Pastoral Counseling and Shame: Contrasting Western and Chinese Perspectives

Grace Li-Hua Chen-McClone
Loyola University Chicago

Follow this and additional works at: https://ecommons.luc.edu/luc_theses

Part of the Religion Commons

Recommended Citation
https://ecommons.luc.edu/luc_theses/3652

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Theses and Dissertations at Loyola eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Master's Theses by an authorized administrator of Loyola eCommons. For more information, please contact ecommons@luc.edu.

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 3.0 License. Copyright © 1991 Grace Li-Hua Chen-McClone
PASTORAL COUNSELING AND SHAME:  
CONTRASTING WESTERN AND CHINESE PERSPECTIVES

by

Grace Li-Hua Chen-McClone

A Thesis submitted to Faculty of Graduate School of Loyola University of Chicago in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts

May 1991
Abstract

This work provides a cross-cultural approach to the pastoral counseling of shame within a Chinese cultural context. The focus of the work is a contrast of Western and Chinese perspectives on the phenomenon of shame through exploring the theological, psychological, and healing dimensions in each culture. The purpose is to offer a cross-cultural approach to the counseling of shame within a Chinese context. The sources fundamental to this study are the religious, psychological, and healing resources that exist within both the Western and Chinese cultures. For the Chinese, this means the resources of traditional Chinese religion such as Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism.

This study concludes that shame is experienced, understood, and treated differently in the two cultures. Shame in Chinese culture is much more a social phenomenon and healing will take place within the context of that entire social matrix of the family and clan. So too, the approach of the pastoral counselor will demand an attention to the unique aspects of shame that flow from that cultural context.
Acknowledgements

The author is indebted to the following people:

Edward Quinn, M.M. who sent crucial materials from Taiwan helpful in this study, and offered reflections from his thirty plus years as a missionary to Taiwan, R.O.C.

Robert Sears, S.J. Ph.D., for his input, consultation, and time as director of this Thesis.

Gerard Egan, Ph.D. for his support, input, and affirmation as reader.

Frances Belmonte, Ph.D. for her support, encouragement, and valuing of Chinese culture.

Kathy Cunningham for her typing assistance and patience.

To the many clients, students, and supervisors both here in the States and in Taiwan who have shared their journey of life with the author.
This thesis is dedicated to

my husband, Kevin McClone
my Grandfather, Ch Chen
my father, Chien-Hsiang Chen
my mother, Chien-Yen Lin-Chen
my sister, Shu-o Chen-Tsai
my brothers, Min-Chiang Chen
        Miao-Tze Chen
TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. INTRODUCTION ................................................. 1

A. Problem ..................................................... 1

B. Previous Research ....................................... 2

C. Limitations ............................................... 3

D. Sources .................................................... 3

E. Methodology .............................................. 4

F. Defining Shame and Distinguishing Shame and Guilt ............... 5

II. THEOLOGY/PHILOSOPHY/SPRITUALITY OF SHAME: WESTERN AND CHINESE PERSPECTIVES .......... 7

A. Western: Theology/Philosophy/Spirituality ...... 7

1. OLD TESTAMENT ........................................ 7

2. NEW TESTAMENT ......................................... 9
   a. Introduction ........................................ 9
   b. Jesus and shame ................................... 10
   c. Samaritan woman .................................. 11
   d. Jesus and the cross ................................ 12
   e. Peter and shame .................................... 13

3. TRADITION ............................................... 14

4. WORLDVIEW ............................................. 15

B. Chinese: Theology/Philosophy/Spirituality ...... 18

1. HISTORICAL OVERVIEW ............................... 18

2. ANCESTOR WORSHIP .................................. 19

3. CONFUCIANISM ......................................... 20

4. TAOISM .................................................. 21

5. BUDDHISM ............................................... 25

6. WORLDVIEW ............................................ 28
III. PSYCHOLOGY OF SHAME: WESTERN AND CHINESE PERSPECTIVES

A. Western: Psychology of Shame

1. SHAME: A GROWING CONCERN .......... 30
2. SPECIAL FEATURES OF SHAME .......... 32
   a. Shame as affect .......................... 32
   b. Invisibility of shame .................... 32
   c. An experience common to many .......... 33
   d. Multi-Generational ....................... 34
   e. Continuum -- Respectful vs. Shame-bound systems .................. 34
   f. Relational ............................... 35
   g. Shame -- A complex phenomenon ......... 38
3. DEVELOPMENTAL THEORY OF SHAME
   IDENTITY AND SELF ....................... 38
   a. Shame over the life cycle .............. 38
   b. Psychological magnification of shame scenes:
      Defending scripts ....................... 39
4. ADDICTION AND SHAME .................. 42
5. SHAME IN FAMILY SYSTEMS ............... 42

B. Chinese: Psychology of Shame

1. CONCEPT OF FACE (LIEN) ............... 45
   a. Contrasting loss of Face -- East and West ...... 46
   b. Positive and negative aspects of Face ........ 47
   c. Examples .................................. 48
2. SOMATIZATION OF PSYCHOLOGICAL PROBLEMS .................. 49
3. EMOTIONAL EXPRESSION .................. 52
4. "WE" VS. "I" CULTURE ..................... 53
5. A SHAME CULTURE VS. GUILT CULTURE ..... 53
6. EXTENDED FAMILY ....................... 55
7. AUTHORITARIAN FAMILY STRUCTURE ....... 56
8. TIGHT SOCIAL CONTROLS VS. RELATIVELY FLEXIBLE CONTROLS ............... 56
9. CONTROL OF EMOTIONS .................. 57
10. FILIAL PIETY OR LOYAL DEVOTION ........ 58
11. HOLISTIC VS. A DUALISTIC TRADITION ... 58
12. LOW TOLERANCE FOR AMBIGUITY .......... 58
I. INTRODUCTION

A. Problem

In this past year, I took a course on Healing in the Family, where class members were to choose a topic for study. I chose to write on the area of shame. This initial reflection on the phenomenon of shame expanded my interest in this complex subject. In particular, I found myself reflecting on how prevalent shame was in my various experiences; my ten years of Clinical Pastoral Education supervising students, my four years of Crisis Counseling in Taiwan, my counseling here in the states, and my own personal and family life experience.

A central question for me in my reflections on shame was the differences in Western and Chinese perceptions of shame. My last five years here in the States have taught me that Western psychology flows out of Western philosophical thought and often is in sharp contrast with many of my own Chinese values and understandings. Consequently, I became interested in how shame might be understood in a totally different philosophical and religious worldview. For example, in my elementary school in Taiwan, R.O.C., my home country, there were four key words that hung over the entrance to the school: (1) "Li," which meant propriety, an attendance to ritual, ceremony, and courtesy, a sense of respect, honor, and emotional balance, (2) "Yi," meaning righteousness; a virtuous obedience to
communal values, (3) "Lien," meaning clean, honest, and upright, and finally (4) "ch’ih," meaning shame, disgrace, humiliation, to feel ashamed. These four virtues of which shame was one, were the Chinese equivalence of Western faith. They symbolized the spirit of what it meant to be fully human, whereas in the West, shame is a wound to be overcome.

As a pastoral counselor, I hope to return to my home country of Taiwan within this next year and offer my learning and insights gained from the West. In order to most effectively serve the needs of my own people, I must be able to integrate what I have learned here and apply it to my own Chinese cultural context. Specifically, I see shame as such a crucial aspect within my own culture, and I felt I needed to look at the pastoral counseling of shame in a cross-cultural framework. This research is an attempt to contrast the approaches to shame in the West and in Chinese culture, highlighting both the common themes and critical differences. My hope is to come up with some insights and approaches to the pastoral counseling of shame that are appropriate for Chinese clients, whether Chinese-Americans in the United States or Chinese persons in their native lands. The questions that I seek to explore are 1. Where does shame come from in Chinese culture? 2. How is it different from the West? 3. How is it similar? 4. What differences in the approaches to healing or pastoral counseling of shame are there? and 5. How important are cultural variables in our understanding and treatment of shame?

B. Previous Research

The previous research in this area is very limited. While there has been a lot
written on shame and its treatment in the West, little has been explored with regard to the treatment or healing of shame in Chinese culture. Even more rare is the focus on shame from a pastoral counseling perspective. Pastoral counseling is new, even here in the States, and in China and Taiwan, it is even newer yet. What I did find helpful was some insightful reflections by Howard Clinebell (1986) in his contrast of pastoral psychology and care in China and the West. While this material was limited to one brief article, it did give me an initial focus for further research.

C. Limitations

A major difficulty in my research was having somewhat limited access to original Chinese sources. However, I did find the two books sent from Taiwan by Father Edward Quinn, The Psychology of Chinese People, Eberhard (1973) and Guilt and Sin in Traditional China, Bond (1986) to be very valuable resources for me. Another limitation has to do with the reality that pastoral counseling is so new in Chinese culture and Taiwan. Consequently, there is little material that deals directly with pastoral counseling in Chinese culture, much less pastoral counseling and shame.

D. Sources

Outside of the two books sent from Taiwan by Father Edward Quinn, there were several key articles that helped in my research on Chinese and shame. Just to mention a few key ones, the article by Shon and Ja (1983) on "Asian families," had some useful research on the dynamics of shame among Asians; Toupin's article (1980), on "Counseling Asians," helped look at insights for pastoral counseling and shame, and Tseng and Wu's book Chinese Culture and Mental Health (1985),
contained numerous articles that greatly facilitated my research.

As far as shame in the West, I found Kaufman (1980, 1989) to be a central resource, due to his extensive research on the subject as well as his organized and comprehensive approach. Other key sources were Augsburg's book, Pastoral Counseling Across Cultures (1986), Bradshaw's Healing the Shame That Binds You (1988), and Fossum's and Mason's Facing Shame (1986). Together, these sources helped provide me with an integrated understanding of shame from the West in order to provide a starting point for contrasting it from a Chinese cultural context.

E. Methodology

My aim is to present a contrast of shame from Western and Chinese perspectives. In so doing, I hope to highlight a cross-cultural approach to the understanding and treatment of shame from the Chinese perspective. I will begin with looking at Western philosophical, theological, and spiritual thought with regard to this phenomenon of shame. Next, I will offer a contrast, by focusing on the Chinese worldview, with its unique philosophical, religious, and spiritual orientations. Having explored these ancient sources, I will turn to the psychological understandings of shame from both Western and Chinese vantage points.

In the third major section of this work, I will focus on the healing of shame from a pastoral counseling perspective. I will begin by exploring four Western models of healing shame, and then offer an integrative model based on this survey. From this integrative model, I will offer a critique from a Chinese cultural perspective. In addition to the critique, I will also highlight some other central
dimensions of healing that are crucial to consider when counseling Chinese. Finally, I will offer some spiritual and theological reflections on pastoral counseling shame that integrate both Chinese and Judeo-Christian spiritual sources.

F. Defining Shame and Distinguishing Shame and Guilt

Although shame has been the topic of numerous psychological and anthropological investigations, it still remains a difficult emotion to conceptualize. In the Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling (Hunter, ed., 1990) defines shame as a painful feeling of being exposed, uncovered, unprotected, vulnerable. Etymologically, the Indo-European roots from which shame derives means, "to cover."

There is no consensus at the present regarding the dynamics, meaning, valuation of shame, or even terminology for shame. The most widespread confusion regards the distinctions between shame and guilt. Authors differ on what these distinctions are and this adds to the confusion. However, there are some common distinctions that most agree on, such as guilt relates more to acts while shame involves one's sense of identity (Hunter, 1990; Kaufman, 1989; Morris, 1971). Gerhart Piers (1953) set forth what has become the standard psychoanalytic distinction between shame and guilt. Both are defined structurally as the products of tension between the ego and superego. Shame is a response to failure and the shortcomings of the self in relation to the ego ideal; guilt is in response to transgression. Also, shame is more inseparably connected to feeling than guilt. A person can be guilty without feeling guilty. Alternately, he or she may feel guilty without being guilty. But if a person feels ashamed, he or she is ashamed (Hunter,
Another critical distinction that I wish to highlight is that generally speaking, guilt is more about something I did or did not do, while shame is the revelation of something which I am. Finally, shame seems peculiarly social, inseparable from one's sense of "face" and "losing face." To say that to be ashamed is to be ashamed of oneself is to point to the connection of shame and one's identity. What one is, of course, is broader than simply what one has consciously chosen. It involves all that one identifies with or wishes to be identified with (Hunter, 1990). In Chinese culture, this identity is intimately intertwined with the family, clan, and society (Eberhard, 1973).
II. THEOLOGY/PHILOSOPHY/SPIRITUALITY OF SHAME: WESTERN AND CHINESE PERSPECTIVES

A. Western: Theology/Philosophy/Spirituality

1. OLD TESTAMENT

As a pastoral counselor, I seek to draw upon the riches of scripture to speak to this phenomenon of shame. Although the Western Christian tradition in the post biblical period has neglected the phenomenon of shame and has failed to give it sustained reflection, the Scriptures are filled with references to shame. The biblical story indeed begins with the human experiences of anxiety, shame, and guilt. Placed in an anxiety context of taboos with life and death sanctions, the man and woman dare not transgress the divine prohibitions. Naked, yet unashamed, they live in a paradise of innocence until willful disobedience disrupts all. Anxiety triggers flight; shame reveals nakedness. The two persons experience the anxiety surrounding seeing and being seen, knowing evil and being known by it, acting willfully and being exposed in it -- these are the components of shame (Augsburger, 1986).

According to The Dictionary of Pastoral Care and Counseling (1990), shame and its derivatives appear 195 times in the Old Testament, and 46 times in the New Testament. In exploring biblical references to shame, another author confirms this predominance of shame-related words in the Old Testament. Some exemplary passages he notes are Hosea 4:6-7; Jeremiah 3: 24-25; Ezra 9:6-7; or the sharp
contrast between Psalm 31, with its pure expression of shame, and Psalm 32 with its focused expression of guilt and yearning for forgiveness. This same author notes that the word "shame" occurs eight times more often than guilt in the total scriptures (Augsburger, 1986).

In examining further these Old Testament references to shame, we find some interesting similarities. For example, a central theme seems to be the emergence of shame whenever there is a turning away from the covenantal relationship established by God. Shame emerges as the Israelites turn to various idols and fail to trust in Yahweh’s providence. As one researcher notes,

There is a rich cluster of shame-related terms used in Scripture: to dishonor, disgrace, ridicule, humiliate, scorn, reproach, confound, taunt, scoff, naked, and face (e.g., Ps. 44, 13-15; Noble, 1975, p. 27). Though shame is associated with many sins, from theft to prostitution, it is most centrally the result of idolatry (Hunter, 1990, p. 1161).

The other theme that seems to emerge is God’s fidelity and constant love that continually calls people back into relationship and communion. Another author also notes this theme and sees it operative in all of scripture as he states,

Throughout the biblical accounts, human shame and guilt occur in this context of grace offered as steadfast love. All human activity, whether honorable or shameful, responsible or guilty, occurs in this context of the unchanging steadfast love of the Creator which constantly draws all creatures toward wholeness and healing (Augsburger, 1986, p. 139).

God’s fidelity and unconditional love offers the care and support that allows trust to replace anxiety, acceptance to restore honor where we are shamed, and forgiveness to resolve guilt. Herbert Morris, in his book Guilt and Shame (1971), states that in an experience of shame, trust is seriously jeopardized or destroyed.
The greater the expectation, the more acute the shame; the greater the discrepancy between one's image of oneself and the image others have of one, the more one has to "put on a brave face" (Morris, 1971).

This is indeed a basic theme throughout the Old Testament, where God continually remains faithful and calls his people back. God responds to the shame of his people by bringing it into the open, and calling for a spiritual cleansing (e.g., Ezechial: 36). Yahweh will cleanse them from their idols and place a "new heart, and a new spirit" in them. The sin is named and brought into the open to be forgiven and healed.

