Differences in Motivational Patterns of College Student Brothers as Revealed in the TAT, the Ratings of their Peers, and the Ratings of their Superiors: a Validation Study

Thomas Leo Quinn
Loyola University Chicago

Follow this and additional works at: https://ecommons.luc.edu/luc_diss

Part of the Psychology Commons

Recommended Citation
Quinn, Thomas Leo, "Differences in Motivational Patterns of College Student Brothers as Revealed in the TAT, the Ratings of their Peers, and the Ratings of their Superiors: a Validation Study" (1962). Dissertations. 650.
https://ecommons.luc.edu/luc_diss/650

This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Noncommercial-No Derivative Works 3.0 License.
Copyright © 1962 Thomas Leo Quinn
DIFFERENCES IN MOTIVATIONAL PATTERNS OF COLLEGE STUDENT BROTHERS
AS REVEALED IN THE TAT, THE RATINGS OF THEIR PEERS,
AND THE RATINGS OF THEIR SUPERIORS:
A VALIDATION STUDY

by

Thomas Leo Quinn

A Dissertation Submitted to the Faculty of the Graduate School
of Loyola University in Partial Fulfillment of
the Requirement for the Degree of
Doctor of Philosophy

June
1962
VITA

Thomas Leo Quinn was born in Oakland, California, August 9, 1922. He was graduated from St. Anthony's High School, Long Beach, California, June 14, 1940. He majored in English at St. Mary's College, California and was graduated from there, February, 1947, with the degree of Bachelor of Arts.

From 1946 to 1948 the author taught English courses at Cathedral High School, Los Angeles, California; and during the following year he taught similar courses at Mont La Salle High School, Napa, California. From 1949 to 1954 he was principal of Mont La Salle High School.

During the summers of the same period he took additional courses in English at the University of California and courses at the L'Institute Catholique in Paris. He has also done work in physiology at the University of California. He began his studies in psychology at Loyola University in 1955 and was graduated with the degree of Master of Arts in 1959.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many persons have generously contributed their time and talents that this study might be completed. A special word of gratitude is due Dr. Magda B. Arnold for her generous counsel and encouragement, and especially for her suggestions regarding this exploration of her method of TAT analysis.

Very special thanks are also due to Brother U. Alfred, former Provincial of the California District of the Christian Brothers, and to Brother T. Jerome, who is presently the Provincial. Without their cooperation it would not have been possible to test the young aspirants to their Order. For similar reasons the author is also in debt to Brother U. Pius, Brother V. Gerard, Brother W. Raphael and Brother R. Camillus, all of whom were superiors in the various houses of formation of the Christian Brothers in California when the author did the major portion of the testing for this study.

For the opportunity in Philadelphia of doing the testing necessary for the pilot study for this investigation, the author acknowledges his appreciation to the superiors of the Student Brothers there: Brother James, Provincial, and Brother Paul, Director.

Finally, a very special word of thanks to all of the Junior Novices, Novices, and Scholastics who participated as subjects in this investigation.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION TO THE PROBLEM</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Screening of religious candidates--Purpose of the present investigation--The measuring device: the TAT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Studies on male candidates to the religious life and priesthood--Studies employing the TAT in various vocations--Studies employing the Sequential Analysis of the TAT--Pilot studies for this investigation--Summary of the review of the literature</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. DESIGN OF THE RESEARCH</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The sample--Group administration of the TAT--Control for intelligence--Maintaining anonymity--Ranking by peers--Ranking by high TAT scorers--Ranking by superiors--The scoring system--Scoring the TAT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. RESULTS OF THE INVESTIGATION</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The criterion--The Philadelphia pilot study--Relationships between TAT scores and judges' ratings--False positives--False negatives--Pollyanna stories--Areas for future investigation--Implications of this investigation for religious formation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX I</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graph I: Average rankings and corresponding variances of forty-five subjects done by their peers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graph II: TAT scores of forty-five subjects compared with their</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
rankings by forty-five peers.

Graph III: TAT scores of forty-five subjects compared with their rankings by two superiors.

Graph IV: TAT scores of forty-five subjects compared with their rankings by ten high TAT scorers.

APPENDIX II .................................................. 109

Scoring for the Sequential Analysis of the TAT

APPENDIX III .................................................. 114

Protocols and stories of three false positives and one false negative.

