



2013

# Visual Analysis of E-Textbooks for Senior High School in Indonesia

Ouda Ena

*Loyola University Chicago*

---

## Recommended Citation

Ena, Ouda, "Visual Analysis of E-Textbooks for Senior High School in Indonesia" (2013). *Dissertations*. 513.  
[https://ecommons.luc.edu/luc\\_diss/513](https://ecommons.luc.edu/luc_diss/513)

This Dissertation is brought to you for free and open access by the Theses and Dissertations at Loyola eCommons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Loyola eCommons. For more information, please contact [ecommons@luc.edu](mailto:ecommons@luc.edu).

[Creative Commons License](#)

This work is licensed under a [Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 3.0 License](#).

Copyright © 2012 Ouda Ena

LOYOLA UNIVERSITY CHICAGO

VISUAL ANALYSIS OF E-TEXTBOOKS FOR  
SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL IN INDONESIA

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED TO  
THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE SCHOOL OF EDUCATION  
IN CANDIDACY FOR THE DEGREE OF  
DOCTOR OF EDUCATION

PROGRAM IN CURRICULUM AND INSTRUCTION

BY

OUDA TEDA ENA

CHICAGO, ILLINOIS

MAY 2013

Copyright by Ouda Teda Ena, 2013

All rights reserved.

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I would like to express my greatest gratitude to Ann Marie Ryan, Ph. D., the chairperson of my committee, for her insightful advice and encouragement. Gratitude is extended to the members of the committee: Leanne Kallemeyn, Ph. D. and Amy Heineke, Ph. D. for their professional support.

A note of special thanks goes to Raymond Tambunan and Felicia Kristanto for their assistance to rate the data.

Finally, I would like to express my sincere appreciation to my wife, Dewi Widyastuti, my family and friends for their love and support.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS .....	iii
LIST OF TABLES .....	vi
LIST OF FIGURES .....	vii
ABSTRACT .....	viii
CHAPTER	
I. INTRODUCTION .....	1
Background and Rationale for the Study .....	1
Diversity .....	1
Ethnicity .....	3
Religion .....	5
Gender Roles .....	7
Socioeconomic Status .....	9
Indonesian Education System .....	11
Statement of the Problem .....	14
Purpose of the Study .....	15
Research Questions .....	16
Significant of the Study .....	16
II. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE .....	18
English Language Teaching .....	18
ELT in Southeast Asia .....	23
English Language Teaching in Indonesia .....	24
English Language Teaching Curriculum .....	26
Electronic Textbooks .....	28
E-textbooks in Indonesia .....	30
English E-textbooks .....	31
Critical Education .....	32
Learning Materials in Critical Education .....	34
Summary .....	35
III. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY .....	37
Methodology .....	38
Research Design and Method .....	40
Sample Selection .....	41

Data Gathering and Instrumentation .....	44
Data Collection Procedures .....	46
Data Analysis Procedures .....	47
Methodological Limitations .....	50
Ethical Considerations .....	52
IV. DATA ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION .....	53
General Description of the E-textbooks .....	53
Results .....	55
Visual Images Representing Ethnicity .....	56
Human Images Representing Ethnicity .....	58
Animal and Object Images Representing Ethnicity .....	62
Visual Images Representing Religions .....	65
Human Images Representing Religions .....	66
Animal and Object Images Representing Religions .....	67
Visual Images Representing Gender .....	69
Human Images Representing Gender .....	70
Visual Images Representing Socioeconomic Status .....	73
Human Images Representing Socioeconomic Status .....	74
Animal and Object Images Representing SES .....	76
Discussion .....	79
Cultural Representation in the English E-textbook .....	79
Ethnic Diversity .....	80
Religious Diversity .....	82
Gender Role Stereotype and Bias .....	84
Socioeconomic Representation .....	86
Inner and Expanding Circles in the English E-textbook .....	87
Summary .....	89
V. CONCLUSIONS .....	91
Overview of the Study .....	91
Discussion of the Findings .....	93
Ethnic Representation .....	93
Religion Representation .....	95
Gender Representation .....	95
Socioeconomic Status Representation .....	96
Conclusion .....	96
Implication for Practice .....	100
Recommendations for Future Research .....	101
Summary .....	103
REFERENCE LIST .....	104
VITA .....	118

## LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. Data Collection Form to Observe the Frequency of Occurrence.....	46
2. Data Collection Form to Describe the Visual Images.....	46
3. Human Images Representing Ethnicity, Religion, SES, and Gender .....	57
4. Human Images that Represent Ethnicity.....	61
5. Animal Images that Represent Ethnicity. ....	63
6. Object Images that Represent Ethnicity. ....	65
7. Human Images that Represent Religion. ....	67
8. Object Images that Represent Religion. ....	69
9. Human Images that Represent Gender. ....	73
10. Human Images that Represent SES. ....	76
11. Animal Images that Represent SES. ....	77
12. Object Images that Represent SES. ....	78

## LIST OF FIGURE

Figure	Page
1. The Map of Indonesia with its International Boundary. ....	3

## **ABSTRACT**

The purpose of the study was to evaluate the visual images used as illustrations in the English electronic textbooks for grades ten, eleven, and twelve in Indonesia. Qualitative visual content analysis was employed as the methodology of the research. The analysis focused on whether these e-textbooks accommodated the religious, gender, ethnic, and socioeconomic diversity of the students. These four aspects of cultural diversity that influenced students learning in Indonesian contexts were crucial to examine because the students were so diverse as a result of the geographical conditions and historical background of Indonesia.

Eight English e-textbooks were examined. First, the result showed that Melanesian ethnic groups were under represented in all English e-textbooks examined. The Melanesian images of human, animals, and objects were markedly lower in numbers compared to the Austronesian and foreign ones. Due to the fact that the Melanesian ethnic groups were significantly less represented in numbers, they were also considerably underrepresented in roles. The range of roles of Melanesian people depicted in the English e-textbooks was very limited. Second, it showed that in the eight English e-textbooks examined only Islam and Christianity were represented by human images. Christianity, Hinduism, and Buddhism were represented by the images of objects in the English e-textbooks series.

Confucianism was not represented at all in the e-textbooks series. Third, the study showed that there were gender bias and gender stereotypes in the visual images used as illustrations of the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia. Women were underrepresented in the overall English e-textbooks examined, men were depicted as having wider range of roles as shown by their occupations and tasks they performed, and the visual images used as illustrations contained gender stereotypes related to emotions and feelings. Fourth, the study showed that all the three SES groups: low, mid, and high were represented in the English e-textbooks and most of the visual images represented the mid SES group. Finally, the study also showed that the writers of the English e-textbooks adopted English as an international language paradigm. As a result, the ultimate goal of learning English was no longer native-like competency but international intelligibility.

# CHAPTER 1

## INTRODUCTION

### **Background and Rationale for the Study**

This study was a visual analysis of eight English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia. It examined whether the visual images used as illustrations in these e-textbooks represented the cultural diversity of Indonesia. The four cultural aspects studied were ethnic, religious, gender, and socioeconomic diversity.

Indonesia is a large country covering an area of 5,193,250 square kilometers, out of which 2,027,087 square kilometers are land and the remainder is water. The Indonesian population is estimated to be 220,953,634 people. It is fourth in the world for its population density. According to the data from the Central Bureau of Statistics the number of school children is 25,389,000 (*Biro Pusat Statistik* or The Central Bureau of Statistics, 2010). These school children represent the diversity of the Indonesian population. The most notable diversity in Indonesia includes ethnicity, religion, gender, and social economic status.

### **Diversity**

Four aspects of cultural diversity that influence students learning in Indonesian contexts are ethnicity, gender roles, religion, and socioeconomic status. As mentioned

earlier, these four aspects are so diverse because of the geographical conditions and historical background of Indonesia.

Indonesia proclaimed its independence on August 17<sup>th</sup>, 1945 after about 350 years of Dutch colonialization and three and a half years of Japanese occupation. Prior to European colonialization Indonesia consisted of some smaller and bigger kingdoms. Throughout history there had been two kingdoms that now resembles current day Indonesia in terms of territory. Sriwijaya, a Buddhist kingdom reigned in the archipelago from the 7<sup>th</sup> to 11<sup>th</sup> century. The second was Majapahit kingdom that ruled the country from the 12<sup>th</sup> to 14<sup>th</sup> century. It declined and finally lost its power with the emergence of smaller Islamic kingdoms in the 15<sup>th</sup> century.

Geographically, Indonesia consists of more than 15,000 Islands. Administratively, it is divided into 33 provinces (See Figure 1.1). The population of Indonesia is 220,953,634 people from more than 1000 ethnic groups with more than 700 different languages (Davies, 2010; Parker, 2010; Suryadinata, Arifin, & Ananta, 2005). In terms of religious diversity, the Indonesian government officially acknowledges six religions, namely Islam, Protestantism, Catholicism, Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism. Indonesia with a population of 220 million Muslims has become the nation with the largest Muslim population in the world. Each of the four aspects of cultural diversity will be discussed in the next sections.



Figure 1. The Map of Indonesia with its International Boundary.

Source of map:

[http://images.nationmaster.com/images/motw/middle\\_east\\_and\\_asia/indonesia\\_admin\\_2002.jpg](http://images.nationmaster.com/images/motw/middle_east_and_asia/indonesia_admin_2002.jpg)

## Ethnicity

Ethnic identity is a dimension of self, as an individual and as a group member. It forms, develops, and emerges from membership in a particular ethnic group. It is a consequence of distinctive socialization processes and is influenced by the degree of personal significance individuals attach to membership in an ethnic group (Sheets, 2005). Defining one's ethnicity is often complicated. For government records ethnicity in Indonesia is defined by using a patriarchal system. Indonesia does not have an official system of ethnic identification. People use a self-identification system concerning ethnicity.

Indonesia is a multi-ethnic society, with more than 1,000 ethnic groups. The size of most ethnic groups is small, and only 13 groups have more than 1 million each (Suryadinata, et al., 2005). Sheets (2005) defines ethnicity as “part of peoples’ personal and cultural history” (p. 20). It is a complicated category that “includes all the cultural, psychological, and social phenomena associated with a particular group” (Sheets, 2005, p. 20). An ethnic group is a distinctive social group in a large society who set themselves apart or who is set apart by others due to distinctive cultural patterns, beliefs, histories, values, attitudes, languages, national origins, and physical traits (Sheets, 2005).

The 2000 population census in Indonesia showed that the biggest ethnic group is Javanese, comprising 41.71% of the population, followed by Sundanese with 15.41%. The third largest ethnic group is Malay with 3.45%. The number of ethnic groups in one province among the 31 provinces in Indonesia also varies. Some provinces such as the provinces in the island of Java are inhabited by more than 90% of Javanese. Other provinces are more diverse. The most diverse are Papua Provinces in the island of Papua with less than 50% Papuan, meaning that there are less native ethnic people than newcomers. The unequal share of wealth and tensions between different cultural groups has sometimes triggered ethnic conflicts.

In general there are two big ethnic groups that resulted from the ancient migrations namely, Melanesians and Austronesians. Melanesian people inhabited the eastern part of the country and the Austronesians inhabited the western part of Indonesia. Most of the big cities are in the west and therefore, the western part is more economically developed than the east. The development gap between the east and the west often creates

regional conflicts where some small separatist movements such as in Papua, South Maluku, and Timor want to break away from Indonesia.

The schools and classrooms throughout the nation represent the ethnic diversity discussed above. In some areas the classrooms consist of only one ethnic group but in other regions they may be more diverse. In central Java where plurality is low for example, most public schools consist of at least 95% Javanese students. On the contrary, public schools in the island of Papua are more diverse with less than 50% Papuan students in public schools (Suryadinata et al., 2005). As a consequence, schools with more diverse student populations have to deal with more ethnic tensions compared to schools with less diverse student populations.

In the past, the government adopted a centralized system of government and overemphasized unity of the nation so ethnic diversity was long neglected and a color-blind policy was used. Similarly, the education system was also centralized. A single curriculum was used nationally. As a result, education was used as a way to create obedient citizens (Indarto, 2008).

## **Religion**

Religion in a broad sense refers to any pattern of beliefs, emotions, practices, and organization that derive from perceptions of the ultimate significance of the human and natural worlds (Beckford, 2010). In Indonesia everyone has the right to follow a religion of his or her choice but the government only recognizes six religions namely, Islam, Buddhism, Hinduism, Catholicism, Protestantism, and Confucianism. Islam is the dominant religion in Indonesia with 88% (around 220 million) of the population being Muslim. This makes Indonesia the largest Muslim country in the world. Other religions

include Protestantism (6%), Roman Catholicism (3%), Hinduism (2%), Buddhism (1%), and other smaller religions. In general Muslims fall into two categories, Javanese traditionalists who often align with Nahdatul Ulama (Charismatic Islamic Scholars) and modernist Muslims who align themselves with Muhammadiyah, a mass-Muslim organization with a more religiously orthodox but progressive social outlook.

Constitutionally Indonesia is a secular state but religion, in this case Islam, exists in most affairs (World Trade Press, 2010). Some Islamic groups have been trying to establish an Islamic state that adopts Sharia law in Indonesia. Aceh, the western most province, has adopted Sharia law completely. However, most Muslims in Indonesia strive for a moderate Islam that has a strong commitment to tolerance and pluralism (Hefner in van Wichelen, 2010). Although ultraconservative or more hard-line tendencies exist within Islamism in Indonesia, moderation is the norm and demonstrates how Islam and democracy are compatible (van Wichelen, 2010). Aligning Islamic traditions with globalization forces of consumerism played a central role in shaping middle class Muslims, for example, by turning the modes of veiling into commodifiable accessories of identity and/or lifestyle (van Wichelen, 2010).

Religion plays a significant role in Indonesian society. The Indonesian constitution mandates that all persons have to be religious. People have to choose one of the six religions acknowledged by the government. This religion is included on national identity cards and other formal documents. In reality there are many people who practice traditional belief systems such as animism although they are officially registered as members of certain religious groups (Parker, 2010).

Conflicts and tensions between Christians and Muslims exist in areas where the number of the populations is almost the same. In areas where one religious group is a minority one-way conflicts occur. Radical Muslim clerics and aggressive Christian missionaries contribute significantly to these conflicts even inciting them in some cases. Some politicians take advantage of these situations to gain power. (Haryatmoko, 2010; Warta, 2011).

Religious education is a compulsory subject at all education levels from elementary school to university. According to the 2003 law of National Education System schools and universities should provide teachers of each religion for the students. This policy is challenging for religious-based schools. Public schools often segregate students with different religions to make scheduling easier. This approach has been criticized as creating tensions among students with different religions rather than promoting inter-religious understanding (Kelabora, 1979; Zuhdi, 2005; Soejadmoko, 2009; Haryatmoko, 2010).

Similar to ethnicity, religion diversity in the classrooms reflects the diversity in the society. In some areas public schools might consist only of students from one religious group but in some others they might consist of students from many different religions. Religions and religious education as a compulsory school subject play important roles in shaping the students' views about inter-religious relationships in the society.

### **Gender Roles**

Gender is a combination of nature and culture, biological traits as well as learned behaviors (Ryan, 2010). The Indonesian government applies a heteronormative standard

where there are only two genders, male and female; however, homosexuality and transgender exists in public life and are not criminalized. Transgendered people are accepted as part of the society although they often become victims of discrimination. They generally can only work in certain fields such as, fashion, beauty salons, entertainment, and some work as street singers or prostitutes. Apart from a male-dominated society in general, some communities adopt matrilineal systems in which women are in charge of the household and men take their wife's surnames such as in Minangkabau and West Timor (World Trade Press, 2010).

According to the 2010 Indonesian government census, the populations of women and men in Indonesia are 118, 010,413 and 119,630, 913 respectively. Indonesia is basically a patriarchal society, where women are expected to play traditional subordinate roles as daughters, wives, and mothers; however, Indonesian women have come a long way in their majority Islamic and male-dominated society. They have become more economically independent over the last few years. Women gained the right to vote at the same time as Indonesia's independence in 1945. Women can legally engage in any social and economic activities. They can inherit equally with men in spite of customary Islamic inheritance laws, which are unfavorable to women (World Trade Press, 2010).

Gender roles are among other cultural identities that play an important role in learning. Sheets (2005) identifies how they develop:

Gender roles develop through a socialization process in the family and community. These roles are screened through specific cultural norm. Other family characteristics such as race, culture, socioeconomic level, class, and religion can also significantly shape children's gender learning (p. 43).

Although gender inequality still exists, the situation is changing. Indonesian law mandates that political parties should include at least 20% women as their candidates for the House of Representatives and the local senate (World Trade Press, 2010).

In education, women are often marginalized. In rural areas and under-developed areas where resources are scarce when a choice has to be made parents often discourage girls from continuing their education. Therefore, boys outnumber girls in enrollment in elementary schools and only 12.8% of girls finish high school. The literacy rate of women from all age groups is as low as 42% (*Biro Pusat Statistik*, 2010).

### **Socioeconomic Status**

Socioeconomic status is a difficult construct to measure. Low socioeconomic status is directly related to poverty. Poverty is defined as an economic inability to fulfill food and nonfood basic needs measured by consumption expenditure (BPS, 2010). To measure poverty incidence, BPS-Statistics Indonesia has used the concept of basic needs. A person whose average expenditure per capita per month is below the poverty line is considered poor. The method used in calculating the poverty line consists of two components, i.e. Food Poverty Line (FPL) and Non-Food Poverty Line (NFPL). The FPL is the minimum expenditure required by an individual to fulfill his or her basic food needs equivalent to a daily minimum requirement of 2,100 kilo calories per capita per day, while the NFPL refers to the minimum requirement for household necessities, clothing, education, and health (BPS, 2010).

According to the Central Statistics Agency (BPS, 2010), the number of Indonesians living in poverty as of March 2010 was around 31.02 million people or about 13.33 percent of the total population. The agency calculated the ability of a person to

survive with 200,000 rupiahs (US \$22.4) per month as the poverty line. The number of people living below the poverty line is greater in rural areas (16.56%) compared to their urban counterpart (9.87%) (BPS, 2010).

Studies show that students from low socioeconomic families often suffer conditions such as inadequate shelter, inferior food, unsafe neighborhoods, and substandard schools that affect their emotional and social well-being (Campbell, 2010; Sheets, 2005). Myths and stereotypes about the ideal family can influence teacher expectations and attitudes regarding the ability of students to learn and behave. By acknowledging and respecting wide spectrum of families, teachers can discourage prejudice. They can take an active role in reinforcing the vital link between home and school (Sheets, 2005).

The statistical data from the Indonesian Central Bureau of Statistics (BPS, 2011) shows a direct correlation between poverty and school participation rate. When the poverty rate of a province is low, the school participation rate in that province is high and vice versa. The province with the lowest poverty rate is Jakarta with only 3.75 percent of its population living below the poverty line. The school participation rate is high for all school levels, 99.16 percent, 91.45 percent, and 61.99 percent for elementary, junior high, and senior high schools respectively. As a comparison, West Papua is the province with the highest poverty rate with 31.98 percent of its population living below the poverty line. As a result the school participation rate is also low for all school levels. Only 76.22 percent of children age 6-12 enroll in elementary schools. The enrollments for junior and senior high school are 74.35 percent and 48.28 percent respectively (BPS, 2011).