2. NEW TESTAMENT

a. Introduction

Having explored shame in the Old Testament, we now turn to the usage of shame within the New Testament. Shame occupies a much less prominent place in the New Testament. Almost all new Testament references speak of shame as disgrace (e.g., "who...endured the cross, despising the shame," Heb. 12:2). The absence of the sense of shame is most strikingly evident in the original Greek (Hunter, 1990). Aidos, the Greek word for the positive sense of shame, which links it with awe and the sacred, appears but once.

Augsburger (1986), in his research, also notes that shame is used less frequently than guilt, and concern for the sense of shame seems almost missing. The lack of shame among the early Christians is shown in their desacralization of holy places, their demystification of ritual, the bold claiming of intimacy with God, and
the broad inclusion of people from all races, ranks, and levels in the community of grace.

b. Jesus and Shame

The origins of shame involve a severing of the interpersonal bridge. (Kaufman, 1980). The fundamental trust one longs for and expects is violated and controlling defenses emerge keeping the person from risking, loving, and developing intimate relationships. There is a strong consensus among New Testament scholars that one of the characteristic features of Jesus of Nazareth was his remarkably free and intimate relationship with God. As is well known, the affectionate term, abba, an Aramaic diminutive for "father" used by both children and adults in addressing their fathers, may have been Jesus' habitual way of addressing God in prayer (cf. Mk 14:36). Such an address for God in prayer is practically without analogy in Jewish piety and contrasts with reverential formality and elaborate address typical of intertestamental Jewish piety (Senior and Stuhlmueller, 1983).

While Jesus himself was undoubtedly a strict Jew, there are examples where he summons up his own authority and own experience to place the values of inner integrity in direct confrontation with his opponents interpretation of the law (Senior and Stuhlmueller, 1983). In particular, Jesus brings healing where there was shame, and shames those who set themselves up as judges. Jesus breaks with the socially and religiously prescribed customs of his day and shares table fellowship with outcast public "sinners," and or tax collectors (cf., for example, Mt. 9:10, 11:19, Mk 2:15-17, Lk. 7:31-35). He shows an open attitude toward the despised Samaritan (cf., for
example, Lk. 10:10-37; 17:11-19; John 4). He freely associates with women, including them in his community of disciples, openly conversing with them, and publicly accepting their signs of affection and loyalty -- actions taboo and shameful for a public religious teacher in the patriarchal society of Jesus’ day (cf., for example, Lk 7:36-50; 8:1-3; Jn 4:27, et.).

These provocative associations of Jesus’ are not incidental to his ministry. The extension of compassion, loyalty, and friendship across well-defined boundaries of exclusion was a parable in action, a way of vividly communicating Jesus’ understanding of God and the quality of his rule. A good example of this is the story of the sinful woman who came to Jesus in the house of a pharisee. (Lk. 7:36-50) The woman, who the gospel says, "had a bad name in the town," (v. 37) was living with shame. Upon hearing of Jesus’ dining there, she brought an alabaster jar of ointment. She waited behind him at his feet, weeping, and her tears fell on his feet. She wiped the tears with her hair, covering his feet with kisses. The woman was forgiven because, as the gospel states, she had shown such "great love" (v. 47). What this story seems to indicate is a reversal of shame or perhaps better, a transformation. Jesus heals what is regarded as shameful and exposes the blindness of those who have no shame.

c. Samaritan Woman

Another central example of how Jesus deals with shame is the gospel story of the Samaritan woman at the well (Jn. 4:1-30). In this story, Jesus meets the Samaritan woman at the well. He acknowledges her presence and asks her for a
drink (v. 7). Jesus risks his own shame by associating with a Samaritan and a woman (v. 9-10). What Jesus does is to accept this woman. He doesn't shame her. However, he does confront the truth about her life. Jesus brings her shame out of hiding and names it by acknowledging her five husbands, yet doesn't condemn her. He speaks the truth (v. 19), and invites her to a life of "spirit" and "truth" (v. 23). The woman was going to the well alone, cut off from the community through her feelings of shame. She was isolated, alienated, and Jesus' acceptance of her allows her to be transformed, to be restored to relationship. She is empowered in her healing to be reunited to the community. Healing occurs in facing fully one's shame in the presence of another and finding acceptance. The acceptance allows for forgiveness and reconciliation, restoration to self, God, and others.

d. Jesus and the Cross

Jesus himself was the victim of shameful experiences. The Pharisees questioned him (Lk. 22:54-62). Jesus was lonely, afraid, and felt anguish (Lk: 39-46), but remained truthful to himself and turned to God in prayer. In his later life, Jesus would be "mocked," (Lk: 22:63), (Lk: 23:36), "unjustly accused," (Lk 23:1-7), "made fun of," and "treated with contempt" (Lk 23:10-12), paraded through the streets to be publicly humiliated and later crucified (Lk 23:26-32) (Boff, 1981). This reality of shame of the cross is central to Christianity as Donald Capps so aptly states,

Crucified as a common criminal in full public view, Jesus experienced shame of the most excruciating kind. Its injury to self was incalculable. Thus, to view life from the perspective of the cross, as Christians do, is to embrace our shameful selves, for Jesus' experience on the cross is the paradigmatic shame experience for Christians (Capps, 1983, p. 92).
Jesus experienced tremendous pain both physically and emotionally. He knew shame and ridicule to the point where his "anguish" led to the sweating of blood (Lk 22:44). Jesus found hope for overcoming these shameful experiences by turning to God in prayer (Lk 22:42, 21-36, 19:41-42). Jesus embraced the shame and allowed himself to grieve and "shed tears" over Jerusalem (Lk 19:41). The experiences of rejection and abandonment threatened to block him from risking anymore and he cried out to "Abba," to find the answers. In turning to his creator, he reaffirmed his deepest identity and acceptance in God and found the courage to keep his integrity.

e. Peter and Shame

Another illustration of shame in the New Testament is in Peter's denial of Jesus. Jesus had told his followers that they would all lose faith in him (Mt 26:31). Peter responded to Jesus in public denial, "though all lose faith in you, I will never lose faith," and Jesus proclaims that Peter indeed will "disown him three times before the night is over" (Mt 26:34). Peter answers for the third time that, "even if I have to die with you, I will never disown you" (v. 35). Peter was called by Jesus to be a leader. He was the "rock" upon which the "Church" would be built (Mt 16:18). Peter's shame was magnified because of this special relationship and responsibility. Peter, the one who affirmed boldly Jesus as the Christ, the Messiah of God, had now disowned him not once, but three times (Mt 26:69-75).

The response of Peter was to "weep bitterly" (Mt 26:75). Peter had denied Christ and in so doing, had denied his very self. The temptation for Peter was to run and hide. Unable to live up to the call and responsibilities given to him, Peter fled
with the other disciples. The shame was indeed great. The transforming of shame begins when the risen Lord appears and the messenger is told to tell his disciples and Peter (Mk 16:7). Peter is the only one named specifically. Peter's shame is healed in Jesus' unconditional acceptance and forgiveness. The disowned parts of Peter are now able to be reclaimed. The result, as the Acts of the Apostles describes, is a Peter who is able to indeed be a rock, one who boldly proclaims the good news of Christ with integrity and conviction.

Jesus again brings the shame in the open by asking three times, "Do you love me," to Peter (Jn. 21: 9-17). The risen Christ comes to the disciples and Peter, and dines with them. Just as Peter denied Christ three times, now he is given three opportunities to reclaim his love for Christ. Jesus then entrusts Peter with the responsibility of feeding his sheep, of bringing that healing-message to others. This is the transforming power of forgiveness.

3. TRADITION

Augustine, as Donald Capps (1983) noted, can lead us to some understanding of what shame experiences mean for the Christian identity. The insight comes from Augustine's own Confessions, where he reveals his own sense of shame before God, over the way he treated a dying friend, as he states,

Lord, before whose eyes the abyss of man's conscience lies naked, what thing within me could be hidden from you, even if I would not confess it to you? I would be hiding you from myself, not myself from you. But now, since my groans bear witness that I am a thing displeasing to myself, you shine forth, and you are pleasing to me, and you are loved and longed for, so that I may feel shame for myself...and choose you (Capps, 1983, p. 91).

By trying to avoid his shame, Augustine realized that he would not be hiding
from God but hiding from himself. This is why it was so important for him to focus on his shameful experiences despite the pain. The issue for Augustine is no longer Adam's question, "How can I conceal my shame?" but, "How may God become known to me?" What Augustine has done in the Confessions is to make the "self" of which we are most profoundly ashamed, the very core of our Christian identity (Capps, 1983).

St. Ignatius in the Spiritual Exercises (1951) gives us another source from the tradition. In the first week experience of the Spiritual Exercises, the retreatant, much like in the example of Augustine, is often led to an experience of his or her own sinfulness in light of God's grace and fidelity. The initial prayers in this first week focus more on thanksgiving and praise to God. After a few days, it is a common experience, especially for new retreatants, to confront their own sense of alienation from God and come face to face with their own neediness. The task is to not run, but face this present vulnerability and need of God as it presents itself. As one author notes in his commentary on this first week experience,

Moreover the effectiveness of this "first week" experience in the Exercises comes precisely because both the alienation and the saving are experienced in the present. In the present, and in prayer I experience my helplessness, my alienation, those things I was running away from, and mirabile dictu, I find that I have nothing to fear; God loves me with all my warts and moles (Barry, 1973, p. 99).

4. WORLDVIEW

Questions such as, who is a healthy person? and what is good and evil? flow out of the cultural context of which one belongs. In the West, as Clinebell (1986) notes, we have a much more "I centered" culture. The understandings of personal
identity, personality development, and wholeness is deeply rooted in this *I* centered culture. Robert Bellah (1985), in his celebrated study of American society, *Habits of the Heart*, says that individualism lies at the very core of American culture. There is a biblical individualism, and a civic individualism, as well as a utilitarian, and an expressive individualism. Bellah says that whatever the differences in these basic understandings of individualism, there are some things they all share, and that is the fundamental belief in the dignity, indeed the sacredness of the individual. Anything that would violate our right to think for ourselves, judge for ourselves, make our own decisions, live our lives as we see fit, is not only morally wrong, it is sacrilegious (Bellah, 1985, p. 142).

How does all this relate to shame? It seems to me that this trend toward greater individualism has led to a cut off from our own tradition. In our Judeo-Christian heritage, the call to covenantal relationship is primary. However, with the loss of extended family bonds and the demands of a modern age, individuals become more and more alienated from one another and their roots. There is a loss of communal identity, and responsibility to others and society. Shame grows in response to this lack of connectedness and belonging.

However, there are rich sources for understanding shame in both Greek and Hebrew cultures. In the Greek tradition, we are dealing more with a "shame culture" than real guilt. The Homeric hero "loses face," his public reputation (time) means everything to him (Eliade, 1987). These two root cultures of Western civilization -- Hebrew and Greek -- are especially sensitive to the concept of shame as a more positive phenomenon. In a beautiful passage in the Talmud, we read:
A sense of shame is a lovely sign in a person. Whoever has a sense of shame will not sin quickly; but whoever shows no sense of shame in his visage, his father surely never stood on Mount Sinai.

(Hunter, 1990, p. 1162)

This above quote highlights the positive aspect of shame tied to bringing honor. However, with time there occurred a moralization process whereby shame became guilt.

It seems that the switch in focus from shame to guilt came into being with Christianity. The Christian emphasis on freedom and individual responsibility led to greater individualism. Along with this emphasis on freedom is the faculty of the will which was unknown in Greek antiquity and only really begins to emerge in the first century of Christianity. What aroused the distrust of philosophers was the connection of will with freedom. The touchtone of a free act is that we could have also left undone what we actually did (Arendt, 1978). This growing emphasis on free will brought with it significant changes in how sin was perceived. Gradually, the focus became more on the self. Consequently, individuals came to view sinfulness and judgement in more personal terms. In other words, the focus became more on what did I do wrong, or on my sinful actions.

A further characteristic of the Western worldview is the nuclear family in contrast to the extended family. Clinebell emphasizes the nuclear family culture that exists in the West where the extended family has all but disappeared and where even the nuclear family bonds are threatened (Clinebell, 1986). All of these aspects of culture affect how shame is experienced, viewed, and responded to and treated.
B. Chinese: Theology/Philosophy/Spirituality

1. HISTORICAL OVERVIEW

Shame in Chinese culture must be understood in light of its own historical and cultural context. In order to begin to understand the ways of thinking and being of Eastern peoples, particularly the Chinese, we need to explore those major religions and philosophies that are embedded in their history and culture. During the course of some 3,500 years of history, the Chinese developed their own distinctive ideas concerning humanity's origin, nature, destiny, and their relationship to the universe they inhabit. Religion in China has differed from religion in Western societies in that institutionalized religion has been relatively weak. Religion in China, however, permeated the wider cultural setting. Every traditional Chinese home was a religious shrine, whilst the concept and structure of all major Chinese institutions contained the religious elements. One author so aptly states,

In China the beliefs and ritual of diffused religion develop their organizational system as an integral part of the organized social pattern, and perform a pervasive function in every major aspect of Chinese social life (C.K. Yang, 1970, p. 20).

There are four main streams that make up Chinese religion. The first is a primitive animism which goes back to the dawn of history, in which the cult of the ancestors forms a prominent part. Next there is Confucianism which did not become a dominant philosophy of life and a state cult until about the second century B.C., some three hundred years after the death of Confucius. Thirdly, is Taoism, which arose as a philosophy and way of life in some ways diametrically opposed to Confucianism. Finally, Buddhism, which was introduced into China by way of central
Asia either during or before the first century A.D. I will examine briefly the major teachings and influences of these religions and/or philosophies on the Chinese people in hopes of deepening our understanding of their unique worldview.

2. ANCESTOR WORSHIP

As far as the earliest religion in China is concerned, we can infer that as for other agricultural peoples, the beliefs were centered in a cult of ancestors, a concern for fertility, and the worship of numerous nature spirits which included the powerful gods of wind and rain (Smith, 1968). When one surveys the religious practices of the Shang Dynasty, which traditionally began in 1766 B.C., we see that most distinctive ideas of a peculiarly Chinese worldview were already in evidence: a cult of ancestors which resulted in a highly organized sacrificial and mortuary ritual; the belief in a supreme being who presides over a hierarchical structure in the spiritual world which was intimately related to man's life and destiny; the idea that only those designated by superior authority were fitted to perform religious functions; the people being merely spectators, which led to an intimate connection of religion with the state; the intense concern for the correct and meticulous observance of ceremonial; and the belief that the main purpose of religion was to maintain a harmonious relationship between heaven, earth, and man. (Smith, p. 11) Practically speaking, ancestral worship is a part of regular life for us Chinese. For example, most Chinese homes have an ancestral tablet, as we did in Taiwan, for regular thanksgiving to our ancestors, and keeping the memory alive. This ancestral worship was especially practiced on major Chinese holidays. As I will show later, shame in Chinese culture impacts on all one's ancestors, and healing must also bear this in mind.
3. CONFUCIANISM

Confucianism has been labeled a philosophy, a religion, an institution, and a secular social theory. In a very real sense, Confucianism reflects all of these descriptions. Tseng and Wu (1985), in speaking of Confucianism, emphasize this secular social theory and say that the foremost purpose is to achieve a harmonious society. In brief, the human person is a relational being. A relational being is sensitive to one's relations with others, above, below, or on equal footing with him or her. Relational beings see themselves situated in the web of a relational network through which they define themselves. Confucius had as his goal the achievement of a good society through the way of Li. Li is the way of the gentleman that involves politeness. However, more than politeness, it was the keeping of rights and ceremonies, and the carrying out of one’s position in life, preserving the five cardinal relations: sovereign and subject; father and son; elder and younger brother; husband and wife; friend and friend (Reese, 1980).

