Public-School Music in Grades 1 - 6: Its Content, Objectives, and Methods

Elizabeth Geraldine Bradshaw

Loyola University Chicago

Follow this and additional works at: https://ecommons.luc.edu/luc_theses

Part of the Education Commons

Recommended Citation


https://ecommons.luc.edu/luc_theses/63

This Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the Theses and Dissertations at Loyola eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Master's Theses by an authorized administrator of Loyola eCommons. For more information, please contact ecommons@luc.edu.

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 3.0 License.

Copyright © 1934 Elizabeth Geraldine Bradshaw
PUBLIC-SCHOOL MUSIC IN GRADES 1 - 6

ITS CONTENT, OBJECTIVES,

AND METHODS

BY

ELIZABETH GERALDINE BRADSHAW

A Thesis Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Degree of Master of Arts in Loyola University

February, 1934
VITA

Elizabeth Geraldine Bradshaw


Member of the Music Supervisors' National Conference.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I    THE PURPOSE OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II   HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III  A COMPARISON OF OBJECTIVES</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV   A COMPARISON OF MATERIALS</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V    A COMPARISON OF PROCEDURES</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI   CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**LIST OF TABLES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VIII</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IX</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XI</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XII</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I. The Names of the Cities in Which the Twenty Courses of this Survey Were Published, the Year of Publication and the Population of Each City (1930 Census).

II. Frequency with Which "Objective" and Synonymous Terms are Used in the Twenty Courses of Study.

III. Frequency with Which the Aims for Grade I Are Accepted Verbatim or in Equivalent Terms.

IV. Year in Which the Twenty Courses of Study Introduce Staff Notation for Sight-singing.

V. Frequency of Acceptance of the Additional Aims Introduced in the Fourth Grade.

VI. Frequency of Acceptance of the Additional Aims Introduced in Fifth Grade.

VII. Frequency of Acceptance of the Additional Aims Introduced in Grade VI.

VIII. Frequency with Which the Materials Suggested by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, other than Textbooks or Supplementary Books, are Accepted by the Twenty Cities.

IX. Textbooks Recommended in the Twenty Courses of this Survey, the Publisher of Each, the Year of Publication, and the Frequency of Acceptance.

X. Supplementary Material Suggested in the Twenty Courses of Study for Grades I-VI, the Publisher, Year of Publication, and the Frequency of their Acceptance.

XI. Number of Minutes per Week Allotted to Music, Grades I-VI, in Each of the Twenty Cities Whose Courses of Study in Music are Being Analyzed.

XII. Frequency of Time Allotments for Music in the Twenty Courses of Study.
# LIST OF TABLES (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XIII</td>
<td>Percentage of Twenty Cities Observing, Exceeding, and Failing to Reach the Time Allotment Recommended by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XIV</td>
<td>Frequency with Which the Procedures for Grade I Are Accepted in the Twenty Courses of Study, Not Verbatim, But in Equivalent Terms</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XV</td>
<td>Appreciation Activities Recognized in the Twenty Courses of Study and Their Frequency of Acceptance</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I

THE PURPOSE OF THE STUDY

The purpose of this study is to examine the content, time allotment, objectives, and methods of public-school music through an analysis of courses of study for music in Grades 1-6 of the public elementary schools. Our survey will include music courses which have been published in twenty cities of the United States having a population of more than fifty thousand inhabitants. While it cannot be claimed that these twenty cities are typical of all those in their group, we may at least believe that such an analysis will give a reasonably correct view of the present status of music in cities of this size.

It is generally recognized that school surveys of any kind are of small value unless the data which have been gathered are interpreted in the light of some accepted standard or criterion. W. F. Monroe, in an article entitled "Dependability and Value of Survey Types of Investigation,"\(^1\) declares that survey data must be interpreted by comparison with similar findings or with norms. In the present analysis, therefore, the twenty courses of study are interpreted by comparing them with the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools which was prepared by the Educational Council of the Music Supervisor's National Conference, and unanimously endorsed by the Conference in 1921. Aims, materials, procedures, and attainments for each year represented in the eight-four plan were outlined in that acceptable standard.

\(^1\) School and Society, Volume 38, October 21, 1933, pp. 517-522.
The present study will follow this fourfold division, omitting, however, the question of attainments, since in only seven of the courses of study is any reference found to such norms as those given in the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools*.

This rather general omission of standards of attainment in courses of study is due to the fact that the Music Supervisor's National Conference has failed to define its standards in concrete and practical terms. E. B. Birge, chairman of the subcommittee on standards of attainment in sight and singing at the end of the sixth grade, presented a report before the Council at the Music Supervisors' National Conference, April, 1928, setting forth standards of attainment in sight singing at the end of the sixth grade. He read from the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools*:

Ability to sing at sight, using words, a unison song of hymn-tune grade; or using syllables, a two-part song of hymn-tune grade, and the easiest three-part songs; these to be in any key; to include any of the measures and rhythms in ordinary use; to contain any accidental signs and tones easily introduced, and in general to be of the grade of folk-songs such as "The Minstrel Boy." Also knowledge of the major and minor keys and their signatures. Ability of at least 30 per cent of the class to sing individually at sight music sung by the class as a whole.

Mr. Birge explained that, because the Council failed to interpret the standards in terms of illustrative material, his subcommittee had prepared a sixteen-page pamphlet, illustrating standards of attainment in sight singing at the end of the sixth year. Attention was focused upon attainments possible for the class as a whole rather than upon the attainments possible for a part of the class. This report was submitted as supplement-
ary to the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools. The modifications suggested by him and his subcommittee are not found in any of the courses of study being analyzed.

Despite Mr. Birge's rank and influence (he was one of the group that organized the Music Supervisors' National Conference in 1907), the conference failed to act upon his recommendations, and as a result the seventh edition, June, 1932, a reprint of the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, contained only the old material on standards.

Twenty courses of study for music for the first six grades of the elementary school have been analyzed. This number is significant in view of the fact that Henry Harap examined 242 public school courses of study in 1928-1929 and found that thirteen only included music.

Table I shows the names of the cities publishing the twenty courses analyzed in this survey, the year of publication, and the population of each city according to the 1930 census.

TABLE I

The Names of the Cities in Which the Twenty Courses of This Survey Were Published, the Year of Publication, and the Population of Each City (1930 Census)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City Publishing Course</th>
<th>Year of Publication</th>
<th>Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baltimore, Maryland</td>
<td>1932</td>
<td>804, 874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beaumont, Texas</td>
<td>1931</td>
<td>57, 732</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago, Illinois</td>
<td>1930</td>
<td>5,376, 438</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cincinnati, Ohio</td>
<td>1931</td>
<td>451, 180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland, Ohio</td>
<td>1929</td>
<td>900, 429</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denver, Colorado</td>
<td>1932</td>
<td>287, 861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detroit, Michigan</td>
<td>1932</td>
<td>1,568, 662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huntington, West Virginia</td>
<td>1932</td>
<td>75, 572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Beach, California</td>
<td>1927</td>
<td>142, 032</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Footnotes 2, 3, 4, and 5, are given on following page, and on page 5.
In Chapter II the historical development of public-school music in the United States, from 1830 to the present time, will be discussed; the efforts of music teachers, of musical organizations, and of other educators to make music an integral part of school work will be presented.

In Chapter III the objectives proposed in the courses analyzed are compared with the objectives set up by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools of the Music Supervisors' National Conference, and these latter objectives for each grade are criticized in the light of generally accepted principles as proposed by leading authorities on the subject of music education.

The extent to which the twenty cities accept as necessary for effective instruction materials demanded by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools is the topic of Chapter IV. It is recognized that there is

an ample and worthwhile supply of textbook and supplementary music material
which is available for immediate utilization in our schools. An analysis
of this material is presented in relation to the courses studied.

A study of current methods of procedure is attempted in Chapter V.

The following phases of music are analysed:

Song singing (Ear training)
Rhythmic games and plays (Body expression)
Musical vocabulary (Melodic and rhythmic types)
Drill in pitch, rhythm and theory
Formal ear training (Response oral and written)
Appreciation

In conclusion, Chapter VI summarizes the analysis attempted in this
survey of the status of public school music in twenty cities of the United
States having a population of more than fifty thousand.

5. Fifteenth Census of the United States, 1930. Volume Population, United
   States Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, United States
CHAPTER II

HISTORICAL DEVELOPMENT

The introduction of music as a branch of common school education was urged by William C. Woodbridge, an eminent geographer in 1830 in the city of Boston before the convention of the American Institute of Instruction. Mr. Woodbridge became convinced of the importance of making music a part of common education after a visit to the continent of Europe, where in several countries he found music a branch of the national system of education. He believed that the first thing to be done was to introduce a simple method of instruction which should render music instruction practicable; and the second, to supply the music best adapted to children.¹

Music was introduced into the schools of Boston at about the time that Horace Mann began his work as the Secretary of the Massachusetts State Board of Education – June, 1837.

Horace Mann undertook his duties with a full realization of the worth of music as a school subject -- a realization which was to grow as a result of later experience. During his term of office he issued twelve reports on the condition of education in Massachusetts, together with a discussion of the aims, purposes, and means of education. After his Sixth Report he went to Europe, and visited Great Britain, Belgium, France, Germany, and Switzerland. His Seventh Report embodied the results of his trip abroad, and in-

cluded the following significant comment on the teaching of school music:

Music was not only taught in school as an accomplishment, but used as a recreation. Its practice promotes health; it disarms anger, softens rough and turbulent natures, socializes, and brings the whole mind, as it were, into a state of fusion from which condition the teacher can mould it into what forms he will, as it cools and hardens.... Were it not that this report is extending to so great a length, I should say more on the advantages of teaching music in all the schools. 2

In the meanwhile there was active in Boston an individual who may justly be considered the father of music in that city. As early as 1832, Lowell Mason wished to simplify music to fit children's experiences, to offer courses of instruction to school children, and to establish normal courses in the teaching of music. 3 With the aid of William James Webb he organized the Boston Academy of Music. Two years later he published his famous Manual of Instruction. This movement caused officials of the Boston Academy, among whom was S. A. Eliot, father of the late President Emeritus of Harvard University, to present to the Boston school committee in 1836 a report which urged the propriety of making music a school study. The report was accepted on September 18, 1837, but the board failed to make any appropriation to put it into effect. 4

Finding appropriations lacking, Lowell Mason consented to give instruction gratis for one year at the Hawes School in South Boston. As a result of this experiment, the school board on August 28, 1838, voted to introduce music into the public schools; and placed Mr. Mason in charge of

music instruction, a position he held until 1841.

His success inspired an enthusiastic group of men to urge the introduction of music elsewhere, and we find the following cities introducing it in the years indicated: Buffalo, 1843; Pittsburgh and Louisville, 1844; Cincinnati and Chicago, 1846; Cleveland and San Francisco, 1851; St. Louis, 1852; Providence, 1856; Salem, 1858; Baltimore, 1859; Philadelphia, 1860; New Haven, 1865; Lowell, 1866; Troy, 1873; and Portland, Maine, 1876. 5

In 1870 Henry Barnard, editor of the American Journal of Education, presented in an article prepared for that journal the following information concerning the status of music in certain cities in the United States:

A committee on music has a general supervision over the department. Albany, New York, 1867.

The committee on music nominate teachers, make examinations of each grammar school in music at least once in six months and report semi-annually to the board. Boston, Massachusetts.

Music shall be taught in the primary as well as the high schools. Baltimore, Maryland, 1867.