## **Indonesian Education System**

Indonesia declared its independent in 1945 after 350 years of Dutch colonization and three and a half years of Japanese occupation. Sukarno, the first president ruled the country for twenty years and then was followed by Suharto, the second president who led the country for thirty two years. Only after Suharto's forced resignation in 1998 did Indonesia ratify the law that limited presidential terms for two terms or ten years consecutively.

To unify more than 300 ethnic groups with more than 500 languages the first and the second president adopted a centralized government system. Although the motto of the country is "unity in diversity", unity had more emphasis. It often caused the government to use armed forces to maintain the unity of Indonesia. This centralized government system had only benefited the dominant groups and marginalized the minority groups. Ethnic and religious conflicts and social unrest often broke out because of an unequal share of power and wealth among different groups.

Similarly, the education system of Indonesia during the Sukarno era, which was known as the Old Order, and the Suharto presidency, known as the New Order era, adopted a centralized system. There was only one curriculum that was used in the whole country. The textbooks were also written, published, and distributed by the government. Education was used by the government as a means to create obedient citizens and control the society. Fourteen years after the fall of President Suharto the conditions are very similar. Currently the government has adopted a so called school-based curriculum in which public schools have the freedom to develop their own curriculum, but in reality schools still rely very heavily on the local and national office of education.

There are two public education systems in Indonesia. One is under the ministry of education while the other is under the ministry of religious affairs. The ones under the ministry of education represent the view of most Indonesian people that education should be secular, while the ones under the ministry of religious affairs are mainly Islamic schools with the view that education should not be secular for all knowledge is derived from God. This dual system was a compromise between the nationalist scholars who went to Europe and the Muslim scholars who studied in Egypt during the establishment of the Indonesian education system in 1949. These two types of schools exist at all levels, starting from kindergarten to university (Kelabora, 1979; Sirozi, 2004). The ministry of religious affairs is responsible for the textbooks, curriculum, and teacher training for the Islamic schools.

After a long history of highly centralized government system, Indonesia released Regional Autonomy Laws in 1999 that provided greater political and fiscal autonomy for local government. As a result, regions should be less dependent to central government and increase local participation and develop their own resources. Following the enactment of this law, the ministry of education also released guidelines for implementing decentralization at the school level. In the guidelines of school-based management and school-based curriculum, schools are expected to develop their curriculum, provide training for their teachers, and work with school stake holders and businesses to generate more resources. For schools in the cities and well-developed regions, the regional autonomy laws have provided opportunities to create quality education; however, in less developed areas, the laws have reduced a substantial amount of resources and therefore have hindered the schools from providing basic education. The

long history of centralized bureaucracy has created a culture of dependence among local bureaucracies that further impedes the implementation of school-based management. Another hindrance of school-based management implementation is the national test controlled and conducted by central government. It led to schools using the teaching materials and the curriculum recommended by the central government.

All schools, public and private, have the same curriculum with few elective courses decided by the local authority. There are three levels of education before college. These include elementary school for six years, junior high school for three years, and high school for another three years. These three levels are in separate buildings and under different management and bureaucracy. At the end of each level students are to take national standardized tests for core subjects such as, mathematics, English, Indonesian Language, civic education, and religious education. To continue their study in the higher level, for example moving from elementary to junior high school, students have to take an admissions test.

Due to the diverse population of Indonesia, in terms of ethnic, religion, gender and socioeconomic status, its centralized and standardized policy of education should be implemented with great caution. The previous policies had marginalized certain groups of people and created privileged groups (Indarto, 2008; Haryatmoko, 2010). To observe the unfair dynamics between the marginalized and the privileged groups, critical theory in education will be employed in this study. Critical education refers to a philosophy of education as well as a process of critique towards the practices of education with the emphasis on the power relations of different parties involved in it (Giroux, 2001). Critical theory focuses on analyzing the contemporary power interests between groups and

individuals within society, indentifying who gains and who loses in specific situations. The central focus of critical research is the dynamics of how privileged groups support the status quo to maintain their privileges (Kincheloe & McLaren, 2000).

### **Statement of the Problem**

The government ratified the Decentralization Law in 1999 (Tyson, 2010); however, the government, in this case the department of education, still adopts a centralized policy system. One example of the centralized policy is the publication of learning materials. The government controls and publishes learning materials for schools. Centralization has the potential of creating imbalanced power relations between the central and local governments. There is a possibility that the publication of learning materials does not include certain local interests and therefore marginalized these groups and prioritized other groups.

E-textbook publication is one of the centralized publication policies. This policy has also been criticized as costly and marginalizing areas where the Internet facilities do not exist (Maryulis, 2008). Although the government stated that these e-textbooks had been reviewed and certified as qualified by the National Bureau of Education Standardization (Nuh, 2010) there has not been any research regarding whether these books are culturally representative for the diverse population of students.

Previous content analysis studies on English textbooks published in Asia show that they do not adequately represent learners' culture (Yi, 1997; Yen, 2000). One of the cultural aspects that were often inadequately represented is gender. Content of English language curriculum contributes to the formation of gender identity and it often emphasizes gender stereotypes which encourage girls into an ideology of obedience

(Moss, 2010). In fact, early surveys on textbooks published in England and North America showed that women were also underrepresented, trivialized, and stereotyped (Gray, 2002).

### **Purpose of the Study**

The Ministry of Education of Indonesia published the e-textbooks based on the assumption that technology enhances learning. The adoption of e-textbooks was not based on any empirical research. The government published the e-textbooks to provide inexpensive textbooks for schools. It was introduced for the first time by the Decree of the Ministry of Education No. 46/2007. The Ministry of Education bought the copyrights from textbook writers and made the textbooks accessible for free on the Internet. The e-textbook publications continue under the new minister of education with the Decree of Minister of Education No. 41/2008. Up to January 2010, 942 titles had been uploaded to the Internet server of the Ministry of Education (Nuh, 2010).

The purpose of the study is to evaluate the visual images of the English electronic textbooks designated for the 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> graders in Indonesia. Qualitative visual content analysis will be employed as the methodology of the research (Rosengren, 1981; Willis, 2007; Merriam, 2009; Krippendorff & Bock, 2009). The analysis will focus on whether these e-textbooks accommodate the religious, gender, ethnic, and socioeconomic diversity of the students.

The result of this research will contribute to the improvement of English language teaching in Indonesia in particular. It is also expected that the future textbook publishers take cultural aspects such as, gender, ethnicity, religion, and socioeconomic status into consideration. Including local cultures and shifting the goals of learning to understanding

local cultures in global context are more realistic than setting the goals as to attain native-like competency.

### **Research Questions**

Based on the background above, this research is intended to evaluate the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> graders in Indonesia using a critical education theoretical framework.

The research question is:

To what extent is diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia?

- To what extent is ethnic diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?
- To what extent is religious diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?
- To what extent is gender role diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?
- To what extent is socioeconomic diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?

### **Significance of the Study**

Materials evaluation is an attempt to measure the value of materials (Tomlinson, 1998). It can predict whether the materials will promote and facilitate the learning process of the students. Learning materials are relevant to and useful for the students

when they are of learners' interests and related to tasks which learners need to perform in real life. Including cultural aspects and local contexts with balanced representation will increase students' motivation which in turns will help them to engage with the learning materials that might increase to learners' chance to succeed in learning. Studying English teaching materials through visual content analysis is important in an Indonesian context because it could contribute to the development of better learning materials that are designed to cater to a very diverse population.

This study is crucial because Indonesia is a very diverse nation in terms of religion, ethnicity, and socioeconomic status (Suryadinata et al., 2005). It is even more crucial because the e-textbooks are intended for all students around the country. Textbooks play an important role in the Indonesian education system. School teachers rely on textbooks as the predominant source of information for teachers and students. There has been no systematic study of e-textbooks used in Indonesian high schools in terms of their gender, socio-economic, religious and ethnic representation. Through the use of visual content analysis, the researcher will attempt to determine whether, and to what extent, gender, socio-economic, religious and ethnic diversity are represented in English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia.

This study will encourage English textbook writers and publishers to deal with more balanced representations of gender, ethnicity, religion, and socioeconomic status and improve English language teaching (ELT) in Indonesia by including local contexts and thereby decreasing the domination of English speaking countries such as, the United States, United Kingdom, and Australia which are often referred to as the center circle countries in ELT (Kachru, 1996).

## **CHAPTER 2**

### **REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE**

This chapter reviews literature related to doing content analysis of English E-textbooks used in high schools in Indonesia. The study examines whether English E-textbooks culturally represent the diversity of the Indonesian population, a nation comprised of more than one thousand ethnic groups with more than 700 living languages (Davies, 2010; Parker, 2010; Suryadinata, Arifin, & Ananta, 2005). Therefore, first, this chapter discusses English language teaching (ELT) in general and its curriculum followed by a discussion of ELT in Southeast Asian contexts. ELT in Indonesia is discussed to provide historical background as well as information on the current situation. This includes the decision by the Indonesian government through its ministry of education to publish electronic textbooks for schools. The third part of this chapter discusses e-textbook policy implementation in Indonesia. The fourth part discusses critical theory as the framework for the study.

#### **English Language Teaching**

The English language teaching (ELT) paradigm in Asia often positioned native speakers and non-native speakers of English in opposition. Non-native speakers are the learners and the native speakers are the ones to set the standards, what is right and what is wrong in terms of grammar, vocabulary, and other aspects of language learning

(Kramsch, 1998). In this paradigm, terms such as English as a second language (ESL) and English as a foreign language (EFL) were created. English is considered as a second language when the learners use the language out of the class and it has social functions. On the other hand, English is a foreign language when learners cannot use the language other than classroom usage.

The view that native speakers are the standard has been adopted for a long time in the ELT realm. It creates different status among language users. Based on this reality Kachru (1976) categorized language users into three different groups. The first group is the inner-circle, which includes countries such as the United Kingdom, the United States of America, Australia, New Zealand, and Canada. These countries are considered as the norm-providing countries, which have the privilege to set the norms or standards of English language usage. The second group is the outer circle countries, which include countries such as, Bangladesh, India, Malaysia, Singapore, and the Philippines in which English is not the first language, but it has some official use. The third group is the expanding circle, which includes countries where English is learned at school as a compulsory subject, but it does not have official or social function in the community (Kachru, 1996).

The inner circle countries always have benefits from this situation because they are the sources of all standards. Therefore, they have the privileges of setting learning standards, developing teaching methods, learning materials, and testing instruments. The countries in the expanding circle are marginalized because they do not have the power and are the receivers of what the inner circle countries decided.

The marketing of ELT is often parallel with the industrial products in the international market where the developed nations hold an unfair monopoly over less developed countries (Canagarajah, 2002). The worldwide market for English language teaching training is significant. This industry is estimated to be worth around 6.25 billion dollars a year (Kachru, 1996). There have been big competitions in promoting ELT models from the inner circle countries. As a result, policy makers and teachers in the expanding circle countries believe that the ELT models propagated by the central circle through their textbooks, research journals, training programs, and professional organizations are the best. In this assumption, conditions in the expanding circle countries that have to be adjusted (Canagarajah, 2002). The ultimate goal of learning English is becoming like a native so that learners can communicate effectively with native speakers of English. This assumption has been criticized by researchers for being based on fallacies (Kachru 1976; 1996; Kramsch, 1998; Canagarajah, 2002; Gray, 2002; Kirkpatrick, 2011).

The major assumption of English teachers and policy makers in Asia is that English is primarily learned to interact with native speakers of the language. In reality, English is now used by people from diverse cultural and linguistic backgrounds. English is used by people from different nations in Asia as the lingua franca in business, governmental relations, education, and other areas.

The second fallacy is that English is learned to understand American and British culture. In today's contexts in the outer and expanding circles, English is learned to represent local cultural values. It is used to understand and share local cultures to other

non-English speaking people. Indonesian people for example, learn Korean customs from books and other media published in English and vice versa (Kachru 1976).

The third fallacy is the claim that the goal of teaching is to import models from the inner circles. This assumption has no empirical evidence and is often pragmatically not effective.

The fourth fallacy is that the ultimate acquisitional goal is having native like control of the language. Having native-like written competency in English is ideal so that a learner can share ideas; however, having native-like spoken competency is often unrealistic. Having such a goal in English language teaching often leads teachers to put too much emphasis on accuracy and neglect the communicative aspect of the language. As a result, students are able to utter isolated sentences accurately but fail to communicate effectively. A more plausible goal would be international intelligibility (Kirkpatrick, 2011).

The fifth fallacy is that native speakers of English are the norm providers of teaching, policy information, and administration of the spread of English. The last fallacy is that the diversity and variation in English in the outer circle is an indicator of decay of English (Kachru, 1996).

Throughout the 1990s a new awareness in ELT was thriving because of research and publications written from Marxist, postmodernist, or post-culturalist perspectives (Gray, 2002). In these perspectives the global spread of English “was inherently problematic and inextricably linked to wider political issues” (p. 151). ELT practices are not value free, they are cultural and ideological constructs (Canagarajah, 2002; Gray,

2002). To assume that ELT book publishers are mainly in the commercial business for example, is inaccurate and simplistic (Gray, 2002).

Similarly, considering native speakers of English as the standards and defining the ultimate goal of learning English as to attain native-like proficiency are over simplifications. The goal of learning a language is no longer being able to communicate with native speakers. In reality, English language learners will be communicating with other non-native speakers more than with native speakers (Canagarajah, 2002; Gray, 2002; Kirkpatrick, 2001; Kramersch, 1998; Kachru, 1996). As a consequence, the goal of learning a foreign language is to become an intercultural speaker (Kramersch, 1998).

A multilingual model, in which the curriculum provides a course in regional cultures, should be adopted (Kirkpatrick, 2001). The choice of functions, uses, and models of ELT should be determined base on local conditions and needs (Kachru, 1996). Therefore, the teacher should teach the culture of the target language through the language. Culture should not be learned separately. The teaching of culture of the target language and the local context should be represented to create balance in the curriculum.

Another area to consider when adopting a multilingual model is testing. So far the standards of testing are the native speakers of English. In multilingual models, the learners' competency should be measured against successful multilingual speakers not against monolingual native speakers (Kirkpatrick, 2001). In terms of learning materials, regional literature in English can become a major part of the literature curriculum (Kirkpatrick, 2001).

I used the literature on ELT to examine the positions adopted by the e-textbook writers concerning their approach and methodology. When ELT textbooks writers adopt the EFL/ESL approach in writing, the goal of learning English is native-like proficiency. When they adopt the idea of EIL the objective of English language learning is international intelligibility (Kirkpatrick, 2001).

### **ELT in Southeast Asia**

The roles and functions of English in Southeast Asian countries are not identical. They depend on the colonial history of these countries. In former British colonies English is often more developed and has certain social functions in the community. In countries where the British presence was minimal, English does not have any social functions other than a school subject.

The importance of English in Southeast Asia is shown at the governmental level. It was adopted as the only means of communication in the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN). ASEAN with its ten member countries is linguistically diverse. The member countries signed an agreement in 2009 making English the official language of communication among its members (Kirkpatrick, 2001).

The importance of English is also shown in the educational field. English is considered as a second language in the former British colony such as Singapore, Malaysia, and Brunei. English is taught starting at the first grade of elementary school. English is also the language of instruction for subjects such as mathematics and science starting as early as first grade in elementary school in Brunei and Malaysia. In Singapore, English is the language of instruction for all school levels and local languages such as

Chinese, Malay, and Tamil are taught as subjects. English is also considered a second language in the Philippines because it was used officially. English is the language of instruction for mathematics and science starting at the first grade of elementary school since 1974 (Kirkpatrick, 2001).

In countries with different colonial histories, such as Indonesia, Myanmar, and Vietnam, English is often referred to as a foreign language. Without official or social function in the community, English is taught as a school subject. In Indonesia, English is introduced in junior high school. The following sections discuss ELT in Indonesia.

### **English Language Teaching in Indonesia**

English has played an important role in Indonesia. It is not only used to communicate with people from English speaking countries such as the United States, United Kingdom, Australia, or Canada but also people from neighboring countries such as Singapore, Malaysia, the Philippines, and other Asian countries.

In 1950 after the war of independence ended, the Indonesian government started to develop an education system. English was chosen as a compulsory foreign language to learn starting at the junior high school level. Other languages such as Arabic, Mandarin, French, German and Latin are taught as electives at schools where teachers are available (Astuti, 2009).

The formal teaching of English at school started from the Dutch colonial era in early 1900s when French was abolished from primary schools (Groeneboer, 1998 in Mistar, 2005; Sadtono 1997). The teaching of English during the Dutch era was often cited as more successful. That was due to the conditions of small classes, qualified

teachers, and availability of teaching materials. Schools at that time were only for the Dutch and some upper class Indonesians. During the Japanese occupation, from 1942 to 1945, English and other European languages were banned from schools and all books had to be burned (Sadtono, 1997; Mistar, 2005).

The development of systematic ELT started in 1950 when the ministry of education of Indonesia established a cooperation project with the Ford Foundation from the United States to conduct two-year evening classes for in-service teachers to supply schools with qualified English teachers in a short period of time. Some graduates from this program were sent to the United States to continue their study of English linguistics and literature. To meet the increasing demand of teachers, three teachers colleges were established in 1958. In addition to preparing English teachers, English teaching materials and curriculum were also developed. In the 1960s the teaching of English declined due to the influence of the Communist Party and the negative sentiment toward Western countries (Mistar, 2005; Sadtono, 1997). The political situation became normal with the new government in 1965 and the relationship with Western country resumed. The ministry of education began to develop national curriculum that included English as a compulsory subject starting from grade 7<sup>th</sup> of junior high school. The next section discusses the development of English language teaching in Indonesia.

## **English Language Teaching Curriculum**

The first standardized curriculum applied nationally was developed and implemented in 1975. The national curriculum of English was revised in 1984, 1994, 2000, and 2003 (Mistar, 2005; Sadtono, 1997; Yuwono, 2005). According to the 1975 curriculum the purpose of English teaching in high school was to facilitate the development of advance science, technology, culture, and arts, and to enhance international relations. The four language skills: reading, writing, listening, and speaking were taught discretely. The number of vocabulary items students should master when they finished junior high school was 1,500 words and 4,000 words for senior high school student. The method adopted was an audio-lingual approach with the emphasis on the teaching of linguistics patterns through habit-formation drills (Mistar, 2005).

In 1984 the ministry of education revised the national curriculum and therefore it is known as the 1984 Curriculum. The teaching method adopted in this curriculum was known as the Communicative Approach. There was a misinterpretation because of its name, most teachers believed that it should only emphasized speaking skills (Huda, 1992 in Mistar, 2005). Communicative was interpreted as oral communication so other language skills such as reading, listening, and writing were neglected. Grammatical accuracy was sacrificed for fluency; as a result students were almost speaking something similar to English Creole.