Where, then, does the spiritual dimension lie for the Confucian tradition? One place lies in the distant past in the golden age of antiquity. By the time the nominal "founder" of Confucianism lived, there was already belief in an ideal ancient era as a spiritual dimension against which contemporary realities could be judged. Moreover, early versions of key Confucian scriptures were already in existence by then. These scriptures told of the deeds of early rulers and exemplified a basic Confucian principle according to which good rulers prospered and evil ones were punished. This principle, called the Mandate of Heaven (T'ien-ming), specified that
a line of rulers received Heaven's support as long as they behaved virtuously but would lose it and be overthrown as soon as they did otherwise (Jochim, 1986).

Confucius and his followers first located the spiritual dimension within the individual: the hsin (xin), or "mind-heart," an intellectual as well as a moral "organ" represented by a Chinese character that originally designated the physical heart. This idea of an inner organ with the same moral qualities of Heaven, the moral guiding force of the universe, has given Confucianism its distinctive humanistic quality among religious traditions. For what became important for Confucians was not the worship of Heaven, but the discovery of a Heavenly source of correct moral and social behavior existing within the individual. Thus, even when an explicit quest for spiritual sagehood developed among Confucians centuries later, imitating Taoists and Buddhist quests, Confucianism remained with the basic issues of moral and social life in this world. The Confucian quest for spiritual sagehood emerged in the neo-confucianistic period and although meditation was practiced and spiritual enlightenment was sought, Confucians also insisted on being social servants. They severely criticized Taoists and Buddhists for being escapists; and when one of them resigned from public service to become a recluse, it was usually an act of political protest (Jochim, 1986). Perhaps no Chinese philosophy is more crucial to our understanding of how shame operates than Confucianism.

4. TAOISM

It is no easy task to define Taoism, for throughout its history, this philosophical and religious system assumed very different aspects. For my purposes
in this paper, I will try to highlight some of their central principles governing the world and humanity, and speak to their major concepts. One should also note that the ancient Chinese did not have the same conception as the West with regard to body and soul -- or, more accurately, of souls -- and of their relationship to each other.

According to Chinese cosmology, the world was governed by a set of fundamental notions related to unity and multiplicity, space and time, and microcosm and macrocosm. The concepts of tao and te were not specific to Taoism, but belonged to all currents of Chinese thought. Each philosophical school had its tao, that is, doctrines and way of conduct. For Confucians, tao represented an ethical ideal (Eliade, 1987). Tao was a central concept of Lao Tzu (sixth century, B.C.), often considered the founder of Taoism. This sense of tao is more specifically pertinent to the understanding of the Chinese worldview. Tao might be likened to the laws of nature, and better to nature itself. However, tao is more than the regularity of operation in the universe, it is also the reality behind or within appearances, the ultimate metaphysical truth. Like the God of some Western philosophers or the void of Mahayana Buddhism, it is that about which nothing can be predicated, but because of which all particular phenomena have their being. The opening lines of Tao Te Ching, attributed to Lao Tze, struggle to put this essentially inexpressible concept into words:

The Tao that can be told of is not the eternal Tao;
The name that can be named is not the eternal name.
The Nameless is the origin of heaven and earth;
The Named is the mother of all beings,
Therefore let there always be non-being, so we may see their subtlety,  
And let there always be being, so we may see their outcome  
The two are the same,  

But after they are produced, they have different names,  
They both may be called deep and profound,  
Deeper and more profound,  
The door of all subtleties!  
(Thompson, trans., 1975, p. 6)

Behind or beyond heaven are the workings of yin and yang which have their  
source in Tao. The original meanings of yin and yang seem to refer to the shady and  
sunny slopes of mountains respectively. Eventually, the two terms came to describe  
the two antithetical and complementary aspects of the Tao as natural order: a shady  
aspect and a luminous aspect; a cold, passive aspect and a warm active aspect; and  
finally, the feminine aspect and the masculine aspect. The terms are therefore  
relative classificatory headings only; any one thing can be either yin or yang in  
relation to another. These two notions played a fundamental role in all  
philosophical, scientific, and religious thought (Eliade, 1987). Yin and yang might  
best be described as definable phases in a ceaseless flow of change:

When the sun goes down the moon comes; when the moon goes down  
the sun comes. The sun and moon give way to each other and their  
brightness is produced. When the cold goes the heat comes; when the  
heat goes the cold comes. The cold and heat give way to each other  
and the round of the year is completed. That which goes wanes, and  
that which comes waxes. The waning and waxing affect each other and  
benefits are produced (Thompson, 1975, p. 4)

The Chinese fixed on the fundamental qualities observed in things. These  
qualities were not static, but were ceaselessly interacting, transforming, and replacing  
each other. Man was also viewed as subject to changes and transformations. Man
was a little universe, a microcosm, a little "Heaven-earth." It was said that his head was round like heaven, his feet square like earth, and all his organs were homologized to different parts of the universe (Eliade, 1987).

The Taoists condemn all discursive knowledge, for, they maintain, it introduces multiplicity into the soul, which should, rather, "embrace Unity," that is be unified in the Tao. This unity is preserved through a mastery of the senses and passions. The sense organs are conceived as apertures through which the vital principles escape if they are not controlled. The passions and emotions are a cause of depletion of vital and spiritual power. A certain amount of self-denial is advocated, but such self-denial aims at the harmonious use of the sense faculties, not at their suppression (Eliade, 1987).

The Taoist then is especially careful not to intervene in the course of things. This non-intervention is called "wu wei" (non-action), a term that suggests not absolute non-action but an attitude of prudence and respect for the autonomy of other things. Through non-action, the Taoist does nothing other than conform to the Tao, which itself is "always without action but nevertheless brings about everything." The Taoist allows other beings to follow their natural spontaneity (tzu-jan).

Lao Tze compares the power issuing from wu-wei to that of water; in the same way, he says, femininity far surpasses the manly virtues. Furthermore, he proposes that all aggressive action elicits a contrary balancing reaction, and that all energy that has developed to the point of exhaustion reverts to its initial tranquil state. By living in accordance with the principles of wu-wei, one gets along as nature does; the world
gets created, living things grow and pass away without any sign of effort (Blakney, 1983).

This paradoxical expression *wu wei* is the key to Chinese mysticism as these words from the sayings of Lao Tze describe,

More exactly, *wu wei* is man’s part; he is to be still, quiet and passive so that the Way, ultimate Reality, the universe of being may act through him without let or hindrance. The first *wei* is then part of the Way. To use more familiar vocabulary, the idea is to let God be God in you (Blakney, 1983, p. 17).

These crucial aspects of Taoism influence the Chinese understanding of healing and hope, and will be useful sources for my later exploration of the healing of shame.

5. BUDDHISM

One of the world’s three major universal religions, along with Christianity and Islam, Buddhism was founded by Budda Sa Kamuni (ca. 560-480 B.C.E.) more than five centuries before it entered China. It was in China that Buddhism would find its largest, if not most hospitable home. Buddhism did not end up replacing the religions already existing there, as, for example Christianity had in converting the Roman Empire. Due partly to its own nature and partly to the nature of native Chinese religious attitudes, it was designed to become only one dimension of the overall framework of Chinese religion (Jochim, 1986).

For Buddhism, the spiritual dimension lies outside time and history. Its quest to discover this dimension begins with inward meditation and ends with world transcendence. However, the rejection of life’s pleasures, the metaphysical explanations of the illusory nature of the ordinary world, and the pursuit of salvation
through asceticism were all rather foreign to Chinese soil. In fact, it was not so much the doctrine, but the Buddhist ascetic practice that was hard to accept, for it required that one leave family life, shave one's head, and observing sexual abstinence, have no progeny. Consequently, because of this new environment in China, the Buddhism that developed was of the Mahayana type which allowed for a deeper involvement in social life. Holding the dual virtues of wisdom and compassion, Maha-yanists stressed that one must rise above worldly ills and pleasures (wisdom), yet at the same time, remain involved in the world to the extent necessary to bring others to salvation (compassion) (Thompson, 1975, and Jochim, 1986).

In our treatment of shame within Chinese culture, it is helpful to understand deeply held Chinese values such as those found in the Buddhist mentality. Carl Jung, one of the first Western psychologists to make a deep study of Buddhism, aptly describes the richness of Buddhism for giving insight into suffering and its treatment as he states,

It was neither the history of religion nor the study of philosophy that first drew me to the world of Buddhist thought, but my professional interests as a doctor. [And a few sentences later, Jung emphasizes the matter further when he states that...]in our sphere of culture the suffering of the sick can derive considerable benefit from...the Buddhist mentality, however strange it may appear. [Again, a little later, Jung comments] that it is no wonder the doctor, concerned as he is to alleviate psychological suffering, should value religious ideas and attitudes so far as they prove helpful as a therapeutic system, and should single out Buddha as one of the supreme helpers since the essence of his teaching is deliverance from suffering through the maximum development of consciousness (Claxton, 1986, p. 35).

Where the Western psychologist makes a distinction between sensory events and cognitive events, Buddhism speaks of thinking as the sixth sense along with
seeing, hearing, smelling, tasting, and touching. Thus, at the practical level, *Buddhism* accords thinking not necessarily a separate status from the other forms of sensory experience. It is simply one of the six ways in which we experience what the Buddhist refers to as the external world. The Buddhist, for example, will speak of watching one's thoughts come and go in precisely the same way he or she will talk of watching one's usual experiences come and go. The Buddhist speaks of "awareness" which is simply that quality (or perhaps more properly process) that attends to incoming signals (Claxton, 1986). Not for nothing is a chattering monkey used in the East as the symbol for the mind. By its apparently uncontrollable chattering, the mind dominates our attention, preventing us from experiencing what the Buddhist calls "things in themselves," that is, the true essence of things uncontaminated by our concepts about them. And worse still, it prevents us from experiencing that pure awareness that remains when thinking and all sensory data are excluded. The Buddhist psychologist, as David Fontane notes, is therefore, "asking us to experience what we really are instead of what we think ourselves to be" (Claxton, 1986).

The Buddhism that predominated in China emphasized the fact that human beings, as long as they live in this world, are bound in a vicious circle of sin and error through the three poisons of greed, anger, and stupidity. They have little power to save themselves, but enlightenment is guaranteed for all who make a sincere vow of faith in Amitabha, filling the mind constantly with thoughts of him and accepting his mercy and merit (Smith, 1968).
6. CHINESE WORLDVIEW

If we examine the Chinese understanding of what it means to be whole, we get an entirely different picture from that of the West. Clinebell speaks to the implicit understanding of healthy development in any "We" culture as more interdependent as he states,

This contrasts with the implicit understanding of healthy development in any "We" culture where the norm of healthy development is learning to live by the ground rules of interdependency, as expressed in everyday values, customs, assumptions, and laws. For "normal" Chinese persons, the needs of the networks of their relationships -- from extended family, to the neighborhood or brigade of the commune, and on to the whole nation -- take precedence over individual needs (Clinebell, 1986, p. 373).

"Normal healthy persons," in Chinese culture are those who conform to the values of their families and society with its hierarchical pattern of power, rights, and obligations. These deeply felt Confucian principles contribute to the overall worldview of the Chinese person. East Asia has the distinction of evolving the longest continuing recorded civilization in the world. This formidable history provides a background and worldview different from the West, in which the Chinese person must be understood.

In sum, shame must be examined within the cultural, philosophical, and religious heritage from which it emerges. For the Chinese, this means that shame is much more a social phenomenon than in the West. It also means that one's entire clan, including one's ancestors are part of the social matrix. If we do not understand the overall worldview of the Chinese person, we will be severely hampered in our desire to understand and heal this phenomenon of shame. The fundamental
philosophical and religious traditions of Taoism, Buddhism, and Confucianism provide the framework for this understanding and will also provide the sources for its healing.

Having highlighted the religious and philosophical traditions of the West and of Chinese culture, we can now turn to a more indepth look at the psychological aspects of shame in both these cultures. Keep in mind throughout this psychological exploration, the crucial role that culture plays in shame's psychological dynamics.
III. PSYCHOLOGY OF SHAME: WESTERN AND CHINESE PERSPECTIVES

A. Western: Psychology of Shame

1. SHAME: A GROWING CONCERN

Shame in the West is increasingly becoming a major topic of attention and study. Why is this phenomenon of shame surfacing so much today? Gershen Kaufman, in his recent book, The Psychology of Shame (1989), points to several factors. First of all, he notes the recent acceleration of addictive, abusive, and eating disorders as a major factor. In these various syndromes shame plays a central role, and the new and growing focus on these particular disorders has moved shame into the spotlight. Another reason Kaufman (1989) gives concerns the failure of accepted theories and traditional methods of treatment. Thirdly, Kaufman (1989) points to the profound transition in Western culture where parents are more and more burdened by the demands of living in a complex, technological society and feel equally ill-prepared for the demands of parenting in such a society. In response, many parents simply abdicate. The challenge for the next century lies precisely in creating new and viable forms of the family, for work, for interpersonal relations, for schools for psychotherapy -- for all the central institutions of a culture (Kaufman, 1989). Indeed, the growing sense of individualism in the West may be a key factor in the increase of shame.
Shame plays a vital role in the development of conscience. By alerting us to misconduct or wrongdoing -- to transgression in whatever form -- shame motivates necessary self-correction. Thus an understanding of antisocial or psychopathic behavior must begin with an inquiry into shame. The optimal development of conscience depends on adequate and appropriately graded doses of shame. Conscience, as Kaufman states, "will misfire because of too little or too much shame" (Kaufman, 1989, p. 5).

When seeking to understand the psychology of shame, we are confronted with the history of an idea. Kaufman (1989), surveys this history and reveals how previous conceptions of shame have suffered from the restrictions imposed by language on accurate perceptions of inner states. For example, in Freud's work, shame receives comparatively little attention; guilt holds the spotlight. Adler's work on inferiority feelings and the inferiority complex (1933) reflects an increased awareness of the importance of shame related phenomena. His concept of inferiority represents one of the first attempts to accord shame a central role in the development of personality. In the work of Karen Horney (1950), shame's effects are described in terms of Horney's concepts of "neurotic pride" and "the pride system." Horney in fact related shame directly to pride; "The two typical reactions to hurt pride are shame and humiliation. Subsequent inquiries into shame largely concentrate on the distinctions between shame and guilt" (Kaufman, 1989, p. 7-10).

In his pioneering study of identity, Erik Erikson (1950) places shame in the second of eight stages or identity crises that span the life cycle. Kaufman (1980), in
looking at all eight stages, sees that each subsequent crisis involves, at least in part, a reworking of shame. In other words, the affect most critical to the development of mistrust, guilt, inferiority, isolation, and so on, is shame.

2. SPECIAL FEATURES OF SHAME

a. Shame as affect

Though previously neglected, shame has now moved center stage. Let's examine then what we mean by this phenomenon of shame. What are its major features, structure, and dynamics? Most of the researchers on shame seem to indicate that shame is an affect. Kaufman speaks of shame as the affect of inferiority. No affect is more central to the development of identity according to Kaufman. (Kaufman, 1989, p. 17) Another author points out that the affect of shame is much more complex and much richer in cognitive elements than affects such as rage, anxiety, or pleasure which can be called "simple affects" (Wurmser, 1981, p. 69).