There are four music teachers at a salary not exceeding $1,600 each per annum. Chicago, Illinois, 1866.

Vocal is taught in the primary and grammar schools. New York, 1867.

In addition to daily exercises in vocal music, lessons of one hour each week in the elements and science of music are given in each intermediate and grammar school, and in high school. Providence, Rhode Island, 1863.

4. Ibid.
The high and normal schools have two lessons in vocal music a week, and in grammar schools one. The primary schools have two lessons of half an hour each week. St. Louis, Missouri, 1866.

The committee on vocal music nominate to the board a suitable teacher, and exercise a general supervision over the branch, reporting annually to the board. Washington, D.C., 1867.6

The report of Mr. Barnard aroused the interest of the National Normal School and the National Teachers' Association, at whose convention, held in Cleveland, Ohio, in 1870, Mr. Eben Tourjee presented a plea for vocal music in the public schools. He put forth the following arguments for the elevation of music to an honorable place in the curriculum:

1. It is an aid to other studies.
2. It assists the teacher in maintaining the discipline of the school.
3. It cultivates the aesthetic nature of the child.
4. It is valuable as an aid to mental discipline.
5. It lays a favorable foundation for the more advanced culture of later life.
6. It is a positive economy.7

When in 1885 the National Education Association voted to add a music section to its departments, the stamp of approval was placed upon music as a study which should be pursued in every system of public schools in the nation.8

At a meeting of the Department of Music Instruction of the National Education Association held in San Francisco, California, July 20, 1888, a

resolution was adopted to promote a general recognition of vocal music as a regular branch of study in the schools. In order that definite information might be procured to determine the extent to which music was already taught, the directors of the National Education Association were petitioned to make appropriation not to exceed one hundred dollars to defray the expenses of the survey.9

A report on the information obtained from 621 cities and towns in the United States, having a population of 4000 inhabitants and upwards, was published in 1889. In not more than half of these cities and towns was music systematically taught in the public schools.10

In 1892 Mr. Philip C. Hayden pointed out that a course of study in music that could be used as a guide to teachers and superintendents was a necessity, but there was none available. He urged the adoption of a course of study which would explicitly state those elements of music which must be taught in order to reach the standards of results recommended by the Music Section of the National Education Association.11

In a report of the Music Committee of the National Education Association in 1906, a brief statement of the amount of technical musical knowledge which should be required of each normal child in grades 1-8 was outlined by the same Philip C. Hayden, who was a tireless worker for the cause of establishing a standard course in music to guide the schools.12

It was Mr. Philip C. Hayden who issued the call that led to the organ-

11. Hayden, Philip C., Music Education and Some Elements Essential to its Success. National Education Association, Addresses and Proceedings,
ization of the Music Supervisors' National Conference. Earnestly active for many years as the secretary of the Music Department of the National Education Association, he knew intimately the men and women who were struggling to bring the cause of school music to the attention of the educational leaders and the country at large. He recognized the need of an organization of members of his educational group. In November, 1906, writing from the editorial office of School Music in Keokuk, Iowa, where he was also supervisor of music, Mr. Hayden invited about thirty music supervisors in the Middle West to meet in Keokuk at some date to be agreed upon by them. The response was so unanimous, we are told by Mr. Edward B. Birge, who was a member of the first conference membership roll, that in the January, 1907, number of School Music a call was printed, signed by twenty-six music supervisors, which invited all music supervisors to attend the meeting. The result was that 104 persons assembled at Keokuk and held a conference, April 10-12, 1907. As all the members of the new group were also members of the National Education Association, which was scheduled to meet at Cleveland in the summer of 1908, it was decided to hold the next conference in the spring of 1909 at Indianapolis. At this meeting Mr. Hayden was elected the president of the new organization, which later became officially known as the "Music Supervisors' National Conference" (a title adopted at the meeting held in 1910 at Cincinnati.)

In 1921 at the Conference meeting held in St. Joseph, Missouri, a workable plan was adopted to advance the cause of music. A Standard Course

11 (continued). 1892, pp.530-537.
in Music for Graded Schools was presented by members of the Educational Council (now the Music Educational Research Council), composed of such leaders in music as Karl W. Gehrken, Hollis Dann, Peter Dykema, Alice Inskeep, Charles H. Farnsworth, T. P. Giddings, Osbourne McConathy, W. Otto Miessner, C. H. Miller, and Frances E. Clark. The committee aimed to set up standards which would be reasonable and practicable and which all schools would adopt. This course, known as the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools was unanimously adopted in May, 1921, by the Music Supervisors' National Conference.

Previous to 1925, when the membership in the Music Supervisors' National Conference had grown to upwards of 3000, the public school music teachers had been meeting in sectional groups, known as the Eastern Music Supervisors' Conference, the North Central Music Supervisors' Conference, the Northwest Music Supervisors' Conference, the Southern Conference for Music Education, the Southwestern Music Supervisors' Conference, and the California Western School Music Conference. At the convention of the Music Supervisors' National Conference in Kansas City, Missouri, in 1925, a committee under the able leadership of Peter W. Dykema introduced a resolution which provided that the members of sectional conferences be automatically members of the national conference, that the meetings of both be biennial, the national conference to be held in the even-numbered years, and the sectional conferences, the odd-numbered ones. This achievement of the committee brought the music supervisors into national agreement.14

The last step in the growth of the Music Supervisors' National Con-

14. Ibid.
ference was the appointment of an executive secretary with headquarters in Chicago. All the business of the National Conference is conducted from his office. Here are published the five issues of the Music Supervisors Journal, and the Annual Yearbook, for the benefit of upwards of 10,000 members. 15

When, in 1830, William C. Woodbridge attempted to introduce a simple method of instruction in music which should render musical instruction practicable, and to supply the music best adapted to children, he laid the foundation of the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, which was authorized by the Music Supervisors' National Conference in 1921, and which was intended to bear aloft the standard of good music to inspire and stimulate the pupils so that each in turn will desire to know more of the art and to participate in it, vocally, instrumentally, or aurally.

It is the extent to which these standards have been adopted, and their conformity to the best views on objectives and methods in school music, that we hope to study in the chapters that follow.

15. Ibid.
CHAPTER III
A COMPARISON OF OBJECTIVES

Henry Harap, in an article, "Critique of the Present Status of Curriculum Making," discusses at some length the meaning of the word "objective," a term commonly used in the literature of curriculum-making. An analysis of the meaning attached to the term by those who employ it reveals the fact that it is not always used in the same sense; but despite the minor variations that appear, one idea is always present: an objective is a goal that has been purposefully chosen as an end in the educational process.

Undoubtedly, therefore, the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, when referring, as it does, to the "aims" of music instruction, attaches to the term the same meaning as that found by Harap in the word "objective."

Table II shows the frequency with which "objective," or its several synonymous expressions, is used in the twenty courses of study analyzed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Terms</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aims</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aims (general and specific)</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aims (general)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>General statement</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goals</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Seven of these courses of study use the word "aims," which is the term adopted by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools. A careful examination of the courses of study, however, leads to the conclusion that other expressions such as, "goals," "objectives," "principles," and "purposes," have the same meaning as "aims" which is used in the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools.

The Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools presents four aims Grade I. Table III enumerates these aims and shows the frequency with which they have been accepted.

**TABLE III**

Frequency with Which the Aims for Grade I Are Accepted Verbatim or in Equivalent Terms

(The Aims as Here Expressed Are Taken Verbatim from the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aims</th>
<th>Frequency of Acceptance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. To give every child the use of his singing voice and pleasure in song as a means of expression</td>
<td>Verbatim: 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. To cultivate the power of careful sensitive aural attention</td>
<td>Verbatim: 8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### TABLE III (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aims</th>
<th>Frequency of Acceptance</th>
<th>In Equivalent Terms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. To provide the pupils through accompaniments to some of their songs and the hearing of much good music, an experience richer than that afforded by their own effort</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. To give every child enjoyment of music as something heard as well as something expressed</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Detroit, Milwaukee, and Philadelphia accept the aims of the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools* for the first grade verbatim; Long Beach, New Haven, and Tulsa accept the second, third, and fourth aims verbatim; New York and Beaumont accept the second aim verbatim; Pittsburgh accepts the first aim verbatim. The remaining cities, although they use different expressions to convey the same ideas, recognize the four aims of the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools* — (1) "to give every child the use of his singing voice and pleasure in song as a means of expression," (2) "to cultivate the power of careful sensitive aural attention," (3) "to provide the pupils through accompaniments to some of their songs and the hearing of much good music an experience richer than that afforded by their own effort," (4) "to give every child enjoyment of music as something heard as well as something experienced."^2

The first aim, "To give every child the use of his singing voice and pleasure in song as a means of expression," is, when properly understood, in

---

2. *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools*. (See note, p. 17)
perfect harmony with the views of our best authorities on school music today. Mr. Proschowski, in addressing the Music Supervisors' National Conference in 1930, asserted that in the development of the singing voice the teacher tries to secure volume without forcing, diction so distinct that the listener may understand without great effort, intonation, spontaneity, expression, and varieties in volume. Pupils should be taught to use the singing voice in the same easy and natural manner in which they use the speaking voice. This is perhaps the most important point to be observed. Damrosch, Gartlan, and Gehrken are of the opinion that song-singing means singing a song after it has been learned, merely for the sake of the aesthetic satisfaction that attaches to taking part in the activity. Unless such an aesthetic reaction ensures -- i.e., unless the children feel joyful as they sing their songs, -- the teaching of music as an art must be judged to have been a failure.

"To cultivate the power of careful sensitive aural attention" (aim 2), is to develop ability to recognize and reproduce a musical tone. Too commonly teachers despair of developing this power in all children, and look upon the so-called "monotones" or "non-singers" as incapable of carrying a tune. Hollis Dann, in his New Manual for Teachers states that if a child has no real physical handicap such as defective hearing, or vocal incapacity, he can be taught to sing, and need no longer be classed as a "monotone," or "non-singer." Every incentive should be employed to create

a desire on the part of the listeners to join the singing group, and the
teacher should make every effort to eliminate mere "listeners" as soon as
possible. Children who have received any musical training in the first
grade and who still cannot sing a tune must be given individual and special
attention.

Charles Hubert Farnsworth in his *Education through Music* has a passage
which explains admirably the significance of Aim 3, Grade I. He says that
at the end of the first year the pupils should have a keen feeling both for
tone quality and for its expressive use in connection with their songs. If
the children have had accompaniments to their songs, or have listened to
singing better than their own, an effective basis of experience has been
laid for a more accurate and definite observation of tone as used in the
more advanced work of the second year.  

Authorities who have written on music appreciation recognize Aim 4
as a legitimate objective in Grade I. Thus, a sub-committee on music
appreciation for the first six grades, reporting to the Music Supervisors'
National Conference in 1930, advised that every effort be expended, even as
early as first grade, to provide a musical experience through contact with
good music in order that right attitudes toward worthy music may be devele-
oped.

The *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools* recommends that the
aims of the first year be continued in second year with the addition of the
staff as early as the middle of the first year or as late as the beginning
of the third year, depending upon the order of procedure.

   Company, New York, 1909, pp. 41-60.
7. Report of Sub-Committee on Music Appreciation for the first Six Grades,
Table IV shows the frequency with which the courses of study analyzed follow the suggestions for the introduction of staff notation for sight singing.