Another curriculum was introduced in 1994. There were not many changes in English language teaching. However, there was a change of priority of language skills in the 1994 curriculum. The most important language skill was reading, followed by

listening, speaking, and writing. The expected number of words mastered was reduced to 1,000 from 1,500 words for junior high school and 2,500 words for senior high school reduced from 4000 in the previous curriculum. For the students in senior high school majoring in the languages, they had to master 3,000 words by the end of the program. Language skills and language elements were no longer taught separately as in 1984 curriculum. The teaching was wrapped around language themes and functions (Mistar, 2005).

In 2004 a competency-based curriculum was adopted. There were not any significant changes in terms of learning materials. In the previous curriculum trimester the school calendar was used. In the 2004 curriculum a semester school calendar was introduced. The government controls the quality of education by setting basic competencies and standard competencies. These competencies are measured by a standardized national test at the end of year 9 and 12.

In 2006, in line with the implementation of the Regional Autonomy Law, the ministry of education promoted school-based management and school-based curriculum. Schools are expected to developed their own curriculum and be independent financially. The adoption of a school based management system has only benefited schools in the cities and in the well-developed areas. Schools in the less developed and rural areas suffer a lack of resources because of the significant budget cut from the central government. The government still controls education by suggesting approved teaching materials and administering national standardized tests.

The result of English teaching in Indonesia varies greatly. In well-developed areas and big cities it has been considered successful. Some schools in the big cities now even have bilingual classes with English and Indonesian as the languages of instruction. In less developed areas, however, English teachers and learning materials are often not available.

### **Electronic Textbooks**

According to Weber and Cavanaugh, (2006) e-books are textual documents that have been converted and "published" in an electronic format and are displayed on e-book readers, devices, or computers using e-book software programs. It includes all types of publications which are accessible electronically. E-Books, like many other forms of computer technology, have three basic components: hardware, software, and the e-book file (Weber & Cavanaugh, 2006). Therefore, the minimum requirement to be able to read e-textbooks in schools is a set of computer. The e-textbooks for schools in Indonesia that were published by the Ministry of Education are uploaded to the internet, so in order to be able to read or download the file an internet connection is needed.

Similar to printed textbooks, e-textbooks should abide by the criteria of good learning materials. E-textbooks have some advantages compared to printed textbooks. Ease of use is the main advantage that characterizes e-textbooks (Grensing-Pophal, 2010). Another advantage is the fast delivery of the content. Electronically distributed readings may offer advantages for distance learning because electronic copies can be made available quickly and cheaply (Vernon, 2006). Fast access and rich content has also been identified as a benefit of e-books. Hyperlinks can lead the reader to extensive supplemental information, simulations, tutorials, glossaries, dictionaries, tests, and other

resources with a few clicks of the mouse (Vernon, 2006). Similarly, Weber and Cavanaugh (2006) highlight the main benefits of e-textbooks such as the ease of making copies, perceived as being up-to-date, space-saving, and around the clock availability. Ease of use and text modification has also been recognized as a benefit that outweighs printed textbooks. Portability is another advantage of e-textbooks. (Insinnia & Skarecki, 2004).

Although e-textbooks have many advantages, they also have some limitations. Other writers (Insinnia & Skarecki, 2004; Vernon, 2006) state that e-textbooks are better than printed books but Weber and Cavanaugh, (2006) noted that e-textbooks are unfavorable compared to print ones for perceived ease of reading. Many studies show that students liked electronic books and content, but ultimately insisted on being able to print it out at some point (Gresing-Pophal, 2010). While a few students adapted to the electronic textbook, most generally did not because of interface design, time constraints, and study strategies (Vernon, 2006).

Another disadvantage of e-textbooks is students' and teachers' cultural and computer competence. Teachers who were not familiar with computers or could not work confidently with computers could become a barrier for the adoption of e-book technology. Teachers represent a different generation from the students. For example, many teachers did not grow up with technology and are, consequently, not as comfortable making this shift (Gresing-Pophal, 2010). Vernon (2006) stated that paper was embedded in our culture, which is why the majority of students and teachers prefer printed materials.

### **E-textbooks in Indonesia**

The publication of e-textbooks in Indonesia was based on the assumption that technology enhances learning. There was no evidence that the adoption of e-textbooks was based on scientific research. The e-textbook policy instituted by the Indonesian Ministry of Education was meant to provide inexpensive textbooks for schools therefore increasing access to resources. It was introduced for the first time by the Decree of the Ministry of Education No. 46/2007. The Ministry of Education bought the copyrights from textbook writers and made the textbooks accessible for free on the Internet. The e-textbook publications continue under the new minister of education with the Decree of Minister of Education No. 41/2008. By January 2012, 927 titles had been uploaded to the Internet server of the Ministry of Education. The e-textbooks are accessible and downloadable from <http://bse.kemdiknas.go.id/>.

Electronic School Textbooks is a government program to provide inexpensive textbooks. The Ministry of Education bought the copyrights of the books from the authors so it was free (Nuh, 2010). According to the government these e-textbooks have been reviewed and certified as qualified by the National Bureau of Education Standardization (Nuh, 2010).

E-textbooks in Indonesia have been criticized heavily on their use, cost, and accessibility. E-textbooks were only suitable for students with good information technology knowledge and geographic areas with Internet infrastructure (Maryulis, 2008). They are also difficult to access due to the large size of the files (Maryulis, 2008). Some of the files size of the books are as large as 23,000 Kb (kilobytes) and take more

than one hour to download. In the end, many teachers preferred to use textbooks available in bookstores because of practical concerns.

### **English E-textbooks**

The Ministry of Education has published 927 E-textbooks for all school levels up to January 2012. There are 291 E-textbooks for elementary school, 154 for junior high school, 276 for senior high school, and 204 for vocational school. English e-textbooks are not available for all levels. In the 1994 curriculum English was introduced as an elective subject starting from as early as 4<sup>th</sup> grade when a teacher is available. However, there are no English e-textbooks for elementary school. English e-textbooks are also not available for vocational school despite the fact that many vocational school graduates work abroad such as in Korea, Taiwan, and Japan.

There are three different titles for all levels of junior high school; therefore, there are nine e-textbooks. There are ten e-textbooks available for senior high school. Two titles were available for 10<sup>th</sup> grade and four titles are available for each 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grades.

The main advantages of e-textbooks are ease of use, low cost, and fast content delivery. However, it also has limitations due to such issues as slow Internet connections and access to computers. The implementation of the e-textbook policy needs to be evaluated to make sure that it is beneficial for all intended users. Critical education theory is suitable to evaluate whether the policy provides better access to learning resources for all students or if it offers benefits only to certain groups and therefore marginalizes other groups.

The literature on e-textbooks in general provided background of what has been studied, the advantages of e-textbooks, and the challenges of its implementation. This made me aware of important areas that have been studied and led me to observe new topics when examining the e-textbooks used in Indonesia.

### **Critical Education**

Critical education refers to a philosophy of education as well as a process of critique towards the practices of education with the emphasis on the power relations of different parties involved in it. McLaren (1998 in Wink, 2000) defines critical pedagogy as a way of thinking while Giroux (2001) characterizes critical education as theoretical work as well as a conscious practice of education.

Critical pedagogy is a way of thinking about, negotiating, and transforming the relationship among classroom teaching, the production of knowledge, the intuitional structures of the school, and the social and material relations of the wider community, society, and nation state (McLaren in Wink, 2000, p. 31).

Critical education is an application of critical theory in education. According to Giroux (2001) critical theory refers to the theoretical work developed by certain members of the Frankfurt School as well as to the nature of self-conscious critique and to the need to develop a discourse of social transformation and emancipation that does not cling dogmatically to its own doctrinal assumptions. It refers to both a school of thought and also a process of critique. Critical theory focuses on analyzing the contemporary power interests between groups and individuals within society – indentifying who gains and who loses in specific situations. The central focus of critical research is the dynamics of

how privileged groups support the status quo to maintain their privileges (Kincheloe & McLaren, 2000, p. 281).

According to Kincheloe and McLaren (2000) “critical social theory is concerned in particular with issues of power and justice and the ways that the economy, matters of race, class, gender, ideologies, discourses, education, religion and other social institutions, and cultural dynamics interact to construct a social system” (p. 281). Therefore, critical education is concerned with issues of power and justice within the realm of education. These issues of power relations and justice exist because of different economic status, race, class, gender, ideologies, discourses, education, religion, and other social factors embedded in the education system. These issues are often very subtle that people do not notice and are considered to be normal. Critical education is a way of analyzing imbalances in power relations within education as well as a conscious practice to attempt to bring about changes toward a more just education system.

Critical education is suitable as the theoretical framework for my study because it is concerned with issues of power and justice within the realm of education. The objective of my study is to observe whether the learning materials provided by the government privileges certain groups of students and thereby marginalizing other groups. Critical theory in education will be employed to study the unfair dynamics between marginalized and privileged groups. Critical education focuses on analyzing the contemporary power interests between groups and individuals within schools, identifying who gains and who loses in specific situations. Critical theory will be the framework of

this study in an examination of the English e-textbooks for grades 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> published by the government.

### **Learning Materials in Critical Education**

Learning materials play a important role in teaching and learning activities in the classrooms. Textbooks are often the only if not the main sources of learning in Indonesia. Indonesia with a population of more than 200 million is a diverse country in terms of ethnicity, language, religion, and socio-economic status (SES). Publishing any learning materials for schools should take diversity into account in order that the materials cater to the learning needs of students with different ethnic, language, religion, and socio-economic backgrounds.

In order to promote learning, materials should be culturally relevant and inclusive, accommodating the many cultural differences of the students. Culturally relevant teaching materials should include students' culture in order to maintain it and to avoid misinterpretations other cultures (Ladson-Billing, 2009). Culturally relevant teaching is a pedagogy that empowers students intellectually, socially, emotionally, and politically by using cultural referents to impart knowledge, skills, and attitudes. These cultural referents are not merely vehicles for bridging or explaining the dominant culture; they are aspects of the curriculum on their own right (Ladson-Billing, 2009a, p. 20).

Tomlinson and Lynch-Brown (2010) recommended criteria for evaluating and selecting culturally relevant learning materials for school and classroom libraries. These criteria include authentic depiction of the cultural experience from the perspective of that group; accuracy of cultural details in text and illustrations; positive images of minority

characters; balance between historic and contemporary views of groups; and adequate representation of any group. Similarly, Campbell (2010) put forward fifteen minimum qualitative criteria to align or choose textbooks to make sure that they are culturally relevant to the students. The first criterion is that the learning materials are unbiased and non-stereotypical. Secondly they should have a comprehensive, complete, and inclusive view of society and its history. They should also have diverse viewpoints. They should not only represent the culture of the majority group. Good learning materials should build on and extend students' experiences. And finally, they should help students analyze and comprehend how real-life situations.

The literature on critical education and instructional material development helped me develop the criteria to evaluate whether the learning materials are culturally appropriate reside in both the written texts as well as the visual images. Both of them could be used to study whether certain learning materials or textbooks have balanced representation (Sheets, 2005).

### **Summary**

This chapter discusses ELT in general and in Southeast Asian contexts. It also discusses the Indonesian education system with a focus on the history of English language teaching and the development of its curriculum to provide the context in which these e-textbooks are used. Electronic textbooks in general and English e-textbooks are also discussed because they were used as the sample for this research, which intended to evaluate cultural representativeness of the learning materials used in Indonesia.

Critical education was used as the theoretical framework of the research because it provided a standpoint to evaluate whether the learning materials, in this case the English e-textbooks for grades 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup>, privileged certain groups of students and marginalized other groups. This theoretical framework and the related literature reviewed provided the basis for answering the following research questions:

To what extent is diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia?

- To what extent is ethnic diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?
- To what extent is religious diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?
- To what extent is gender role diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?
- To what extent is socioeconomic diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?

## **CHAPTER 3**

### **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

The purpose of the study was to evaluate cultural representations in English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia. The representation of four cultural aspects namely, ethnicity, religion, gender, and socioeconomic status were analyzed. Eight English e-textbooks for grades 10, 11, and 12 published by the Indonesian Ministry of Education were studied using qualitative content analysis.

Content analysis refers to a research technique for making replicable and valid inferences from text or other meaningful matter to the context of their use (Krippendorff, 2004). Texts or documents in content analysis do not only denote written text but also include visual, digital, and physical material (Altheide, 1996; Merriam, 2009). Texts have meaning relative to particular contexts, discourses, or purposes (Krippendorff, 2004). In content analysis studies the researcher draws specific inferences from a body of texts in their context. The texts in this study referred to the visual images in the English e-textbooks developed for the 10th, 11th, and 12th graders of senior high school in Indonesia. All visual images were elicited as data for the purpose of analyses.

To analyze the visual images from the specified e-textbooks a qualitative approach was employed. First, the frequencies of all categorized visual images were

counted. The images were categorized using the four cultural aspects namely, religion, ethnicity, gender, and socioeconomic status. Secondly, descriptions of all visual images were made. Finally, interpretations of all visual images were developed based on critical pedagogy theory.

Qualitative content analysis methodology was used to answer the proposed research questions:

To what extent is diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia?

- To what extent is ethnic diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10th, 11th, and 12th grade in Indonesia?
- To what extent is religious diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10th, 11th, and 12th grade in Indonesia?
- To what extent is gender role diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10th, 11th, and 12th grade in Indonesia?
- To what extent is socioeconomic diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10th, 11th, and 12th grade in Indonesia?

### **Methodology**

The purpose of the study was to provide descriptions of visual images incorporated in English e-textbooks and critically observed how they represented the cultural diversity of the students. The study also provided interpretations as to how these visual images marginalized and prioritized certain group of students. The main research question that guides the inquiry was: To what extent do cultural diversities being

represented in the visual images of English e-textbooks for 10th, 11th, and 12th graders in Indonesia?

Visual images were used as the sources of data to observe the representation of cultural diversity in the English e-textbooks because of their richness in providing cultural information. They do not merely accompany the text, since they often provide much more important cultural information than the texts. They often provided the unconscious beliefs of the writers. What images included were as important as what images which were absent because from the e-textbooks because they revealed the writers' reasons behind the choice (Taylor, 2002). Banks (2007) stated that there were two main reasons for using visual images in research. First, visual images are easy to find and to access. The second reason for incorporating them is that "they might be able to reveal some insight that was not accessible by any other means" (p.4).

Qualitative content analysis methodology provided a theoretical basis for how this study was conducted. Qualitative approaches to content analysis have their roots in literary theory, the social sciences, and critical scholarship. They are characterized by close reading, rearticulating new narratives, and the researcher assigning new meanings or interpretations (Krippendorff, 2004). It differs from quantitative content analysis, which refers to a statistical technique for obtaining descriptive data on content variables. The main difference between them is that qualitative content analysis is interpretive in nature and allows multiple data entry points, while quantitative content analysis is statistical with one data entry point (Altheide, 1996).

The objective of qualitative content analysis is to verify hypothesized relationships and to discover new or emergent patterns (Altheide, 1996). Whereas the

purpose of quantitative content analysis is only to verify a hypothesis by providing precise, objective, and reliable observations about the frequency of content characteristics occurrences (George, 2009). A reflective process of data collection and analysis also characterizes qualitative content analysis. The researcher was central to all of these processes and the protocols were used only as guidelines. These processes were recursive and reflective allowing new categories and variables to emerge throughout the research. Therefore, the focus of data gathering involved collecting numerical and narrative data.

### **Research Design and Methods**

Research method refers to a set of investigative procedures employed in a study. There are three common research tools that are normally associated with qualitative study. They are interview, observation, and document analysis (Merriam, 2009). This study used document analysis as its main method. Document analysis includes different procedures for analyzing and interpreting data from the examination of documents and records. The term document refers to written texts and other forms such as visual images and films.

The documents that were analyzed in this study were the visual images found in the English e-textbooks designed for 10th, 11th, and 12th graders in Indonesia. The document analysis procedure included document selections, protocol development, data collection, data coding and organization, and data analysis. Corresponding to the research question, the visual images were analyzed to determine whether they represented religious, ethnic, gender, and socioeconomic diversity of the students.

### **Sample Selection**

Purposive sampling is used in this study. In purposive sampling strategy, "units were chosen not for representativeness but for their relevance to the research question, analytical framework, and explanation being developed in the research" (Schwandt, 2007, p. 269). The units of study were English e-textbooks for the 10th, 11th, and 12th graders in Indonesia.

The purpose of the study was to observe the representation of cultural aspects in teaching materials. Therefore, English e-textbooks were chosen because they provided rich cultural information about local as well as foreign cultures. It is important to study the representation of local cultures and the cultures from the English speaking countries in ELT materials to create balanced perspectives. International ELT materials published in the inner-circle countries often marginalized local cultures and denounced local varieties of English (Kachru, 1996; Kirkpatrick, 2011; Kramsch, 1998). Another reason for choosing English e-textbooks was also in relation to my expertise and field of study, which is English education.

Ideally, both written texts and visual images were analyzed to better understand the representativeness of ethnicity, gender, religion, and socioeconomic status of the e-textbooks. However, due to time constraints of the research only visual images from the e-textbooks were analyzed. Visual images from these e-textbooks provided more cultural information than the written texts. The written texts were used to provide additional information when needed to accurately interpret the visual images. In addition, visual images could either hinder or promote learning. When the visual images were relevant to the written texts, they could enhance comprehension. On the other hand, they could affect

students negatively when they were poorly designed (Donovan & Smolkin, 2002). Appropriate visual images could also deepen students' engagement with the texts, improve their comprehension, and facilitate language acquisition (Tomlinson, 1998).

English textbooks were chosen because the purpose of the study was to observe the representation of cultural aspects in ELT materials. English textbooks provided rich cultural information of local cultures and foreign cultures as well. Studying the representation of local cultures and foreign cultures, especially of the English speaking countries would create balanced perspectives. International materials published in the West often marginalized and denounced local cultures and local varieties of English (Kachru, 1996; Kirkpatrick, 1998; Kramersch, 2001). Another reason for choosing English textbooks was because of my field of expertise. I had been working and conducting research in English education in Indonesia for more than 14 years.