APPENDIX IV .................................................. 139

Sample Pollyanna stories and the resulting protocol.
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>AVERAGE RANKS AND VARIANCES OF GROUPS A, B, AND C</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>CORRELATIONS BETWEEN TAT SCORES AND RANKINGS OF PEER-JUDGES, SUPERIORS, AND HIGH TAT SCORERS</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION TO THE PROBLEM

Religious superiors in various orders and congregations of the Church agree that they do not want to accept undesirable candidates to the religious life. And this reluctance does not merely refer to admitting undesirable candidates to final profession but extends to the admission of candidates to the first phase of the religious life, the training in the novitiate.

There are several reasons why religious superiors hold this view. From the point of view of the religious congregation, an undesirable candidate presents a problem to both the congregation in general and to his colleagues in particular. He requires a disproportionate amount of the master of novices' time to the detriment of the other novices in his charge. He is frequently difficult to get along with and thus is a disruptive element in the life of the novitiate. And furthermore, he makes it difficult for the master of novices to achieve the proper goal of the novitiate year and consequently places an additional and unnecessary burden upon him. Masters of novices have repeatedly stressed the idea that the screening of candidates is not their essential duty in the novitiate, although it may be a corollary flowing from it. Their job is to instruct and train their novices in the best ways of achieving spiritual perfection.

From the point of view of the candidate himself, he also faces several disadvantages when he is allowed to enter a novitiate to which he is not suited.
If he has an unstable personality, he may find the stress of novitiate life painful and perhaps incur financial obligations should he require professional attention either while he is still in the novitiate or after he has left it to correct the psychological imbalance precipitated by novitiate life. For the candidate who is not bothered psychologically by his ill-fated attempt to become a religious, there is still the fact that the normal tenor of events in his life may be disrupted; entrance into college has been delayed, a desirable job has been refused, or military service has been postponed.

Then, too, the unsuitable candidate may have to struggle with the difficulty that arises when he is faced with the prospect of leaving. Such a step takes courage. He may be afraid either because of his own attitudes towards himself or because of the attitudes of others: it may involve a loss of self-esteem, fear of criticism by his friends, and the disappointment of loved ones. Finally, when he unwittingly experiences the pressure of such psychological threats, he may begin to mobilize his defenses against leaving and refuse to recognize the truth about himself.

Screening of Religious Candidates

If, then, it is desirable from the point of view of the religious congregation and also from the standpoint of the unsuitable candidate that he be refused admission to the novitiate, we may ask what means are now available to eliminate such candidates from the number who apply each year. In general the Church has insisted that superiors check for any intellectual, physical or social impediment in a candidate to the religious life. Thus they will turn away a candidate who is sickly, is not bright enough to engage in the work of the congregation, or who has prior responsibilities to others. To discover such
impediments, the vocational director may employ questionnaires, interview techniques, reports on physical fitness, letters of recommendation, and various personality tests. But it is precisely in the area of personality evaluation that most superiors find the fewest tools to help them choose suitable candidates. They have a general idea of what they are looking for, but they find it difficult to make an objective assessment of the qualities desirable in prospective candidates.

They know that a candidate to the religious life should have high ideals and be willing to work and make sacrifices to attain them. It is not so much that these ideals be explicitly supernatural, although it is desirable that such be the case, but rather that the candidate have the kind of basic personality integration of his intellectual, volitional, and emotional powers that will make for maturity, stability, adjustment, and control in the religious life. When a candidate has this basic personality pattern and a felt desire to become a religious, there is every chance that he will be able to profit from the experience of the novitiate year. But when such a personality structure is lacking, a candidate's prospect of success in the religious life is remote indeed.

**Purpose of the Present Investigation**

This study is precisely concerned with the evaluation of the basic personality structure of male candidates to the religious life by means of a projective technique for psychological screening. It employs Arnold's Sequential Analysis of the TAT and is an outgrowth of a preliminary study that was done a year ago on a group of candidates to the religious Brotherhood.¹

In the pilot study, just the extremes of the range of a group of candidates were used to develop an adequate scoring system for the TAT. In the present project the entire range of a group of candidates is being used to discover if the Sequential Analysis of the TAT can be successfully employed to discriminate among candidates to the teaching Brotherhood who show varying degrees of promise in their vocation.