TABLE IV

Year in Which the Twenty Courses of Study Introduce Staff Notation for Sight Singing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Baltimore, Chicago, Cincinnati, Cleveland, Detroit, Denver, Long Beach, Minneapolis, New Haven, Omaha, Philadelphia, Pittsburgh, Portland, and Spokane introduce in the second grade the staff, notation and sight reading; Tulsa starts this work in the first grade; while Beaumont, Huntington, Milwaukee, Newark, and New York defer it until the third year.

Three leading musical authorities - Damrosch, Gartlan, and Gehrken - believe that the second year is the appropriate time to introduce the staff. They believe that the aim should be to have the pupil understand that the staff is used for visualizing music. He learns in this grade that higher notes on the staff stand for higher tones and lower notes for lower tones; that notes appear both on the staff lines and on the spaces of the staff; that the upper figure of the time signature indicates how many beats there are in a measure; that a whole note has four beats; a dotted half note, three beats; a half note, two; and a quarter note, one. It is not the aim that he should know key signatures, but he is to know the names of the

common symbols, such as staff, clef, sharp, flat, and bar. Most of the time in this grade must be devoted to ear training of various sorts, in going from the song to notation.

All courses of study conform to the recommendations of the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools in the establishment of the staff for the introduction of sight reading not later than the beginning of the third grade. The new aim of this grade is the development of an elementary degree of power and skill in independent sight singing. All courses are in agreement with this aim.

McConathy, Miessner, Birge, and Bray in The Music Hour, Elementary Teachers' Book, present the following program of sight singing:

A. First Grade

1. The separation of music and text; singing with neutral syllables.
2. The recognition of phrase repetition.
3. Singing familiar songs with “so-fa” syllables taught by rote.

B. Second Grade

1. Learning rote songs with books in the hands of children.
2. Observation songs.
3. Reading songs.
4. Study songs.

C. Third Grade

A repetition of the second grade program with new and slightly more advanced material and with gradually increasing demands for independent sight reading from the children.9

The new aims introduced for fourth year by the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools*, the introduction of two-part singing and an extension of tonal and rhythmic material of music appropriate for fourth year - do not receive the same recognition in the courses of study analyzed.

In Table V the frequency with which these aims are accepted may be observed.

**TABLE V**

The Aims Introduced in the Fourth Grade and Their Frequency of Acceptance

(The Aims as here expressed are taken verbatim from the *Standard Course in Music*)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aim</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Introduction steps in two-part singing</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Extension of knowledge of the tonal and rhythmic material of music appropriate to fourth year</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chicago, Cincinnati, Cleveland, Denver, Detroit, Huntington, New Haven, New York, Philadelphia, Pittsburgh, Portland, Spokane, and Tulsa believe that two-part music should be introduced in fourth year; the other seven cities - Baltimore, Beaumont, Long Beach, Milwaukee, Minneapolis, Newark, and Omaha - postpone this aim to the fifth year.

It is debatable whether part-singing should be deferred until the fifth grade. Hollis Dann thinks that a good deal of pleasurable preparation for part-singing may be made in third grade. The essence of part-singing is the ability to sing one's own while hearing other parts. This power needs gradual development, and it should be the aim in any procedure.

preparatory to two-part music to provide experience simultaneously in listening and in singing. Mr. Dann says that the object sought is to give the pupil the power to sing one tone and listen to another at the same time. This is a new problem which should not be neglected. The entire singing experience of the pupil has been along the line of matching tones. Now he is asked to refrain from matching tones. The ear of the pupil must become accustomed to the new effects.

Cundiff and Dykema, in School Music Handbook, believe that it is not generally profitable to have children attempt to carry two sustained parts earlier than in the fifth grade. They agree with Mr. Dann that part-singing may be introduced as early as the third grade, and may be started in the fourth grade, but they insist that well-developed unison singing be thoroughly established before part-singing is begun. Strong groups of children who have had exceptional teaching may be able to do part-singing and to enjoy it sooner than ordinary groups of boys and girls.

Damrosch, Gartlan, and Gehrkens, in Universal School Music Series, Teachers' Book, say that two-part singing shall be stressed in the fifth grade.

McConathy, Miessner, Birge, and Bray, in The Music Hour, Intermediate Teachers' Book, recommend that two-part singing be introduced in the fifth grade.

The fifth year work develops what was introduced in the fourth year, i.e., learning to think rapidly from the way the music looks to the way it sounds, and then singing it.

Table VI shows the frequency with which the courses of study analyzed accept the aims of the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools for the fifth grade.

TABLE VI

Frequency of Acceptance of the Additional Aims Introduced in Fifth Grade

(The aims as here expressed are taken verbatim from the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools)15

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aims</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. To establish two-part singing</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. To develop increasing practical knowledge of the tones of the chromatic scale and power to use them</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Extension of knowledge of the tonal and rhythmic material appropriate to fifth grade</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. To develop a fair degree of power to sing unison songs at sight with words</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. To develop an elementary degree of power to sing two-part songs at sight with words</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

All the courses of study require that two-part singing be established (that is, so taught that all children, without exception, be trained in two-part singing) in fifth grade.

The chromatic scale is best introduced in Grade V according to the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, yet but fourteen cities recognize its importance sufficiently to make it mandatory in this grade. Those cities are Cincinnati, Cleveland, Denver, Long Beach, Milwaukee, Minneapolis, Newark, New Haven, New York, Philadelphia, Pittsburgh, Portland.

Spokane, and Tulsa. Without doubt, all the cities teach chromatics, at least, incidentally; the fact that only fourteen set down a knowledge of the chromatic scale as an aim indicates a tendency to encourage the functional rather than the formal.

Hollis Dann, referring to the introduction of the chromatic scale in this grade, says that in the first four grades of school music only seven tones have been used in scale studies. He believes that much of the difficulty that frequently surrounds the introduction of the chromatics may be removed if drill is based upon the manner in which they are used in the music to be sung. It is generally agreed that drill on chromatic or half-step passages of very considerable length is ill advised and of little value.

All cities agree that the extension of tonal and rhythmic material is desirable in this grade, and that tonal sense and a feeling for rhythm, already stressed in grade one, should be further developed.

Less than half the courses of study approve of singing (at sight) unison songs in grade five, and only three favor the possibility of singing two-part songs at sight. The cities favoring the reading at sight of unison songs are Beaumont, Cincinnati, Huntington, Long Beach, Milwaukee, New Haven, New York, Philadelphia, and Pittsburgh. The three cities which sanction the reading of two-part music at sight are Beaumont, Huntington, and Philadelphia.

It is apparent that the twenty cities represented in this study believe that in grade five all children should learn to carry two-part harmony.

Only three, however, believe that the time has come for children to be taught

to do so at sight.

The regular work of the sixth year continues the study of sight singing introduced in the fourth and developed in the fifth year. The introduction of three-part singing, and the developing of the ability to recognize the minor mode are the two additional aims of the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools for grade six.

In Table VII are shown the additional aims introduced in grade six and the frequency of their acceptance in the courses analyzed in this survey.

**TABLE VII**

Frequency of Acceptance of the Additional Aims Introduced in Grade VI

(The aims as here expressed are taken verbatim from the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools)\(^\text{17}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Aim</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. To begin the development of three-part treble-voice singing</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. To develop ability to deal practically with the minor mode.</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Seventeen cities begin the development of three-part singing in grade six. Three cities - Beaumont, Detroit, and Pittsburgh - do not accept three-part singing in grade six as an aim. Esther Jones, in a paper read before the Northwest Conference of the Music Supervisors' National Conference at Spokane, Washington, in 1929, expressed the opinion that songs selected for three-part singing in grade six should be very simple in melody and rhythm, with slow tempo, in order to give the pupils an opportunity to learn them by heart.

\(^{17}\) Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, p. 15.
It is not altogether certain what was in the minds of the makers of the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools* when they set down as an aim for this grade "To develop ability to deal practically with the minor mode." Perhaps they had nothing more in mind than to develop the child's ability to sing in a minor key and to further his skill in detecting tonal differences between major and minor songs. Since the aim set down in the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools* is vague, it is obvious that we cannot state definitely the purpose of the thirteen cities when they include this aim among the specific ones proper to grade six. However, eleven of these cities use either the *Progressive Music Series* or the *Music Hour Series*, both of which manifestly consider that the difference in tonal effect between major and minor melodies is the one thing of practical value to children, who have actually been singing minor melodies since the first grade.

Summary

The percentages of cities accepting verbatim or in equivalent terms the aims recommended by the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools* are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Aim 1</th>
<th>Percentage of Cities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First Grade</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aim 1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aim 2</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aim 3</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aim 4</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third Grade</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Additional)</td>
<td>Aim 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fourth Grade</td>
<td>65</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Additional)</td>
<td>Aim 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fifth Grade</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Additional)</td>
<td>Aim 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aim 2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aim 3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aim 4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Aim 5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixth Grade</td>
<td>85</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Additional)</td>
<td>Aim 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aim 2</td>
<td>65</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools* recommends for Grade II that the aims of Grade I be continued in Grade II with the addition of
the staff as early as the middle of Grade I or as late as the beginning of
Grade III, depending upon the order of procedure; As a result of this
provision it was observed that all cities establish the staff for the
introduction of sight reading not later than the beginning of Grade III.
CHAPTER IV
COMPARISON OF MATERIALS

Among the materials for effective equipment in Grades I-VI suggested by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools are a keyboard instrument, available for playing accompaniments, a pitch-pipe, a staff-liner, a phonograph, and a carefully selected library of records; there must also be textbooks and supplementary materials for the proper presentation of the lessons in classroom music.

An examination of the twenty courses of study reveals, as shown in Table VIII, the frequency with which the materials suggested by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, other than textbooks or supplementary books (which are shown in separate tables,) are accepted.

TABLE VIII

Frequency with Which the Materials Suggested by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, other than Textbooks or Supplementary Books, Are Accepted By the Twenty Cities

(The materials as here expressed are taken verbatim from the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools)²

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Equipment</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. A keyboard instrument for playing accompaniments</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. A pitch-pipe (if teacher so wishes)</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. A staff-liner</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. A phonograph</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Twenty-five records</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. Ibid., p. 9.
The cities which follow the **Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools** in requiring a piano, or a keyboard instrument, for the playing of accompaniments are Beaumont, Cincinnati, Detroit, Long Beach, Milwaukee, Philadelphia, and Pittsburgh.

The course of study in music of the Denver schools contains the following statement concerning the use of a keyboard instrument for the playing of accompaniments: "It cannot be too strongly emphasized that the piano should not be used until the song is thoroughly learned. Even in sounding the keynote, it is preferable to use the pitch-pipe, since that is the instrument which must be used in succeeding grades."

Precisely why the remaining twelve cities do not specify a keyboard instrument as essential is uncertain. In some cases the reason may be a financial one. Lack of space and the inability of many teachers to use such an instrument may have been reasons influencing the decisions of other cities.

The pitch-pipe, recommended for use in only twelve courses of study, is in all probability used by all the cities represented in this survey, because it is almost impossible for a teacher in whose room there is no musical instrument to conduct a lesson without a pitch-pipe. For example, the Chicago Course of Study does not suggest the use of a pitch-pipe by the teachers of music in Chicago schools, yet the pitch-pipe is considered by the teachers an essential part of the equipment necessary to conduct a music lesson. The same twelve cities that recognized the use of the pitch-pipe also favor the staff-liner. The omission of the staff-liner by the same eight cities which omit the pitch-pipe may very probably be due to the

---

the existence of a condition similar to that found in Chicago where a staff is painted permanently on the front blackboard of every classroom. If a staff is so painted on the blackboard, it is obvious that there is no need to specify staff-liner in a list of equipment.