All the eight e-textbooks published for the high school level were analyzed. There were two e-textbooks for grade 10 and three e-textbooks for grades 11 and 12. The e-textbooks were:

- Interlanguage: English for Senior High School Students X written by Priyana, Renitasari, and Irjayanti (2008), retrievable from <http://bse.kemdiknas.go.id/index.php/buku/details/20080726125041>;
- Developing English Competencies for Senior High School (SMA/MA) Grade X written by Doddy, Sugeng and Effendi (2008), retrievable from <http://bse.kemdiknas.go.id/index.php/buku/details/20080723130751>;

- Interlanguage: English for Senior High School Students XI Science and Social Study Programme written by Priyana, Riandi, and Mumpuni (2008) retrievable from <http://bse.kemdiknas.go.id/index.php/buku/details/20080726125134>;
- Interlanguage: English for Senior High School Students XI Language Study Programme written by Priyana and Muhammad (2008), retrivable from <http://bse.kemdiknas.go.id/index.php/buku/details/20080726125332>;
- Developing English Competencies for Senior High School (SMA/MA) Grade XI of Language Programme written by Doddy, Sugeng, and Effendi (2008) retrievable from <http://bse.kemdiknas.go.id/index.php/buku/details/20080723130809>;
- Interlanguage: English for Senior High School Students XII Science and Social Study Programme written by Priyana, Saridewi, and Rahayu (2008) retrievable from <http://bse.kemdiknas.go.id/index.php/buku/details/20080723125547>;
- Interlanguage: English for Senior High School Students XII Language Study Programme written by Priyana, Muhammad, and Machfutra (2008) retrievable from <http://bse.kemdiknas.go.id/index.php/buku/details/20080723125852>;
- Developing English Competencies for Senior High School (SMA/MA) Grade XII of Natural and Social Science Programme written by Doddy, Sugeng, and Effendi (2008). Retrievable from <http://bse.kemdiknas.go.id/index.php/buku/details/20080723130341>.

### **Data Gathering and Instrumentation**

One of the characteristics of qualitative content analysis is that the researcher has the role as primary instrument for data collection and analysis (Altheide, 1996; Merriam, 2009). The advantage of the researcher as the primary instrument was that I was adaptive and responsive to the process of data collection and analysis. I could expand understanding of the data, process the data immediately, and check for interpretation accuracy. Apart from the advantages, having the researcher as the primary instrument also had weaknesses such as being biased in their selection and interpretation of the data. Therefore, there was a need for the researcher to identify and monitor the possible biases that might affect data collection and analysis. Multiple data coding was also conducted to maintain consistency and gain validity. Another attempt to gain validity was by employing two interraters.

Developing a protocol assisted the researcher in collecting the data (Altheide, 1996). It helped the researcher to focus on the research purpose without denying the possibility of emergence of new variables. A data collection form consisting of variables or categories guided the researcher to concentrate on the research questions posed.

A data collection form consisting of four variables ethnicity, gender, religion, and socioeconomic status were used as the second research instrument in this study. The data collection form was presented in table 3.1. Two categories, human and non-human, were assigned to each visual image. The human category was further divided into male and female. The binary category of male and female was used to correspond to the official category adopted by the Indonesian government although transgender individuals are found in popular media such as televisions and newspapers. The non-human category

included two sub categories, animal and object. Frequency of occurrence was assigned to each subcategory to enable the researcher to interpret the frequency data of the visual images. Descriptions were given when the visual images signify one or more among the four variables chosen. An undetermined category was assigned when the visual image did not belong to any category or there was not enough information to classify the visual image. One data collection form was used to record each visual image. A summary of the frequency of occurrences was given for each e-textbook. A summary of the description of each variable for each book was also made when all images were described.

To maintain consistency and to obtain validity multiple coding and interrater checks were employed. Two interraters with different gender, ethnic, religious, and socioeconomic backgrounds were employed to collect and analyze one out of the eight e-textbooks. The data from the interraters were compared with the rest of the data to obtain consistency and interrater reliability.

Table 1.

*Data Collection Form to Observe the Frequency of Occurrence*

	Frequency of Occurrence																	
	Ethnicity				Religion					SES			Gender					
	Mel	Aus	For	Un	Mu	P	C	H	B	Cf	Un	L	Mi	Hi	Un	M	F	
Human																		
Animal																		
Object																		
N																		
Mel :	Melanesian			Aus: Austronesian					For: Foreigner									
M:	Male			F: Female														
Mu:	Muslim			P: Protestant					C: Catholic									
H:	Hindu			B: Buddhist					Cf: Confucian									
L:	Low			Mi: Mid					Hi: High									
Un:	Undetermined																	

Table 2.

*Data Collection Form to Describe the Visual Images*

Pict.	Category	General descript- ion	Description					Source
			Ethnic -ity	Religion	Socio- economic Status	Gender	Posed/ Candid	
	human							
	Animal							
	Object							

**Data Collection Procedures**

Documents were the main source of data of the study. The documents for this study were the visual images in the English e-textbooks for 10th, 11th, and 12th graders.

The data was elicited using the following procedure:

1. The English e-textbooks for 10th, 11th, and 12th graders were downloaded in portable document format (pdf).

2. The illustrations were documented using the data collection forms.
  - a. Frequency of occurrence of the human and non-human visual images was counted.
  - b. Descriptions of the visual images were given based on the four cultural aspects: ethnicity, gender, religion, and socioeconomic status.

### **Data Analysis Procedures**

Documents are studied to understand how a society shares a common meaning to the objects and symbols in them. From a critical theory perspective, documents are also studied to understand how certain members of the society use documents to create and impose social reality on other groups. Document analysis is a study that attempts to locate, identify, retrieve, and analyze documents to understand their relevance, significance, and meaning (Altheide, 1996). The primary documents for this study were eight English e-textbooks intended for high schools in Indonesia. The emphasis of the analysis was on trying to unravel the authors' assumptions, motives, and intended consequences of the use of visual images in these e-textbooks. To provide careful and thorough descriptions and interpretations multiple coding was employed. Texts from which the visual images originated were used to ensure accurate interpretations. The writers of the e-textbooks provided sources for the illustrations. These sources were used to further verify the interpretations.

The first step in the analysis procedures was to interpret the frequency of occurrence of the variables. Frequency of occurrence played a significant role in document analysis when the variables were countable. It was assumed that when a certain variable had higher frequency of occurrence, it took up more time and space in the

discourse; therefore, it was more significant. The role of the researcher in this stage was assigning the value of significance to the visual images that represented the four variables namely, ethnicity, religion, gender, and socioeconomic status. The researcher determined which ethnic groups, religions, gender and socioeconomic class took up the most and the least space in the e-textbooks.

The second step in the data analysis procedure was interpretation of the visual images. Although frequency data showed the time and space taken up in the discourse it often failed to reveal the deeper reality of the occurring variables. It is possible for example that the frequency of occurrence of male and female visual images was equal. However, it did not necessarily mean that both were equally represented. Analyzing the description of the visual images revealed whether certain variables had been represented proportionately.

To observe whether gender issues had been addressed proportionately in the English e-textbook an analysis on the roles of male and female images were conducted. What roles were they depicting? Were they trivial or important? To observe the ethnic representation, human and non-human visual images were analyzed using two broad categories of Melanesians and Austronesians. More specific categories such as island of origin and ethnicity were assigned if possible. Physical traits and other symbols such as clothing, buildings, and cultural activities were used to provide information on ethnic representation. These symbols were also used to determine religion and socioeconomic representations.

To achieve validity and consistency of data interpretations multiple coding and an interrater check were conducted. First, a general a priori or content specific coding

was conducted (Schwandt, 2007). In the a priori coding, the categories used to classify the data were carefully developed from the research problems and the literature that supported the topic being studied. The second step was analytical coding (Merriam, 2009). In the analytical coding the visual images were not only classified and described, but the coding also came from interpretation and the reflection on meaning of the visual images from the e-textbooks. Another round of both the general and analytical coding was conducted to validate and maintain the consistency of the data coding.

Interrater checks were also conducted to achieve valid data interpretation. Two interraters were employed to make general and analytical coding of one e-textbook out of the eight e-textbooks studied (12.5%). To create a balanced interpretation both female and male inter-raters were chosen. The purpose of employing raters was to confirm my data interpretations as the researcher. Two raters with different backgrounds from each other and from the researcher were employed to see whether there was consistency in interpreting the data. The first rater was a Protestant male with Batak ethnic background. He came from a middle class family and held a master's degree in anthropology. The second rater was a Catholic female with Indonesian-Chinese ethnic background from an upper class family who held a master's degree in business administration.

Cohen's Kappa test was used to decide the agreement between two raters (Wilcox, 1996). I conducted Cohen's Kappa test to evaluate the agreement between my data coding with the first and second raters. The Cohen's Kappa value of my data coding compared to the first rater was .97 and .94 compared to the second rater. Both were above .81 so they were almost in perfect agreement.

I also tested the agreement between the two raters. In general both raters were in almost perfect agreement with average Cohen's kappa value of .90. There were four categories evaluated by the ratters namely, ethnicity, religion, gender, and SES. The agreements for the ethnicity, gender, and SES were in almost perfect agreement with kappa values of .99, .98, and .99 respectively. The kappa value for religion was .66 meaning that the raters were in substantial agreement. It might be a result from the fact that the first rater perceived all Western people in the e-textbooks as Protestants.

### **Methodological Limitations**

Cautions should be made when using documents as the primary data of a research study. Documents can have limitations such as being incomplete, trivial, or unauthentic (Merriam, 2009). These limitations normally exist when they are treated as secondary data providing support for the primary documents. In this study the documents analyzed were the visual images from English e-textbooks and therefore, they were authentic and complete.

The primary research instrument in this study was the researcher. The human instrument in a study had some limitations and biases. These biases and limitations needed to be identified and monitored so that they would not have negative impact in the data collection and analysis processes. I needed to be cautious in interpreting the four cultural aspects studied namely, religion, ethnicity, gender, and socioeconomic status representativeness. As a male Javanese Catholic from a family with mid to low socioeconomic status, I might be biased in dealing with these topics.

First, Indonesian society is a patriarchal society, as a man I am used to this social system where norms and normality are often seen and determined from a male point of

view. Therefore, I needed to monitor my biases of being a male researcher who grew up in a patriarchal society. Secondly, I am Javanese. Javanese is the most dominant ethnic group in terms of population and in terms of political representation. The previous presidents and the current one were all Javanese. Most government ministries and offices were and are headed by Javanese. In President Suharto's era, 1966 – 1998, during 32 years most governors, district and sub-district army and police chiefs were Javanese. Although the number of the population of Javanese is only 41.71% they had controlled the country for a long time. Therefore, over representation of Javanese people and under representation of other ethnic groups in popular media such as television, newspapers, and novels were often considered normal. I needed to monitor my ethnic biases because I came from the dominant ethnic group. Thirdly, I am Catholic. Catholics are a minority in numbers in Indonesia. Although a minority, Catholics played important roles in education and business. Some of the best schools and universities belonged to Catholic churches and foundations. Some of the wealthiest business people were Catholic. By law the state guarantees religious freedom and that there was no religious discrimination. But in reality the minority religious groups often suffered from discrimination and threats. Catholics and other Christian churches for example often became targets of terrorist bombing and other threats by radical religious groups. Finally, I might have biases on interpreting socioeconomic status. Although I now have a good job and consider myself middle class, I grew up poor when I was at school and university. My parents were struggling economically to send all of their six children to school. To monitor my biases as a male, Javanese, Catholic researcher I kept a research journal and recorded issues that came up during the process of data collection and analysis.

### **Ethical Considerations**

The data for this research was collected from documents. It did not involve any human subjects. However, careful considerations should be made in reporting and publishing the result of the research because of the sensitivity of ethnic and religious issues in Indonesia. Ethnic conflicts that claimed many lives still existed in certain parts of Indonesia. Conflicts between Muslims and Christians also had not been completely resolved.

## **CHAPTER 4**

### **DATA ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION**

Eight English e-textbooks used in high schools in Indonesia were examined to identify the representativeness of ethnicity, religion, socioeconomic status, and gender. These e-textbooks were published by the Indonesian Ministry of Education and distributed for free through the Internet. They were downloadable from <http://bse.kemdiknas.go.id/index.php/buku/bukusma>

This chapter is divided into four main sections. The first part provides general descriptions of the eight e-textbooks examined in this study. It discusses for whom are the e-textbooks were intended for and the detailed descriptions of each e-textbook. The second part presents the data gathered under the four categories of representativeness in the study namely, ethnicity, religion, socioeconomic status, and gender. Both qualitative data as well as percentage of occurrence of the cases are presented. The third section discusses the research findings. The fourth part is the summary of chapter four.

#### **General Description of the E-textbooks**

Of the eight English e-textbooks examined in this research, they were classified into three groups. Two English e-textbooks were in the first group. These English e-textbooks were intended for grade 10 in Indonesia. The second group included three

English e-textbooks for grade eleven. There were three English e-textbooks in the last group which were designated for grade twelve.

The first English e-textbook was entitled *Interlanguage: English for Senior High School Students X* written by Priyana, Renitasari, and Irjayanti. It was downloadable for free from e-textbook internet site developed by the Ministry of Education. It consisted of ten chapters. The overall number of images of human beings analyzed in this e-textbook was 303. The book also consisted of twenty-five images of animals and fifty-three images of objects.

The second e-textbook was also intended for grade 10 entitled *Developing English Competencies for Senior High School (SMA/MA) Grade X*. The e-textbooks consisted of six chapters with 210 images of humans, twenty-seven images of animals, and forty-six images of objects. It was written by Doddy, Sugeng, and Effendi.

The third e-textbook was *Interlanguage: English for Senior High School Students XI Science and Social Study Programme* written by Priyana, Riandi, and Mumpuni. There were 10 chapters in this e-textbook. It had 162 images of human beings, four images of animals, and sixty-nine images of objects.

The fourth e-textbook, *Interlanguage: English for Senior High School Students XI Language Study Programme* by Priyana, Machfutra, and Muhammad had fourteen chapters. It contained 345 of human images, five images of animals, and ninety-two images of objects. The fifth was *Developing English Competencies for Senior High School (SMA/MA) Grade XI of Language Programme* written by Doddy, Sugeng, and Effendi. It consisted of 10 chapters with eighty-seven images of human beings, thirty-

four images of animals, and thirty two images of objects. Three e-textbooks were in the second group that were intended for grade 11.

The sixth e-textbook was intended for grade 12. It had 8 chapters with 217 images of human, 40 images of animals, and 97 images of objects. The seventh e-textbook was also designated for 12 grade students consisted of thirteen chapters. It had 338 images of human beings, thirteen images of animals, and seventy-seven images of objects. The last e-textbooks had five chapters. There were 119 images of human beings, twenty-two images of animals, and forty three images of objects.

The images from the eight e-textbooks described above were then classified and examined whether they represented the four broad categories in this research namely, ethnicity, religion, socioeconomic status, and gender. The following sections present the data and the analyses.

## **Results**

Four research questions were proposed as the basis of the research. Visual images from eight English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia were examined and categorized to determine their relevance to the research questions. Four cultural aspects namely, ethnicity, religion, gender and socioeconomic status were examined to answer the questions. This section presents the analyses in four parts based on the cultural aspects aforementioned. Table 3 presented the summary of the visual images of all human beings found in the e-textbooks. They represented ethnicity, religions, gender, and SES. There were 1782 human images in all e-textbooks studied. There were 1651 images represented ethnicity, fifty represented religion, 1776 represented gender, and 1584 represented SES. Twenty nine percent images were in the undetermined category because

they did not contain any specific graphical information that could be used to classify them under any of the designated categories.

### **Visual Images Representing Ethnicity**

The first research question was: To what extent is ethnic diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?

Ethnicity is defined as a distinctive social group in a large society who set themselves apart or who is set apart by others due to distinctive cultural patterns, beliefs, histories, values, attitudes, languages, national origins, and physical traits (Sheets, 2005). Indonesia has more than 1,000 ethnic groups. The size of most ethnic groups is small, and only 13 groups have more than 1 million people (Suryadinata, et al., 2005). It was impossible to assign a category by using all the existing ethnic groups in Indonesia. Therefore, two general categories were used to represent ethnicity. The first category is Melanesian, which represents the population living in the eastern part of Indonesia. Melanesian people had specific physical traits that differ significantly from the Austronesian people who inhabit the western part of Indonesia. Melanesian people have darker skin, curly hair, and round eyes. Austronesian people have fair skin, straight hair, and oval eyes. Another category used was foreigner, which included all non-Indonesian populations. This included all foreigners' images found in the e-textbooks. The last category was uncategorized to classify people who were not identified due to unclear physical traits or unclear images. Images of human, animals, and objects were examined and grouped into the four categories mentioned earlier.

Table 3

*Human Images Representing Ethnicity, Religion, SES, and Gender*

	e- text- book	1	%	2	%	3	%	4	%	5	%	6	%	7	%	8	%	Total
Ethnicity	Mel	1	0.3	0		0		1	0.28	4	4.59	1	0.46	1	0.29	0		8
	Aus	16	54.4	202	96.19	70	43.20	194	56.06	28	32.18	82	37.79	139	41.12	28	23.5	908
	For	11	39.9	6	2.85	83	51.23	124	35.83	54	62.06	103	47.46	162	47.93	91	76.4	735
	Un	25	8.2	2	0.95	9	5.55	27	7.80	1	1.14	31	14.28	36	10.65	0		131
Religion	Mu	21	6.9	5	2.38	1	0.61	6	1.73	0		7	3.23	9	2.66	0		49
	P	0		0		0		0		0		0		0		0		0
	C	0		0		0		0		0		0		0		1	0.84	1
	H	0		0		0		0		0		0		0		0		0
	B	0		0		0		0		0		0		0		0		0
	Cf	0		0		0		0		0		0		0		0		0
	Un	28	93.1	205	97.61	161	99.38	340	98.26	87	100	210	96.77	329	97.34	118	99.1	1732
SES	L	44	14.5	14	6.66	16	9.87	12	3.46	3	3.45	3	1.38	40	11.83	0		132
	Mi	94	31	161	76.66	68	41.97	170	49.13	18	20.69	111	51.15	143	42.31	102	85.7	867
	Hi	14	47.2	31	14.76	62	38.27	129	37.28	51	58.62	47	21.66	105	31.06	17	14.2	585
	Un	22	7.3	4	1.90	16	9.87	35	10.11	15	17.24	56	25.81	50	14.79	0		198
Gender	F	13	45.54	28	13.33	67	41.35	128	36.99	28	32.18	86	39.63	133	39.35	55	46.2	663
	M	16	54.45	181	86.19	95	58.64	218	63.00	59	67.82	131	60.37	205	60.65	59	49.5	1113
	Un	0		1	0.47	0		0		0		0		0		5	4.20	6
Total		30		210		162		346		87		217		338		119		1782

**Human images representing ethnicity.** The first broad ethnic grouping used as a category in this study was Melanesian, representing all ethnic groups living in the eastern part of Indonesia such as Papuan, Moluccan, Flores and other ethnic groups. Out of eight e-textbooks examined, five e-textbooks included human images that represented Melanesian people. Detailed description of the frequency of occurrence of the images of human was presented in table 3. E-textbooks number two for grade ten, number three for grade eleven, and number eight for grade twelve did not include images of Melanesian people at all in their illustrations. The other five e-textbooks included a very small number of Melanesian people.