It is hoped, too, that eventually the findings of this investigation may lend themselves to the screening of candidates to the Brotherhood and also to an evaluation of potential for the religious life in those candidates who need not be excluded from it. In the latter instance, a personality test that would give a novice and, if it be permitted, his superior some measure of the subject's practical attitudes and values would be of great benefit in the work of formation and perhaps help those who seem to start out well in training and then collapse on the way. That there are many such cases may be indicated from the words of William J. Ferree, S.M., in a circular that was distributed to all members of the Society of Mary:

... Even in the American style "postulate" where admission usually represents already a firm commitment to the religious life, a number representing from one-half to two-thirds may drop out before the novitiate... The simple fact is, however, that more candidates leave of their own accord than are advised to drop out so that many real "losses" are to be suspected which are particularly harmful because they come in a highly selected group already subjected to presumably effective formation. It would take a good deal of faith—if not presumption—in our own effectiveness to maintain that many of the voluntary "drop-outs" are not losses which a more intelligent and capable direction could have avoided. Even many of those who are advised to leave may represent failures of adjustment due rather to our ineptness than to any inherent lack of capacity in the candidate.

... Let us simply note in passing that the combined defection of the provinces in the five year period before the last
Chapter amounted to slightly more than the total membership of the three provinces of Switzerland, Austria and Japan. Loss of the equivalent of three provinces in five years... is a disturbing development indeed. It is even more disturbing that these losses have increased since the last Chapter. \(^2\) (Ferree's italics)

By suggesting that the TAT might be employed for an evaluation of a candidate's potential for the religious life and also his progress in training, it must not be inferred that this study is concerned with prediction of religious vocations since various factors beyond the control of the candidate may enter into this problem, as shall be shown later. It is concerned with an evaluation of the candidate's motivational patterns, a factor which is of the utmost importance in considering his suitability to the religious life. So important is this fact that, if it were possible to hold constant such other variables as health, social responsibilities, and intelligence, it is conceivable that the basic motivational pattern revealed through sequential analysis would give a clear index of a candidate's future success in whatever vocation he might choose. In considering motivational patterns for the religious life it would only be necessary to consider the fact that the religious life is a special vocation which requires a better motivation than do most other states of life.

The Measuring Device: The TAT

Before reviewing the literature on Arnold's Sequential Analysis of the TAT in Chapter II, we may briefly discuss the theory behind the test to see why it seems suitable for the purposes of this investigation. In general, as

McCandlish has pointed out in his doctoral dissertation, the validity of this method is based not upon psychological theorizing but has been independently assessed by empirical validation. Nevertheless, since an hypothesis must precede scientific experimentation if the latter is not to be altogether haphazard, it is of some interest and perhaps enlightening to one not familiar with the technique to discuss its theoretical framework and show how it might be used to measure the motivation of religious candidates.

In the administration of this test the subject is shown twenty standard TAT pictures for adult male subjects and instructed to write a short story about the persons and situation depicted in each of the pictures. Thus he will produce twenty stories in all. In this method of analysis there is nothing magical or sacrosanct about the twenty pictures; the experimenter is not concerned, as is so often true in other methods of TAT analysis, with the subject's reactions to the pictures themselves. The relationship between the pictures and the stories is essentially an accidental one since it is the subject himself and not the pictures who produces the stories. If we wish to understand the relationship of a picture to a story, we may think of the picture as the initiating factor, as the starting point for storytelling. The pictures used could just as well be twenty other pictures rather than the standard set, or the subject could be instructed to tell twenty stories without having seen any pictures at all. The pictures merely make it easier for him to start the imaginative process that ultimately results in the stories.

Actually we find a great variety of stories told about the situations depicted in the pictures and sometimes a subject may tell two entirely different stories based upon the same picture. Surely if the pictures themselves were the cause of the stories, if there were a genuine S-R relationship, we would expect a much more uniform series of stories than is found when various sets of stories are compared.

But if we agree that it is the subject who produces the stories, may we then assume that the stories portray actions that are characteristic of their authors? Not necessarily. Some of the stories are autobiographical or biographical, but such is not always the case. When a subject tells a story, he is freed of reality and not bound by truth. The stories often deal with persons or things that have never existed and with situations that are entirely outside the scope of the subject's own life. It is almost a truism to say that subjects frequently tell stories about a character or an incident they have never personally experienced and describe action patterns they would not follow in their own lives. A little boy may tell about an incident involving a nun; a nun may tell of pirates. Furthermore, as Arnold has remarked,

_We cannot even assume that there is an imaginative participation in which the storyteller takes the role of the hero and describes what he would do if he were in the hero's situation. If that were the case, prediction would be simple; the storyteller would do what the hero is doing, given the same circumstances. Everyone who has worked with the TAT knows that nothing is farther from the truth._

---

But though we are dissatisfied with the theory of identification, we are no less dissatisfied with simply knowing that the author of the stories experiences certain emotions, whether they be hate or love, joy or grief, and that he is able to describe them successfully. What the experimenter wants to know is what the subject intends to do when he experiences such emotions, what principle of action he is going to follow in coping with them, what prudential judgment he will make in their regard. And so we must turn to some other method for an explanation of what is happening when a subject produces stories for the TAT if we are to take advantage of their psychological implications.