Hannah Cundiff and Peter Dykema in their School Handbook state that "A pitch-pipe or some instrument is indispensable," and that "staff-liners and miscellaneous supplies are necessary equipment." 4

Concerning the use of the phonograph, eleven of the cities are in agreement -- Beaumont, Chicago, Cincinnati, Denver, Detroit, Long Beach, Milwaukee, New Haven, New York, Philadelphia, and Tulsa. Here the purpose seems to be the providing of a richer experience than that offered by the pupils' own limited performing ability. In those courses of study in music which do not mention the use of the phonograph, no reason is given for the omission of the instrument.

Although the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools recommends a library of twenty-five records, no course of study states any specific number of records to be used. Such expressions as "good records," "suitable records," and "library of records," as well as the term "records," seem to indicate that all the schools expect classrooms to be equipped with an abundance of records. Twenty-five records was a fairly large number in 1921, but today a school would feel that to adopt the old standard was equivalent to expecting too little.

Table IX shows the textbooks recommended, the publisher of each, the year of publication, and the frequency of acceptance in the twenty courses of study in this survey. The total of thirty-seven adoptions in only

twenty cities is due to the fact that many cities use more than one textbook.

TABLE IX

Textbooks Recommended in the Twenty Courses of this Survey, the Publisher of Each, the Year of Publication, and the Frequency of Acceptance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Textbook</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Year of Publication</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Progressive Music Series</td>
<td>Silver, Burdett and Company</td>
<td>1916</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hollis Dann Music Series</td>
<td>American Book Company</td>
<td>1914-1917</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music Education Series</td>
<td>Ginn and Company</td>
<td>1925</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Music Hour Series</td>
<td>Silver, Burdett and Company</td>
<td>1931</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congdon Music Readers</td>
<td>C. H. Congdon</td>
<td>1918-1923</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Universal School Music</td>
<td>Hinds, Hayden and Eldridge</td>
<td>1923</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Progressive Music Series

An investigation of the contents of the textbooks listed in Table IX reveals the following facts: The Progressive Music Series for basic use in the primary, intermediate, and grammar grades, and in junior high schools consists of Book I for Grades II and III; Book II for Grades IV and V; Book III for Grades VI and VII; and Book IV for Grade VIII and junior high school. This series was compiled by Osbourne McConathy, Edward Bailey Birge, W. Otto Miessner, and Horatio Parker. Messrs. McConathy, Birge, and Miessner have all been members of the National Research Council of Music Education, Music Supervisors' National Conference. In this capacity they published a series of textbooks that were widely used in schools.
had an intimate and practical knowledge of all the details of public school music. In their series of textbooks they organized material into a plan of instruction through which children were to learn songs containing musical and literary qualities sufficient to stimulate their appreciation as well as to develop all their mastery of the problems of vocal sight reading, even the very advanced.

Four important divisions of instruction are recognized in the Progressive Music Series—music appreciation, sight reading, interpretation, and voice culture. This fourfold division is the basis upon which the material of each book is organized, though the plan and method of development differ according to the mental and emotional growth of the child. The following procedure is observed in the series:

1. Teaching rote and observation songs for musical experience and oral expression.

2. Concentrating attention upon the purely musical aspects of the songs by singing with "100" or some other neutral syllable.

3. Application of the so-fa syllables to familiar songs; the syllables to be learned by imitation, as a final stanza.

4. Observation of motives and figures; definite ear training for the purpose of developing a vocabulary of music ideas.

5. Presentation of familiar songs in staff notation; observation of familiar motives and figures as represented by staff pictures; drill in rapid visualization.

6. Recognition of familiar melodic figures in the notation of new songs which are read by the children with such assistance from the teacher as may be required.

The Hollis Dann Music Series

The Hollis Dann Music Series consists of six books, one for each of the first six grades. The course was compiled by Hollis Dann, Director, Department of Music Education, New York University. Mr. Dann has been a member of the National Research Council of Music Education for many years.

In First Year Music of his series, Mr. Dann advises that both the words and the music be learned by imitation. The principal activity encouraged in Second Year Music is the singing of rote songs, but in this grade a large amount of time is saved in the learning of rote songs by correlating music with reading. It is the contention of the author of the series that children, in learning to follow the melody line, find their interest stimulated and intensified. In Third Year Music all the activities of the second year are continued - song-singing, sight singing from blackboard and book, and rhythmic drills. Third Year Music introduces new intervals, new tones, and new rhythms. All songs in Fourth Year Music of the series not marked "Rote Song" are to be learned at sight. Words and music should be learned simultaneously, if possible, even of two-part songs and rounds.

Material for systematic practice in eye training is found in this grade. It is believed that the surest and most interesting way to gain a practical, working knowledge of music symbols is through the actual use of them in writing music. The writing book is introduced in this grade. But here as throughout the course, singing is the chief goal of all musical activity. In this grade all the above-mentioned objectives are intensified through the introduction of new rhythms, the study of scales, part-singing.
and the writing of original melodies. In Sixth Year Music special atten-
tion is given to three part-singing, which is one of the most valuable and
interesting features of study for this year. This series as presented by
Hollis Dann provides material for six years of music in school systems
where the teaching of music functions under normal conditions, which in-
clude an average time allotment of twenty minutes for a daily lesson and
a corps of classroom teachers trained to teach music.  

The Music Education Series

The Music Education Series, edited by Thaddeus P. Giddings, Director
of School Music in Minneapolis, Minnesota; Will Earhart, Director of School
Music in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania; Ralph L. Baldwin, Director of School
Music in Hartford, Connecticut; and Eldridge W. Newton, managing editor of
the series, is a complete system for the development of music education in
the elementary schools, and consists of two editions - a Five Book Course,
and an Eight Book Course.

Five Book Course

Songs of Childhood ......................... First Grade
Introductory Music ........................ Second and Third
Elementary Music .......................... Fourth and Fifth
Intermediate Music ......................... Sixth and Seventh
Junior Music .............................. Eighth Grade

Eight Book Course

Songs of Childhood ......................... First Grade
Introductory Music ........................ Second Grade

Juvenile Music .......................... Third Grade
Elementary Music .......................... Fourth Grade
Two-Part Music ............................. Fifth Grade
Intermediate Music ........................ Sixth Grade
Three-Part Music .......................... Seventh Grade
Junior Music .............................. Eighth Grade

These two series were devised to take care of the varying conditions in different schools, variances due to locality, length of school term, time allotted to music instruction, and other exterior circumstances peculiar to their environment.

Every standard type, kind, class, and form of vocal music is represented in the Music Education Series. In the Five-Book Course there are 892 songs, consisting of folk songs of all nations, and of art songs. In the Eight-Book Course there are 1351 songs of similar content.

The books in the Eight-Book Course were compiled to be used in the eight succeeding grades of the elementary schools, one book to a grade; whereas the books of the Five-Book Course, with the exception of Book I were so organized that each might serve two successive grades. The Teachers' Book, a manual for either series is indispensable if the best results are to be obtained.

The first book, Songs of Childhood, is used in both series. It introduces rote singing in order to inspire a love of music and to prepare for sight reading. The songs are supposed to be used extensively for assembly singing in the primary grades.

The second book in both courses, Introductory Music, is the first book 8 (continued) in First Year Music, 1914, p. 108; Second Year Music, 1916,
of the series to be placed in the hands of the pupils for study. All music reading is developed through songs - not through vocal exercises and these songs are so selected that the pupils learn to read at sight readily.

The remaining books in both series follow the standards set up in the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools. 9

The Music Hour Series

The Music Hour Series consisting of five volumes - First Book, Second Book, Third Book, Fourth Book, and Fifth Book, one for each of the first five grades, was compiled by three of the authors of the Progressive Series, Messrs. McConathy, Miessner, and Birge, who were mentioned before in the analysis of the Progressive Series, with the assistance of Mabel E. Bray, Director of Music, New Jersey State Teachers' College, Trenton, New Jersey. 10

The purpose of the Music Hour Series is two-fold; to broaden the pupil's experience in music, and to make music function in all possible phases of the child's life, both in and out of school. Rhythm play, for which an outline is included in the Music Hour Series enriches the songs which the child sings by providing an additional outlet for self-expression and interpretation. Every lesson in the Music Hour Series is a lesson in music appreciation. In material and plan the authors of the series carry forward this ideal. They correlate the work in music with other school activities so that the music that the child learns is made purposeful in all of his daily contacts. These varied activities offer a socialized program in music in keeping with the modern emphasis on the integrated curriculum.

8 (continued) p. 109; Third Year Music, 1915, p. 126; Fourth Year Music, 1916, p. 140; Fifth Year Music, 1917, p. 140; Sixth Year Music, 1917, p. 166
The authors follow closely the aims set down by the National Council of the Music Supervisors' National Conference. The study of material of the courses is organized so that the teacher may progress through the book page by page. The entire series presents to the pupil opportunities for experiencing and studying music for its own sake.

The Congdon Music Readers

The Congdon Music Readers offer a more condensed course of music than do the other textbooks mentioned in the preceding pages.11 The readers are arranged in a series from one to five. The author, C. H. Congdon, in Book I, the Primer, suggests that two songs in each key be first taught aurally; after each piece has been learned by ear, notation and sight reading are to be introduced; the children will be taught to sing by note, haltingly at first, but with cumulative power. Book II, a continuation of the Primer, gives the children excellent material that will hold their interest. The songs, while simple in structure, are artistic, and they appeal to the child's music sense. Book III has the material grouped to meet the requirements of Grade IV and Grade V, suggested in the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools; Mr. Congdon, in this book, was assisted by Kate Forman. In Book IV these two authors had Will Earhart assist them in the compilation of material for two-part singing. In Book V C. H. Congdon and Kate Forman present three-part singing.

9 (continued) 190; Juvenile Music, p. 176; Two-Part Music, p. 208.
The Universal School Music Series

The Universal School Music Series is a set of graded school music texts in five volumes compiled by three great leaders in the field of music administration and pedagogy: Walter Damrosch, for more than forty years conductor of the New York Symphony Orchestra; George H. Gartlan, Director of Music in the New York City public schools; and Karl Wilson Gehrken, Director of Music in Oberlin College, Oberlin, Ohio; and Supervisor of Music in the Oberlin public schools.12 The objective of the compilers is a widening of music understanding and music appreciation through participation in singing many beautiful songs. They believe that facility in technical ability is obtained in a minimum of time through the application of modern principles of education and the introduction of time-saving devices.

Book I which is intended for Grades I and II, but which is not put into pupils' hands, provides rote songs, art songs, special songs for the elimination of the monotone, piano pieces for rhythmic drill, seasonal songs, and teaching plans. The Primer is the first book that is placed in the hands of children, being designed for use in the last half of the second year. It includes rote songs, observation songs, and sight-singing songs. The rote songs are taught without syllables from open books. Using the observation songs, the children learn to point to the notes in their own books, singing first the words, then the syllables. Then in the sight-singing section the process is reversed - the syllables are sung first and then the words. Book II continues the work begun in the first book. Each new

[11 (continued) Congdon Music Reader, 1918, p. 126; No. 5, Congdon Music Reader, 1923, p. 188
12. Damrosch, Walter; Gartlan, George H; Gehrken, Karl Wilson. Universal]
problem is approached through a series of rote songs and observation songs before it is presented in sight-singing songs. The Universal Music School Series in this way presents only one major problem at a time. Emphasis in third year is placed on interval drill; and in the fourth year, on rhythmic figures. Book III, for pupils in the fifth and sixth grades, consists of a collection of beautiful songs. The authors of the series believe that the culmination of the beauty in a child’s voice is normally reached in the sixth year of his school life, and that the songs for Grade VI should accentuate that beauty. The plan of the Universal Music School Series provides for the mastering of time, chromatics and two-part singing in the fifth year and of the minor mode and three-part singing in the sixth year. Book IV for the pupils of Grades VII, VIII, and IX, provides a comprehensive, practical, and cultural collection of songs for these grades. It includes a study of musical instruments with specially posed photographic reproductions of the members of the New York Symphony Orchestra. The songs include unison, two-, three-, and four-part arrangements. Practically every song, because of its historical or cultural associations, is a lesson in music appreciation.