- One image of a Melanesian person was found on page fifty eight of e-textbook one for eleventh graders. It depicted a man with curly hair and round eyes. It was a drawn illustration. The man was depicted as wearing a tie and vest and having a conversation with another man. E-textbook four for grade eleven also had one image of a Melanesian person on page 172. It depicted a man with curly hair and round eyes. He was depicted as wearing a traditional costume posing with other people in different traditional costumes.
- E-textbook five, designated for grade eleven had four images of Melanesian people. The first picture frame depicted a girl reading. She has curly hair, dark skin, and round eyes. The second image showed the same girl from the first picture reading poetry. The third and fourth frames showed exactly the same pictures as picture one.

- E-textbooks number six and seven, which was designated for grade twelve, each had one image of a Melanesian person as their illustrations. The person in e-textbook number six depicted a man with round eyes and curly hair wearing a t-shirt. The man was showing a gesture that meant crazy or insane. It was shown on page 73. The same image was used in e-textbook seven to give an illustration of a short text on page 74.

In general, Melanesian people were underrepresented in each e-textbook and in the overall English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia. They were both underrepresented in terms of numbers and roles. Table 3 showed that there were only eight images of Melanesian people compared to 1,782 total number of human images found in the e-textbooks studied. In terms of roles, the Melanesian people were depicted as a business person, a common man, and a student.

The second broad ethnic grouping was Austronesian. It was used to categorize all ethnic groups inhabiting the western part of Indonesia such as Batak, Dayak, Javanese, Sundanese, Balinese and other ethnic groups. All English e-textbooks examined depicted Austronesian human images in the forms of candid and posed photographs and drawings. Table 3 showed that there were 908 images of Austronesian people out of 1,782 human images found in all English e-textbooks studied. E-textbook two for grade ten had the highest number of Austronesian people with 202 images. E-textbooks eight for grade twelve had the smallest number of images of the Austronesian people with twenty-eight people in its illustrations.

The Austronesian people were not only more represented in terms of number. They were also more represented in terms of roles. Austronesian people were depicted as having important roles in the society such as politicians, government officials, teachers, policemen, and business people. They were also depicted as people with high incomes such as singers and movie stars. Both candid and posed photographs were found representing Austronesian people. Posed photographs of Melanesian people were not found in the English e-textbooks studied.

The third category in ethnic representation by human images was foreigner. It included all non-Indonesian people. Further classifications were not made because the focus of the study was examining the representation of Indonesian ethnic groups in the English e-textbooks. Asian, American, European, Australian, and African people were grouped into one category. For further study it would be interesting to further classify foreign people into a more detailed category. Additional information to the images such as the captions, the sources of pictures, and the texts were used to determine whether the images were Indonesian or foreigners.

All e-textbooks represented foreigners in their illustrations. The percentage of images of foreigners in all e-textbooks was relatively high, 41.2 percent on average. E-textbook eight for grade twelve had the highest percentage of foreigner images, 76.5 percent. Four e-textbooks had more than one hundred images in their illustrations. Most foreigners depicted in the e-textbooks were famous people such as, movie stars, singers, and sports figures. Most of them were either Americans or Europeans. Few foreigners were people from other Asian countries such as Korea or Japan.

Table 4

*Human Images That Represent Ethnicity*

	E-textbook								Total
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Mel	1 0.3%	0	0	1 0.3%	4 4.6%	1 0.5%	1 0.3%	0	8 0.4%
Aus	165 54.4%	202 96.2%	70 43.2%	194 56.1%	28 32.2%	82 37.8%	139 41.1%	28 23.5%	908 50.9%
For	112 39.9%	6 2.8%	83 51.2%	124 35.8%	54 62.1%	103 47.5%	162 47.9%	91 76.5%	735 41.2%
Un	25 8.2%	2 0.9%	9 5.5%	27 7.8%	1 1.1%	31 14.3%	36 10.6%	0	131 7.3%
									1782

Mel: Melanesian

Aus: Austronesian

For: Foreigner

Un: Undetermined

The undetermined category was used to group human images, which were hard if not impossible to be classified into one of the previous categories. This was due to either an unclear picture or the fact that the image did not have any specific features that enabled classification. The example of undetermined human image was a drawing of a man with curly hair but with oval eyes found in e-textbooks one page 58. It was hard to determine whether the person was Melanesian, or Austronesian because he had the physical traits of both ethnic groups and the drawing was black and white so it was impossible to determine the skin color. There were 131 images of human beings that were in the undetermined category in all e-textbooks studied.

**Animal and object images representing ethnicity.** Most animal images in the e-textbooks did not contain any information related to ethnicity. Table 4 showed the number of animals that represented ethnicity used as illustration in the e-textbooks. Animals that represented the Melanesian group were only found in e-textbook five designated for grade eleven. It depicted birds of paradise. They were classified into Melanesian category because bird of paradise was a species of bird that was only found in Papua, the eastern most of Indonesian archipelago.

Two e-textbooks included animals that belonged to the Austronesian category. One animal was found in e-textbook two for grade ten. It depicted an elephant. It was included into the Austronesian category because it is only found in the western part of Indonesia. E-textbook five had five animals that were categorized as representing Austronesian ethnic groups. It depicted Sumatran tigers and elephants. They were included into this category because they can only be found in the western part of Indonesia. Tigers and elephants are not found in the eastern part of Indonesia in modern times.

Foreign animals were found in four e-textbooks. These animals were included in the category because they were not originally from Indonesia. E-textbook two for grade ten depicted a giraffe and zebra. They are not native Indonesian animals. E-textbook four for grade eleven had two images of lions. Lions are not found in Indonesia either. E-textbook five for grade eleven depicted two types of foreign animals. They included kangaroos and camels. E-textbook six that was for grade twelve contained four images of

foreign animals including lions and Siamese cats. The total number of foreign animals was twenty one, bigger than the number of local animals.

Table 5

*Animal Images that Represent Ethnicity*

	E-textbook								Total
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Mel	0	0	0	0	2	0	0	0	2
					5.9%				1.2%
Aus	0	1	0	0	5	0	0	0	6
		3.7%			14.7%				3.5%
For	0	2	0	2	13	4	0	0	21
		7.4%		40%	38.2%	10%			12.3%
Un	25	24	4	3	14	36	13	22	141
	100%	88.9%	100%	60%	41.2%	90%	100%	100%	82.9%
									170

Mel: Melanesian

Aus: Austronesian

For: Foreigner

Un: Undetermined

Table 5 showed that foreign objects were similar to the animal images that the total number of the images was bigger than the number of objects representing Melanesian and Austronesian groups combined.

There was only one object that represented the Melanesian ethnic group found in e-textbook four for grade eleven. It depicted a photograph of a beach in Ambon. It was categorized to belong to the Melanesian group because the location of the beach is in Ambon, Moluccas islands. Therefore, it represented eastern part of Indonesia.

The Austronesian group was represented by different images of objects throughout all e-textbooks examined. In e-textbook one for example, there were images of culinary dishes from western Indonesian areas such as *nasi lemak*, steam rice with

beef, from Sumatra and *gudeg*, jack fruit cooked in coconut milk, from Yogyakarta. They were classified into the Austronesian category because these dishes were originally from Sumatra and Yogyakarta. The e-textbook with the highest number of images from this category were e-textbooks six and seven for grade twelve. They both contained nine images each. They included images such as DVD movies and books. They were classified as belonging to the Austronesian group because the settings of the stories were in western cities of Indonesia. The writers, producers, actress and actors were Austronesian people.

All English e-textbooks studied contained images of foreign objects. This category was used to group all objects that were not originally from Indonesia. These objects were found relatively higher in number compared to the first two categories. Table 5 showed that all e-textbooks had more than 15 images of foreign objects. E-textbook one for grade ten had the least number of foreign objects and e-textbook four for grade eleven had the most number of images, forty-eight. They included photographs of places such as, Sidney Harbor Bridge, White House, and Yokohama city in Japan.

Almost half of the images did not have any specific features about the designated ethnic grouping and therefore were hard to classify. These objects were included in the undetermined category. The objects in this category included images such as a global warming poster, a photograph of a tree, and a picture of some pills. They were also general objects that were found in all cultures.

Table 6

*Object Images that Represent Ethnicity*

	E-textbook								Total
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Mel	0	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	1
				1.09%					0.20%
Aus	2	5	1	5	5	9	9	2	38
	3.8%	10.9%	1.45%	5.4%	15.6%	9.3%	11.5%	4.65%	7.5%
For	15	25	38	48	17	31	46	17	237
	28.3%	54.3%	55.1%	52.8%	53.1%	31.2%	58.2%	39.53%	46.6%
Un	36	16	30	38	10	57	22	24	234
	67.9%	34.8%	43.5%	41.3%	31.2%	58.8%	29.5%	55.81%	45.2%
									510

Mel: Melanesian

Aus: Austronesian

For: Foreigner

Un: Undetermined

**Visual Images Representing Religions**

The second research question was: To what extent is religious diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?

This was concerned with to what extent the visual images in the English e-textbooks used in Indonesia fairly represented all religions acknowledged by the government. To answer the research problem all visual images in the e-textbooks were examined. Images of human beings, animals, and objects were categorized and analyzed as to whether they represented or symbolized any of the six religions acknowledged by Indonesian government namely, Islam, Catholicism, Protestant, Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism.

**Human images representing religions.** Only Islam and Catholicism were represented in some of the e-textbooks examined. Six e-textbooks contained human images whose dresses symbolized the Muslim religion. One e-textbook had human images that represented Catholicism.

Table 6 summarized the frequency of human images that represented the six official religions in Indonesia. There were twenty-one images of people who represented Muslims in e-textbook one for grade ten. All of them were women and were categorized into the Muslim category because they were wearing the hijab. Muslim men were not represented in e-textbook one. E-textbooks two, three, four, and seven also depicted Muslim women. They were identified as Muslim because of the dresses they wore. There was only one Muslim man depicted in the English e-textbooks studied. The image of a Muslim man was found in e-textbook four. He was categorized into the Muslim group because he was depicted as wearing a white Muslim cap.

The only human image that represented Catholicism was found in e-textbook eight. A woman was depicted among the crowd of people in a rally opposing abortion. She was classified as representing Catholicism because she was holding a rosary. Other people in the crowd were not classified as representing Catholicism because there were no symbols on them that related them directly as being Catholics. Table 6 showed that the number of human images representing religions was relatively small, only fifty images, compared to 1782 human images in all e-textbooks examined.

Table 7

*Human Images that Represent Religion*

	E-textbook								TOTAL
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Mu	21	5	1	6	0	7	9	0	49
	6.9%	2.4%	0.6%	1.7%		3.2%	2.7%		2.7%
P	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
C	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
								0.84%	0.05%
H	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
B	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Cf	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Un	282	205	161	340	87	210	329	118	1732
	93.1%	97.6%	99.4%	98.3%	100%	96.7%	97.3%	99.2%	97.2%
									1782

Mu: Muslim

P: Protestantism

C: Catholicism

H: Hinduism

B: Buddhism

Cf: Confucianism

Un: Undetermined

**Animal and object images representing religions.** There were no animal images in the English e-textbooks examined that represented or symbolized the six official religions in Indonesia. However, it was interesting to note the presence of dogs and pigs, which are often considered to be animals to avoid due to religious reasons in Islam. Camels were found in e-textbook five for grade eleven. They were originally from the Middle East and are often associated with Saudi Arabia where Islam was founded. However, they are not related to Islam as a religion.

Table 7 showed that the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia represented four religions Protestantism, Catholicism, Hinduism, and Buddhism by

images of objects in their illustrations. Eight images of objects represented both Protestantism and Catholicism. I classified them as to belong to both religions because they were found in both religions. They were images of burial coffins and Easter eggs. I found two images of coffins in e-textbook one for grade ten. I categorized them as representing Protestantism and Catholicism because only Christians use coffins for purposes of burial. Muslims are wrapped with white cloths when they are buried. Buddhists and Hindus are normally cremated in Indonesia. I found three images of painted eggs for Easter in e-textbook three for grade eleven. I considered them to represent both Protestantism and Catholicism because they were found in the traditions of these religions. E-textbook four for eleven graders also had three images of Easter eggs.

The writer used one image of a goddess statue as an illustration in e-textbook one. I considered it as representing Hinduism because such images were often found in Hindu temples in Indonesia. E-textbook two for tenth graders represented Buddhism by showing one image in its illustration. It depicted Borobudur, the largest Buddhist temple in the world. It represented Buddhism, although it was used as an example of a tourist destination in the e-textbook, the temple was still used as a place of worship by Buddhists.

Table 7 showed that most objects were put into undetermined category due to the fact that they did not depict any features that symbolized the six official religions acknowledged by Indonesian government.

Table 8

*Object Images that Represent Religion*

	E-textbook								Total
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
Mu	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
P	2	0	3	3	0	0	0	0	8
	3.8%		4.3%	3.3%					1.6%
C	2	0	3	3	0	0	0	0	8
	3.8%		4.3%	3.3%					1.6%
H	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
	1.9%								0.2%
B	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
		2.2%							0.2%
Cf	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Un	50	45	66	89	32	97	77	43	499
	94.3%	97.8%	95.6%	96.7%	100%	100%	100%	100%	98%
									509

Mu: Muslim

P: Protestantism

C: Catholicism

H: Hinduism

B: Buddhism

Cf: Confucianism

Un: Undetermined

**Visual Images Representing Gender**

The third research question was: To what extent is gender role diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?

It concerned with whether the English e-textbooks designated for high school in Indonesia represented gender equally in their illustrations. The representativeness of gender was examined by comparing the roles and number of male and female characters in the visual images used as illustrations in the e-textbooks. Three categories namely,

female, male, and undetermined were used to classify the visual images examined. Three types of visual images namely; images of people, animals, and objects were examined to determine gender representations. The data showed that the visual images of both animals and objects did not contain information of gender. Therefore, the representation of gender was observed mainly through the images of people found in the English e-textbooks.

**Human images representing gender.** Binary distinction of female and male were used although in reality transgendered people are found in Indonesian society. This binary distinction was adopted in this study to conform to the official gender division used by the Indonesian government. Undetermined category was assigned when there was no sufficient graphical information to determine the gender of the visual images.

Gender roles comparison between females and males was examined to determine the fairness of the representations. Gender role was defined as a set of social and behavioral norms that were generally considered appropriate for either a man or a woman in the society (Ryan, 2010; Sheets, 2005). The English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia represented both females and males as having different roles and social status. However, they also depicted the existing presumptions about males and females. These presumptions were often in the form of gender role stereotypes.

The images that depicted female stereotypes in traditional gender roles were the pictures of women cooking and serving food. There were four frames of pictures of women cooking in e-textbook one for grade ten and one other same picture in e-textbook three for grade eleven. E-textbooks one, three, and four also depicted similar pictures,

where women were serving food in family gatherings. These images reinforced the gender role stereotypes that women were nurturing and the caregiver of the family.

Other images that showed male and female role stereotypes were the pictures that showed emotions. Sadness and compassion were mainly shown by females in the English e-textbooks examined. There were five images of teenage girls with sad faces or crying in e-textbooks one, three, four, six, and seven. The girls in e-textbooks three and four were depicted as crying and were accompanied by boys. The boys were depicted as holding their emotions in control while the girls were crying. The sad girls in e-textbooks one, six, and seven were accompanied by adult females who were shown as comforting them and thus reinforcing the stereotypes that women were compassionate and sympathetic.

The male role stereotypes were depicted by men as being assertive and having power or control. These were shown in e-textbook four where a father was shown as getting angry to a daughter. The father was shown as holding a roll of newspaper that might give an impression that he was about to hit his daughter. This picture was a posed photograph, which might be done on purpose. This particular picture was used twice in the e-textbook. Another stereotype of males being assertive was shown with a picture of a male employer getting angry to his employee.

Three of the images in the English e-textbooks showed nontraditional gender roles. In e-textbook one for grade ten a man was shown holding a small child. This might be against the traditional stereotypes for males. Another nontraditional role image was found in e-textbook eight where a man was shown watering flowers. This picture was

used twice in this e-textbook. Nontraditional gender role image of females such as fixing a house or a car, or working with heavy machinery was not found in the e-textbook series.

Most occupations in the e-textbooks were represented by males and females. In terms of number, some professions such as, reporters, television announcers, singers, and movie stars were almost equally represented. Some other professions such as teacher and police officer were also represented by both males and females. However, male police officers outnumbered female police officers in the overall e-textbooks studied. Female teachers were shown teaching smaller children such as kindergarten as shown in e-textbooks three, four, five, and eight. Male teachers were shown teaching high schools in the e-textbooks.

Some professions were only represented by men. All doctors, politicians, and soldiers in the e-textbooks were men. They were depicted in e-textbooks two, five, and seven.

In terms of number, the images of men were more dominant than the images of women as shown in table 8. All the English e-textbooks examined had depicted more male characters in their illustrations. E-textbooks one for grade ten; three for grade eleven; and eight for grade twelve had slightly higher number of male images. E-textbook one had 54.4 percent male and 45.5 percent female images. E-textbook three depicted 58.6 percent of men and 41.3 percent of women images. Similarly, e-textbook eight had 49.6 percent images of men and 46.2 percent images of women. The other e-textbooks had bigger differences in number between male and female images shown as their

illustrations. Table 8 showed that males images were more dominant shown by significantly higher number of images in the illustrations of the e-textbooks. There were 1113 male images or 62.4 percent compared to 663 women images of 37.2 percent from the overall number of 1782 human images.

Table 9

*Human Images that Represent Gender*

	E-textbook								Total
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
F	138	28	67	128	28	86	133	55	663
	45.5%	13.3%	41.3%	37%	32.2%	39.6%	39.3%	46.2%	37.2%
M	165	181	95	218	59	131	205	59	1113
	54.4%	86.2%	58.6%	63%	67.8%	60.4%	60.6%	49.6%	62.4%
Un	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	5	6
		0.5%						4.2%	0.3%
									1782

F: Female

M: Male

Un: Undetermined

### **Visual Images Representing Socioeconomic Status**

The fourth research question was: To what extent is socioeconomic diversity represented in the visual images of the English e-textbooks for 10<sup>th</sup>, 11<sup>th</sup>, and 12<sup>th</sup> grade in Indonesia?

This research question was formulated to study how the visual images in the English e-textbooks used in Indonesia represented the socioeconomic status. The images were classified into three namely images of human, animal, and objects. Each image group was examined whether they represented low, mid, or high socioeconomic status.

Undetermined category was used to classify human, animal, and object images that were not identifiable in terms of their socioeconomic status.

**Human images representing socioeconomic status.** Almost all English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia depicted people from low socioeconomic status (SES). Seven out of eight e-textbooks examined included images of people from low economic status. E-textbook eight for twelve graders did not depict people from low SES. The number of images showing people from low SES was relatively small compared to other categories. The images of people from low SES were depicted as having different occupations with low incomes such as farmers, garbage pickers, and beggars.

Most of human images found in the English e-textbooks were representing middle class family. All e-textbooks examined included images of people from mid SES in their illustration. The decisions to include them in certain SES groups were based on the supporting images in the frames such as, clothing, houses, vehicles, or other objects that denoted whether the people were of low, middle, or high SES.