Stories are the unique product of distinctly human activity; animals never tell stories. But they are also unique when compared to responses given to other kinds of psychological tests. In the Rorschach Test, for example, just as in the TAT, both memory and imagination are employed in producing responses to the inkblots. But in the TAT and other similar tests, e.g., the MAPS Test, there is something more than is to be found in the Rorschach: a story which is the product of man's imagination using all of his powers in a strictly individual way. Unlike the responses to inkblots, a story portrays an action pattern directed to a specific goal and manifests, we believe, a definite underlying attitude on the part of the author, not so much about this particular action-pattern as about the class of action-patterns represented by it. McCandlish describes the relationship of the action pattern to the emotional attitudes of the writer who has created it when he remarks,

This ability to use memory and creative imagination under the direction of the practical intellect to explore "action to be
"brought about" is called by Maritain, "creative intuition." It is not bound by truth or logic; it is the well-spring of fantasy; it is the source and fecundity of man's art; it is the testing ground of his future activities.5

This means that when the storyteller gives his imagination free rein to explore a situation, he frees it of the restrictions imposed by the intellect in search of truth, as, for example, in working out a mathematics problem. His creative imagination portrays "action to be brought about," and this portrayal consists in an exploration of possible future activity "permeated by movements of the appetites towards their own end." This permeation by the appetites is crucial in the testing situation, for a storyteller's desires, drives, emotions, and urges will direct the imaginative activity portrayed in the story in terms of what he feels about such activity.

The stories are practical in nature. They show how a character wants to act in a situation and how his decision to act one way rather than another affects him or his environment. As he describes the effect that the action in the story has, as he describes the prudential nature of a character's decision, the author is himself making a prudential judgment on such action, though unwittingly, and this judgment is reflected in the outcome of the story. It is with these elements, the action pattern and the outcome, that the experimenter must work to discover which principles are accepted and which are rejected by the author himself. As Arnold has said,

...the only possibility left is that the storyteller reviews various possible actions in imagination and that he agrees

5McCandlish, p. 18.
with or approves those that are rewarded in the story or have a favorable outcome and disagrees with or disapproves those actions that are punished or lead to misfortune and difficulties.

The job of the investigator using sequential analysis is to recognize the significant action-pattern portrayed in a story, note the outcome of the action-pattern, and then state the relationship between the two in a succinct statement called the import. An import is formulated by the investigator for each of the prudential judgments or morals implied in the stories. A list of twenty imports constitutes the subject's TAT protocol and is the data from which an analysis of character can be made.

In developing a series of imports for the protocol, however, the investigator does not limit himself to the individual stories. A given story may be sufficiently ambiguous to provide two different imports if it appeared in two different protocols. Also there is the possibility that only one aspect of a complex story is of concern in determining the import of the story for the protocol or it may be that much of a rambling story must be ignored in determining the import. An example of such a story is the following:

(card 2)

The young man and the younger woman in this picture have been married for some time, perhaps three years or more, and are living on a large farm in the Midwest. Unfortunately for them, the man's mother is also living with them. She is a semi-invalid and is the legal owner of the property. She has, however been very generous with her possessions and for all practical purposes has turned the entire farm over to the young couple. All that she gets in return is her board and room. Her presence on the farm is not too annoying and in some respects is a source of companionship for the young wife. However, the fact that the couple has not had any children during the last couple of years has been a source of

---

6Magda B. Arnold, II, 340.
great suffering for all three persons on the farm. The husband wants children badly as does the young wife. The mother doesn't say much, but everyone knows that she is disappointed too. The picture shows the young wife going off to school. This job is a symbol of defeat for the three of them. Certainly if she had had children, she would have stayed home. Eventually, against the advice of the mother, the young couple adopt two children. The fact that the mother was opposed to the adoption is very strange; for, in reference to the other childless couples she has known, she has consistently urged adoptions. But when it came to her own family, she silently disapproved of it. She has never said anything, but her reluctance to welcome warmly the children into the home is an indication of her attitude. Finally, when the children get old enough to notice their grandmother, to follow her around, and make over her, she gives in and accepts them. From then on everything is happy on the farm.