In addition to the textbooks recommended in the twenty courses of study in this survey, supplementary material is also suggested.

TABLE X

Supplementary Material Suggested in the Twenty Courses of Study for Grades I-VI, the Publisher, Year of Publication, and the Frequency of their Acceptance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supplementary Material</th>
<th>Publisher</th>
<th>Year of Publication</th>
<th>Frequency of Acceptance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Songs of the Childworld</td>
<td>John Church</td>
<td>1904</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foresman Book of Songs</td>
<td>American Book Company</td>
<td>1927</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Songs of the Childworld

*Songs of the Childworld*, by Jessie L. Gaynor, is a series in three volumes: the first book gives play and motion songs used in the kindergartens and primary grades, clothes anew, however, as to words and melody; the second book expresses the spirit of childhood with a variety of rhythms and reality of expression; the third book has melodies and rhythms appealing to the child mind and child heart.

The Foresman Books of Songs

The *Foresman Books of Songs* is a series consisting of *Child's Books of Songs*, *First Book of Songs*, *Second Book of Songs*, *Third Book of Songs*, *Fourth Book of Songs*, and *Fifth Book of Songs*. The compiler, Robert Foresman, has divided the work into four developmental stages for Grades I-VI. At first the child is taught by purposeful imitation. This stage, during the second period, is gradually being usurped by the teaching of the use of musical notation. In the third stage, the child's ability to read
music at sight is developed. In the fourth stage, music appreciation is more fully stressed.

Edward Bailey Birge, co-author of Progressive Music Series and Music Hour, in an article written for the Music Supervisors' National Conference, "Writing Down to Children," calls attention to these three observations: first, that an immense field has been created for the writing of children's songs; second, that, as shown by the long succession of school song books, the folk song is strongly in evidence; and third, that the most successful of children's songs written by American composers have the simple charm of the folk song. 15

Mr. E. W. Newton, as a publisher, makes the following resume of the part the publisher contributes to the general progress of public-school music:

First, the publisher has developed a high standard in the mechanical features of school music books.

Second, the publisher through educational training not only has raised the standard of efficiency in music teaching but has also influenced colleges and universities to include public-school music as a vocational study worthy of adequate credits.

Third, through the music department the publisher has helped the editor and author to perfect manuscripts which shall become of general service to the profession.

Fourth, through able representatives the publisher has anticipated the needs of the profession and therefore is qualified to select editors who are able to prepare manuscripts to meet the needs. 16

13. (continued from previous page) Gaynor, Jessie L. Songs of the Child-world. Cincinnati: John Church Company, 1904. Songs of the Childworld, No. 1; Songs of the Childworld, No. 2; Songs of the Childworld, No. 3.
Will Earhart, Director of Music in the Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania public schools says with regard to the essential qualities necessary for all school music materials:

The conditions of public school music material in general may perhaps best be traced by comparing it with our English readers. Gradually our educational literature in English has been built up until we now have, for every year of the child's development, a rich supply of genuinely educational material, nicely adapted to the child's technical powers, intellectual comprehension and heart interests. With respect to vocal music, there was a time when the more familiar simple pieces of the adult repertory were brought over into the school room and constituted almost the whole of musical literature for children; but little by little, through the years, this has been changed, and today an educational song literature is available that is equal to the educational literature for English.

Referring to the extraordinary output of school song literature in the last twenty-five years, Edward Bailey Birge says:

And how have the children reacted to all this song material? Exactly as you would expect. Some of it they love, some they tolerate, and some they probably positively dislike. But this is the normal reaction, equally true of literature readers or any kind of material which is passed upon by a board of editors. And it is only fair to say that the school music books of the past quarter century contain as high an average of successful songs, judging from their popularity, as the music publications of any of our standard publishers other than those of school music.


18. Birge, Edward Bailey. "Drafting the American Composer for School Song
CHAPTER V

COMPARISON OF PROCEDURES

The Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools suggests a variety of means to promote the child's musical growth, entrusting to the individual school system the responsibility for determining the best possible way of making them effective. Among these means may be listed rote-singing for establishing a background of musical experience, ear training (a small part of which pertains to the correction of so-called monotonies), sight-reading, drills in rhythm, and the study of music theory and appreciation. The twenty courses of study analyzed in this survey include to a marked extent the foregoing means.

In the courses of study analyzed it was found that only three cities stated clearly the amount of time allotted to music each week. Those cities are Chicago, Minneapolis, and Spokane. It was necessary, in order to secure the information, to communicate with the superintendents of public schools in the cities where the time element was omitted. Table XI shows the number of minutes per week allotted to music in each of the twenty courses of study, Grades I-VI, as ascertained from the printed courses of study or from the letters addressed to the writer by the superintendents.

TABLE XI

The Number of Minutes per Week Allotted to Music, Grades I-VI, in Each of the Twenty Cities Whose Courses of Study in Music Are Being Analyzed

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of City</th>
<th>Grades</th>
<th>First</th>
<th>Second</th>
<th>Third</th>
<th>Fourth</th>
<th>Fifth</th>
<th>Sixth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baltimore</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beaumont</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chicago</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>90</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cincinnati</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cleveland</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Denver</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Detroit</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>66</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Huntington</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Beach</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milwaukee</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minneapolis</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newark</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Haven</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Omaha</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pittsburgh</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portland</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spokane</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tulsa</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table XII shows the frequency of different time allotments in the courses of study analyzed.

TABLE XII

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Minutes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>250 150 125 120 100 90 80 75 66 60 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First</td>
<td>2 7 8 1 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second</td>
<td>2 5 9 1 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third</td>
<td>1 2 3 1 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fourth</td>
<td>1 2 4 8 1 3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE XII (continued)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>250</th>
<th>150</th>
<th>125</th>
<th>120</th>
<th>100</th>
<th>90</th>
<th>80</th>
<th>75</th>
<th>66</th>
<th>60</th>
<th>40</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Fifth</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixth</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools presents the following schedule of minimum time allotments to the study of music, to support the idea that music must be given a reasonable and fair amount of time of the school day:

In a daily schedule of 300 or more minutes, music as such should be allowed not less than 15 minutes daily in primary grades, not less than 20 minutes daily in intermediate grades, and not less than the equivalent of 25 minutes in grammar, junior high and high school grades. The time assignment is not to include the valuable functioning of music as an ally in Physical Culture, English, Festivals, Pageants, etc. In upper grades the time allotment may include one period of Glee Club practice or orchestra rehearsal. All other periods of instrumental music, (piano and orchestral instruments) should be additional.²

Table XIII shows the percentage of cities observing, exceeding, and failing to reach the recommended time allotment of the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools.

### TABLE XIII

Percentage of Twenty Cities Observing, Exceeding, and Failing to Reach the Time Allotment Recommended by the Standard Course in Music for Graded School

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Behavior</th>
<th>First</th>
<th>Second</th>
<th>Third</th>
<th>Fourth</th>
<th>Fifth</th>
<th>Sixth</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Observing</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Exceeding</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Failing to Reach</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools presents six procedures for Grade I. Table XIV shows the frequency with which these procedures are accepted in the twenty courses of study.

### TABLE XIV

Frequency with Which the Procedures for Grade I Are Accepted in the Twenty Courses of Study, Not Verbatim, But in Equivalent Terms

(The procedures as here expressed are taken verbatim from the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools.3)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Procedure</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Singing songs by rote, using light head tones ordinarily not exceeding the range of the treble staff</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Imitative exercises for curing so-called monotones</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Singing songs entire, or phrase by phrase, individually (to include all members of the class)</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Occasional use of accompaniments on well learned rote songs</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Directing aural attention to beauty of tone in singing and to simple aspects of music as observed in rote songs and in music heard, such as repetitions and recurrence of phrases, and repeated rhythms</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The teaching of syllables as desired</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first procedure as suggested by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools for Grade I is:

Singing song by rote, using light head tones ordinarily not exceeding the range of the treble staff.

The following comments regarding this procedure are found in the twenty courses of study: 1. Baltimore tells the teacher to sing for the class in teaching and correcting songs, not with them; 2. To make the children feel the importance of good tone quality at all times by using, in the classroom, songs in which tonal quality is the chief feature; always to use a tuning fork, pitch-pipe, or piano in getting the keynote; never to guess or to allow the class to guess at pitch.

2. Beaumont directs the teacher to sing the entire song, using a light quality of tone, the song to be kept within the natural range of children's voices.

3. Chicago stresses the development of light head tones within range of the treble clef, but suggests no method.

4. Cincinnati refers the teacher to the methods of teaching rote songs as suggested by Hollis Dann in his textbooks.

5. Cleveland does not state the procedure to be used, but stresses the singing of songs.

6. Denver notes that the proper tone quality is dependent upon the use of light head tones, clear enunciations, prompt attack, and correct tempo. Conditions that make for good tone quality are accurate pitch, correct posture, plenty of fresh air in the room, and enthusiasm on the part of the teacher.
7. Detroit indicates that the child be given a concept of beauty in tone quality, which, guided by a sensitive ear, he will be able to reproduce quite naturally; correct breathing and tone placement, accompanied by posture and careful emunciation, will produce beauty of expression.

8. Huntington maintains that beautiful light tones can be produced if the child sings in pitch, enunciates clearly, and pronounces correctly and with expression. The course of study refers to Hollis Dann's methods.

9. Long Beach observes that the singing voice should be kept light and clear within a safe compass for good tone production. Correct breathing, correct pronunciation, and plenty of fresh air lead to forward placement of tones.

10. Milwaukee adheres to the procedure recommended by the Progressive Music Series.

11. Minneapolis proposes that the pupils be taught to sing with a perfectly smooth, light, pleasant tone, and claims that nothing of value in music can be established until a fine tone is accomplished.

12. Newark does not give any suggestions on the procedure other than to refer to the text of Hollis Dann.

13. New Haven does not give any directions as to procedure.

14. New York City notes that particular attention should be paid to tone quality, phrasing, and interpretation.

15. Omaha does not suggest a procedure to follow other than the one used in the Progressive Music Series.

16. Philadelphia indicates that the teacher should use a light head tone quality when singing for her class, and states that the tonal reaction of the children will depend on the interpretation expressed by the teacher.
17. Pittsburgh stresses the importance of ear training and rhythm.

18. Portland particularly notes the necessity of the teacher's sounding the key note before giving the tone on which the song begins, thus stressing accuracy of pitch.

19. Spokane says that the supervisor should be held responsible for securing correct tone quality.

20. Tulsa aims to teach the pupils how to use their voices correctly, by utilizing special drills on tones of the scales.