The images of people that represented the mid socioeconomic group depicted different roles and occupations. The example of roles of the people in the pictures included a housewife cooking in a kitchen, a girl learning to play guitar, a person watching television, and other activities involving equipment found in middle class families. Beside the roles they played and the activities they did, occupations also provided information that was useful to classify them into the middle SES category. Occupations such as police officers and teachers shown in the e-textbooks were classified into the middle SES category because of the standard salaries. The picture of a police

officer on page 30 of e-textbook number five was an example of a middle SES occupation because the possible earnings of a police officer on average were high enough to pass the poverty line but not too high to afford a luxurious life style.

Objects that accompany the persons in the pictures were also used to determine the socioeconomic category. The picture of two girls found on page forty of e-textbook number two for example was included in the middle SES category because the girls in the picture were shown as reading a newspaper and sitting on a sofa. Newspaper subscriptions and sofas are quite expensive and only middle class families would be able to afford them.

People from high SES groups were represented in all English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia. Table 9 showed that the total number of images of people that represented the high SES group was 585 out of 1782. It was lower than the number of people images that represented the middle SES group but was much higher than the number of images that represented the low SES group.

The images of human beings were categorized into high SES group because of their occupations and possible incomes as well as the objects that accompany them. Most of the images were the pictures of popular figures with higher incomes such as, movie stars, singers, and sport persons. They were Indonesian as well as international popular figures. A picture of a television presenter and comedian who was well-known in Indonesia found in e-textbook five for grade eleven was included in the category of high SES because of his possible income. Another example of high SES was a picture of a family having a meal. It depicted the members of the family in the dining room ready to

eat. It was included in the high SES category because of the expensive objects such as the silverware, the dining table, and the food served.

The rest of the images that did not have any graphic information that enabled classification into low, mid, or high SES were included into the undetermined category.

Table 10

*Human Images that Represent SES*

	E-textbook								Total
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
L	44	14	16	12	3	3	40	0	132
	14.5%	6.7%	9.9%	3.5%	3.4%	1.4%	11.8%		7.4%
Mi	94	161	68	170	18	111	143	102	867
	31%	76.7%	42%	49.1%	20.7%	51.1%	42.3%	85.7%	48.6%
Hi	143	31	62	129	51	47	105	17	585
	47.2%	14.8%	38.3%	37.3%	58.6%	21.7%	31.1%	14.3%	32.8%
Un	22	4	16	35	15	56	50	0	198
	7.3%	1.9%	9.9%	10.1%	17.2%	25.8%	14.8%		11.1%
									1782

L: low

Mi: Middle

Hi: High

Un: Undetermined

**Animal and object images representing SES.** All English e-textbooks studied depicting animals in their illustrations. Table 10 showed that most of the animals were in the undetermined category because they did not have enough graphic information that could be used to classify them into the low, middle, or high SES group. There was only one English e-textbook depicting animal image that could be classified into middle and high SES. E-textbook one for grade ten had images of gold fish and hamsters. They were classified into the middle SES category because they are inexpensive pets. Poor families

with lower income do not normally have pets in their homes. It also contained images of pure bred dogs and cats. They were categorized into the high SES group because only families with high income could afford buying and keeping these animals.

Table 11

*Animal Images that Represent SES*

	E-textbook								Total
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
L	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Mi	2	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	2
	8%								1.2%
Hi	19	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	19
	76%								11.2%
Un	4	27	4	5	34	40	13	22	149
	16%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	87.6%
									170

L: low

Mi: Middle

Hi: High

Un: Undetermined

The images of objects in the e-textbooks were also divided into four categories namely, low, mid, and high SES and undetermined. Only two e-textbooks represented objects from low SES group. E-textbook three for grade eleven depicted a small farm land with poor farmer in shabby clothes in its illustration. Farmers with small land were often associated with rural poverty in Indonesia. Another object representing low SES was found in e-textbook five for grade eleven. It showed garbage bags in the dumping area. It was included in the low SES group due to the fact that dumping areas were associated with poor and homeless people who worked as garbage pickers in these areas.

Table 11 showed that most images of objects from the English e-textbooks were in the mid and high SES category. There were 186 and 193 images of objects in the mid and high SES categories respectively. All e-textbooks contained images of objects from the mid and high SES group. Images such as, ordinary shoes, newspapers, and motorcycles were classified as representing mid SES group because they were objects that were most commonly found in ordinary household. Images such as, imported books, fancy dining table and luxurious houses for examples were categorized into high SES group because they showed that only people with higher incomes could afford such luxury.

The rest of the images of objects were classified into undetermined category because they did not have specific features that can be used to classify them into the first three previous categories. Images such as trees, forests, and mountains were the examples of undetermined pictures.

Table 12

*Object Images that Represent SES*

	E-textbook								Total
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	
L	0	0	1	0	1	0	0	0	2
			1.4%		3.1%				0.4%
Mi	32	13	19	39	8	42	25	8	186
	60.4%	28.3%	27.5%	42.4%	25%	43.3%	32%	18.6%	36.5%
Hi	17	16	30	34	19	28	31	18	193
	32.1%	34.8%	43.5%	37%	59.4%	28.9%	39.7%	41.9%	37.9%
Un	4	17	19	19	4	27	21	17	128
	7.5%	37%	27.5%	20.6%	12.5%	27.8%	26.9%	39.5%	25.1%
									509

L: low  
Hi: High

Mi: Middle  
Un: Undetermined

## **Discussion**

Representation of cultural aspects such as ethnicity, religion, gender, and socioeconomic status in English teaching materials were the major concerns in this study. From the analyses of the, I found that the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia had biases in representing the four aspects aforementioned. Overall I found that although the e-textbooks had biases but they had adopted the paradigm of English as an International Language (EIL). This section discusses the cultural representations found in the visual images in the e-textbooks. It also presents how the e-textbooks adopted the EIL paradigm and thereby empowering local material writers and publishers (Kachru, 1996; Kirkpatrick, 2011).

### **Cultural Representation in the English E-textbook**

Research showed that students would have more motivation when the learning materials were inclusive (Campbell, 2010; Ladson-Billing, 2009b; Tomlinson & Lynch-Brown, 2010). They would be more engaged in learning when the learning materials included their cultures. When students of diverse cultural groups could not find themselves and their cultures were ignored they felt alienation from school. To promote learning, materials should be culturally relevant and inclusive, accommodating the many cultural differences of the students. Culturally relevant teaching materials should include students' culture (Ladson-Billing, 2009a). Learning materials should adequately represent any cultural groups. The teaching of culture of English language and the local context should be represented to create balance in the curriculum.

The next section discussed how the eight e-textbooks examined take cultural aspects such as, ethnicity, religion, gender, and socioeconomic status into considerations.

**Ethnic diversity.** In this study an ethnic group was defined as a distinctive social group in a large society who set themselves apart or who was set apart by others due to distinctive cultural patterns, beliefs, histories, values, attitudes, languages, national origins, and physical traits (Sheets, 2005). Indonesia is a multi-ethnic society, with more than 1,000 ethnic groups. The size of most ethnic groups was small, and only 13 groups had more than 1 million each (Suryadinata, et al., 2005). These ethnic groups were divided into two big ethnic groups in this study. These two broad grouping was resulted from the ancient migrations namely, Melanesians and Austronesians. Melanesian people inhabited the eastern part of the country and the Austronesians inhabited the western part of Indonesia. All foreigners were categorized as one group. Visual images of people, animals, and objects, which contained specific graphical information about the ethnic groups were used to determine the ethnic representation.

The English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia had adopted English as an international language (EIL) model shown by the inclusion of local cultures in their contents. They included local contexts shown in the texts and the visual images used as illustrations. The illustrations depicted images of people, animals, and objects that represented the two broad ethnic categories, Melanesian and Austronesian. The illustrations also depicted foreign people, animals, and objects as the representation of foreign cultures.

Although Melanesian, Austronesian, and foreign cultures were all represented by the visual images in the English e-textbook, the representation was not balanced. Melanesian cultures were under represented in all English e-textbooks examined. All Melanesian images of human, animals, and objects were much lower in numbers compared to the Austronesian and foreign ones. There were 908 images of people or 50.98 percent representing the Austronesian ethnic groups and there were only eight images of people or 0.44 percent representing the Melanesian ethnic groups in all English e-textbooks examined as shown in table 4.1. Because of significantly less represented in numbers the Melanesian ethnic groups were also way underrepresented in roles. The roles of Melanesian people depicted in the English e-textbooks were very limited. The important roles were depicted through the images of the Austronesian people.

The e-textbooks were published by the Ministry of Education and intended for all high school students in Indonesia. It meant that the publication was funded by the tax payers throughout the country. The fact that Melanesian people were not proportionately represented in the e-textbooks marginalizes Eastern Indonesia students from the instructional materials. The students with Melanesian ethnic background may feel disfranchised and as previous studies have shown, this can result in low motivation and lower achievement when there are cultural gaps between home and school (Campbell, 2010; Ladson-Billing, 2009a).

The English e-textbooks series also represented foreign cultures in their illustrations. The illustrations depicted foreign people, animals, and objects. People from the United States of America and United Kingdom were found more in numbers

compared to other groups of foreigners. Although the focus of the study was Indonesian ethnic groups, it was interesting to note this phenomenon. It reflected the English as a foreign language model in teaching where the goal of English learning is to communicate with the native speakers of English. Including more Asian culture through the use of visual images would be more realistic for the students because they would most probably use English to communicate with people from the neighboring Asian countries (Kirkpatrick, 2011). Balanced representation of the culture from English speaking countries and from other Asian countries offers students the opportunity to understand English as an international language.

**Religious diversity.** Indonesia officially acknowledged six religions in its constitution. Religious diversity was a common phenomenon in everyday lives and at schools. There were public school holidays for each religion in the national curriculum calendar. Including religious topics in learning materials was viewed as showing reality of everyday lives and making the materials contextual.

The English e-textbooks examined included topics related to some religions. The visual images used as illustrations also depicted people and objects representing certain religions. Some visual images were used to provide illustration for texts related to topics about certain religions. Some other images were used as illustrations for texts, which were not about religions. However, not all six religions acknowledged by Indonesian government were represented.

Throughout the eight English e-textbooks examined only Islam and Christianity were represented by human images. There was no animal image that represented

religions. Images of objects found in the English e-textbooks series only represented Christianity, Hinduism, and Buddhism. Confucianism was not represented by either human or object images.

Most images that represented religions were not used to illustrate texts about religions. They were used to illustrate texts on unrelated topics. The image of Borobudur temple in e-textbook one, which represented Buddhism for example, was used to provide illustration for a text on tourism. The statue of a Hindu goddess from the same e-textbook was used as an illustration of a text about legend and folk tales. Another example of an image representing religion used as an illustration for non-religious text was the image of a woman holding a rosary. It was used as an illustration of a text about an anti-abortion protest. The images of women wearing hijab, which represented Islam, were also used as illustrations of common activities such as cooking, career, and sports. The only images used as illustrations of texts related to religions were the Easter eggs. They accompanied texts about Easter traditions.

Including visual images related to religion would be ideal to show the reality of religious life in Indonesia. Integrating topics about religions in the learning materials other than learning materials for religious education promoted inter religious understanding among Indonesian students (Haryatmoko, 2010; Kelabora, 1979; Parker, 2010). However, balanced representations and accurate depictions of all religions should be made to develop inclusive learning materials that in turn would promote students' learning motivation. Imbalanced representations and inaccurate depictions of any religion would disfranchise certain group of students and demotivate them. Religion is an

important cultural aspect in Indonesia, discounting it from instructional materials could have detrimental effect on students (Ladson-Billing, 2009a).

Previous studies showed that religious education failed in promoting inter religion understanding among students because of its segregate nature (Haryatmoko, 2010; Kelabora, 1979; Parker, 2010; Putranta, 2005; Soedjatmoko, 2009). Creating balanced and accurate religion representation through the use of visual images may promote mutual understanding among students with different religions. In the long run it could minimize the existing tensions and conflicts between different religious groups which have not been fully resolved in Indonesia (Haryatmoko, 2010).

**Gender role stereotype and bias.** Gender is not a mere biological trait but it is also learned behavior (Ryan, 2010). Gender roles are learned in the family and through education. Gender stereotypes existed in the society where males and females were often overly expected to behave in certain manner based on the societal beliefs and norms. These expectations often limited the opportunities of women and girls to perform certain tasks or assume certain jobs. In education stereotyping could limit students' future decisions regarding various aspects of their lives, including choice of profession and career development. Stereotypes keep both sexes in traditional professions and were incoherent with the various kinds of existing opportunities (Mills & Mills, 1996).

The third research question of the research was concerned about how the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia represented gender through the use of visual images in their illustrations. First, in terms of numbers, women were underrepresented in the overall English e-textbooks examined. There were 663 images of

women and girls compared to 1113 images of men and boys. Secondly, men were depicted as having wider range of roles as shown by their occupations and tasks they performed. Certain professions such as doctors and soldiers were only depicted by men. Other occupations such as teachers, police officers, reporters, and singers were illustrated by both men and women. The visual images used as illustrations in the English e-textbooks series also contained gender stereotypes related to emotions and feelings. Women were depicted as caring, sympathetic, and passionate, while men were depicted as having power and kept their emotions in control.

The visual images of males and females in the e-textbooks series did not represent the reality that exists in the society. In reality the number of women is more than the number of men according to 2000 population census (BPS, 2010). Women play important roles in the society. Women own about sixty percent of micro, small, and medium scale business enterprises. Women also hold more than 11 percent of the seats in the parliament and represent about 11 percent of government ministers. More than sixteen percent of judges and about fifteen percent of Supreme Court Judges are women (World Trade Press, 2010). Women are increasingly playing more important roles in the society. This fact should be better represented in all textbooks used in schools.

E-textbook writers and publishers should create balanced representations of males and females so that the English e-textbooks would be motivating and engaging for both male and female students. Balanced and accurate depictions of both genders in instructional materials would make students aware of the inequalities that had existed for women in Indonesian culture and encourage students to take corrective actions (Mills &

Mills, 1996). The balanced representations should not only be in equal numbers of both genders but also they should be depicted as having the same roles. Gender role stereotypes that limited men and women to perform certain limited tasks should be avoided. Showing egalitarian roles might lead students to have broader views on the choices of professions.

**Socioeconomic representation.** The fourth focus of the research concerned with whether the visual images in the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia had balanced representation of students from different socioeconomic backgrounds. Inclusive learning materials that represented all SES groups might reinforce important links between school and home cultures. As a result, learning materials would be engaging and motivating for students from different SES groups.

The English e-textbooks examined included all the three SES groups: low, middle, and high. Images of human, animals, and objects found in the English e-textbooks mostly represented the middle SES group. Middle SES group were represented by 867 human images. Low SES group had the least representation in the e-textbooks. They were only represented by 132 human images. The high SES group was in the second position, represented by 585 images.

The composition of low, mid, and high SES groups found in the e-textbooks does not reflect the reality of SES composition of Indonesian people. The English e-textbooks represented 0.39 percent of people from the low, 36.6 percent from mid and 38 percent from high SES groups. In reality, the percentage of people living below poverty line in Indonesia is much higher, 13.3 percent. In rural areas, the poverty rate is even

higher, as high as 16.6 percent. The English e-textbooks should reflect the real socioeconomic situations of Indonesia.

The imbalanced representation of SES groups would demotivate students whose groups were not represented in the learning materials. Balanced and accurate depictions of students' home cultures would increase students' learning motivation and improve their performances and achievements. The data showed that the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia needed to be improved by including more visual images that represented students from low SES group to reflect the reality. Realistic and accurate depictions of all people from different SES in instructional materials would make students aware of the socioeconomic conditions that exist in Indonesian society (Mills & Mills, 1996).

### **Inner and Expanding Circles in the English E-textbook**

For many years the English language teaching (ELT) paradigm in Indonesia adopted the distinction of native speakers and non-native speakers of English. Indonesians as the non-native speakers were the learners and the native speakers were the ones to set the standards, what was right and what was wrong in terms of grammar, vocabulary, and other aspects of language learning (Mistar, 2005; Sadtono 1997). Indonesia was considered to be an expanding circle because English was learned as a foreign language. The inner circle countries had benefits from this situation because they were the sources of all standards. Therefore, they had the privileges of setting learning standards, developing teaching methods, developing learning materials, and developing testing instruments. Indonesian educators were marginalized because they did not have

the power and were in receipt of what the inner circle countries decided. The marketing of ELT was often parallel with the industrial products in the international market where the developed nations held an unfair monopoly over less developed countries (Canagarajah, 2002). As a result, policy makers and teachers in Indonesia believed that the ELT models promoted by the central circles through their textbooks, research journals, training programs, and professional organizations were the best. Because of this, it was assumed that Indonesian ELT had to be adjusted (Mistar, 2005; Sadtono 1997). The ultimate goal of learning English was to become like a native, so that learners could communicate effectively with native speakers of English.

This study showed that the dichotomy of non-native and native speakers no longer seems to exist because the eight e-textbooks studied were written by Indonesians and published by Indonesian publishers. When the EFL paradigm was adopted in a particular country, only textbooks written by native speakers would be considered as the legitimate source of learning. The context, shown by the use of the visual images, was about local as well as global themes. The visual images used as illustrations depicted people, animals, and objects from local and international contexts. The inclusion of local contexts enabled students to understand and share their cultures with the international community. This fact underpins the writers' and publishers' paradigm of EIL. English was used to understand and share local cultures with other non-English speaking people as well as with English native speakers.

This study also showed that the writers of the e-textbooks did not adopt an EFL paradigm in which the contexts of instructional materials were almost always native

speakers' contexts. The use of both local and international contexts shown by the choice of visual images showed that the writers also adopted the view of English as an international language (EIL) in which the purpose of the study was to communicate local and global content with an international community. The main goal of English language learning was to be able to attain international intelligibility. The publication of the e-textbook series would encourage textbook writers and publishers to improve English language teaching in Indonesia by including local contexts and thereby lessen the domination of English speaking countries such as the United States, United Kingdom, and Australia which are often referred to as the inner-circle countries in ELT.

The e-textbooks studied included local as well as international contexts; however, the immediate international contexts were underrepresented in the e-textbooks. Few Asian countries such as Japan and South Korea were included. The international contexts were still more focused on the inner circle countries such as England, United States, and Australia. Inclusion of more Asian countries such as Singapore, Malaysia, the Philippines, and Vietnam would be ideal because most likely students will be communicating in English with people from these neighboring countries.

### **Summary**

This chapter discussed the data analysis and the findings. It presented qualitative data and descriptions of the visual images used as illustrations in the eight English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia.

The data showed that Melanesian ethnic groups were underrepresented in the English e-textbooks series. Austronesian which referred to ethnic groups inhabiting the

western part of Indonesia was much more dominant in terms of number of images and roles the images played in the society.

Not all official religions acknowledged by the Indonesian government were represented in the e-textbooks. The images of people only represented Islam and Christian religions. The images of animals and objects represented Christianity, Hinduism, and Buddhism. Confucianism as one of the official religions acknowledged by Indonesian government was not represented in the e-textbooks.