Fossum and Mason (1986) speak of this phenomena of shame as an inner sense of being completely diminished or insufficient as a person. It is the self judging the self. A moment of shame may be so painful that one feels robbed of personal dignity. A pervasive sense of shame is the ongoing premise that one is fundamentally bad, inadequate, defective, unworthy, or not fully valid as a human being.

b. Invisibility of shame

Another distinguishing feature of shame is its invisibility. The very word, shame, is derived from an Indo-European root (skam or skem) which means "to hide," and from which we derive our words skin and hide (Nathanson, 1987). The
Chinese say that the dragon possesses the power of metamorphosis and the gift of rendering itself invisible. Shame's invisibility is powerful, yet the invisible in life is what we long to know intimately. Shame is internalized (Bradshaw, 1988) and felt as "inner torment" (Kaufman, 1989, p. 17). Shame is a wound made from the inside, dividing us from both ourselves and others, as Kaufman so aptly states in quoting Tomkins (1963),

If distress is the affect of suffering, shame is the affect of indignity, of defeat, of transgression and of alienation. Though terror speaks to life and death and distress makes of the world a vale of tears, yet shame strikes deepest into the heart of man. While terror and distress hurt, they are wounds inflicted from outside which penetrate the smooth surface of the ego; but shame is felt as an inner torment, a sickness of the soul. It does not matter whether the humiliated one has been shamed by derisive laughter or whether he mocks himself. In either event he feels himself naked, defeated, alienated, lacking in dignity and worth (Tomkins, 1963, p. 17).

c. An experience common to many

Another feature of shame is that it is an experience that is common to many from a variety of ages, socio-economic groups, ethnic and racial backgrounds. Shame seems to be a universal phenomena. In fact, there are many cultures such as my own Chinese culture that are often referred to as shame cultures. One of the reasons for this seems to be the predominance of values of "honor" and not losing "face" that permeate the culture. Howard Clinebell and a group of pastoral psychologists toured China in 1984, and in writing about his reflections, Clinebell (1986) notes;

In China, the dominant culture value is to bring honor and not shame to one's parents, clan, neighborhood, community, and nation. Normal healthy persons are those who conform to the values of their families and society with its hierarchical pattern of power, rights, and obligation. (Clinebell, 1986, p. 374)
d. Multi-generational

The above statement by Clinebell brings us to another primary characteristic of shame and that is its multi-generational aspect. This aspect is magnified in my own Chinese culture by the notion of the extended family. Unlike most families here in the West, the Chinese generally have at least three generations living together under one roof. Shame is inherited through the generations and the most likely candidates are those who protect their history with secrets, mysteries, and myths. Since it is kept hidden, it can't be worked out. Whether about suicides, homicides, incest, abortions, addictions, public loss of face or financial disaster; all the secrets get acted out (Fossum & Mason, 1986; Bradshaw, 1988).

e. Continuum: Respectful vrs. shame-bound systems

Family systems fall on a continuum between respectful and shame-bound systems according to one author (Fossum & Mason 1986). Bradshaw (1988) speaks of nourishing shame on one end of the continuum and what he refers to as "toxic shame" at the other end. Regardless of the particular words used, many who have researched the psychological dynamics of shame seem to indicate that shame runs in degrees and at times can be positive, healthy, and humanizing. As Bradshaw (1988) writes in his preface on Healing the Shame That Binds You,

In itself, shame is not bad. Shame is a normal human emotion. In fact, it is necessary to have the feeling of shame if one is to be truly human. Shame is the emotion which gives us permission to be human. Shame tells us our limits. Shame keeps us in our human boundaries, letting us know we can and will make mistakes, and that we need help. Our shame tells us we are not God. Healthy shame is the psychological foundation of humility. It is the source of spirituality. (Bradshaw, 1988, p. vii preface)
Contemporary Western psychology is almost uniformly negative in both defining and evaluating the emotion of shame. However, a recent exception is pastoral psychotherapist Carl Schneider (1977), who has examined both sides of shame and challenged this united front, as she states:

Shame and the sense of shame is a devalued dimension of human experience. In contradistinction to the ethical stance adapted by many popular contemporary thinkers, we need to attend to shame, not to dismiss it as a mechanism that is crippling, or inhibiting, but rather to suggest that a sensibility to the sense of shame will result in a richer understanding of what it means to be fully human (Schneider, 1977, p. ix).

The positive side -- shame as discretion -- can be observed in three forms. First, as an emotion rooted in the physiology of human beings, evidenced by the spontaneous blush of modesty or at even the thought of intense embarrassment; secondly, as a disposition toward choosing socially desirable or acceptable behavior; shame is a habitual tendency, a settled disposition to act in certain ways and according to certain principles; and thirdly, as an ethical inclination characterized by modesty, moderation, or temperance.

Shame is both positive and negative, both the capacity for discretion and, when indiscreet, the consequent disgrace. This polar emotion offers the possibilities of keen sensitivity to others and intense pain before others. Both sides of shame are essential parts of our humanness.

Relational

Another important feature that is a part of this phenomenon of shame is its relational dimension. We learn how to become persons through the process of
intimate relationships with family and friends. Identification is one of our normal human processes which begins with caregivers or significant others and extends to family, peers, culture, nation and world. When children grow up in a shame-based environment, they identify with that environment. This marks the beginning of the process of internalizing shame (Kaufman, 1988).

In the context of Chinese culture where the extended family remains strong, the relationship patterns are much different than in the West. Within American families, the emphasis is on the single nuclear family, which has a time-limited span. The general view is that two individuals who are independent adults meet, court, marry, and have children. They rear their children to become responsible, self-sufficient individuals who will ultimately leave home and repeat the process.

However, in the traditional East Asian framework, the family is not time-limited. The concept of extended family which I spoke of earlier extends backward and forward. The individual is seen as the product of all the generations of his or her family from the beginning of time. This concept is reinforced by rituals and customs such as ancestor worship and family record books, which trace family members back over many centuries. Because of this continuity, the individual’s behavior has different importance and consequence. Personal actions reflect not only on the individual, but also on all of the preceding generations of the family since the beginning of time. Also individual actions will impact upon all future generations as well (Augsburger, 1986).

Exploring shame from the perspective of interpersonal relations is as
important as understanding its innate activator. A relationship is a bond between
two individuals, whether a parent and child, teacher and student, two siblings, two
peers, a therapist and client, or two adults. Kaufman (1989), speaks of this relational
dimension as an ongoing process of establishing bonds and that it is never an end
state. Identification begins as a visual process but quickly becomes an internal
imagery process that encompasses visual, auditory, and kinesthetic senses. The face
has central importance in interpersonal relations because the facial gazing between
infant and mother is the source of primary identification, the earliest form of
communion. An interpersonal bridge forms out of reciprocal interest and shared
experiences of trust. Trusting must be matched by the parent behaving in a
trustworthy fashion. According to Kaufman (1989), "consistency (not perfection) and
predictability (not rigidity) are crucial to building this interpersonal bridge, whether
with a child, friend, or client" (Kaufman, 1989, p. 33).

Barriers to communion with another, to continued shared positive affect with
another, will rupture the interpersonal bridge. Any event that ruptures the
interpersonal bridge vitally linking infant to mother, father, or anyone else significant,
will activate shame. The failure to fully hear, openly validate and understand
another's need by directly communicating its validity can sever the interpersonal
bridge and thereby activate shame. Nathanson (1987), in referring to this
interpersonal dimension of shame, states that since shame produces temporary
separation, or instant insecurity, logic suggests that somewhere near its core, shame
has to do with separation anxiety, the emotion calling to the attention the child that
he or she is in danger because the mothering, protecting person is unavailable.
g. Shame: A complex phenomena

Having highlighted some of the major features of shame in the West, let's now explore the psychological dynamics of the shame process itself. One author, Wurmser (1981) emphasizes the importance of expectations in the emergence of shame. Shame may occur when certain expectations are not fulfilled; these expectations may be largely conscious ego standards or largely unconscious standards of the ego ideal. He points out further that a mere falling short of ego standards, or even the postulates of the ego ideal does not evoke shame. What is necessary in addition is that the inner wishful image of the self be "betrayed" and that certain self-critical, self-punishing, and reparative processes be set in motion. Only then does shame arise. If these criteria are not fulfilled the failing of ego standards leads to loss of self-esteem but not to shame.

3. DEVELOPMENTAL THEORY OF SHAME Identity AND SELF

a. Shame over the life cycle

Developmental theories offer another view of shame. Among the most integrative accounts of the development life cycle is the worldview of Erik Erikson (1950), offering a psychological-social-biological-spiritual analysis of eight stages of life. In an instinctual-conflictual approach, he sees the child as moved by conflicting drives toward both attaching and separation and therefore seeking a resolution of the appropriate polar tensions that arise in each stage. Both the positive and negative poles must be present before the integrative "virtue" emerges. Thus both trust and mistrust are necessary for the virtue of hope to be born; unless there is tension
between the urge for autonomy and the doubt of one's ability to risk or the shame from having overstepped one's bounds, the virtue will is not created and the child may be willful or will-less rather than willing (Augsburger, 1986).

Erikson (1950) stressed that to discover the personal-social-cultural "meaning" of an event in an individual's life, it must be studied with reference to four "coordinates": (1) the contemporary stage life of the individual, (2) his or her life history, (3) contemporary stage of the socio-cultural unit he or she belongs to, and (4) the history of the socio-cultural unit (Erikson, 1950, p. 247-263). In a society such as that of the Chinese where the child is trained by a large number of persons -- mother, father, aunts, uncles, grandparents in an extended family -- it is more likely that an outer-directed personality will emerge. Socialization in the joint family -- communal family tends to create a familial identity, not a personal identity. This is in contrast with the Western societies, where shame is devalued and anxiety repressed, the development of adult shame response rarely occurs. When shame is felt, it is not as adult embarrassment before peers and a loss of face in the community, but as an intensely regressive experience, a return to global self-negation of early childhood.

b. Psychological magnification of shame scenes: Defending scripts

Continuing our exploration of the psychological dynamics of shame we come to the defenses that characterize these dynamics. Kaufman (1989), in his work on the psychology of shame, speaks of defending scripts. In examining the individual's developing rules for responding to, predicting, controlling, and interpreting a
magnified set of shame scenes, he illuminates the particular strategies of defense that develop to protect the self against further encounters with shame. He also describes how initially these defending strategies or scripts are externally directed and forward looking, designed to escape from and avoid future encounters with shame. Rooted in governing scenes, these defending strategies have affect-imagery-language features. They comprise rules for action and cognition (Kaufman, 1989).

Kaufman (1989) describes general classes of defending scripts that become organized around shame. These classes are rage, contempt, striving for perfection, striving for power, transfer of blame, internal withdrawal, humor, denial. Bradshaw (1988), in speaking of these defenses, states that "each ego defense allows the child to survive situations which are actually intolerable" (Bradshaw, 1988, p. 74). For Bradshaw, as for Kaufman, the list is similar and include behaviors of perfectionism, striving for power and control, rage, arrogance, criticism and blame, judgmentalness and moralizing, contempt, patronization, caretaking and helping, envy, people pleasing, and being nice. Each behavior, according to Bradshaw, focuses on another person and takes the heat off oneself.

To help illustrate the dynamic of these scripts, let’s examine one such defense -- that of perfectionism. Kaufman notes that perfectionism scripts organize the self in order to erase every perceived blemish. The self must excel in an ever-widening circle of activities, while nothing done is ever seen as good enough. Perfecting the self comprises a set of rules for responding to magnified scenes of shame. In predicting and controlling shame scenes, perfectionism is an attempt to compensate
for feeling inherently defective, never quite good enough as a person. Hence, the perception that nothing done is ever good enough -- it could always have been done better. The inevitable result is that one is plunged back into shame. Perfection scripts are therefore both self-limiting and self-validating (Kaufman, 1989).

Bradshaw (1988) describes perfectionism in similar terms and states that perfectionism becomes learned when one is valued for what they do, not who they are. When love and acceptance become dependent on performance -- perfectionism is created. The performance is always related to what is outside the self. The child is taught to strive onward and there is never a place to rest and have inner joy and satisfaction. The perfectionism leads to comparison-making which becomes another major way that one continues to shame themselves internally. One continues to do on the inside what was done on the outside.

The final step in the developmental sequence according to Kaufman (1989) occurs when one's essential identity becomes based on shame. Defeats, failures, or rejections need no longer be actual but only perceived as such. The internal shame process has become magnified beyond what the basic affect of shame itself might produce as an amplifier, whether in the form of shyness, embarrassment or guilt. The internalization and further magnification have created an identity, a distinctive pattern of relating to oneself, that continuously absorbs, maintains, and spreads shame. The self has become shame-bound. Furthermore, the internal relationship between owned and disowned parts of the self recreates within the self the identical shame-activating qualities initially encountered interpersonally (Kaufman, 1989).
4. ADDICTION AND SHAME

Another important class of syndromes where shame plays a central role is that of the addictive disorder. The addiction functions as an escape from or sedation of these intolerable negative affects. Feelings of shame are reduced by becoming addicted to something. Addiction, while sedating the negative affect, also reproduces shame, and thus reactivates the cycle. The objects whether alcohol, drugs, food, or gambling are longed for repetitively, causing repetitive disappointment in self; the self feels powerless, depleted by its own addiction.

Jesus had compassion for those caught in the sin of addiction, whether it was sexual addiction, addiction to money, or addiction to power. He looked beyond the surface addiction to the person filled with shame and unbearable pain.

Bradshaw (1988), in his research on addictive patterns, found that addictions become a high priority when there is intolerable pain. He sees toxic-shame as such a form of unbearable pain as he describes;

To be shame-based is to be in intolerable pain. Physical pain is horrible, but there are moments of relief. There is hope of being cured. The inner rupture of shame and the "mourning" of your authentic self is chronic. It never goes away. There's no hope for a cure because you are defective. This is the way you are. You have no relationship with yourself or anyone else. You are totally alone. You are in solitary confinement and chronic grief.

You need relief from this intolerable pain. You need something outside of you to take away your terrible feelings about yourself. You need something or someone to take away your inhuman loneliness. You need a need-altering experience. (Bradshaw, 1988, p. 95)

5. SHAME IN FAMILY SYSTEMS

When looking at shame within family systems theory, our focus is to explore
the individual and/or family relationships within three systems: the family of procreation in which the client now lives; the family of origin; and the family of affiliation/close friendship. We focus on the family of origin because we assume that the client's behavioral patterns were shaped by parents and siblings and extended family members with whom they grew up (Fossum and Mason, 1986). For some people, these families of affiliation become like a substitute family for the individual who is cut off from their family of origin.

The family systems model views those individuals experiencing shame as part of a much larger system in which they play only one part in the history. In other words, everyone grows up in a family context. This insight can provide relief to the person who has internalized much of the family pain. This can also plant seeds for the essential understanding that we all do belong -- that while we are responsible for our behavior today, we did not become who we are alone. Minuchin (1974) notes that every member's sense of identity is influenced by his sense of belonging to a specific family.

Some families specialize in shaming. The members of these families continually say and do things that create and perpetuate shame. We call these families "shame-based families." The family systems approach emphasizes this multi-generational transmission aspect of shame and note that children who grow up in shaming families often emerge as shame-based adults whose lives center around feelings of low self-worth and defectiveness. Shaming parents often come from shaming families themselves. They simply may not know a better way to parent, or
may not realize the damage they do with their shaming attacks. While a certain amount of shame is inevitable, shame-based families, however, cannot or do not control this shaming behavior. Members of these families often seem to attack each other (Potter-Efron, 1989).

The family systems approach to shame has to deal with family roles, rules, boundaries, myths, and secrets. Bradshaw (1988) notes that all families have roles but what distinguishes the shame-based family is that the roles are necessitated by the needs of the family system. The roles are necessitated in the family's attempt to balance itself in the wake of the primary stressor. Whether the primary stress is Dad's alcoholism, Mom's pill addiction, Dad's violence, etc. each role is a way to handle the family distress and shame. The power of these roles for the shame-based person is their rigidity and predictability. Staying in the roles gives one a sense of identity. Whether the family hero, or mediator, or scapegoat, the role is essentially a false self or false perception.