This story, the second in a series of twenty, presents some difficulty to an analyst when it is considered alone. The reason is obvious: it offers two possible imports. One import could deal with human relationships; the other import could stress the frustration experienced in meeting the demands of one's vocation or job. To determine which import is significant in this story (and therefore in the author's mind), the investigator must concern himself not only with the individual story but also the general pattern of imports being produced in the series of stories of which this story is a part. If we consider the first story, the story told before this one, we find that it offers only one import; similarly for the two stories that were told after this one. The respective imports for the first, third, and fourth stories in the test are:

1. When a man is required to do a job for which he has neither talent nor taste, he will fall in the estimation of his superiors when he does not live up to their expectations.

3. If circumstances make it impossible for a man to attain his goal, though it is tantalizingly near, he may put on a brave show but there is despair in his heart.

4. But there are worse things than that: to be unfaithful to one's
vows. Though a man may repent later, he will never recover what he has lost.

When the analyst considers these three imports, it becomes evident that the subject is concerned about his life's work, his vocation, and his ability to meet the expectations that others have for him. It may be then safely assumed that the part of the story dealing with the grandmother's attitude towards the adopted children and the way that she came to accept them is not the crucial import for the author of this story. Much closer to him is the problem faced by the young wife: a person who is not able to do what is expected of her and who must accept a job that is a symbol of defeat. The attitude revealed in the story concerning this problem best fits into the sequence of imports found in the four stories. That this is not just idle speculation on the part of the analyst is born out by the fact that the author of the stories later described in an interview a problem that had arisen in his life which exactly parallels that revealed in the four imports mentioned above.

As might be expected, a person who has a serious problem will concentrate upon it and deal with it throughout the twenty stories, but a man who does not have a serious problem, who is not experiencing serious emotional conflict, may explore quite a few different problems in twenty stories and so his stories are more difficult to analyze and to bring together in a protocol. In any event, when the investigator has worked out the imports of several stories in a series, he will usually be able to determine the import of an ambiguous story (see Chapter IV, p. 65) and, as we have seen, even throw away part of a story if it is not relevant to the sequence of imports being developed in the test.

It is of interest to note that, even when a subject rejects a story after
he has written it and then writes another that apparently is entirely different
as far as he can see, the underlying imports of the two stories are essentially
the same. He cannot escape the direction given his creative imagination by
his emotional state and his self-ideal. For example, one subject wrote the
following story:

(card 18)

John has been a professor at the university for ten years
and has been successful. But his young wife died suddenly
last week and he was heartbroken. He turned to drink and for
the past week he has been living in bars. It is two in the
morning and the tavernkeeper wants to close up for the night,
but John won't move. Finally the bartender grabs him and
shoves him out the door. He stumbles and falls to the street.
There on the edge of the gutter, he begins to see what is
happening to him, how far he has fallen from his rightful
place. He sees that a life spent in bars is not for him.
Half in a daze, he picks himself up and turns towards home,
back to the place where he belongs.

After he had completed the story, he discarded it because, as he explained
later, he felt that the investigator would "get too much out of it." He then
proceeded to write the following story from the same TAT picture and submitted
it as part of his series of stories:

The fellas were in the museum of modern art in a big
metropolitan city in the East. They wandered down the
corridors just looking at different pictures. One that
attracted their attention showed a man being grabbed by
someone from behind; it looked as though the man had three
hands. This puzzled the two young men and only confirmed
their suspicion that modern art was completely foolish and
not worth looking at. The more they saw, the more they
wanted to beat it. So they decided to get to hell out of
there and go over to the mechanics museum where they felt
more at home among the things with which they were familiar
and understood.

Although these two stories seemed quite different to their author and he
thought that the one involving drunkenness and depression was much more revealing, both stories actually result in approximately the same import.
18. If a man finds himself in a milieu that is not proper to him, he must leave it and go to a place where he belongs and that makes sense to him.

And so it is with each series of stories that a man tells; they are the product of his free imagination and the imports can be found in them that express his deepest attitudes, the product of psychological activity beyond his voluntary control.