The e-textbooks also underrepresented women and the low SES group. The number of women images in the English e-textbooks series is much lower than images of men. Some professions were illustrated by both women and men, but some others were only represented by men. Almost all images of women and men depicted traditional roles thereby might enhance gender role stereotypes that might limit both genders' opportunities. Similarly, low SES group was underrepresented in the e-textbooks. Excluding certain group from the e-textbooks might disfranchise and demotivate learners.

The consequences of imbalanced representation and suggestions for improvement of the English e-textbooks were presented in the discussion section. Imbalanced or absence of students' culture in learning materials might alienate students. In turn, learning motivation would become low and as a result, the achievement would also become low. The English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia needs to provide a more balanced representation of ethnicity, religion, gender, and SES in order not to marginalize certain groups of students.

## **CHAPTER V**

### **CONCLUSIONS**

This chapter concludes the research by presenting an overview of the study, a discussion of the findings, conclusion, implications for English Language Teaching (ELT) practice, and recommendations for future research on the development of ELT materials.

#### **Overview of the Study**

The purpose of the study was to evaluate the visual images used as illustrations in the English electronic textbooks for grades ten, eleven, and twelve in Indonesia. Qualitative visual content analysis was employed as the methodology of the research. The analysis focused on whether these e-textbooks accommodated the religious, gender, ethnic, and socioeconomic diversity of the students. These four aspects of cultural diversity that influenced students learning in Indonesian contexts were crucial to examine because the students were so diverse. This diversity was because of the geographical conditions and historical background of Indonesia.

Evaluating the cultural aspects of the English e-textbooks for grades ten, eleven, and twelve in Indonesia was necessary because it contributed to the development of balanced ELT materials in Indonesia. The English e-textbooks published by the Ministry of Education were one series of learning materials used nationally by teachers in

Indonesia. The publications were controlled by the central government. Centralized policies had often created imbalanced power relations between the central and local governments. The publication of learning materials often did not include certain local interests and therefore marginalized local groups and prioritized other groups. Indonesia is so diverse, in terms of ethnic, religion, gender and socioeconomic status, so its centralized and standardized policy of education should be implemented with great caution. Due to this fact, critical theory in education was adopted as the theoretical framework of the study. Critical theory in education focused on power relations between different groups in educational field and practice.

This research was an attempt to assess the value of English e-textbooks as one of the sources of learning materials in Indonesian. It predicted whether the materials promoted and facilitated the learning process of the students. Learning materials were relevant to and useful for the students when they were of learners' interests and related to tasks which learners needed to perform in real life. Including cultural aspects and local contexts with balanced representation might increase students' motivation which in turns helped them to engage with the learning materials that might increase to learners' chance to succeed in learning. This research focused on evaluating English teaching materials through visual content analysis. It was important in an Indonesian context because it could contribute to the development of better learning materials that were intended to cater to a very diverse population.

Content analysis was adopted as the methodology of the study. In this study content analysis referred to the research technique for making valid inferences from the visual images meaningful to the context of their use, English e-textbooks series

(Krippendorff, 2004). Content analysis was characterized by close reading, rearticulating new narratives, and the researcher assigning new meanings or interpretations (Krippendorff, 2004). Texts or documents in content analysis did not only denote written text but also included visual images (Merriam, 2009; Altheide, 1996). In content analysis studies the researcher drew specific inferences from the collection of visual images in their contexts. The visual images in this study referred to all pictorial illustrations in the English e-textbooks developed for the 10th, 11th, and 12th graders of senior high school in Indonesia. All visual images were elicited as data for the purpose of analyses.

This study used document analysis as its main method. Document analysis included different procedures for analyzing and interpreting data from the examination of documents. The term document referred to visual images in this study. The documents that were analyzed were the visual images found in the English e-textbooks designed for 10th, 11th, and 12th graders in Indonesia. The document analysis procedure included document selections, protocol development, data collection, data coding and organization, and data analysis. The visual images were analyzed to determine whether they represented religious, ethnic, gender, and socioeconomic diversity of the students.

## **Discussion of the Findings**

### **Ethnic Representation**

Indonesia is comprised of around 1000 ethnic groups. These ethnic groups scattered around the country inhabiting more than 1500 big and small islands. In this study I decided to examine the general broad ethnic grouping because it was impossible to examine the representations of the existing ethnic groups. For the purpose of the study, I divided the existing ethnic groups into two larger groups, Melanesian and

Austronesians. The Melanesian ethnic group included all ethnic groups inhabiting the eastern part of Indonesia. The ethnic groups inhabiting the western part of Indonesia were included into the Austronesians group. The specific features to group them were eye shape, hair type, and skin color. Melanesian people generally had round eyes, curly hair, and darker skin tones. Austronesians people normally had oval eyes, straight hair, and lighter complexions.

The result of the research showed that Melanesian cultures were under represented in all English e-textbooks examined. All Melanesian images of human, animals, and objects were noticeably lower in numbers compared to the Austronesian and foreign ones. Due to the fact that the Melanesian ethnic groups were significantly less represented in numbers, they were also considerably underrepresented in roles. The range of roles of Melanesian people depicted in the English e-textbooks was very limited. The important roles were depicted through the images of the Austronesian people.

In this study, I concentrated on observing the presence of Indonesian ethnic groups in the English instructional materials used in high school. However, I found that apart from Indonesian ethnic groups, there was an interesting finding about foreigners in the English e-textbook series. The number of foreigners in the illustration was high. I classified foreigners into one group. I found that people from the United States of America and the United Kingdom were more in numbers compared to other groups of foreigners. Asian people were only represented by Korean and Japanese. People from the neighboring Asian countries, to whom Indonesian people would be communicating with, were not represented in the English e-textbooks. I was interested in further studying this phenomenon in future research.

### **Religion Representation**

The results of the study showed that the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia included images that represented religions. Not all religions acknowledged by the government were represented in the e-textbooks. Indonesia officially acknowledged six religions in its constitution. Although Indonesia is a secular country, religions were incorporated in everyday lives such as in schools.

The study showed that the visual images used as illustrations depicted people and objects that represented certain religions. It showed that in the eight English e-textbooks examined only Islam and Christianity were represented by human images. Images of objects in the English e-textbooks series represented Christianity, Hinduism, and Buddhism. Confucianism was not represented at all in the e-textbooks series.

### **Gender Representation**

The research results showed that there were gender bias and gender stereotypes in the visual images used as illustrations of the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia. First, in terms of numbers, women were underrepresented in the overall English e-textbooks examined. This did not reflect the reality that according to the 2000 census, woman population was bigger than men population. Secondly, men were depicted as having wider range of roles as shown by their occupations and tasks they performed. Thirdly, the visual images used as illustrations contained gender stereotypes related to emotions and feelings. Women were shown as caring, sympathetic, and passionate and men were shown as having power and kept their emotions in control.

### **Socioeconomic Status Representation**

The fourth focus of the study was to examine the representation of socioeconomic status. The visual images used as illustrations in the e-textbooks were categorized into three groups. The study showed that all the three SES groups: low, mid, and high were represented in the English e-textbooks. Most of the visual images represented the mid SES group. The high SES group was slightly less represented in terms of number of images. The low SES group had the least representations in the e-textbooks.

### **Conclusion**

There are five conclusions drawn from this study. They are related to the four research questions aforementioned. The last conclusion is related to the position of the English e-textbooks in relation to the English as a Foreign Language paradigm.

First, the study revealed that the Melanesian ethnic groups were underrepresented compared to Austronesian ethnic groups. Most visual images used as illustrations in the English e-textbooks series depicted pictures or photographs that represented Austronesians ethnic groups. As the consequence of much less in numbers, the Melanesian ethnic groups' range of roles was also limited. All important roles were exemplified by Austronesians people.

Previous studies showed that imbalanced representation and inaccurate depiction of ethnicity in instructional materials had detrimental effects on students (Campbell, 2010; Ladson-Billing, 2009b; Sheets, 2005). The imbalanced ethnic representation in the English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia would also have unfavorable consequences for the students. The absence of Melanesian cultures from the instructional materials may cause similar discontinuity between home and school culture

for Melanesian students that could then result in disfranchisement and disengagement. The e-textbooks as the learning materials did not accommodate the Melanesian ethnic groups. Students whose culture was not represented would have low learning motivation that in turn might result in lower academic achievement.

Second, the study showed that not all official religions in Indonesia were represented. The images found in the e-textbooks did not equally represent the existing religions. Human images only represented Islam and Christianity, while the images of objects only represented Christianity, Hinduism, and Buddhism.

Indonesia was secular country but religion is an important matter where the government involved in many areas. All Indonesian citizens should choose one of the official religions acknowledged by the government. Religious education was a compulsory subject in all education level from elementary school to university both in public and private institutions. There were two education systems in Indonesia. One was under the Ministry of Education and the other one was under the Ministry of Religion Affairs. Including religious topics in the textbooks other than textbooks for religious education was a common practice. Students would feel alienated and disfranchised when they were not represented in the learning materials (Campbell, 2010; Ladson-Billing, 2009b; Tomlinson & Lynch-Brown, 2010). Students would find the learning materials de-motivating and not engaging.

The English e-textbooks for high school in Indonesia did not reflect the reality of the existing religions in Indonesia. The images of human beings represented Islam and Christianity but left out Hinduism, Buddhism, and Confucianism. Religion is a sensitive issue and played an important role almost in all aspects of live in Indonesian society. It

even often causes tensions and conflicts that have not been properly resolved. The religious education has failed in promoting inter religion understanding because of its segregate nature. Balanced representation and accurate depiction of the reality of religious life in Indonesia in instructional materials other than the instructional material for religious education could promote inter religious understanding and in the long run would reduce the tensions and conflicts between different religious groups.

The third conclusion of the study was that there were bias representations in terms of numbers and roles for women in the English e-textbooks for Indonesian high school students. Women were underrepresented in all English e-textbooks examined. Men had wider range of roles. The roles assumed by both women and men were in line with the existing gender roles stereotypes in the society. Women were depicted as caring, sympathetic, and passionate while men were depicted as having power and kept their emotions in control. Gender bias representation in textbooks brought negative consequences to both male and female students (Mills & Mills, 1996). Stereotyping could curtail students' future decisions regarding various aspects of their lives, including choice of jobs and career development. The stereotypes kept both sexes in traditional professions, and were irrelevant to the abundant kinds of existing opportunities.

Fourth, the study concluded that the English e-textbooks for high school students in Indonesia had imbalanced representations of people from low, middle, and high socioeconomic groups in the society. Most of the human images represented people from the middle socioeconomic group. This depicted the reality of socioeconomic structure in Indonesia. Most of Indonesian population was in the middle class group (BPS, 2010). The second most represented were people from high socioeconomic group

and the least represented were the low socioeconomic group. This did not represent the reality of Indonesian society. According to the census of 2000, the number of people living under poverty line was more than the number of people from the high socioeconomic group (BPS, 2010).

Similar to other cultural aspects, the imbalanced representation of SES in textbooks could bring detrimental effect for students. Textbooks that were not inclusive of all culture of the students might be de-motivating and disengaging for students.

Another finding of the study, which emerged later and was not part of the research questions proposed at the beginning study was related to the paradigm used by the e-textbooks writers. The writers of the e-textbooks series had moved from English as a foreign language position to English as an international language paradigm. The inclusion of images from the local contexts suggested that the writers attempted to help students to be able to share local cultures in English and avoid the over emphasis on the culture of native speakers of English found in earlier English text books (Kachru, 1996; Mistar, 2005; Sadtono, 1997). The consequences of this paradigm shift were related to the standards, purpose, and ultimate goal of learning. The utilization of local contexts through the use of visual images depicting local cultures confirmed that the purpose of learning English was not merely to be able to communicate with and to discuss culture of people from English speaking countries but also to be able to discuss learners' own cultures and to communicate with people from other cultures who did not share common national language. It also confirmed that the ultimate goal of learning English was no longer native-like competency but international intelligibility.

In conclusion the study revealed that there were imbalanced representations of religion, ethnic, gender, and SES in the English e-textbooks for high school students in Indonesia. They also contained gender roles stereotypes of men and women. The English e-textbooks series adopted English as an international language as their paradigm in which English is learned to share local cultures with the neighboring and broad international community who did not share common language.

### **Implication for Practice**

Although the autonomy law had been enacted in 1999 many policies were still be made by central government. One of the policies was the publication of textbooks for schools. The Indonesian Ministry of Education was responsible for the textbooks publication for school. Therefore, it needed to establish guidelines for textbooks writers on the quality of textbooks in terms of balanced ethnic, religion, gender, and SES representations. The following are the suggested guidelines to improve the balanced cultural representations:

1. Austronesian and Melanesian ethnic groups should be represented equally by the visual images used as illustrations in terms of number and roles. It is achievable through the equal depiction of human, animals, and objects that represent the ethnic groups. More images of foreigners depicting common people, not only famous people should be given to provide realistic depictions of the foreign cultures.
2. All official religions acknowledged by the government should be represented in the textbooks. Although about ninety percent of Indonesian population is Muslims there should be balanced representations of all religions.

3. Gender bias and gender roles stereotypes should be avoided. Women should be depicted as having as wide range of tasks and occupations as men. Both men and women should be depicted in more egalitarian roles to avoid the trap of traditional stereotypical gender roles.
4. A more balanced representation of low, middle, and high SES groups should be obtained by depicting all groups based on the existing reality in the society.

In addition, the Ministry of Education should provide training programs for textbooks writers, curriculum developers in provinces and districts, and teachers. The training programs should be designed to help educators and officials to increase awareness about cultural biases in instructional materials.

### **Recommendations for Future Research**

1. This content analysis study only made use of the visual images as the sources of data to study cultural representations of English e-textbooks used in Indonesia. It is therefore recommended that future research include both visual images and written texts. Although visual images provide rich cultural information, written text can offer specific information of equal importance.
2. In this study broad categories of Melanesian and Austronesian ethnic groups were used. It is therefore recommended that future research employ more specific ethnic categories. Ethnic representation could be based on the existing main islands. Using textual information might help future research to further classify ethnicity into more detailed categories.
3. This study grouped all foreigners into one single unit. It is recommended that future research classify foreigners into more detailed categories based

on their nationalities. Especially studying the representations of other Asian nations will be useful because they are the nations that most probably will be interacting in English with Indonesian people.

4. This study examined eight English e-textbooks for grades 10, 11, and 12 of high school in Indonesia. There were other English e-textbooks series for grades 7, 8, and 9 of junior high school. Examining all English e-textbooks for all grades might provide a more comprehensive picture of cultural representations in instructional materials. It is therefore recommended that future research examine the English e-textbooks for grades 7, 8, and 9 of junior high school. It is expected that the combination of this study and future studies would provide a better understanding of cultural representation in the e-textbooks published by Indonesian Ministry of Education.

5. The Ministry of Education had published 927 e-textbooks through January 2012. There were 291 e-textbooks for elementary school, 154 for junior high school, 276 for senior high school, and 204 for vocational school. They included most school subjects. This study only examined English e-textbooks for high school. It is therefore recommended that future research examine other e-textbooks for other levels and other subjects. It would be useful for the improvement of the quality of instructional materials in terms of cultural representation.

6. The Ministry of Education did not only publish e-textbooks. It also published conventional textbooks for all school levels. It is therefore also recommended that future research study all school textbooks.

### **Summary**

The study was an attempt to evaluate the cultural aspects of English e-textbooks for grades ten, eleven, and twelve published by the Ministry of Education of Indonesia. The visual images were used as the source of data whether of the e-textbooks represented the four cultural aspects examined. The cultural aspects studied were ethnic, religion, gender, and SES. The results of the study showed that there were imbalanced representations of ethnic, religion, gender, and SES in the English e-textbooks examined. Developing guidelines for cultural representation was suggested to improve the quality and inclusiveness of English instructional materials. It is expected that the results of this study inform teachers, textbook writers and publisher.

## REFERENCES

- Altheide, D.L. (1996). *Qualitative media analysis*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publication Inc.
- Astuti, D. (2009). Sikap dan preferensi kepala sekolah SMA se Jawa Tengah terhadap bahasa asing pilihan (Attitude and preferences of Senior High School in Central Java province towards foreign language). *Lingua*, 6(1).
- Au, W. & Apple, M.W. (2009). Rethinking reproduction: neo-marxism in critical education theory. In M.W. Apple, W. Au, & L. A. Gandin (Eds.), *The Routledge international handbook of critical education* (pp. 83-95). Hoboken: Routledge.
- Beckford, J.A. (2010). Religious diversity and social problems. In T. Hjelm (Ed.), *Religion and social problems* (pp. 53-66). Hoboken: Routledge.
- Bell, J. & Gower, R. (1998). Writing course materials for the world: A great compromise. In Tomlison, B. (Ed), *Material development in language teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Block, D. & Cameron D. (2002). *Globalization and language teaching*. London: Routledge.
- Bowles, S. & Gintis, H. (1989). Can there be a liberal philosophy of education in a democratic society? In H.A. Giroux & P. McLaren (Eds.), *Critical pedagogy, the*

- state, and cultural struggle* (pp. 24-31). Albany: State University of New York Press.
- BPS (2010). *Strategic Data: Statistics Indonesia*. Jakarta: BPS-Statistic Indonesia.
- Brutt-Griffler, J. (2010). Bilingualism and English language teaching. In Wyse, D., Andrews, R., & Hoffman, J. (Eds.), *The Routledge international handbook of English*. Hoboken: Routledge.
- Buckingham, D. (2009). 'Creative' visual methods in media research: Possibilities, problems and proposals. *Media, Culture & Society*, 31(4), 633-652. Retrieved from <http://mcs.sagepub.com/content/31/4/633>.
- Burke, A. & Hammet R.F. (2009). *Assessing new literacies: Perspective from the classroom*. New York: Peter Lang.
- Byram, M. & Fleming, M. (1998). *Language learning in intercultural perspective: Approaches through drama and ethnography*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Campbell, D.E. (2010) *Choosing democracy: A practical guide to multicultural education*. Boston: Allyn & Bacon.
- Canagarajah, A.S. (2002). Globalization, methods, and practice in periphery classrooms. In Block, D. & Cameron D. (Eds.), *Globalization and language teaching*. London: Routledge.
- Costanzo, M. (2010). Moving from text-bound to tech-bound. *School Talk*, 15(3), 4-6. Retrieved from <http://www.ncte.org/library/NCTEFiles/Resources/Journals/ST/STO153apr2010.pdf>

- Davies, S. G. (2010). *Gender diversity in Indonesia: Sexuality, Islam, and queer selves*. Hoboken: Routledge.
- Donovan, C.A. & Smolkin, L.B. (2002). Considering genre, content, and visual features in the selection of trade books for science instruction. *The Reading Teacher*, 55 (6), 502-521.
- Dulay, H., Burt, M., Krashen, S. (1982). *Language Two*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Elson, R.E. (2005). Constructing the nation: Ethnicity, race modernity and citizenship in early Indonesian thought. *Asian Ethnicity*, 6(3), 145-160. doi: 10.1080/14631360500226556.
- Feenberg, A. (2009) Word and image in online education. In T.H. Engstrom & E. Selinger (Eds.), *Rethinking theories and practices of imaging* (pp. 327-337). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Friend, T. (2003). *Indonesian destinies*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.
- George, A. (2009). Quantitative and qualitative approach to content analysis. In K. Krippendorff & M.A. Bock (Eds.), *The content analysis reader*. Los Angeles: Sage.
- Giambo, D., Gonzales, M.E., Szecsi, T., & Thirumurthy, V. (2007). Beyond Johnny Appleseed: Learning English as a new language through ethnically diverse literature. *Childhood Education*, 83(2), 104-107.
- Giroux, H. A. (1989) Schooling as a form of cultural politics: Toward a pedagogy of and for difference. In H.A. Giroux & P. McLaren (Eds.), *Critical pedagogy, the state,*

*and cultural struggle* (pp. 125-151) . Albany: State University of New York Press.