The family systems approach works at building up a level of trust secure enough to help clients clarify their own perceptions. It doesn't look for fault but seeks to expose the system as a whole and how each member of the family plays a part. Hopefully, when clients are able to trust enough to be vulnerable, they can begin to establish more flexible boundaries and permit more ambiguity. The shame-based family, because of secrets and low self-esteem, often leaves family members feeling alone and isolated (Fossum and Mason, 1986).

The family systems approach to shame, in addition to clarifying boundaries,
can provide other opportunities for growth. Fossum and Mason (1986) point out that this possibility for growth involves what Carl Whitaker has called, "energy conversion." This conversion is seen when families uncover the hurt, anger, and rage known in shame which were felt over the years but never expressed. These built up layers of accumulated pain so clog our "spiritual drains" that release is demanded by our internal systems. Family therapy is often referred to by Fossum and Mason as "Drano." With Drano and a willing family, the "drains" can be unclogged to allow the family’s natural human feelings to surface. (Fossum and Mason, 1988, p. 161)

In this way, the individual family members can begin to learn how to be what Herbert Anderson (1984) calls, "being separate together." Being separate selves who are capable of being together with other separate selves is necessary for a vital society that both celebrates diversity and honors community.

B. Chinese: Psychology of Shame

1. CONCEPT OF FACE

We've seen how we Chinese are ancestral, social, and concerned with proper behavior in this life. We find these insights to be confirmed in our psychological studies as well. A central concept that illustrates this point is the notion of "face" in Chinese society.

Derald Wing Sue (1984) examines the cultural implications of shame or "losing face" in Asian context. Sue notes that for the Chinese the welfare and integrity of the family is of great importance. Members of the family are expected to submerge behaviors and feeling to further the welfare of the family and its
reputation. The behavior of individual members of the family is expected to reflect credit on the entire family. If a member of a family behaves in such a manner as to embarrass or shame himself or herself, the entire family shares in the shame and "loses face." So important is the stress on reputation and face that "bad behaviors" (exhibiting disrespect for parents, juvenile delinquency, failure in school, psychopathology, etc.) are handled as much as possible within the family, and public admission of problems is suppressed. (Sue, 1984, p. 121)

The concepts of shame and loss of face involve not only the exposure of your actions for all to see, but also the withdrawal of all the family's, community's or society's confidence and support. In societal structures where interdependence is so important, the actual or threatened withdrawal of support may shake the individual's basic trust that there will be others to rely upon and raise her existential anxiety of being truly alone to face life. Thus the fear of losing face can be a powerful motivating force for conforming to family and social expectations (Shon & Ja, 1983).

The West with their stress on individualism and the lack of extended families makes breaking away from familial and societal constraints much less complicated.

a. Contrasting loss of Face: East and West

Let's continue by contrasting this notion of "losing face" with Western approaches to shame. Shon and Ja (1983) note from their research that highly developed feelings of obligation govern much of the traditional life of people from East Asian cultures. Shame and loss of face are frequently used to reinforce adherence to prescribed sets of obligations. They contrast this with American society.
which has tended toward the ideals of the self-sufficient, self-reliant individual who is the master of his or her fate and chooses his or her own destiny. High value is placed on the ability to stand on your own two feet, or pull yourself up by your own bootstraps, or do your own thing. In contrast, Asian philosophies tend toward an acknowledgement that individuals become what they are because of the efforts of many things and many people. They are the products of their relationships to nature and other people. The greatest obligation of East Asians is to their parents who have brought them into the world and have cared for them when they were helpless. The debt that is owed can never be truly repaid; and no matter what parents may do, the child is still obligated to give respect and obedience.

b. Positive and negative aspects of Face

Many of the psychological aspects of positive and negative shame become intensified in a culture such as that of the Chinese where the concept of "face," "saving face," or "losing face" is an Asian preoccupation or social obsession. In Chinese culture, the feelings of shame have both internal and external origins. One feels shame before the ego ideal as well as before the community's ideals.

We Chinese may often appear modest and humble to Western observers. However, in one sense this modest appearance is not what it appears to be on the surface. It is self-protection as well as modesty. To avoid the possibility of unnecessarily losing face, a Chinese normally will understate his or her capabilities. Then if one fails, they will be measured by a lower standard. Their shame will be less intense. On the other hand, if one had boasted about their abilities and failed,
they would be ridiculed by the group. Hu Hsien-Chin, in a book by Noble (1975), has concisely summarized the positive and negative aspects of face:

We have seen that all the infringements of the moral code, all acts contrary to behavior of a person's ego status cause a depreciation of character. The loss of esteem is felt acutely and is symbolically expressed as "loss of lien." The fear of "losing lien" keeps up the consciousness of moral boundaries, maintains moral values, and expresses the force of social sanctions. Behavior that is not usually classed as immoral: the self-confidence of the opportunist, the criticism of another in the absence of control of one's conduct, the failure at an undertaking through lack of judgement, are also punished by "loss of lien." "Loss of lien" is felt acutely, for it entails not only the condemnation of society, but the loss of its confidence in the integrity of ego's character. Much of the activity of Chinese life is operated on the basis of trust. As the confidence of society is essential to the functioning of the ego, the "loss of lien" has come to constitute a real dread affecting the nervous system of ego more strongly than physical fear (In Noble, 1975, p. 452).

c. Examples

To illustrate further the role of shame within Chinese culture, here are a couple of personal examples provided by Wong and Cressy in Noble's book (1975), Naked and Not Ashamed:

A girl student did not do well in chemistry or in writing Chinese characters. Her elder brother told her, "It is a shame that a Chinese cannot even write good Chinese characters." As a result of her failure, she was "sentenced" to spend her whole summer in isolation working in her studies (Noble, 1975, p. 57).
The personal decision of a grandmother who had become a Christian to have a simple funeral proved to be embarrassing to one of her aunts. Elaborate funerals with expensive coffins were the custom. The grandmother, making her funeral arrangements before her death, bought a plain coffin. The aunt was very much afraid that the clan would lose face if the customary expensive funeral was not held (Noble, 1975, p. 57).

An illustration of the impact of personal failure upon the individual comes from the area of business. A good businessman suffered severe financial reverses which resulted in the loss of his business. As a result, he lost his will to live. He did not return to his family until the serious illness of a grandmother required him to do so. His loss of face kept him from returning (Noble, 1975, p. 57).

2. SOMATIZATION OF PSYCHOLOGICAL PROBLEMS: A CHINESE PHENOMENA

Because the fear of losing face is so pervasive in Chinese culture, psychological symptoms such as anxiety, depression, and other dysphoric states become expressed externally into somatically experienced and expressed distress. For example, the very terms that Chinese apply to dysphoric states men (depressed, sad), fan-tsaо (troubled, worried, anxious), Kan-huo (irritable, angry), shen-k'uei (kidney weakness or deficiency), shenching shuai-jo (neurasthenia) are semantic networks that convey psychological meaning through somatic symbols (heart, liver, kidneys, nerves respectively) (Kleinman and Lin, 1981, p. xiv).
The combination, and mutual reinforcement, of somatization and denial of psychological familial factors hardens Chinese patients' resistance to counseling, psychotherapy, or psycho-social intervention, especially by outsiders (including professionals). To the Chinese, the family is a sacred bastion, to be shielded from the eyes of outsiders, to be protected from the meddling of strangers. Kleinman (1978) highlights the research of others who support this notion. Chen (1970) and Lee (1973) responded that while the "silent Chinese" do have a myriad of problems, their strong sense of shame and pride have precluded and hindered their use of community programs and services. Sue and McKinney (1975) also observed that an admission of emotional problems and the inability to work out one's problems would arouse shame and reflect poorly on the family name, all of which results in the Chinese resistance to the use of professional services. Consequently, it is a common experience of counselors and psychiatrists, even in the first interview, to be consulted by the family on detailed dietary measures, hormone therapy, vitamins, or herbs for the patient for either fortifying (pu) his yin or cooling (t'ui-huo) his overheated yang in order to restore a proper balance (Kleinman and Lin, 1981, p. 393).

Somatization of psychological problems may compare with the growing addictions in the West in response to shame. The research on addictions in Chinese culture reveals some interesting contrasts with the West. The rarity of alcoholism among Chinese has been widely documented (Kleinman and Lin, 1981; Tseng and Wu, 1985). Possible reasons that are posited for this are as follows: 1. Chinese mostly drink only with meals and on ceremonial occasions. 2. Confucianism and
Taoism are the two main life philosophies guiding the behavior of the Chinese. While Confucian ideology stresses self-control and moderation, Taoism teaches harmony with the environment. Both are strongly opposed to the impulse releasing effect of alcohol. 3. The absence of drinking centered institutions and groups (taverns and bars) discourages regular, excessive consumption of alcohol. In addition, among Chinese-Americans it has been speculated that gambling, which is very widespread, may be a symptom substitute for alcoholic indulgence (Kleinman and Lin, 1989, p. 249).

Tseng and Wu in their book, Chinese Culture and Mental Health (1985), make reference to a study by Minuchin, Rosman, and Baker that observed four characteristics in the family process that may encourage somatization. They are enmeshment, overprotectiveness, rigidity, and lack of conflict resolution. Each of these can be found to a certain degree in the interaction of the Chinese family. Somatized presentation and behavior is created in Chinese culture by the blocking expression of emotion while at the same time encouraging and nurturing somatic preoccupation. For example, a child who complains of abdominal cramps will be given warm soup to eat and tenderly cared for, while a child who expresses fear will be scolded. Verbal expressions of emotions in the Chinese language are still predominantly somatic-oriented. Even though there are written characters designating states of depression, there are no equivalent expressions in the spoken language. The closest to such an expression is xin ging bu hgo (the condition of my heart is not good), a somatic description. (Tseng and Wu, p. 105) This is supported
by numerous research studies that reveal Chinese as being noted for their lack of psychological awareness. Affective features are presented less frequently than neurasthenic, hypochondriacal, and psychosomatic complaints.

The National Institute of Mental Health, in collaboration with the Office of Refugee Resettlement found that feelings and emotional problems per se are rarely, if ever, considered to be a proper reason for seeking professional assistance. Depression, regrets, guilt, shame, or similar preoccupying sentiments may weigh heavily on a Southeast Asian's mind and life, yet these are perceived as essentially private concerns and to talk about them would be about as discrete and commendable as parading in the nude in public (Owan, 1985).

3. EMOTIONAL EXPRESSION

In researching the phenomena of shame within Western and Eastern cultures, I came across a study that looked at the ethnic variations in the emotional expression of Chinese and Americans. Specifically, this research looked at shame in Caucasian and Chinese-American populations. The results of this study revealed that shame for white Americans was rated as low, passive, empty, hazy, sick, tense, sad, ugly, stale, bad, complicated, and serious experience. It is obviously an aversive state and one to be avoided. The picture of shame for Caucasians is one characterized by a judgmental process revolving around strong, painful, but rather non-specific feeling.

The results with Chinese-Americans in this same study indicate shame as rough, angular, sick, excited, tense, sad, ugly, red, bad, complicated, and serious. As was the case with Caucasian-Americans, shame is clearly an aversive feeling. The
differences in the results lead to the conclusion that shame is less clearly identifiable (or perhaps understood) for the Caucasian group. It does not appear as specific and identifiable as with the Chinese group. One interpretation of this is that shame may be used as a technique of social control more often in Asian societies and children can learn to read the cues more readily (Marsella, Murray, and Golden, 1974).

4. "WE" VRS. AN "I" CULTURE

Clinebell (1986), in his contrast of Western and Chinese approaches to pastoral psychology and care, highlights this aspect of "We" centered cultures -- that they define themselves and their identity in radically different ways. Where the Western understanding of "normal" development is as movement from dependency to autonomy, this contrasts with healthy development for the Chinese, which is learning to live by the ground rules of interdependency, as expressed in everyday values, customs, assumptions, and laws. For "normal" Chinese persons, the needs of the networks of their relationships -- from the extended family, to the neighborhood, and on to the whole nation -- take precedence over their individual needs (Clinebell, 1986, p. 372-373).

5. A SHAME CULTURE VRS. GUILT CULTURE

In contrast to the more guilt oriented Western cultures, China is much more of a shame culture. As in the case of We-cultures versus I cultures, the differences between shame and guilt cultures are matters of degree, with varying ratios between the two dynamics of social control. There seems to be fundamental differences in the formation and structure of what is regarded as "healthy" conscience in the two
types of culture. In Chinese culture, the dominant value is to bring honor and not shame to one's parents, clan, neighborhood, community, and nation (Clinebell, 1986, p. 374).

Augsburger (1986) explores in detail this question of guilt cultures versus shame cultures and provides some helpful insights. Beginning with Margaret Mead's work which characterized the Western cultural character as guilt-oriented, and contrasted it with Japanese culture, terming it shame-oriented, the distinction was made between outer-directed cultures as controlled primarily by shame and inner-directed cultures shaped primarily by guilt. Later research provided a more satisfactory explanation saying that persons in a society may be more oriented by shame or more directed by guilt, but both are present to some degree in the culture and its people. In other words, to call a society a "shame culture" or a "guilt culture" reduces the complex patterns of affect to a single emotional control pattern. Subsequent research confirms that anxiety, shame, and guilt are a universal developmental sequence, although they occur in varying measures and are expressed in diverse cultural patterns. The emotional dimension is only part of the process of the control patterns, along with the perception of responsibility as being in the self or in the situation, or the sense of agency may be internal to the person or external in the environment; thus, a multi-dimensional systems model is necessary to understand the configuration of controls, emotions, and responsibilities whether in the person, the group, or in the culture (Augsburger, 1986, p. 119-121).

In Guilt and Sin in Traditional China (1973), Wolfram Eberhard explores
various authors who have researched socialization in the Far East, especially in China, Japan, and Burma, and concludes that socialization was performed mainly by instilling a feeling for shame. The agency which produces either feelings of shame or feelings of guilt is the family. In a society where the child is trained by a number of socializing agents, as in extended family, or in which the trainers discipline the child by saying that he will be punished by other social agents, "shame-oriented" personality types are produced (Eberhard, 1973).

6. EXTENDED FAMILY

One of the basic differences between Chinese and Western cultures as noted by Howard Clinebell in his research was that of the extended family or clan. This extended family is the fundamental context within which children are socialized and personality structures formed. The influence and control which older relatives have is much more extensive than the nuclear family culture of the West. Family living arrangements in China typically are three-generational and the process of differentiation takes a different course than that of the West (Clinebell, 1986, p. 371). Tseng and Wu, in their book, Chinese Culture and Mental Health note that perhaps most central to Chinese culture is the value of the family as the fundamental unit of society. J. Hsu recognizes that the Chinese family system, not the individual, is the focal point of psychotherapy (Tseng and Wu, 1985, p. 7).

The Confucian philosophy, is behind the family system's organization which usually calls for prescribed status giving every man and woman a definite place in society. If everyone knows his place and acts in accordance with his position, social order is assured (Leung, 1985).
7. AUTHORITARIAN FAMILY STRUCTURE

In Chinese culture, tremendous emphasis has been placed on parental authority and filial piety. Chinese families are traditionally patriarchal with communication and authority flowing from top to bottom (Leung, 1985). Clinebell (1986), in his research, confirms that relationships in China are more hierarchical and authority-centered than in most egalitarian Eastern cultures. Consequently, the Chinese understanding of and norms for the leader, teacher, healer, or minister is more strongly authority-centered than in the West.

