable (Lee & Handsfield, 2018).

In Chicago, Shannon’s second-grade classroom welcomed primarily Latinx students from Spanish-speaking households. Based on annual test scores and anecdotal observation, she recognized that her students collectively struggled with writing. Shannon knew they had rich background knowledge, but her writing curriculum provided universal prompts that did not utilize these resources. To center writing on her students’ unique identities and funds of knowledge, she selected Mi Familia/My Family by George Ancona (2004) as a mentor text. Bilingual and written in first person with photographs to tell the nuanced, non-fiction story of the child’s family, the text provided an age-appropriate and culturally relevant perspective, as well as myriad linguistic scaffolds including bilingual text, photographs, and sentence frames.

After reading and discussing the book, the class brainstormed questions to ask family members to gather information for their own books, including translating questions into home languages. Students conducted interviews and took related photographs, which were used to create storyboards and eventually bilingual texts about their families. Other teachers have described similar projects using Family Pictures/Cuadros de Familia (Garza, 2005) and Islandborn (Díaz, 2018) to prompt interviewing of family and community members, followed by producing both narrative and artwork to share traditions and histories. These projects enabled students to center their identities and use funds of knowledge as springboards for writing development, drawing from the structures and content of a strong mentor text.

Tackling Trauma

In addition to reflecting positive facets and experiences in their lives, mirror texts can also support students in grappling with complex topics and difficult occurrences. Claire Verden’s research (i.e., Verden, 2012; Verden & Hickman, 2009) has explored the use of texts in supporting social and emotional learning in middle-grade classrooms. Involving students with identified behavior and emotional disorders at an urban school with 74% students of color and 62% students from low-income families, her findings indicated the value of strategically selecting and using read-aloud texts with age-appropriate storylines reflecting the cultural backgrounds and lived experiences of students. Students identified with characters, using them as models for decision making and interactions with peers, as well as connecting to and reflecting upon their own behavioral choices. Because of the strategic selection of texts based on characters’ cultural backgrounds, urban settings, and storylines mirroring their own struggles, readers used texts to promote social and emotional learning and well-being.

John, a second-grade teacher with predominantly Latinx students, knew that his students faced complex circumstances daily, including stressors related to immigration and documentation. He sought to provide space for children to share and grapple with these experiences. John selected Super Cilantro Girl/La super niña de cilantro by Juan Felipe Herrera (2003), a story where the protagonist’s mother was stopped at the border in Tijuana for not having a green card. Esmeralda Sinfronteras morphed into a superhero, Super Cilantro Girl, flying to the border, covering the border crossing with sweet-smelling cilantro, and rescuing her mother from the holding facility.

Following the read-aloud, John modeled and prompted students to create, draw, and write about their own superhero in dialogue journals. While many became superheroes to solve issues related to family separation or documentation like Esmeralda, others aimed to combat neighborhood gang violence or bring home family members from incarceration in prison. John read and responded to each story, which provided students with opportunities to reflect and share their experiences and emotions so that the teacher could be better aware and prepared to support their social and emotional well-being.

Inciting Action

Using texts as mirrors can also promote broader social action about issues influencing students. Souto-Manning (2009) described how reading and discussing culturally relevant texts prompted her first graders to recognize segregation in their school. Using students’ connections and discussions to guide her text selection, including The Other Side (Woodson, 2001) and The Story of Ruby Bridges (Coles, 1995), students problematized the school’s use of pull-out programs, which were often stratified by race and socioeconomic status. Mediating complex but important discussions among primary students from marginalized backgrounds who are commonly impacted by these segregated, pull-out programs, this teacher-researcher contended that the strategic use
of children’s literature fostered both culturally responsive pedagogy and critical literacy, thus holding incredible potential to respond to the educational inequities in today’s classrooms regarding race, language, and social class.

In Miguel’s suburban first-grade Spanish–English transitional bilingual classroom with Latinx students, a group of children approached him about a new student from Central America sitting by herself during recess. Being a former student and current teacher at the school, this did not come as a surprise to him, as children often felt left out depending on the day or activity. Miguel brought up the issue during circle time, prompting a discussion where everyone indicated feeling left out, alone, and sad on the playground at some time. To mediate the conversation and provide a textual example of this happening at another school, he selected The Buddy Bench by Patty Brozo (2019) to use as an interactive read-aloud.