Giroux, H.A. (1999). *Corporate culture and the attack on higher education and public schooling*. Bloomington: Phi Delta Kappa Educational Foundation.

Giroux, H. A. (2001). *Theory and resistance in education: Towards pedagogy for the opposition*. Westport: Bergin & Garvey.

Giroux, H. A. (2006). *The Giroux reader*. Boulder: Paradigm Publisher.

Giroux, H.A. & McLaren, P. (1989). Introduction: schooling, cultural politics, and the struggle for democracy. In H.A. Giroux & P. McLaren (Eds.), *Critical pedagogy, the state, and cultural struggle* (pp.xi -xvi). Albany: State University of New York Press.

Gray, J. (2002). The global course book in English language teaching. In Block, D. & Cameron D. (Eds.), *Globalization and language teaching*. London: Routledge.

Grensing-Pophal, L. (2010) Are textbooks obsolete? An education in the impact of electronic textbooks . *EContent*, 33(3), 18-22. Retrieved from <http://www.econtentmag.com/Articles/Editorial/Feature/Are-Textbooks-Obsolete-An-Education-in-the-Impact-of-Electronic-Textbooks-65999.htm>

Haryatmoko. (2010). *Dominasi penuh muslihat: Akar kekerasan dan diskriminasi (Domination full of conspiracy: The root of violence and discriminations)*.

Jakarta: Penerbit Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

Indratno, A.F.T. (2008). Kurikulum beridentitas kerakyatan (Curriculum for the people).

In A.F.T. Indratno (Ed.), *Kurikulum yang mencerdaskan: Visi 2030 dan*

- pendidikan alternatif (Empowering curriculum: 2030 vision and alternative education)* (pp.107-112). Jakarta: Penerbit Buku Kompas.
- Insinnia, E. & Skarecki, I. (2004). E-books. *Media and Methods*, 41(1), 23.
- Janis, I. (2009). The problem of validating content analysis. In K. Krippendorff & M.A. Bock (Eds.), *The content analysis reader* (pp. 358-366). Los Angeles: Sage.
- Jin, L. & Cortazzi, M. (1998). The culture the learner brings: a bridge or a barrier? In Byram, M. & Fleming, M. (Eds.), *Language learning in intercultural perspective: Approaches through drama and ethnography*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Kachru, B.B. (1976). Models of English for the third world: While man's linguistic burden or language pragmatics? *TESOL Quarterly*, 10(2), 221-239. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3585643>.
- Kachru, B.B. (1996). World Englishes: Agony and ecstasy. *Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 30 (2), 135-155. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3333196>.
- Kachru, B.B. (2008). Symposium on intelligibility and cross-cultural communication in world Englishes: Introduction. *World Englishes*, 27 (3/4), 293-296.
- Kelabora, L. (1979). Assumption underlying religious instruction in Indonesia. *Comparative Education*, 15(3), 325-339. Retrieved from <http://www.jstor.org/stable/3098905?origin=JSTOR-pdf>.
- Kincheloe, J.L. & McLaren, P. (2000). Rethinking critical theory and qualitative research. In N.K. Denzin & Y.S. Lincoln (Eds), *Handbook of qualitative research* (pp.279-314). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publication, Inc.

- Kirkpatrick, A. (2011). English as an Asian lingua franca and the multilingual model of ELT. *Language Teaching*, 44(2), 212-224. Retrieved from <http://journals.cambridge.org>
- Kramersch, C. (1993). *Context and culture in language teaching*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Kramersch, C. (1998). The privilege of the intercultural speaker. In Byram, M. & Fleming, M. (Eds.), *Language learning in Intercultural perspective: Approaches through drama and ethnography*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Krippendorff, K. (2004). *Content analysis an introduction to its methodology*. Thousand Oaks, CA.: Sage Publication Inc.
- Krippendorff, K. & Bock, M.A. (2009). *The content analysis reader*. Los Angeles: Sage.
- Kubota, R. (2002). The impact of globalization on language teaching in Japan. In Block, D. & Cameron D. (Eds.), *Globalization and language teaching*. London: Routledge.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2009a). *The dreamkeepers: Successful teachers of African American children*. San Fransisco: Jossey Bass.
- Ladson-Billings, G. (2009b). Race still matters: Critical race theory in education. In M.W. Apple, W. Au & L. A. Gandin (Eds.), *The Routledge international handbook of critical education* (pp.96-122). Hoboken: Routledge.
- Liem, G. A. D. (2009). The use of partial least squares (PLS) path modelling analysis in a cross-cultural investigation into the relationships of values, classroom cultural climate and learning approach. In B. Matthews, T. Gibbon, C. Aldous & L. Saha (Eds.), *The Process of Research in Education - A Book of Exemplars: A*

*Festschrift in Honour of John P. Keeves AM* (pp. 371-406). Adelaide, SA: Shannon Press.

Lindkvist, K. (1981) Approaches to textual analysis. In K.E. Rosengren (Ed.), *Advances in content analysis* (pp.23-41). Beverly Hills: Sage Publication.

Littlejohn, A. (1998). The analysis of language teaching materials: Inside the Trojan horse. In Tomlison, B. (Ed.), *Material development in language teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Maryulis, M. (2008). *Buku digital bikin ribet anak sekolah (Digital books are such hassle to school children)*. Retrieved from <http://maryulismax.wordpress.com/2008/07/24/buku-digital-bikin-ribet-anak-sekolah>.

Mason, P. (2005). Visual data in applied qualitative research: Lesson from experience. *Qualitative Research*, 5(3), 325-346. Retrieved from <http://qrj.sagepub.com/content/5/3/325>.

McMillan, S.J. (2009) The challenge of applying content analysis to the world wide web. In K. Krippendorff & M.A. Bock (Eds.), *The content analysis reader*. Los Angeles: Sage.

Merriam, S.B. (2009). *Qualitative research: a guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey Bass.

Messwati, E.D. (2007). Membenahi pendidikan yang kedodoran (Improving struggling education). In C. Verdiansyah (Ed.), *Membongkar budaya: Visi Indonesia 2030 dan tantangan menuju raksasa dunia (Unveiling culture: Indonesian 2030 vision*

*and the challenges to become world power*) (pp. 295-300). Jakarta: Penerbit Buku Kompas.

Mills, R. & Mills, R. (1996). Adolescents' attitude toward female gender roles: Implications for education. *Adolescence*. 31, 123.

Mistar, J. (2005). Teaching English as a foreign language (TEFL) in Indonesia. In G. Braine (Ed.), *Teaching English to the world: History, curriculum, and practice* (pp. 75-85). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.

Morrow, R.A. & Torres, C.A. (2002). *Reading Freire and Habermas: Critical pedagogy and transformative social change*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Moss, G. (2010) Gender and the teaching of English. In Wyse, D., Andrews, R., & Hoffman, J. (Eds.). *The Routledge international handbook of English*. Hoboken: Routledge.

Mougeon, R. (2010). *The sociolinguistic competence of immersion students*. Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

Napitupulu E. L. (2009, May 6). Belum semua siswa bisa unduh buku sekolah elektronik (Not all students have access to download the electronic books). *KOMPAS*.

Retrieved from

<http://lipsus.kompas.com/dulmatin/read/2009/05/06/15363481/Belum.Semua.Siswa.Bisa.Unduh..Buku.Sekolah.Elektronik>.

Nuh, M. (2010) Buku teks pelajaran murah departemen pendidikan nasional (Inexpensive textbooks from department of national education) . *Depdiknas*. Retrieved from <http://bse.depdiknas.go.id>.

- Parker, L. (2010). *Religious tolerance and inter-faith education in Indonesia*.  
 Proceedings from the 18th Biennial Conference of the Asian Studies Association  
 of Australia. Retrieved from  
[http://asaa.asn.au/ASAA2010/reviewed\\_papers/Parker-Lynn.pdf](http://asaa.asn.au/ASAA2010/reviewed_papers/Parker-Lynn.pdf).
- Pauwels, L. (2010). Visual sociology reframed: An analytical synthesis and discussion of  
 visual methods in social and cultural research. *Sociological Methods & Research*,  
 38(4), 545-581. Retrieved from <http://smr.sagepub.com/content/38/4/545>.
- Peck-Chong, L. (2007). *An analysis of gender and ethnic representations in Chinese and  
 Malay primary school reading textbooks: grades 2-6*. (Doctoral dissertation).  
 Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses database. (UMI No. 3290735)
- Pennycook, A. (1989). The concept of method, interested knowledge, and the politics of  
 language teaching. *TESOL Quarterly*, 23, (4).
- Putranta, C., S.J. (2005). Sumbangan agama dalam proses reformasi di Indonesia:  
 Mencari kerangka pemahaman teoretis dalam perspektif kristiani (The  
 contributions of religions to the process of Indonesian reforms: In search of  
 theoretical frameworks in Christian perspectives). In A. M. S. Soewandi, B.  
 Widharyanto, B. Bram, & Y.F. S. T. Nugraha (Eds.), *Pelangi pendidikan:  
 Tinjauan dari berbagai perspektif (Education anthology: Multi perspectives study)*.  
 Yogyakarta: Penerbit Universitas Sanata Dharma.
- Ramstedt, M. (2011). Menafsir kembali tata norma Bali pasca Orde Baru: Reformasi  
 negara dan kegalauan makna ke-Bali-an (Reinterpreting post New Order Baliness  
 norms: State reforms and the ambiguity of Baliness meaning). In M.Ramstedt &  
 F.I. Thufail (Eds.), *Kegalauan indentitas: Agama, etnisitas, dan*

- kewarganegaraan pada masa pasca Orde Baru (Confused identity: Religion, ethnicity, and citizenship in post New Order era)*. Jakarta: Grasindo.
- Richards, B. (2009). *Vocabulary studies in first and second language acquisition: The interface between theory and application*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Rosengren, K.E. (1981). *Advances in content analysis*. Beverly Hills: Sage Publication.
- Ryan, M. (2010). *Cultural studies: A practical introduction*. Chichester: Wiley-Blackwell.
- Sadtono, E. (1997). ELT development in Indonesia a smorgasbord. In E. Sadtono (Ed.), *National seminar: The development of TEFL in Indonesia* (pp. 1-20). Malang: Penerbit IKIP Malang.
- Schwandt, T. (2007). *Dictionary of qualitative inquiry* (3rd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Sepstrups, P. (1981). Methodological development in content analysis. In K.E. Rosengren (Ed.), *Advances in content analysis* (pp. 133-158). Beverly Hills: Sage Publication.
- Sheets, R.H. (2005) *Diversity pedagogy: Examining the role of culture in the teaching-learning process*. Boston: Pearson Education Inc.
- Sims, R.L. (2009). Gender equity in management education: Inferences from test bank questions. In K. Krippendorff & M.A. Bock (Eds.), *The content analysis reader* (pp.328-332), Los Angeles: Sage.
- Sirozi, M. (2004). Secular-religious debates on the Indonesian national education system: Colonial legacy and a search for national identity in education. *Intercultural Education*. 15(2). doi: 10.1080/1467598042000224998

- Soedjatmoko. (2009). Pengaruh pendidikan agama terhadap kehidupan sosial (The influence of religious education in social life). In A. H. Triman (Ed.), *Menjadi bangsa terdidik menurut Soedjatmoko (Becoming an educated nation according to Soedjatmiko)*. Jakarta: Penerbit Buku Kompas.
- Sularto, St. (2008). Tentang mimpi besar Indonesia (About Indonesian big dreams). In A.F.T. Indratno (Ed.), *Kurikulum yang mencerdaskan: Visi 2030 dan pendidikan alternatif (Empowering curriculum: 2030 vision and alternative education)* (pp. 95-101). Jakarta: Penerbit Buku Kompas.
- Sulistiyani, H. D. (2010). The construction of women in contemporary Indonesian women's cinema. In K. Sen & D. Hill (Eds.), *Politics and the media in twenty-first century Indonesia: Decade of democracy* (pp. 160-171). Hoboken: Routledge.
- Suryadinata L., Arifin, E.N., & Ananta, A. (2005). *Indonesia's population: Ethnicity and religion in a changing political landscape*. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies.
- Suwignyo, A. (2008) Kurikulum dan politik (kebijakan) pendidikan (Curriculum and politics of education). In A.F.T. Indratno (Ed.), *Kurikulum yang mencerdaskan: Visi 2030 dan pendidikan alternatif (Empowering curriculum: 2030 vision and alternative education)* (pp. 37-64). Jakarta: Penerbit Buku Kompas.
- Taruna, J.C.T. (2008). Kurikulum yang mencerdaskan. In A.F.T. Indratno (Ed.), *Kurikulum yang mencerdaskan: Visi 2030 dan pendidikan alternatif (Empowering curriculum: 2030 vision and alternative education)* (pp. 65-78). Jakarta: Penerbit Buku Kompas.

- Taylor, E. W. (2002) Using still photography in making meaning of adult educators teaching beliefs. *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 34(2), 123-140.
- Tomlinson, B. (1998a). *Material development in language teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tomlinson, B. (1998b). Seeing what they mean: Helping L2 readers to visualise. In Tomlinson, B. (Ed.), *Material development in language teaching*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tomlinson, C.M. & Lynch-Brown, C. (2010). *Essential of young adult literature*. Boston: Pearson.
- Tilaar, H.A.R. (2005). Pendidikan multicultural (Multicultural education). In I.P.Baryadi, B. Rahmanto, C. Rismiati, P.A. Subagyo, R. Rohandi, St. Sunardi (Eds.), *Pendidikan nasional dalam reformasi politik dan kemasyarakatan (National education in political and societal reforms)*. Yogyakarta: Penerbit Universitas Sanata Dharma.
- Twine, F. W. (2006) Visual ethnography and racial theory: Family photographs as archives of interracial intimacies. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 29(3), 487-511. Retrieved from <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/01419870600597909>.
- Tyson, A. D. (2010). *Decentralization and adat revivalism in Indonesia: The politics of becoming indigenous*. Hoboken: Routledge.
- Van Wichelen, S. (2010). *Religion, politics, and gender in Indonesia: Disputing the Muslim body*. Hoboken: Routledge.

- Vernon, R. F. (2006). Paper or pixels? An inquiry into how students adapt to online textbooks. *Journal of Social Work Education*, 42(2), 417-428. Retrieved from <http://search.proquest.com.flagship.luc.edu/docview/57037966?accountid=12163>
- Warta, C. (2011). Perkembangan masalah agama di Papua: Sengketa antaragama dan pencegahan konflik (The development of religious problems in Papua: Inter religions conflicts and the preventions). In M. Ramstedt & F.I. Thufail (Eds.), *Kegalauan indentitas: agama, etnisitas, dan kewarganegaraan pada masa pasca Orde Baru (Confused identity: Religion, ethnicity, and citizenship in post New Order era)*. Jakarta: Grasindo.
- Weber, C. L & Cavanaugh, T. W. (2006) Promoting reading: Using ebooks with gifted and advanced readers. *Gifted Child Today*, 29(4), 56-64.
- Wei, L. (2010). *Applied linguistics review 2010*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- Wepner, S.B. & Strickland,D.S. (2008). *The Administration and supervision of reading programs*. Teachers College: Columbus University.
- Widiyanto, Y. N. (2005). The making of a multicultural English teacher. *English Teaching: Practice and Critique*, 4(1). Retrieved from <http://education.waikato.ac.nz/research/files/etpc/files/2005v4n1nar1.pdf>
- Wilcox, R. (1996). *Statistics for the social sciences*. San Diego: Academic Press, Inc.
- Willis, J.W. (2007). *Foundations of qualitative research: Interpretive and critical approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Wink, J. (2000). *Critical pedagogy: Notes from the real world*. New York: Addison-Wesley Longman Inc.

- World Trade Press (2010). *Indonesia society and culture complete report*. Petaluma: World Trade Press.
- Yen, Y. (2000). *Identity issues in EFL and ESL textbooks: A sociocultural perspective*. (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses database. (UMI No. 9971668)
- Yi, H. (1997). *A Content analysis of Korean textbooks for adult learners of Korean as a foreign language*. (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses database. (UMI No. 9929015)
- Yim, S. (2003). *Globalization and national identity: English language textbooks of Korea*. (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses database. (UMI No. 3071173)
- Yuwono, G.I. & Harbon, L. (2010). English teacher professionalism and professional development: Some common issues in Indonesia. *The Asian EFL Journal Quarterly*, 12(3).
- Yuwono, G. I. (2005). *English language teaching in decentralised Indonesia: Voices from the less privileged schools*. Proceedings from the Australian Association for Research in Education, International Education Research Conference, The University of Western Sydney: Parramatta.
- Zuhdi, M.(2005). *Religious education in Indonesian schools*. Proceedings from Redesigning pedagogy: Research, policy and practice: An international conference, Retrieved from <http://conference.nie.edu.sg/paper/new%20converted/ab00167.pdf>. Nanyang Technological University: Singapore.

## VITA

Ouda Teda Ena is the fifth child of SV. Sukadi Harsawijaya and Th. Subarsilah. He was born in Yogyakarta, Indonesia on October 17, 1970. He is currently a lecturer at Sanata Dharma University. He married Dewi Widyastuti in 2002.

Ouda attended SDN Kwagon elementary school, SMP Budi Mulia junior high school, and SMAN Argomulyo high school. He earned BA in English education from Sanata Dharma University in 1997. He earned a Master of Education degree in English Education from Universitas Negeri Malang, Indonesia in 2005.

Ouda began to teach at Sanata Dharma University after he graduated in 1997. He worked for the English Education Department, School of Education of Sanata Dharma University for the past 15 years.

## **DISSERTATION COMMITTEE**

The Dissertation submitted by Ouda Teda Ena has been read and approved by the following committee:

Ann Marie Ryan, Ph.D., Director  
Associate Professor, School of Education  
Loyola University Chicago

Leanne Kallemeyn, Ph.D.,  
Assistant Professor, School of Education  
Loyola University Chicago

Amy Heineke, Ph.D.,  
Assistant Professor, School of Education  
Loyola University Chicago