The authoritarian character of the Chinese family undoubtedly has some influence on their child-rearing practices. By and large, Chinese parents make demands and expect their children to obey. The old-fashioned parents do not normally feel obligated to consult their offspring about matters that affected their lives. Hence, parent-child relationships are often characterized by a formal, respectful, expression of traditional role expectations. Emotional displays and the expression of personal grievances are discouraged if not actively suppressed (Leung, 1985). All of this affects the expression and treatment of shame in Chinese culture.

8. TIGHT SOCIAL CONTROLS VS. RELATIVELY FLEXIBLE CONTROLS

In the West, autonomy, individual freedom and space (psychological and physical) and preference for relatively loose, flexible social structures are predominant values. However, for us Chinese, the emphasis is clearly more on the persons as members of the clan and society. One's identity as a Chinese is rooted in their responsibilities to family and society. Consequently, the Chinese have always had
much more tightly knit and overtly controlling social structures. The structures provide much greater emotional as well as material support to families in times of crisis.

9. CONTROL OF EMOTIONS

From childhood, Chinese are trained to control emotions that are considered adverse and disruptive to harmonious social interaction. Punishment of aggressive behavior among children is a characteristic Chinese child-training technique that may account for the learning of self-control and emotional restraint at an early age (Tseng and Wu, 1985). Emotional control among the Chinese may also be seen in a report that, in Hong Kong, despite the extreme population density of the dislocated migrants from the mainland, the rate of occurrence of emotional problems is lower than for Thais, Malays, and Indians in their homelands (Lee, 1985). Song Weizhen (1980), in his research of the Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory (MMPI) tests, the first MMPI tests ever done on the mainland of China, reports that in contrast to Westerners, the mainland Chinese are still found to be "emotionally more reserved, introverted, fond of tranquility, overly considerate, socially overcautious, habituated to self-restraint" (Song, W.Z., 1980).

The deep Confucian influence teaches Chinese to inhibit their emotional expressions through a discipline of the will. For example, if a person has feelings that may disrupt the family peace and harmony, he is expected to hide them. It is, therefore, only natural for them to be reluctant to express their feelings or to talk about their personal problems in a counseling situation (Leung, 1985, p. 9). This is especially true with regard to shameful feelings and experiences.
10. FILIAL PIETY OR LOYAL DEVOTION

Filial piety or loyal devotion to parents is often a primary commandment to all Chinese according to the Confucian philosophy. Ancestors and elders are viewed with great reverence and respect in most families. Under most circumstances, the child is strictly tabooed to contradict his elders or parents and must exhibit self-restraint at all costs. These role expectations are further reinforced by the larger society. The line of authority is clear-cut where the father is the head of the household and his authority is unquestioned. Even after a son is married, his primary duty is often to be a good son and his obligation to be a good husband and father comes second. In other words, a man’s primary allegiance is to the family in which he is born (Leung, 1985).

11. HOLISTIC VS. A DUALISTIC TRADITION

China, in contrast to the long Western tradition of body-mind dualism, has an ancient heritage of understanding persons and their healing more holistically. While the psychological and spiritual problems of the West have been viewed traditionally as caused mainly by forces within persons (e.g. sinful use of free will, psychodynamic conflict), in contrast, the dominant view in China through the centuries, as reflected in the Taoist tradition, for example, understands all illnesses as caused by disharmony -- within persons and between them and their family, group, society, and the universe (Clinebell, 1986).

12. LOW TOLERANCE FOR AMBIGUITY

Chinese, as part of their ethnic characteristics, tend to evaluate ideas on the
basis of their immediate practical application and to avoid the abstract, reflective, theoretical orientation. Because of their practical and applied approach to life problems, Chinese tend to be more intolerant of ambiguities and to feel more comfortable in well structured situations. It has been suggested that the ambiguity and lack of structure that usually accompany the traditional psychodynamic counseling approach may, indeed, create extreme discomfort in Chinese counselees. Consequently, one could expect the Chinese counselees to perceive the counselor as less credible if he or she were to use the traditional psychodynamic approach with them (Leung, 1985).
IV. PASTORAL COUNSELING -- HEALING SHAME

A. Pastoral Counseling/A Cross Cultural Approach

In the Clinical Handbook of Pastoral Counseling (1984), Donald Browning defines pastoral counseling as those caring acts of the church under the guidance of the minister that addresses issues of care from the perspective of both Christian theology and the modern social sciences, especially the modern developmental and psychotherapeutic psychologies. In reflecting on the above definition by Browning (1984), I can see that there are some limitations with regard to pastoral counseling in a non-Western context. Augsburger, in his book, Pastoral Counseling Across Cultures (1986), notes that the time has come for the pastoral counseling movement to function from an expanded, intercultural perspective. It is time to cross over into other perspectives and return with the broadened vision of humanness that emerges only along the cultural boundaries. Augsburger continues by saying that the training of pastoral counselors must be broadened to include alternate worldviews.

Derald Sue, in his book, Counseling the Culturally Different (1981), notes that almost all definitions of counseling encompass certain philosophical assumptions: (a) a concern and respect for the uniqueness of clients; (b) an emphasis on the inherent worth or dignity of all people regardless of race, creed, color, or sex; (c) a high priority placed on helping others to attain their own self-determined goals; (d) valuing freedom and the opportunity to explore one's own characteristics and
valuing freedom and the opportunity to explore one's own characteristics and potentials; and (e) a future-orientated promise of a better life (Sue, 1981, p. 3).

If we reflect on these philosophical assumptions, we can see that the healing relates directly to the values, goals, and potentials of the culture in which our client is rooted. For me, this means that I must draw from the Western approaches to healing shame what is helpful but also critique those aspects of culture that do not fit the Chinese context. Viewed interculturally, the pastoral counselor or caregiver has many different images, whose work takes a rich variety of forms, whose task is accomplished in a wide spectrum of styles, and whose role requires a breadth of definitions. It is difficult to name a common denominator. One-to-one counseling, marital and family therapy, and group therapy models are similar in most settings in the West, but they become almost unrecognizable to the Western eye in cultures where most problems are resolved within the joint family, where the vertical patterns of filial piety depend on the wisdom of the elders, and where the conversations on problems of living occur in informal rather than formal contractual settings. Christian caring is radically altered by its context, whether in Christian, secular or non-Christian cultures (Augsburger, 1986). Pastoral counseling in my home country of Taiwan where Christians comprise less than 1% of the population, will have a radically different look than here in the West.

Having highlighted some of the critical aspects of cultures, I now turn to a definition of pastoral counseling offered by Augsburger (1986) which more aptly addresses healing in a cross-cultural setting. Augsburger defines pastoral counseling
Pastoral counseling is a liberating and healing ministry of the faith community that is based on a relationship between pastor (minister or pastoring team) with counseling skills and a family or person who come together to engage in conversation and interaction. The relationship is a dynamic process of caring and exploration, with a definite structure and mutually contracted goals, and occurs within the tradition, beliefs, and resources of the faith community that surrounds and supports them (Augsburger, 1986, p. 151).

I like this focus on a healing relationship that occurs within the tradition, beliefs, and resources of the faith community that surrounds and supports people. This means that pastoral counseling within Chinese culture must be able to draw not only on the Christian heritage, but also on the many spiritual sources deeply rooted in Chinese culture. Let us now explore the various approaches to healing shame, beginning first with the West.

B. Western Models of Healing of Shame

1. KAUFMAN

Kaufman, in his book, *The Psychology of Shame* (1989), offers a developmental theory of shame, identity, and the self. He highlights Erik Erikson's (1950) developmental theory of shame that looks at the second stage of the life cycle, that of toddlerhood. The psychosocial crisis at this stage is *autonomy vrs. shame and doubt*. The establishment of a sense of autonomy requires tremendous effort by the child as well as extreme patience and support from parents or caregivers. Some children fail to emerge from this period with a sense of mastery. Because of failure at most attempted tasks or continual discouragement from parents, or most likely because of both, some children develop an overwhelming sense of shame and self
doubt (Newman, 1987).

This is the negative resolution of toddlerhood. Shame is the feeling the person experiences after having been caught in some misdeed. Because this feeling is so unpleasant and becomes internalized, in order to avoid it, children may refrain from engaging in new activities. In theological terms, the child loses his/her sense of wonder and creativity in life. The image of God that is formed reflects the conditional love of the parent. The sin lies in all of those false images of self (idols) that tell the individual they are not loved and accepted for who they are. Healing comes when the individual learns through a caring, respectful, and loving encounter that they are special, unique, and precious.

Healing for Kaufman (1989) occurs through an identity regrowth. In other words, therapy for the pastoral counselor involves an identification relationship. The pastoral counselor can offer a genuine and honest human relationship that provides for some of the client's deepest needs, caring, and respect above all. Because maladaptive patterns became internalized through identification, new experiences of identification between the client and pastoral counselor can bring healing to shame, instill hope, and free our client from the shackles of the past.

Jesus' encounter with the Samaritan woman at the well reflects this type of identification process. Jesus respectfully meets this woman, risking his own shame in the process, and knowing fully her own shameful circumstances of having five husbands. Jesus brings her shame into the open, yet doesn't judge her; instead, he brings about healing through accepting her as she is. Kaufman (1989) states that first shameful scenes must be recovered and made fully conscious before healing can take place. The result is the woman returns to the very community from which she has
felt alienated. She is known in her shame and yet embraced and she is then able to recognize the Christ.

Healing also involves creating what Kaufman (1989) refers to as "new scenes." These new scenes or tapes mean simply that a self-contempt script can be replaced with active respect for the self. The healing process in pastoral counseling involves not simply language, but image and affect as well. After the shameful scenes are recovered and made conscious, they must then be relieved as completely as possible using respectful presence and imagery. The old scenes or tapes cannot be eliminated, but can be reshaped by creating new scenes with positive affect. I can think of one woman that I have been counseling where I have tried to counteract her negative shame scenes through homework tasks of positive affirmations. This letting go of dysfunctional scripts is an active daily process. Often the negative talk and self blame have been built up over years and so too healing will often take time.

The clients must face the shame scenes directly, in the present, and learn self-nurturance and self-forgiveness. Ultimately, forgiveness involves a choice. It is no easy task, especially when one has suffered tremendous abuse.

2. FOSSUM AND MASON

Healing shame for Fossum and Mason (1986) is rooted in the concepts of family systems theory and offers another Western approach. Their therapy model for shame is inclusive and multi-level which means they explore the individual and family relationships. As with the other approaches to shame, their’s is an ongoing process. In other words, healing takes place throughout the family life cycle. Family
intimacy and a restoring of relationships is an unspoken goal. The healing movement is one from shame to respect. In the initial phase of therapy, the tasks of healing begin by gathering information through tools such as genograms and family histories. In this way, by placing the problem in the larger context of the family system, the clients can see how each member of the family is affected. It is a "no fault" approach that seeks not to focus blame but come to understanding and change. History-taking also widens the context by placing the current relationship within a long-term systematic context. We look for lifetime patterns of reliability, rapport, dignity and respect, abuse, loss and grief. It is important to explore abandonments, neglect, and cut-offs of previously vital relationships, because they are usually generated by someone's shame and produce shame in the people involved. What rules do family members have for dealing with conflict and tension? Does conflict occur openly? If it does, are there ways to resolve it? (Fossum and Mason, 1986)

The guiding ideal here is a sense of healthy shame that reflects greater respect for diversity and interdependence. In the shame-bound family system, there is little respect for differences and individual uniqueness. The stress is often more on being in control and doing things right, whereas in a respectful system, family members are more free to learn and grow. Theologically speaking, the respectful system reverences the wonderful diversity in creation and recognizes that by our very nature as humans, we are imperfect and incomplete. In other words, the individual who grows up in a respectful system sees the human being as a constantly unfolding mystery. The more we open up to this mystery, the more we open up to others and
our deepest selves. Rooted in the healing process toward a more respectful system is the appreciation of the dignity of each person and their crucial place in the family.

As a pastoral counselor, healing shame involves recognizing the individual as a unique person and a person in relationship. This theme is deeply rooted in the biblical notion of covenant. Covenantal relationships call for mutual responsibility and accountability and recognize that shame is never healed alone but always in the context of relationships. Healing deepens as more individual members assume some responsibility in the overall healing process.

The trusting relationship of the therapist is essential in allowing the client to confront central organizing loyalties and long-held control patterns. Once the clients confront these patterns, there is a shift from problem-solving and symptom-focused intervention to more broad-based growth. This is what Fossum and Mason refer to as the deepening phase. There is a re-negotiation of the therapeutic contract that leave the energy and motivation for therapy with the client. At this point, the client's step out of their control cycle and may be flooded with feelings but have little resources for dealing with them. The new contract for more long-term work at building healthier relationships is begun. The healing takes place in respecting the process the clients are in and offering reassurance and encouragement for the hard work ahead. It is also a healing task to have a clear sense of one's own boundaries as a counselor.

The closing phase comes when the clients are able to confront their problems and not only survive but grow and become stronger. It is the time of becoming
separate together. The closing is not absolute and a door is left open realizing that they may need to return for support now and then. This final stage is an opportunity to reminisce about the journey, the crises that were lived through, and provide a map or set of tools for the road ahead.

3. BRADSHAW

Bradshaw (1988) follows and expands on the twelve steps of A.A. in his model of healing. Like many other authors, Bradshaw views shame as primarily a hidden phenomenon and says that the first step is to come out of hiding and acknowledge the hurt. This phase is called the recovery phase and encompasses the first three steps of A.A. These first three steps allow us to rejoin the human race, to accept our need for community and our human limitations. This initial phase is one of awareness, of recognition, of exposing the secrets, and naming the shameful sources.

Bradshaw (1988) adds a spiritual dimension to his look at healing shame. In fact, he sees a healthy sense of shame or humility as the ground of spirituality. To know oneself as finite, limited, and in need of God is the core of our deepest identity. The entire twelve steps of A.A., so fundamental to Bradshaw’s healing model, are rooted in spirituality. Jesus’ own experiences of the cross reveals the sort of emptying of self and acceptance of human limitation that guides the healing process. Jesus’ own approach was to gradually let go and surrender to the will of God; so too, the healing begins when shame is embraced and one begins to trust in a higher power.

The second phase which encompasses steps four through nine of A.A. deal with grief work. The healing tasks are to re-experience the original pain, to grieve
the unresolved grief, and to begin to discover the "inner child" (Bradshaw, 1988). Once felt, the grief is able to be validated as real and it can begin to be resolved. From there, Bradshaw states that new corrective experiences can be begun such as embracing the inner child, and reprogramming more positive and affirming self-images. The counselor helps the client to begin to stop negative or shaming images and convert them to affirmation, self-acceptance, awareness of limitations. Steps eight and nine talk about making an inventory of persons harmed and to make amends where possible. This means that healing also involves emotional honesty in relationship and a restoration of broken relationships with self, God, and the other.

This sort of healing is reflected in the Samaritan woman at the well, who learns through the respectful acceptance of Jesus to "worship in spirit and in truth" (Jn. 4:24). The woman reaches out to the community she was alienated from. She is restored to relationship with herself, God, and others.

Finally, Bradshaw talks of the discovery phase (steps 10, 11, 12) which help the client maintain those restored relationships. These steps imply that healing is an ongoing process, it is rooted in dynamic relationships, and that it is rooted in a spiritual awakening. Shame deepens when an individual is focused on the external world and his or her energy is devoted to maintaining this false or public self. The spiritual life, on the other hand, is an inner life and marks the ground for a healthy sense of shame. Shame has the potential to restore us into proper balance with God, self, and other.
4. AUGSBURGER

My final author, Augsburger (1986), takes a cross-cultural approach. Feelings of shame have both internal and external origins. One feels shame before the ego ideals as well as before the community's ideals. Shame, with its ideal demands from within and social demands from without, produces an impulse to hide, flee, avoid, and deny. One feels stuck, on the spot, blamed, and rejected. Regardless of which culture we look at, the loss of face before others, the loss of honor in the group, the loss of worth before the self, all create intense inner pain. In shame, one feels the imploding of the condemning world. The massive introjection of self-depreciation must be drained off and the positive thrust of the shame process directed toward recovery and healing.