D. A. Clippinger, in his book on voice culture, gives a few basic principles that the teacher may follow. He says that a good tone is easily produced. It must be based on the right idea of tone and the proper condition of the voice. It is right only when it satisfies the trained ear. 4

Hannah Matthews Cundiff and Peter W. Dykema in their School Music Handbook believe that the natural singing voice of the adult is not a good example or pattern for children, as it is too robust. 5 The teacher needs to learn to use an exaggerated, light, head tone quality in her school work. Children naturally use the proper head voice on upper tones such as fourth line treble staff "d" and this quality should be carried down into the lower tones. Vocal experts are largely agreed that beautiful tone depends upon right mental concept, which children will get when they understand the true expression of the sentiment of the words to be sung; such as a lullaby tone, a bird-like tone, a sighing wind tone, etc. The teacher should be the judge of the tone at first, but when the right quality is secured the class

should be led to recognize it and appreciate it. This right quality is dependent on certain conditions which the teacher should be aware of:

1. Healthy conditions of the nose and throat.
2. Breath support.
3. Relaxed open throat.
4. The frequent and attentive hearing of good tone.
5. Remedial aids to overcome difficulties.

The courses of study invariably indicate the selections advisable for a given grade in the texts recommended. These songs, selected by reputed musical authorities, show that the two elements of song-text and music have been scrutinized in the endeavor to make the selections attractive and worthy. If the following questions about the song can be answered in the affirmative, then its selection is warranted:

1. Would the text be selected as a "memory gem" if it were judged merely as poetry?
2. Is it adapted in thought and expression to the age for which the song is intended?
3. Is it a tune that wears well?
4. Is the poem more effective when sung with the music than when recited?
5. Is the music suited to the text?
6. Does it strengthen the main ideas and suggestions of the words?

We are told by Alice G. Thorn in her book, Music for Young Children, that singing experiences for children in school shall give satisfaction and pleasure; that children shall come to know and appreciate beautiful music in songs; that each individual child shall acquire an increasing amount of skill as a singer; and that the child shall learn to sing as a medium of self-expression.

6. Ibid., p. 73.
Songs for little children are taught by rote. The teacher sings the entire song without interruption, and the children, after listening, attempt to reproduce the melody and words. In learning a song the melody should receive the chief emphasis. A song must be sung many times to the children before it can be accurately reproduced. Good posture, when the child stands, or sits, and plenty of fresh air are indispensable if good singing is to be secured.

The teacher may preserve spontaneity and joy in rote singing if she investigates the previous musical experiences of each child in order to discover his singing ability. She must organize the large group into smaller divisions in order to give the children the maximum opportunities for singing alone. She must help the non-singer.

Special attention should be given to the non-singer, the "monotone." The Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools suggests for procedure 2, Grade I, "Imitative exercises for curing so-called monotones." Cleveland, Cincinnati, and Portland do not indicate that such a procedure is followed in their respective cities. Beaumont, Cleveland, Denver, Detroit, Huntington, Long Beach, Milwaukee, Omaha, Philadelphia, and Tulsa classify the voices of children into three groups: those who sing correctly, those who approach the correct tone, and those who fail to produce the correct tone, or "monotones."

So called "monotones" differ widely in their limitations. Some lack high tones, some low; some have plenty of range but do not sense tone direction. Some fail to distinguish pitch differences in their own tones, and in some the ear is unreliable. The cause may be some ear, nose, or
throat trouble which needs a physician's attention. Usually, the trouble is due to imperfect idea of tone, to some muscular interference, or to an uncultivated ear.

A child filled with the spirit of music (introduced by rhythmic plays and games) will, in the opinion of Cundiff and Dykema make rapid progress with tonal exercises; they suggest the following plan for tonal development:

1. Imitating whistles
2. Imitating the sound of the wind, the rising in tone of the siren whistle may be produced by having the child follow in tone the rising course of a chalk line.
3. Imitating bells large and small
4. Humming like a mosquito.
5. Humming vowel sounds
6. Calling names in octaves, low to high
7. Throwing tones up like a ball (in octaves)
8. Applying pressure on head and face where tone is supposed to be
9. Imitating the voice of another child. (The clear child voice is frequently more helpful than the teacher's voice as a model.)
10. Imitating tones which the teacher sings into the child's ear (phrases, figures, etc.)
11. Reproducing tones, phrases, etc., played on reed organ. (This sustained tone is usually effective.)

Rhythmic expression, according to Mrs. Florence R. Dangerfield in "Musical Appreciation through Rhythmic Expression," is fundamentally a physical manifestation, and the art of music is one of the most direct manifestations, and the art of music is one of the most direct manifestations of the vital element of rhythm. Mrs. Dangerfield has prepared a progressive series of lessons arranged from kindergarten through the elem

lementary grades. The early lessons consist of action plays and such fundamental movements as walking, running, skipping, hopping, galloping, and sliding, done to the songs which the children sing. These movements are the background of the formal dances to be studied in later years. These directed activities take various forms, such as rhythm play, dramatization, folk dancing, all leading by progressive steps to organized rhythmic feeling.

In the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools procedure 3, for Grade I, is "Singing songs entire, or phrase by phrase individually (To include all members of the class).” Hollis Dann, in his "New Manual for Teachers," offers the following explanation of this procedure:

After singing the song several times, the teacher sings the first phrase, immediately followed by the children singing the same phrase without breaking the rhythm ....... When the first phrase is sung correctly, the next one is taught in the same manner. Then the teacher sings the first two phrases combined, the children responding. This procedure continues until the first stanza of the song is complete. Repetition of each phrase by the teacher should not be necessary in additional stanzas.10

This procedure is observed in the following cities: Beaumont, Denver, Detroit, Long Beach, Minneapolis, Philadelphia, Pittsburgh, and Spokane. The remaining cities do not mention this procedure.

Procedure 4 of the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools is "Occasional use of accompaniments on well learned rote songs." This procedure is observed in but five of the courses of study - those of Beaumont, Huntington, Milwaukee, Philadelphia, and Pittsburgh. The omission of the

procedure may be due to the option left in interpreting the word "occasional." However, Damrosch, Gartlan, and Gehrkens in their Teacher's Book are of the opinion that the piano accompaniment has its dangers and must not be overworked. The two reasons given are that in the lower grades the piano is apt to cover up all sorts of faults in the singing, and often causes the pupils to sing too loudly; while in grades where sight-singing is observed the piano often interferes with independence.

The Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools has as procedure 5, "Directing aural attention to beauty of tone in singing and to simple aspects of music as observed in rote songs and in music heard, such as repetitions and recurrence of phrases, and repeated rhythms." Twelve cities - Baltimore, Beaumont, Cincinnati, Cleveland, Detroit, Denver, Long Beach, New Haven, New York, Philadelphia, Spokane, and Tulsa - recognize the procedure. This procedure is, of course, extremely comprehensive, and there is a possibility that the failure of the remaining cities to make note of it is due to the fact that they may regard every lesson in music a lesson in music appreciation. McConathy, Miessner, Birge, and Bray tell us in Music Hour, Elementary Teacher's Book, that music appreciation is a many-sided experience affecting every phase of the pupil's activity. They believe that rote singing, rhythm plays, and instrumental participation all demand listening as a basis for the activity of the child. Rhythm and melody, form and design, tone color of the instruments or voices performing are all stressed in the progression of music study from grade one to six.

The sixth procedure noted by the Standard Course in Music for Graded
12. McConathy, Miessner, Birge, and Bray. Music Hour, Elementary Teacher's
Schools is "The teaching of syllables as desired." This is observed by Baltimore, Denver, New Haven, Philadelphia, Portland, Spokane, and Tulsa. The expression "as desired" leaves to the cities the option of teaching syllables in first grade. This is in all probability the reason why thirteen cities failed to insert it in their courses of study. Charles Hubert Farnsworth in *Education through Music*, says in regard to the teaching of syllables in the first grade: "They are not an aid in the present work, but preparation for more complex work to follow." 13

**Grade II**

The additional procedures proposed for second grade in the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools* are the use of the staff in practicing or preparing for sight-singing, and frequent practice in individual singing. 14

An analysis of the courses of study in cities introducing the staff and individual singing in second grade reveals the following facts: Baltimore and Chicago do not suggest a procedure; Cincinnati observes that the teacher should teach the lines of the staff, but does not indicate a procedure; Cleveland omits a method of procedure; Denver observes that the staff teaching is necessary but does not tell how to do it;) Detroit points out to the teacher the necessity of staff notation but says nothing concerning the method; Long Beach directs attention to the value of teaching staff notation by having the teacher draw a staff on the blackboard and place notation on the staff in the following order: staff, bars,

---

notes, and rests; Minneapolis suggests that lines and spaces be introduced; New Haven introduces the staff but does not indicate method; Omaha utilizes the staff; Philadelphia teaches the facts of note reading through the introduction of the divisions of the staff in the following order: staff, bars, double bars, notes, and rests; Pittsburgh and Portland introduce the staff, but indicate no method of procedure; Spokane does not suggest a procedure. Tulsa teaches the facts of note-reading through the introduction of the staff. In Beaumont, Huntington, Milwaukee, New York City, and Newark the introduction of notation is deferred from Grade I to Grade III. One concludes that this important feature is developed through the use of texts and the suggestions of a supervisor.

Beaumont, Chicago, Denver, Milwaukee, Minneapolis, New Haven, New York, Omaha, Portland, and Philadelphia in their procedure regarding frequent practice in individual singing advocate the following:

Beaumont: Singing by individual members of the class.
Chicago: Individual song singing.
Denver: Individual singing which includes singing phrases, and singing entire song.
Milwaukee: Frequent practice in individual singing.
Minneapolis: Permitting pupils to sing the song in unison first, individuals to repeat single phrases.
New York: Frequent practice in individual singing.
Omaha: Permitting children of best group to sing individually.
Portland: Individual recitation with class as critics.
Philadelphia: Singing phrases and songs individually.

Cundiff and Dykema in the School Music Handbook claim that individual singing can be handled expeditiously if too much is not attempted. 15

Grade III

In this grade we find that the additional procedure cited by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools is "systematic practice in sight-singing." While all courses stress the need of systematic practice in sight-singing, the directions as to procedure are left to the supervisor or to the suggestions offered in the text-books. Since sight-singing is a skill, there is no seemingly short cut to its acquirement. Repetition upon repetition of the same succession of tones is essential before the visual and auditory imagery is made definite. Sight-singing skill cannot be said to have been accomplished until the ordinary tone progressions are comprehended at a glance.16

The use of the "Movable Do" system in teaching sight reading seems to be the accepted procedure in the courses of study analyzed.

In 1925 the Research Council of the Music Supervisors' National Conference made a report upon the subject of the "Movable Do." The Council favored the system because of the far greater ease with which the whole problem of sight singing may be approached when the same syllable names always stand for the same interval relationship. Do-Mi-So- invariably means a major chord built on the tonic, or keynote, of the major key; to sing any major triad all that needs to be done is to form the habit of always singing the same intervals when that combination of syllables is given. This simplifies the approach to sight singing to such an extent that very small children and even those without much musical talent may be taught to exper-

---

ience the joy of reading music. It also makes it possible to read with equal facility in all keys from the very beginning. It is possible because of this to select in the lower grades those keys which lie in the most favorable part of the child’s vocal compass.

Sir George Grove exhausts the subject of the "Do Methods" in his Dictionary of Music and Musicians.17

Staff notation, as the name implies, consists in the reading of notes which are written upon the five lines and four spaces of the staff. The position of the note indicates tone and pitch; the form of the note indicates tone and length.

Following are a few suggestions for the teacher to observe in presenting sight-reading work:

1. Be sure that the problems involved are understood. Unless a pupil has previously mastered a difficulty, he cannot read it at sight.