Miguel read the text aloud in English, stopping to model and prompt children to make connections throughout the various events in the story. Miguel then had students brainstorm action steps in small groups, with the class ultimately deciding to act on this issue and propose a solution to district administration. They put together a video proposal for their own schoolyard buddy bench, where any child feeling alone on the playground could go to find a buddy. Miguel used the video, which involved the entire class sharing feelings and reenacting recess experiences, to successfully secure funding for the bench.

Engaging Families

Family literacy programs can offer valuable opportunities to engage parents using ITs that embrace personal, familial, cultural, and linguistic identities (Dávila et al., 2017). Researchers have discovered the value of using culturally relevant mentor texts to prompt storytelling and writing. In her project entitled Somos Escritoras, Flores (2018) selected and used Latinx children’s literature with Latina girls and their mothers. In a series of sessions, each with its own mentor text and related strategy to promote writing and artwork, participants defined their identities and learned from one another by collectively sharing stories. López-Robertson (2017) also drew from the assets of Latina mothers with their children, using texts related to their lives to promote storytelling in literature discussions, which subsequently connected home and school literacies and engaged all stakeholders in prioritizing families’ funds of knowledge. When educators invited families into schools to read with their children, their rich perspectives and stories became resources for students’ learning, literacy development, and identity exploration.

Stella’s suburban kindergarten classroom engaged young learners speaking 10 different languages, with over half of families coming from different regions of India. As a White, English-dominant teacher teaching, Stella consistently reflected upon how to create an inclusive community where her students could see themselves and learn about the cultures and traditions of one another. She invited families as partners to achieve this goal, with parents coming into the classroom to talk about cultural traditions and holidays. Prior to Diwali in late October, three mothers brought children’s books from India to read aloud in both Hindi and English, then acting out the story of Diwali using puppets. They followed up by teaching the class about traditional Indian clothing and leading the class in an interactive activity to paint diya candles.

While the lesson and texts served as windows into the holiday for some students, the mirror was incredibly valuable for Stella’s Indian students. She overheard students speaking to each other in Hindi for the first time at school. By learning about the holiday and having the stories read in Hindi, they became more comfortable using their home language in the classroom, something she had tried to encourage since the beginning of the school year. Stella also built on this parental involvement, seeking out support from these families and others to produce multilingual labels and displays that included all home languages spoken by students.
Bringing Inclusive Mirror Texts into Classrooms

As schools continue to diversify, educators welcome children with multifaceted identities and diverse lived experiences into their classrooms. In their plight to nurture children’s learning, teachers might look to inclusive texts as integral tools, particularly mirrors that reflect students’ rich backgrounds, homes, and communities. As schools procure high-quality texts, teachers can make these texts a central feature of classroom instruction. In this way, texts reflective of students become an integral tool, particularly mirrors that reflect students’ identities.

Teachers are the key to bringing textual mirrors into the classroom. Like Claudia, Flora, Gina, Robert, Shannon, Miguel, John, and Stella, teachers can use texts that reflect children’s lived experiences to develop identity, community, language, literacy, empathy, and understandings. Two levers are integral to teachers doing this important work: awareness and agency. First, educators must recognize children’s nuanced identities and experiences, as well as the need to integrate high-quality texts reflective of unique learners. Second, stakeholders must embrace and support teachers’ agency to incorporate textual mirrors into the curriculum.

These levers can be complex to enact, particularly in settings where school boards and legislators seek to limit diverse characters and perspectives in classroom texts. In these contentious times, we encourage educators to focus on the research-based benefits of using textual mirrors. As evidenced by the research outlined in the previous section (see Table 1), mirror texts center students while supporting progress toward goals for literacy, learning, and development. Educators can use the research-based IT framework (Heineke & Papola-Ellis, 2022) to make strategic choices regarding classroom texts to allow children to see themselves across the school day and use their funds of knowledge to develop as readers and learners.

REFERENCES


LITERATURE CITED