The goals of therapy are rooted in the fundamental belief that, "shame has the seeds of betterment in it." Augsburger highlights the central aspects of this healing process in shame as follows:

As healing proceeds, a reclaiming of ego, ego ideal, ego in relationship, and ego esteem takes place. Most frequently this requires (1) the recognition of the ego ideals, (2) the reclaiming of the values prized, (3) the grieving for their loss or betrayal, (4) reaffirmation of ideals as goals to be sought rather than judgements to be dreaded, (5) the examination of values betrayed before others, and (6) recommitment of self toward gaining respect (Augsburger, 1986, p. 135).

In this process, the pain of disgrace is reframed and the elements of discretion claimed and directed toward the future. The possibilities of recovering hope and regaining a sense of worth begin the reduction of shame and the return to open relationship.
The following diagram illustrates those forces present in the experience of shame and points to the therapeutic goals that are needed:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>EGO IDEAL</th>
<th>SOCIAL CONTEXT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DISCRETION</td>
<td>Discretionary values are incorporated as parental ideals and are internalized in early childhood. This ideal prompts, guides, limits, and corrects planned behavior.</td>
<td>Discretionary values are present in the social context and are enforced by conditional acceptance, inclusion, and respect. They serve as a spur to conform to expectations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DISGRACE</td>
<td>Disgrace is felt internally as one falls short of the ego ideal, so no audience is required for the experience of shame.</td>
<td>Disgrace occurs as one feels exposed, humiliated, rejected as a total person. It is experienced as a loss of face, loss of respect and status.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GOALS OF THERAPY</td>
<td>Internal adjustment, integration, reframing, reconciliation with ego ideal.</td>
<td>Social acceptance, inclusion in relationship, regaining of face before significant persons.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Augsburger, 1986, p. 135)

In the four-variable grid above, we can see that internal and external forces are present in the experience of shame. In response to feelings of shame, the pastoral counselor's unconditional acceptance offers an undergirding esteem where there has been a severe loss of self-worth. Augsburger (1986) points to the floor of grace as the core of this relational encounter that reaffirms the basic trust necessary for healthy personality formation. Hope is born out of a grace-filled encounter that makes assimilation of shame possible. Jesus' own ability to embrace his shameful experiences was deeply rooted in the intimate relationship and trust he had in God.
In the same way, Augustine, who I spoke of earlier, came to realize that his issue was no longer Adam's question, "How can I conceal my shame?" but "how may God become known to me?"

5. INTEGRATIVE MODEL

In reviewing Western approaches to healing shame by Bradshaw, Kaufman, Fossum and Mason, and Augsburger, it becomes clear that while there are differences, some central themes and process of healing emerge. Reflecting on these central themes I have come up with an integrated model for healing. This model may be highlighted by the six following phases or processes healing: 1. Trust established, 2. Naming the shame, 3. Claiming it, 4. Grieving, 5. Integrating, and 6. Spiritual awakening and generativity. I will briefly summarize the psychological and theological aspects of these phases and then later offer a critique of them from a Chinese perspective.

a. Trust established

Fundamental in all of the approaches I have explored from the West is the aspect of trust. Before shame can be named, an atmosphere of respect and trust must be established. Augsburger (1986) identifies this trust as the primal layer of personality formation. Trust is built on genuine caring and respect for the dignity of the individual in shame. In order for painful feelings to eventually be embraced, the client must feel they will be accepted. Kaufman (1989) states that shame-based clients require the kind of security-giving relationship that has been so lacking in their lives. In theological terms, trust is established by walking along with the person, not judging, but actively listening and allowing the client’s own process to flow. It
involves genuine caring and respect, the type modeled in Jesus’ encounter with the woman at the well. Jesus walks step by step with the woman and gradually the full truth of herself is revealed and she is able to emerge from hiding back into communion. God’s fidelity throughout salvation history reflects the trust he gives his people; a trust that forms the ground for repentance and new life.

b. Naming

Bradshaw (1988) refers to this step of naming as "coming out of hiding." As long as our shame is hidden there is nothing that can be done about it. Kaufman (1989) speaks of observing and naming the "inner voices." By observing the impact of these inner voices, how they make the client feel, we can begin to name them (Kaufman, 1989). Fossum and Mason (1986) speak about this naming as a crucial step in the "initial phase of therapy." Augsburger (1986) speaks of "recognizing the ego ideals." Naming patterns accurately is important because names create tools, enhance inner power, and illuminate inner states. They provide the clues to the past as well as provide gateways to release and change. The power and identity rooted in naming has deep biblical roots, especially in the Old Testament.

c. Claiming

Claiming involves more than recognizing or naming. It involves being willing to face the shame with an effort to "engage affect, imagery, and language" (Kaufman, 1989, p. 211). This is claiming and entails a conscious effort. Claiming involves choice, and self-acceptance (Bradshaw, 1988). Others speak of this idea of claiming in regard to acceptance of other’s separations in the family (Fossum and Mason,
1986). For Augsburger (1986), it is "reclaiming the values prized." Healing involves action. In theological terms, we become participants in creation. To heal is to choose to risk, to grow, to become vulnerable.

d. Grieving

All of the Western approaches acknowledge the crucial process of grieving in healing shame. The grief is tied often to the betrayal of trust from parent, caregiver, or significant other. The only way to healing and wholeness is through the grief. This is often a painful and difficult process and demands that an atmosphere of acceptance, respect, and trust is established with the pastoral counselor. Bradshaw (1988) speaks of grieving as the "original pain feeling work." Grief varies in duration to the intensity of the trauma or loss experienced. Fossum and Mason (1986) speak of reclaiming buried feelings, and the task of the therapist is to "accept clients where they are, respecting their pain and offering empathic support."

In theological terms, the healing of shame is often a painful process. It involves facing the hurt, the damage done to self and others. It is a process that must be gone through. One example is of the woman with a bad reputation who wept at the feet of Jesus anointing his feet with her tears. Grief is also modeled in the anguish felt and tears shed by Jesus in his passion and death.

e. Integrating

This phase of healing is the bringing together of the distorted or disintegrated parts of the self. Kaufman (1989) identifies this as "reowning the disowned parts of the self" and Bradshaw (1988) speaks of "integrating your disowned parts."
disowned part of the self is what Jung referred to as our "shadow side." Without integrating our shadow, we can't be whole. Integration in the family systems model highlighted by Fossum and Mason (1986) occurs when the therapist witnesses the clients of a family being able to "be separate together," and confront their problems directly despite the tensions. The signs of integration are clearer boundaries, differentiation, and a willingness to not avoid conflict but face it constructively. Augsburger (1986) identifies integration as a therapeutic goal.

The integration recognizes the healthy and redeeming aspects of shame as a ground for deeper wholeness and humility. This represents the full acceptance of one's self as limited, vulnerable, and in need of others. It is the phase of harmony and balance with God, self, and other. Peter, in the example I used earlier, depicts this sort of integration. Peter was always clinging to his undying loyalty and fidelity to Jesus. He would be the only one who would remain true till the end, he would never deny his Lord. It was only after he faced his own shame and accepted those failings and limitations as part of himself that he was open to Jesus' healing love and forgiveness. Having experienced his own sinfulness, he knew more fully what it meant to be human. In embracing this vulnerability, he was able to "feed" others (Jn. 21: 15-17).

f. Spiritual Awakening and Generativity

In this final phase of healing, the client moves toward wholeness and completeness. There is a "letting go" (Bradshaw, 1988), "a personal sense of dignity" (Fossum and Mason, 1986), an "inner source," (Kaufman, 1989) on which to rely.
This is the path of continued healing and wholeness and is reflected in the inward journey. A.A. speaks of "seeking through prayer and meditation to improve our conscious contact with God, as we understand God." It is letting go of control and allowing serenity and peace to flow. The compulsive and controlling behaviors have kept the shame-based person from discovering the richness of solitude. In this phase, solitude is no longer feared but nurtured.

This final phase is an inward journey that deepens one's awareness and integrity. This level of healing reflects a deepening of all that has gone before, and the sense of healthy shame is embraced. Ultimately, this phase of healing is characterized by a growth in intimacy and being truly present and there for others. Having focused so much externally before, the shame-based person was overly preoccupied with self-protection and control. At this final phase, the individual has begun to learn how to let go and let God, one day at a time. The discipline of control gradually gives way to the discipline of surrender.

C. CONTRASTING WESTERN MODELS WITH CHINESE PERSPECTIVES

Having explored some of the major Western theories and approaches to healing shame, I am now ready to offer a critique from my own Chinese perspective. Realizing that the Chinese cultural worldview presents a unique context, I will examine the particular approaches to healing that respect that reality. In addition, I will seek to integrate in my own pastoral counseling approach the rich resources of both my Chinese religion and my Judeo-Christian heritage.
1. TRUST ESTABLISHED

I will begin my exploration of pastoral counseling shame by critiquing each of the six generalized phases from the West from a Chinese cultural and religious perspective. I will point out in each phase that are both similar and different in this cross-cultural approach.

The first stage of establishing trust is crucial within Chinese culture for a variety of reasons. The client within Chinese culture has already risked a great deal in seeking help and that risk must be deeply respected. If the client or individual seeking help in dealing with shame feels that he or she can trust the pastoral counselor, then more open sharing might eventually take place. Respect for the shamed person in Chinese culture will demand that in the initial stages of counseling, the client may be very indirect and talk in circles. The culturally sensitive pastoral counselor will respect this distance and not push for self-disclosure. Shon and Ya (1983), in their study on Asian families, highlight this element of trust as a prerequisite for effective counseling, as they state,

Before revealing family conflicts and secrets to a therapist, the family will try to develop a trusting and comfortable relationship or alliance...this involves finding out some information about the therapist. If the therapist is uncomfortable with this and gives information very reluctantly, it is likely the family will, in turn, feel uncomfortable about revealing information. This does not mean the therapist must tell his or her life story, but he or she must give enough information so that the family has some perspective about their therapist (Shon and Ya, 1983, p. 225).

2. NAMING

The phase of healing indicated by naming is an especially difficult process for
us as Chinese. It is made especially difficult because to admit to shame is somehow to expose or perhaps blame one's parents or family. The shame, if kept hidden, will be less likely to bring shame to one's ancestors. The hesitancy to talk about or name the shame is not so much because it is hidden, but rather that to talk about one's family would only magnify the felt sense of shame. As Leung notes in his research on the cultural variables of counseling Chinese,

Due to the heavy emphases Chinese culture puts on "shame" and "face," it is already very difficult for the Chinese counselee to reveal personal matters to the counselor so as to prevent both himself and the family from losing "face." Loss of face would be far more serious should the counselor be Caucasian. Losing face is already a shame, losing face to someone outside the Chinese ethnic group makes it even more shameful (Leung, 1985, p. 10).

Chinese experiences of shame are more often suppressed than repressed but naming the shame is no less complicated because of the tremendous social and cultural factors that prohibit revealing the family business to outsiders. In Guilt and Sin in Traditional China (1973), the author explores original Chinese sources in literature that speak about shame and concludes that in most of these examples, "shame occurs only if the action is made publicly known" (Eberhard, 1973, p. 13). The naming can only occur when the individual is assured that he or she is safe and will be honored.

3. CLAIMING

This area is especially crucial for Chinese, and might be better termed "facing shame." As I mentioned earlier, shame is a social phenomena and often the awareness is there (not so much repressed but suppressed), but facing it in "affect, imagery, and language" as Kaufman (1989) states is no easy task. This may, indeed,
be an overwhelming experience for the Chinese client seeking pastoral counseling. When to acknowledge one's shame before someone outside the family brings further disgrace, the motivation to fully face or claim is greatly diminished. Claiming will eventually be possible with a respectful counseling relationship that adheres to deeply held cultural values and is sensitive to the ways and thinking of its client.

Jesus reflected this process of claiming in the willingness to continually face his own truth and not run from it. More than simply recognizing the shame he experienced in his own passion, it also involved a choice to embrace it. In my own Chinese tradition of Confucianism, we would say that claiming involved the virtue of authenticity. As we say in Chinese, if you know, you say you know; if you don't, then you don't. True wisdom and knowledge comes in accepting one's limitations.

4. GRIEVING

Having spoken previously about how we as Chinese are taught to inhibit our emotional expressions as part of our cultural upbringing, we can see that there might be some major difficulties with expressions of grief. This expression of painful feelings is especially complicated by the fact that the counselor most likely will be someone outside of the family. What then does this mean for the pastoral counselor? How does one remain sensitive to these deep cultural inhibitions and still promote ongoing healing?

There is no easy answer to the above questions, and indeed the inability or unwillingness to express such feelings has at least contributed to the extensive amount of somatization of psychological problems among the Chinese (Kleinman and
Lin, 1981). However, it is important to also recognize that just because expression of feelings is highly valued in Western culture, does not make it universally appropriate. To illustrate this point, counselor Kiyo Morimoto of Harvard, in a series of conversations on psychotherapy and Asians, noted:

There is a crucial distinction related to the meaning of shame to Asians in the counseling process. The recognition of feelings in the Western culture through sharing generally results in a confirmation of the legitimacy of the feeling. The sharing opens up the possibility for exploring and understanding other sources of conflict and pain. For an Asian, however, the empathic recognition of his/her feelings by the counselor threatens the client who is already experiencing feelings of shame for needing help and even greater anxiety at further exposure of unacceptable feelings (Toupin, 1980, p. 85).

What Morimoto acknowledges is confirmed in my own counseling work in Taiwan. The traditional Western approach, which is heavily dependent on the client talking about personal experiences and problems, has been less effective with Chinese. What has been more beneficial in practice has been a relationship in which the therapist reveals some personal problems, sanctioning through this sharing the client's vulnerability. Through sharing, a trust can be developed with the therapist who has experienced the same feelings, yearnings, and experiences. In pastoral counseling shame, the therapist must realize the process of revealing feelings will be slower and may demand the counselor to be comfortable with self-disclosure, and aware of his or her own shame. The pastoral counselor must also realize the acute anxieties the Chinese client is feeling just being "in therapy," and understand as Toupin notes that "verbalizing may not bring relief" (Toupin, 1980, p. 86).

Another important point related to this area of sharing painful feelings is the
importance of the counselor picking up the non-verbal cues and realizing that there is much more than what is verbalized or explicitly stated. The process of healing demands attention, presence, awareness, and a deep respect for the client's own process. This does not mean that grieving is not possible or necessary in healing. However, it does call for patience and sensitivity to the cultural realities of the Chinese client.

Jesus provides a model for pastoral counseling shame that speaks to the phase of grieving. The willingness of Jesus to continue to welcome outcasts and sinners of his day reveals his deep awareness of his own shame. This willingness on the part of Jesus to risk and expose himself to what was considered shameful allowed true grief and repentance to emerge. Such is true, for example, with the story of the woman with a bad reputation (Lk. 7: 36-50). Jesus doesn't deny the truth of her "many sins," but sees her "great love" and her heart that longs for healing.

5. INTEGRATING

This integrating phase that so many Western authors speak of with reference to shame reminds me very much of the principle of yin and yang in Chinese Taoistic philosophy. Brightness is produced when the sun and moon give way to each other. Another way this is commonly expressed in my Chinese culture is, "in lightness there is darkness and in darkness lightness." The healing process of shame involves the reconciling of opposites, a theme that is at the heart of yin and yang. The shadow side is not to be feared, but accepted fully as an integral part of what it means to be fully human. This is the core of what is meant by healthy shame. Shame, when
recognized, purified, and embraced, has the power to see ourselves as we really are -finite, limited, and in need of others.