2. Work rapidly without discussion. Train the child to work more and more independently of the teacher. In taking up a new piece, for instance, the children without direction or questioning from the teacher should immediately determine the key and the name of the tone, should either audibly or to themselves establish the tonality and the initial tone by singing the tonic chord after the teacher or a pupil has sounded the key note, and in individual work should start themselves without command or signal after teacher or pupil has set the tempo. All this is possible at least from the fourth grade up.

3. Alternate class and individual work at phrases where no break in continuity will result.

4. Have a musical performance of all material used, through suggestions as to interpretation, such as organ tone, crescendo, and diminuendo, staccato, etc. Do not use music of such difficulty that these are forgotten. Sight reading means singing correctly with proper expression.

5. Set up a strong incentive, such as: (a) Pride in accomplishment, (b) The rivalry of game contests, (c) Joy

or original work, with self-direction as in project work, (d) Pleasure of independence in selecting and playing music, (d) Asset for admission into bands, choirs, glee clubs, etc.

Sight reading requires an abundance of suitable material, definite time allotment, and, finally, skillful and tactful direction. By following the suggestions given, any good teacher can present sight reading readily and profitably.

Grade IV

The Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools offers the following specific procedures for Grade IV:

1. The introduction of two-part singing to be by "chording" into two parts on sustained tones at intervals chiefly of the 3rd or 6th, or by sounds; both first and second parts to contain both boys and girls; the voices of all to be treated as equal.

2. Observing the structure of songs sung and listening to and giving account of salient points in the structure of standard musical compositions with a view to developing appreciation of the beauties of tonal design.

The thirteen cities which introduce two-part singing in Grade IV follow these procedures:


2. Cincinnati: Divides the class into two sections. Teacher sounds "do," one section singing and holding "do" while the other section sings and holds "mi." Teacher indicates scale-wise progressions upward and downward by definite hand movements, both sections following progression from their beginning tone. Teacher then re-


verses division of parts in order to give equal practice to each section in singing both alto and soprano.

3. Cleveland offers no suggestion as to procedure.

4. Denver: The class should always sing a round as an ordinary song until it is familiar. Then the teacher may enter with the second part, and lastly, the class, divided into two groups, may sing it as a round.

The class should listen to two-part harmony in various compositions, both vocal and instrumental.

The class is divided into two sections to learn to sustain thirds, one singing a tone and the other a third above, or the sixth below it.

5. Detroit: Rounds provide the easiest approach to independent part singing. Rounds should be memorized as unison songs before attempting the division into parts. Two-part music should be attacked by both parts reading at the same time. Pupils should not hear parts separately before attempting to read them.

6. Huntington: No suggestion is offered as to procedure.

7. New Haven: Two-part singing is to be introduced by "chording" in two parts on sustained tones, at intervals which harmonize well.

8. New York City: Develops ability to sing rounds as a preparation for two-part singing. No method suggested.

9. Philadelphia: Part-singing is easily provided by singing rounds in two or three parts. Divides the class into two equal groups for a two-part round or three equal groups for a three-part round;
the round is sung continuously, each group joining in at a given signal, until each group has repeated the round three times. After a round has been developed, chording is practiced.

10. Pittsburgh gives no suggestion other than that found in the adopted textbook.

11. Portland offers no suggestion as to procedure except that given in the textbooks.

12. Spokane: Two-part singing is introduced as alto and soprano through the medium of rounds.

13. Tulsa: From the beginning of two-part singing, both parts should be sung simultaneously at sight, never separately, never by rote, except to correct or master a particularly difficult spot. The class should be divided into equal divisions, without regard to sex. The songs for the beginning of two-part singing should be very simple in melody and time problems.

It is obvious that the attempt to introduce two-part singing in the fourth grade is recognized as a procedure that requires a simple approach, as by means of rounds or chording.

Cundiff and Dykema present an approach to two-part singing in their School Music Handbook. They believe that part singing requires the grouping of the class into sections. If the school room is shallow and wide, the dividing line for part work should be from front to back, thus making sections at the left and right of the room.

Good voices and the independent singers may be scattered throughout the class; sometimes pupils are arranged according to ability from the front to the back of the room. There should be no attempt in early part singing to assign children permanently to either soprano or alto, as the parts sung should be inter-changeable until, in the sixth or seventh grade, voices show distinct tendencies.

One simple approach to part singing is made through the use of rounds. The entire class learns the complete song by rote, or by note, and sings it in unison. Next, the class forms one division, the teacher the other. As the class finishes the part marked 1 and begins the part marked 2, the teacher begins part 1 of the portion, and together they sing straight through the whole song twice, the teacher finishing last. Another method of approach is by combining tones (chording). The class may sing one tone; the teacher may sing with a tone which harmonizes - lower, higher, or in unison. Again the listening approach is used in the following manner: small groups may sing certain passages while the class listens. Older pupils from the upper grades may come visiting and sing part music. Victrola records of two parts or two instruments may be used.

The second specific procedure offered by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools for Grade IV is:

Observing the structure of songs sung and listening to and giving account of salient points in the structure of standard musical compositions with a view to developing appreciation of the beauties of tonal design.21

This procedure functions as definitely in choral music, instrumental music, and theory instruction as in listening lessons and is usually termed "Appreciation." It is accepted in the twenty courses of study analyzed, not verbatim, but in language similar in meaning.

The New York City course of study gives a well defined procedure for appreciation by means of the phonograph or piano:

1. Write the title of the composition and the name of its composer on the blackboard.
2. Present the solo instruments of the orchestra: the violin, the trumpet, the flute, the clarinet, using phonograph records.
3. Study the song form; recognize and repeat the phrases, periods, cadences.
4. Review the selections of the preceding grades.
5. Recognize and name familiar melodies played on the phonograph or the piano. 22

Grade V

The Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools recommends the continuance of two-part singing and the use of chromatics in Grade V. In the twenty courses of study analyzed it is observed that emphasis is placed on two-part singing. The only city that emphasizes the teaching of chromatics is Tulsa, and this city suggests that staff exercises or songs in books containing simple half-step progressions be used.

It is obvious that the work of Grade V develops further what was introduced in Grade IV, i.e., learning to think rapidly from the way the music looks to the way it sounds, and then singing it. The use of chromatics, it is observed, can easily be studied in connection with the songs in which they occur.

Grade VI

The specific procedure as recommended in the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools* for Grade VI is: "Three-part singing introduced, through the development of harmonic sense, using triads if desired."

The cities agree on the introduction of three-part singing, but Denver alone outlines a procedure, which is summarized as follows:

**Listening:** The children may listen to two-part and three-part harmony in various compositions, both vocal and instrumental.

**Singing three-part rounds:** The class should always sing the round as an ordinary song until it is thoroughly familiar; then it may be sung as a round.

**Chording:** The class is divided into three groups, each singing a tone of the chord progressively and sustaining it. For example, if the tones of the chord to be sung are "do, mi, sol," the first group sings "do" and holds it, as the second and third groups in turn sing "mi" and "sol" respectively. All three groups sustain their tones, listening to the chord effect, until the teacher gives the signal to stop.

Esther Jones in a paper read before the Music Supervisors' National Conference in 1929 declares that three-tone chords are used as a means of developing the harmonic sense.

Simple three-tone chord progressions of I-IV-I, I-V-I, and the combination I-IV-I-V-I are excellent chords for beginning work in chord progression. Chords should be sung slowly and pupils should be encouraged to listen for the three parts. Miss Jones outlines the procedure in teaching 23 *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools.* Op. Cit. p. 16.

three-part singing as follows:

1. Class takes beginning tones from pitch-pipe.

2. Teacher sets rhythm.

3. Class studies first phrase, and then sings with neutral syllable "loo," and continues singing until a mistake has been made.

4. Teacher calls attention to mistake, which is isolated and corrected, and class sings from beginning of phrase again.

5. After song has been sung correctly with "loo," words are then used.

6. Attention is called to marks of expression which interpret the song.25

In a report of the Subcommittee on Music Appreciation for Grades I-VI, presented by Mrs. Lenore Coffin, Chairman, at the Music Supervisors' National Conference in Chicago, 1930, the following standards were formulated:

Music Appreciation. The term Music Appreciation should apply to every musical activity in the school curriculum * * * *

Experience in Music. An outstanding aim of the listening period is to provide a rich musical experience through acquaintance with worthy musical literature which the children themselves cannot sing or perform ***

Attitudes and Habits. This enlarged and enriched musical experience will develop correct attitudes toward good music and will establish the habit of preferring good music * * * *

Factual Knowledge. Facts about the musical compositions, composers, etc., should be "by-products," developed through the pupils' experiences and interest in the music * * * *

Pupil Activities. Pupil activities, such as responding to rhythm, feeling, thinking, discriminating, evaluating, may be stimulated by purposeful questions and suggestions about the music. This pupil participation will result in active listeners. Through active listening the music is recreated and the listener "becomes" the music.

Dangers of a Course of Study. Any graded outline is harmful if followed rigidly and if it is not adapted to fit the needs and experiences of the children * * * *

Time Allotment. In general one lesson each week (or one-fifth of the music time) should be given to appreciative listening.

Lesson Plan. After deciding upon the purpose of the lesson, the
teacher, if not already familiar with the music, should study her subject
matter (the music) and plan her procedure tentative pupil activities.
Repeated hearings of the same composition are imperative for permanent
acquaintance with the music. These re-hearings should be motivated by
questions or suggestions about the music, such as the rhythm, melody,
harmony, form, mood, type, instruments, or voice performing. Fanciful
stories should not be concocted about the music. In general the music
should be played first without comment. Let the music speak for itself.
The voice of music should be heard more than the voice of the teacher.
In the lower grades, the lesson should generally close with "quiet
listening."

Attitude of the Teacher. The attitude of the teacher is of vital
importance. The teacher herself must be an appreciative participant in
the music and create a sympathetic environment for the message of the
music.

The introduction of the rhythm orchestra is regarded as a step in
pre-orchestra training. It gives to the pupils free muscular response, ear
training, and joyous expression. Likewise, the instruction in piano,
violon, or in orchestra contribute to the appreciation of music.

Table XV shows the frequency with which the courses of study analyzed
recognize the value of the victrola, radio, rhythm band, piano instruction,
and orchestra instruction.