6. SPIRITUAL AWAKENING AND GENERATIVITY

This final phase of healing is a growth in inner awareness. It is an outgrowth of the unifying and integrating process. The healing continues as the self is able to let go of control -- to let go and surrender to a higher power or Master of Heaven. The Chinese Taoist principle of "wu wei" best symbolizes for me the movement of healing shame at this phase. At the heart of the teaching of "wu wei," is the call to Stillness (solitude), a surrender to the ultimate reality and letting go of the illusion of control.

The spirituality of A.A. speaks of improving our conscious contact with God, and Buddhism calls for deliverance from suffering through a maximum development of consciousness (Claxton, 1986). Whatever words are used, the idea remains essentially the same -- healing of shame demands deeper internal awareness. Water for Lao Tzu symbolizes the behavior of the wise person because it takes the path of least resistance (Jochim, 1986). This symbol of water may also reflect the healing of shame at its deeper levels, where peace is found in the principle of non-interference, "wu wei." The Serenity Prayer best captures this mysterious reality in these words,

God grant me the serenity to accept the things I cannot change, the courage to change the things I can and the wisdom to know the difference.

In this final phase of healing shame, the student or client becomes teacher and grows in his/her willingness to share out of the depths of their liberating experience.
This generative power is witnessed, for example, in various twelve-step groups where individuals in long-term recovery become sponsors for newer members.

D. Other Dimensions of Healing Shame in Chinese Culture

Now having critiqued the major Western themes or phases in the healing of shame from Chinese culture, I would like to highlight some other key dimensions of healing that are crucial to consider when pastoral counseling in Chinese culture. The attitude toward healing, role of the family, and the counselor/client relationships are three such critical areas to take note of.

1. ATTITUDES TOWARD HEALING

According to Michael Harris Bond in *The Psychology of Chinese People* (1986), empirical studies of patients and normal subjects have found that Chinese adopt multiple causal attributions and coping strategies in dealing with their problems. These cultural characteristics suggest the importance of a wholistic approach to healing that involves an interactionistic paradigm, in which psychological processes, somatic factors, and the situational and social contexts all contribute to an understanding of Chinese psychopathology.

The cross-cultural pastoral counselor dealing with Chinese must view shame in all its dimensions, and be sensitive to the variety of ways this phenomena is manifested. A systems model is needed to examine the role of multiple factors in the perception and recognition of psychological disturbances such as shame, and in seeking treatment for them. This demands that models for healing shame be rooted in the cultural context of the Chinese people.
2. ROLE OF THE FAMILY

For Chinese people, the importance of the family, the institution which has patterned the entire social matrix, can hardly be overestimated. Lin and Lin, in their article, "Love, Denial and Rejection: Responses of Chinese Families to Mental Illness," dramatically points out this importance of the family as they so aptly describe:

It is the bastion of their personal and economic security; it provides the frame of reference for personal and social organization; it controls all the behavioral and human relationships of its members through a clearly hierarchical structure and sanctioned code of conduct; it transmits moral, religious, and social values from generation to generation through role modeling, coercion and discipline. It also offers a haven for safety, rest and recreation; it maintains the altar for ancestor and religious worship. The influence of the family on the lives of its mentally ill members is no less profound than it is for anyone else. The handling of the mentally ill in Chinese society cannot, therefore, be considered without taking the family context into account (Kleinman and Lin, 1981, p. 387).

The critical role played by the family keeps individuals who may need help from seeking it until all the family's means of healing have been exhausted. With utmost diligence and vigilance, the head of the family and its members proceed with trial and error in carrying out treatments. If and when a treatment proves to be ineffective, then another round of selecting a treatment method starts in a similar fashion to the previous one with a renewed effort to implement it, always with the hope of obtaining satisfactory results. Even when the family has tried a variety of methods, it still would be hesitant to approach an outsider for the stigma of shame (Owan, 1985). The process of seeking outside help is a cautious one and expands to concentric circles to include relatives, elders of the community, officers of the clan,
school teachers, and other trusted friends who the family regard as equal to their relatives. Their views on the causes of the psychological problem are considered and their advice and treatment is valued (Kleinman and Lin, 1981).

What does all this mean with regard to pastoral counseling in a Chinese context? At the very least, it means the counselor must be very sensitive to the crucial role of the family. Leung (1985) notes that there will be strong restraint in expressing any negative feeling towards the parental figure during the counseling process. Intimate revelations of personal or social problems may not be acceptable because such difficulties reflect not only on the individual, but also on the family. Thus, the family may exert strong pressures on the counselee not to reveal personal matters to "strangers" or "outsiders" so as to prevent the family from "losing face."

Another implication for pastoral counseling is that the therapist must respect these critical family ties and seek to involve the family in the counseling process. I think this is one reason why family approaches to counseling have achieved more success in my home country of Taiwan than other more individualistic approaches. With regards to healing shame, the pastoral counselor may be dealing only with the individual but eventual healing must involve the entire family.

3. COUNSELOR/CLIENT RELATIONSHIPS

Healing of shame in Chinese culture calls for empathy and respect for the process the client is going through. Many authors who have researched this phenomenon of shame, speak of the importance of the counselor having dealt with shame on a personal level. A pastoral counselor who is out of touch with his or her
own issues related to shame, may compromise the therapeutic relationship (Hunter, 1990; Kaufman, 1989). This is especially true in dealing with Chinese clients who may need the therapist or pastoral counselor to display their own vulnerability and limitations. The challenge facing pastoral counselors is to accept feeling limited without feeling lesser for the limitation.

This relational aspect is very crucial in dealing with Chinese. Chinese are relational-oriented and they must know the person if they are to share with him or her. Jesus, in his own ministry, was not afraid to risk self disclosure and frequently brought about healing through his own willingness to risk.

E. Some Final Theological/Spiritual Reflections: A Cross-Cultural Approach

1. FILIAL PIETY

Central to the healing of shame in Chinese culture is understanding the deeply rooted nature of filial piety for Chinese people. Disobedience to one's parents is considered the most heinous crime as the Chinese proverb states, "Under heaven, no parent is ever wrong." This obedience to elders in their lifetime, and veneration of their spirits after death, has been the duty of a fourth of the world's population for over four thousand years. Duties to parents are continuous, never-ending, alive or dead (Augsburger, 1986). The unwavering loyalty, while contributing to the overwhelming nature of shame, also provides the context in which healing will take place.

Augsburger (1986), in looking at filial piety, notes that it is as central to Chinese ethics as neighbor love is to Western Judeo-Christian thought, as he states,
Filial piety is not mere dutifulness to one's parents, but rather it constitutes an integral approach to what it means to be human (Augsburger, 1986, p. 167).

The philosopher Mo Tzu (fifth century B.C.) taught that unconditional love or filial piety ought to be extended to all human kind and not reserved in a special degree to parents and family relations. Despite this view, the Confucianist view of particular rather than universal love prevailed. However, the two are not opposed in Confucian thought. Universal love is seen as a natural result of profound filial piety. The vertical virtue, when obeyed, energizes all others. In Chinese, we say that the person who has filial piety would be someone you could trust and rely on.

These deeply held values of filial piety have the potential to lead to a healthy sense of shame. The driving force is to bring respect and honor to one's parents and ancestors. In honoring your ancestors, you honor yourself. The deep resources for healing shame in Chinese culture are found in filial piety. The desire to bring honor can be a very useful spiritual energy to draw upon when counseling with Chinese persons. Change demands a desire to change, and the desire for honor is deeply rooted in the Chinese person.

2.  RESTORING HONOR

Healing shame for Chinese takes place in the context of relationships. Shame in Chinese culture is a social phenomena that is interwoven in the family system. As I reflected on the differences in shame in the East and West, I realized that healing shame for us as Chinese demands some action. It is not enough to go through counseling, the Chinese person must somehow restore the honor lost, as in the examples I presented earlier with regard to "losing face."
The way Jesus dealt with people in shame was to lead them to repentance. It was not enough to simply recognize one’s sin, but to turn away and repent. Repentance demands some change. So too, with the Old Testament references to shame where healing took place in turning from idolatry and back into covenantal relationship.

3. **METAPHOR OF EXILE**

The biblical image that captures the experience of the Chinese person in shame is that of the exile. The exile is a lonely process, patience is called for as one is separated from their homeland. All of one’s loyalties and connections are distant leaving the person in shame feeling alone, isolated, and tempted to despair. Shame, for Chinese, as I reflect on my own experience, cuts us off from the source of our identity, our family. The survivors of the fall of Israel, for example, lost an essential part of their existence. They could no longer be Israelites, if there was no nation of Israel. Only through time, after facing the crisis directly was a restoration made possible. Grieving was part of that process that would finally lead to a more integrated life, but only after they were able to reinterpret their experience in exile. So too, the Chinese experience of healing shame often comes through being able to reinterpret the events and struggle for new forms and meaning. These questions and risk-taking with the counselor allows the space for a new beginning and a renewed hope.

4. **RESPECT**

Let me illustrate some potential sources for healing shame using the resources
of Chinese culture and religious tradition. When I worked as a crisis counselor in Taiwan, our busiest time came in summer after the results of the college entrance exams were announced. This national exam is the only way a Chinese person may enter college, and there are many more applicants than space available. This exam is highly competitive and those who fail feel shame, and usually there are quite a few suicides at this time. Students feel they have failed to meet the expectations of their parents, many of whom have worked hard and sacrificed for this opportunity. This shame is often overwhelming. Healing begins when the pain is acknowledged and faced by the student. Those who come to the crisis counseling took a risk of greater exposure and shame by asking for help outside the family. The attitude of the counselor in this situation is one of deep respect, "Li."

The pastoral counselor, in Chinese culture, faces the client with patience and gentleness, realizing that this is "holy ground." The Chinese person experiencing shame has been taught to suppress a lot of painful feelings and emotion, and healing demands waiting, listening, and attending to the process of the client. There will most likely be a point of problem-solving. The problem-solving comes later after walking with the client through the painful and fearful task of facing shame. Healing comes through an authentic caring relationship with the client. Chinese are relationship-oriented, and we must feel trust and respect before we will allow ourselves to reveal underlying issues of shame. The healing is in the relationship. Like Jesus, with the Samaritan woman at the well, who gently, respectfully brought about healing through meeting the woman for who she was, through her culture and
values. Jesus had embraced his own shame and knew who he was. This was the ground for his intimate relationship with God. It was a humility that led him to see with eyes of compassion, not condemnation; acceptance, not rejection. This is healing through a respectful encounter.

5. OTHER SPIRITUAL SOURCES OF HEALING IN CHINESE CULTURE

Looking at the Chinese spiritual sources for healing, we can return to the Taoist principle of "wu wei," best captured in the symbolism of the water. Healing shame calls for a respectful attention to the natural flow on the part of client and counselor. It is accepting the nature, and coming to terms with what can’t be controlled.

When the river water flows into a rock, the water flows around and finds its way. This metaphor speaks to the Chinese person, and can be helpful in the healing process. If we return to the example of the student experiencing shame at failing the college entrance exam, the healing might eventually come in choosing to take one year off to study for the exam again, or in exploring other options to restore honor.

Another image of healing comes from the core of Buddhist teaching. The end of Buddhism is asking us to experience what we really are instead of what we think ourselves to be (Claxton, 1986). In shame, healing begins when the individual is able to experience what is hard to face in him or herself. The acceptance of oneself as limited and in need is not separated from who we are, but an essential part of what it means to be fully human. As we cross the boundary from avoiding shame to embracing it, accepting it as an intimate part of ourselves, we create an inner climate in which God becomes revealed to us (Capps, 1983).
Healing shame for Chinese can also be found in those very Confucian values from which it flows. Shame, when properly embraced, is virtue and can be reflected in a healthy sense of interdependency. Confucian values teach not simply obligations and rules, but responsibilities as well. Confucius taught that each member of the family system had responsibilities to other members and justice and right conduct were also called for. Healthy shame, for Confucius, was grounded in spiritual values such as humility as he states,

Chuan-sun Shih asked about Manhood at-its-best. "He who in this world can practice five things may indeed be considered Man-at-his-best."
"What are they?"
"Humility, magnanimity, sincerity, diligence, and graciousness. If you are humble, you will not be laughed at. If you are magnanimous, you will attract many to your side. If you are sincere, people will trust you. If you are diligent, you will be successful. If you are gracious, you will get along well with your subordinates" (Ware, 1983, p. 180).

V. CONCLUSION

I hope that I have helped contribute to our understanding of shame from a Chinese cultural perspective. At the very least, we can see that how shame arises, functions, and is eventually treated will depend upon the dynamics of that culture from which it comes. The Western worldview which flows out of its philosophical and biblical roots takes a more individualistic and "insight-orientated" approach to the understanding and treatment of shame, whereas my own Chinese culture views shame in the social matrix of the family, clan, and society. Healing shame from a pastoral counseling perspective will vary with these two radically different worldviews. The sources for healing must flow out of the deeply held cultural values held by each. For my own Chinese culture, this means a sensitivity to a family systems approach,
a respect for deeply held values of filial piety, an awareness of the interdependent nature of Chinese society, and a host of other cultural variables.

This study was helpful in my own integration of shame and has led to further questions. The research in this area is extremely limited within my own culture, and I hope to return to Taiwan and continue the process of dialogue with those working in counseling, pastoral work, and the study of culture. In particular, much more research needs to take place with regard to pastoral counseling models for healing shame that address the fundamental issues, concerns, and complexities of Chinese society and culture.
REFERENCES

Anderson, Herbert. *The Family and Pastoral Care.*


Augsburger, David W. *Pastoral Counseling Across Cultures.*


Bellah, Robert, etc., *Habits of the Heart.*


Bond, Michael Harris. *The Psychology of the Chinese People.*
Hong Kong: Oxford University Press, 1986.

Bradshaw, John. *Healing the Shame That Binds You.*


Capps, Donald. *Life Cycle Theory and Pastoral Care.*


Vita

Grace Li-Hua Chen McClone, wife of Kevin P. McClone, was born in Hsin-Chu, Taiwan, R.O.C. in 1950. She is daughter of Chien-Hsiang Chen and Chien-Yen Lin-Chen.

Grace attended elementary, high school, and college in Taiwan. In 1980, she was baptized into the Catholic Church and in the same year entered Fu Jen Catholic University in Taipei, Taiwan to study theology. At the same time, she began Clinical Pastoral Education training in Taiwan. In 1986, Grace came to the United States to study Clinical Pastoral Education at the University of Chicago Hospital. In 1989, she enrolled at Loyola University Chicago in the Masters of Pastoral Counseling Program.

Grace’s clinical experience involved four years as a crisis counselor in Taiwan from 1976 to 1980, over ten years of combined Clinical Pastoral Education in Taiwan and the U.S., including years of chaplaincy and supervision of students. At present, she is completing her Pastoral Counseling Internship at Family Care Network in Oaklawn, Illinois.
The thesis submitted by Grace Li-Hua Chen-McClone has been read and approved by the following committee:

Robert Sears, S.J., Ph.D., Director
Adjunct Professor of Pastoral Studies
Institute of Pastoral Studies
Loyola University Chicago

Gerard V. Egan, Ph.D.
Adjunct Professor of Pastoral Studies
Institute of Pastoral Studies
Loyola University Chicago

The final copies have been examined by the director of the thesis and the signature which appears below verifies the fact that any necessary changes have been incorporated and that the thesis is now given final approval by the Committee with reference to content and form.

The thesis is therefore accepted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts.

Apr. 12, 1991
Date

Robert T. Sears
Director's Signature