**TABLE XV**

**APPRECIATION ACTIVITIES RECOGNIZED IN THE TWENTY COURSES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Appreciation</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rhythm Band</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harmonica Band</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Piano Instruction</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victrola (phonograph)</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Orchestra</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

for the First Six Grades." *Music Supervisors' National Conference,
Beaumont, Chicago, Detroit, and Long Beach encourage the rhythm band; Detroit, the harmonica band; piano instruction is given in Long Beach; victrolas are used in Beaumont, Chicago, Cincinnati, Denver, Detroit, Long Beach, Milwaukee, New Haven, New York, Philadelphia, and Tulsa; the radio is recognized in Beaumont and Minneapolis; orchestra instruction is found in Chicago, Detroit, Long Beach, and Spokane. The failure of the other cities to include the activities does not necessarily mean that they fail to utilize the activities mentioned. For example, Dr. Walter Damrosch, speaking before the Music Supervisors' National Conference in 1930, said in regard to the use of the radio for school music appreciation:

Last year when we began, we already had the enormous total of over one million and a half children listening in over the radio; that means that many thousand schools had, as if by magic, supplied themselves with radios, with receiving sets, with lous speakers . . . .
The National Broadcasting Company has tried to estimate the number of pupils listening, and their estimate is 5,176,960 this year.27

Summary

1. The percentages of cities using each of the procedures of the Standard Course in music for Graded Schools are as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Procedure</th>
<th>Grade I</th>
<th></th>
<th>Grade II</th>
<th></th>
<th>Grade III</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Procedure 1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Procedure 1</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>Procedure 1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure 2</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>Procedure 2</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>(Additional) Procedure 1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure 3</td>
<td>40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure 4</td>
<td>25</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure 5</td>
<td>60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure 6</td>
<td>35</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Procedure</th>
<th>Grade IV</th>
<th></th>
<th>Grade V</th>
<th></th>
<th>Grade VI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Procedure 1</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>Procedure 1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Procedure 1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure 2</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Procedure</th>
<th>Grade VI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Procedure 1</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Five procedures are observed by one hundred per cent of the cities; five by 50 per cent or more; while it is believed that the cities not indicating a procedure as suggested by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools used the procedure indicated by the supervisor or in the textbook used in the individual school. As the compilers of the texts are to a large extent members of the Music Education Research Council of the Music Supervisors' National Conference, it seems safe to assume that the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools is the criterion upon which the procedure of the twenty courses of study is based.
CHAPTER VI

A survey of twenty courses of study in music was made to ascertain a reasonably correct view of the present status of music in Grades I-VI of the public elementary schools. It includes music courses which have been published in twenty cities of the United States with a population of more than fifty thousand inhabitants. This number is significant in view of the fact that Henry Harap examined 242 courses of study in 1928-1929 and found that only 13 included music.

The courses of study in music analyzed in this survey were procured from cities which are included in the states that comprise the six united conference divisions of the Music Supervisors' National Conference, an organization of 10,000 members. The six united conference divisions are the California Western School Music Conference, Eastern Music Supervisors' Conference, North Central Music Supervisors' Conference, Northwest Music Supervisors' Conference, Southern Conference for Music Education, and Southwestern Music Supervisors' Conference.

Twenty courses of study were received from cities situated as follows: one from the California Western Music Conference; five from cities in the Eastern Music Supervisors' Conference; seven from cities in the North Central Music Supervisors' Conference; two from cities in the Northwest Music Supervisors' Conference; two from cities in the Southern Conference; and three from cities in the Southwest Music Conference.
It is recognized that school surveys are of small value unless the data which are gathered are interpreted in the light of some accepted criterion. In this analysis, therefore, the twenty courses were interpreted by comparison with the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, a course prepared by the Education Council of the Music Supervisors’ National Conference, April, 1921. (The seventh edition of the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools was authorized by the Music Education Research Council in June, 1932.

It is the purpose of this chapter to present data based upon (1) time allotment given to music, (2) the comparison of objectives, (3) the comparison of materials, and (4) the comparison of procedures, as found in the twenty courses of study.

Time Allotment

Three courses of study - Chicago, Minneapolis, and Spokane, - include a time allotment in music. It was necessary, in order to secure information regarding time allotment given to music in the other seventeen cities included in the survey, to communicate with the superintendents of public schools of the cities where the time element was omitted.

The Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools insists that music should be allowed not less than 15 minutes daily in the primary grades, and not less than 20 minutes daily in the intermediate grades. The survey shows that 40 per cent of the cities in Grade I, 50 per cent in Grade II, 45 per cent in Grade II, 10 percent in Grade IV, 10 per cent in Grade V, and 10 per cent in Grade VI conform to the time allotment suggested by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools. The cities having a time allotment above or below that suggested by the Standard Course in Music for
Graded Schools, with one exception, made no comment on the allotment of time given to music. The exception was the city of Omaha. The reply from Omaha gave the following explanation: "Under present conditions brought about by economic measures our program is sadly reduced."

Comparison of Objectives

An analysis of the meaning attached to the term "objective" reveals the fact that it is not always used in the same sense; but despite the minor variations that appear, one idea is always present: an objective is a goal that has been purposefully chosen as an end in the educational process. It is believed, therefore, that the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, when referring, as it does, to the "aims" of music education, attaches to the term the same meaning as that found in the word "objectives."

Grade I

The study revealed that only 35 per cent accepted the first aim in Grade I verbatim ("to give every child the use of his singing voice and pleasure in song as a means of expression"); 40 per cent accepted the second aim verbatim ("To cultivate the power of careful, aural attention"); 30 per cent accepted the third aim verbatim ("To provide the pupils through accompaniments to some of their songs and the hearing of much good music, an experience richer than that afforded by their own singing"); 30 per cent accepted the fourth aim verbatim ("To give every child enjoyment of music as something heard as well as something expressed"). The four aims were accepted, but otherwise expressed, by all other cities in the survey.
**Grade II**

The *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools* recommends that the aims of Grade I be continued in Grade II and that the staff be introduced. The introduction of the staff "may occur as early as the middle of the first year or as late as the beginning of the third year depending upon the order of procedure."

Staff notation is introduced in Grade II by 70 per cent of the courses of study, by 5 per cent in Grade I, and by 25 per cent in Grade III.

**Grade III**

All courses of study agree with the aim of Grade III in the *Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools.* ("Development of an elementary degree of power and skill in independent sight-singing.")

**Grade IV**

Two specific aims are introduced in Grade IV: (1) "Introductory steps in two-part singing," which is accepted in 70 per cent of the courses of study, and (2) "extension of knowledge of the tonal and rhythmic material of music appropriate to fourth year," which is accepted in 100 per cent of the courses of study.

**Grade V**

The survey discloses that 100 per cent of the courses of study believe that the special aim in Grade V, ("to establish two-part singing,") is correct. Seventy per cent agree with the special aim 2 that Grade V is the grade "To develop increasing practical knowledge of the tones of the
Chromatic Scale and power to use them." One hundred per cent of the courses agree that the "extension of knowledge of the tonal and rhythmic material of music, appropriate to fifth year is correct for aim 3. Aim 4, "to develop a fair degree of power to sing unison songs as sight with words" is accepted in 45 per cent of the courses; and only 15 per cent accept the continuance of aim 4, "An elementary degree of power to sing two-part songs at sight with words."

Grade VI

The special aim 1 of the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, "to begin the development of three-part, treble-voice singing," is accepted in eighty-five per cent of the courses of study, and special aim 2 "to develop ability to deal practically with the minor mode, is accepted in 65 per cent of the courses of study.

Comparison of Materials

The materials suggested by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools, other than textbooks or supplementary books, are a keyboard instrument for the playing of accompaniments, a pitch-pipe, a staff liner, a phonograph, and 25 records. These materials are accepted by the courses as follows: 35 per cent favor the use of a keyboard instrument for playing accompaniments; 60 per cent favor the use of a pitch-pipe; 60 per cent favor the use of the staff-liner; and 65 per cent favor the use of a phonograph.

Although the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools recommends a library of 25 records, no course of study states any specific number of
records to be used.

The textbooks listed in the twenty courses of study are the **Progressive Music Series**, 50 per cent; **Hollis Dann Music Series**, 40 per cent; **Music Education Series**, 40 per cent; **Music Hour Series**, 25 per cent; **Congdon Music Series**, 15 per cent; and **Universal School Music Series**, 15 per cent.

The supplementary material suggested in the courses of study are "**Songs of the Childworld**" which is approved in 45 per cent of the courses of study; and **Foresman Books of Songs**, which is approved in 20 per cent of the courses.

The failure of the compilers of the courses to indicate preferences in the selection of supplementary material may be due to the extraordinary output of song material during the last twenty-five years.

### Comparison of Procedures

The procedures recommended in the **Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools** require the teacher to obtain from the supervisor or text the information necessary to follow the steps in the development of each suggested procedure.

#### Grade I

The procedures recommended for Grade I were accepted as follows:

1. "Singing songs by rote, using light head tones ordinarily not exceeding the range of the treble staff," 100 per cent.

2. "Imitative exercises for curing so-called monotones," 85 per cent.

3. "Singing songs entire, or phrase by phrase, individually (to include all members of the class)," 40 per cent.

5. "Directing aural attention to beauty of tone in singing and to simple aspects of music as observed in rote songs and in music heard, such as repetitions and recurrence of phases, and repeated rhythms," 60 per cent.


Grade II

The specific procedures proposed for the Second Grade are (1) "the use of the staff in practicing or preparing for sight-singing," which was accepted in 70 per cent of the courses of study, and (2) "frequent practice in individual singing," which was accepted in 50 per cent of the courses of study.

Grade III

The one specific procedure suggested for Grade III, "systematic practice in sight-singing," was accepted in 100 per cent of the courses of study.

Grade IV

The two procedures suggested for Grade IV by the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools are (1) "The introduction of two-part singing to be by 'chording' in two parts on sustained tones, at intervals chiefly of the 3rd or 6th, or by sounds; both first and second parts to contain both boys and girls; the voices of all to be treated as equal," accepted in 60 per cent of the courses of study; and (2) "Observing the structure of songs
sung and listening to and giving account of salient points in the structure of standard musical compositions, with a view to developing appreciation of the beauties of tonal design," accepted in 100 per cent of the courses.

Grade V

The continued study of two-part singing in Grade V received the approval of 100 per cent of the courses of study.

Grade VI

The procedure suggested in Grade VI, "Three-part singing introduced, through the development of the harmonic sense, using triads if desired," was accepted in 100 per cent of the courses of study.

Mr. John W. Beattie, director of music at Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois, in a report read before the Southwestern Music Supervisors' Conference at Colorado Springs, Colorado, March, 1931, said that the Standard Course in Music for Graded Schools remains today as a basis for many a course of study, and that it stands unchanged ten years after its adoption. This opinion, expressed by Mr. Beattie, appears to be verified in the findings of the analysis of the twenty courses of study that have been presented in this survey.¹

BIBLIOGRAPHY


11. Congdon, C.H. Congdon Music Readers. New York: C.H. Congdon; No. 1 Primer, 1920; No. 2 Primer (continued), 1920; No. 3 Congdon Music Reader, 1922; No. 4 Congdon Music Reader, 1918; No. 5 Congdon Music Reader, 1923.


23. Gaynor, Jessie L. Songs of the Childworld. Cincinnati: John Church Company, 1904. Songs of the Childworld, No. 1; Songs of the Childworld, No. 2; Songs of the Childworld, No. 3.

24. Giddings, Thaddeus; Earhart, Will; Baldwin, Ralph; and Newton, Eldridge. Music Education Series. Ginn and Company, 1923. Songs of Childhood;
Elementary Music; Juvenile Music; Two-Part Music.


31. Hillbrand, E. K. "Historical Instances Wherein the Publisher Has Contributed to Music Culture." Etude XLII. March, 1924.


35. McConathy, Osbourne; Birge, Edward Bailey; Miessner, William; Parker, Horatio. The Progressive Music Series. New York: Silver Burdett and Company, 1925. Primary Book; Book One; Book Two; Book Three; Book Four.

36. McConathy, Osbourne; Miessner, William; Birge, Edward Bailey; and Bray, Mabel. The Music Hour. New York: Silver Burdett and Company, 1931. Kindergarten and First Grade; First Book; Second Book; Third Book; Fourth Book; Fifth Book.


Works Consulted but not Cited


The thesis "Public-School Music in Grades 1 - 6: Its Content, Objectives, and Methods," written by Elizabeth Geraldine Bradshaw, has been accepted by the Graduate School of Loyola University, with reference to form, and by the readers whose names appear below, with reference to content. It is, therefore, accepted as a partial fulfilment of the requirements of the degree conferred.

James A. Fitzgerald, Ph.D. January 9, 1934
Rev. Austin G. Schmidt, S.J. January 1934