Once the twenty imports have been uncovered in sequence, the investigator has before him a cross section of prudential or moral judgments made by the author of the stories. The analysis results in a protocol of twenty imports that are like twenty algebraic formulas in which he reveals his moral principles. But the point is that he does not tell just any story about the characters in the scene before him; he tells a story that has a real meaning for him but a meaning of which he is altogether unaware. In some cases, of course, not only the general principles are evident in terms of a kind of formula but also the actual problems. In the latter instance it is as though the experimenter knew not only the formula of the algebraic equation and could see the plus and minus signs, but as though he also knew what the specific mathematical symbols stood for in the subject's life. In reference to this point, Arnold remarks,

The sequential analysis gives us a picture of a man's motivational pattern, his self-ideal in action. Hence it can be used to predict whether he will act constructively or not. The sequence analysis will also show areas of conflict where firm convictions have not as yet been formed. The normal individual will reveal in the sequence analysis how he is ordering his life. In the neurotic, the sequence analysis shows the preoccupation with particular areas of conflict; in the psychotic, the difficulty, even impossibility, of acting effectively. It is a moot point whether a "deeper" analysis will improve prediction. 7

7Ibid., II, 343.
To be able to determine the quality and measure a man's self-ideal in action, to be able to predict as to whether a man will act constructively or not in his practical everyday affairs, to be able to determine whether a man is psychologically normal or abnormal, these are the claims that the originator of this method of TAT sequential analysis has made for it. If these claims are justified, and, as we shall see in the next chapter, it would appear that experimental evidence weighs heavily in that direction, then it is obvious how this particular diagnostic technique lends itself to an assessment of motivational patterns of candidates to the religious Brotherhood, such as the subjects of this study, and how it could possibly be used both for screening of candidates and also for helping those who are striving for an honest self-evaluation as one of the means to growth in spiritual perfection.
CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

In terms of both the subject matter being studied in this investigation and the technique being employed in it, not a great deal of pertinent material has as yet been published. Very little has been reported on the employment of objective psychological screening devices for selecting candidates to the religious life, to the priesthood, or, more specifically in terms of the present investigation, to the religious Brotherhood.

Although the TAT Test ranks second only to the Rorschach in the number of studies that have been reported, one looks in vain throughout more than a thousand TAT studies for an allusion to the screening of candidates to either the religious life or the priesthood. When one turns from the subject matter of this study to the psychological interpretive procedure being employed in it, the Sequential Analysis of the TAT, one is faced with a similar dearth of material. This latter fact can, of course, be attributed to the comparative newness of the technique.

Since it would be impossible to review all of the literature on the TAT and since there have been no studies on the use of sequential analysis for screening candidates to the religious life, the present survey covers four related areas: (a) studies on male candidates to the religious life and on candidates to the priesthood, (b) studies employing the TAT in predicting various vocations, (c) studies employing the Sequential Analysis of the TAT, and (d) the pilot studies done for this investigation.

Studies on Male Candidates to the Religious Life and Priesthood

Perhaps the study most clearly related to the present investigation is
that completed by Brother Robert Godfrey, S.M., in the education department of Marquette University, Milwaukee, in 1955, called a "A Predictive Study of the MMPI with Candidates for the Religious Brotherhood." Brother Godfrey tested thirty candidates studying in the novitiate of the Brothers of Mary in the Midwest and attempted to predict their perseverance over a period of two years through the analysis of the MMPI profiles. In a personal communication to the present writer, he stated that he found "no correlation between scores on the MMPI and perseverance of the Brothers in the novitiate or in the first year of the religious life."

At the present time there are two studies being made on candidates and professed religious in the Brotherhood, but unfortunately results have not as yet been published on either of them. One investigation is being carried on by the Institute St. George, a school of pedagogy conducted by the Christian Brothers under the auspices of the University of Montreal, Montreal, Canada. It is concerned with the correlation between the scores of novices on the Rorschach and their performance later as disciplinarians in the classroom. As can be seen from the very nature of the experiment, it will be some time before results from this investigation will be forthcoming. The other study is being made in Rome by the Christian Brothers in an attempt to determine the suitability of candidates to the order through a study of various personality types.

Le Roy Mauck did a doctoral dissertation at Loyola University, Chicago, in 1956, called, "An Investigation into the Use of Psychological Tests as an Aid in the Selection of Candidates for the Diocesan Priesthood." He employed several psychological tests in his study of seminarians. Among the tests were the MMPI, the Group Rorschach, the Kuder Preference Test, the Allport-Vernon
Scale of Values, and the Ohio State Test. As an outside criterion he used a Faculty Rating Scale devised by Thomas J. McCarthy at the Catholic University of America. He did not find much correlation between the battery of tests and the Faculty Rating Scale nor for any individual tests and the ratings of seminarians by their professors. The multiple coefficient of correlation between the battery of tests and the Faculty Rating Scale as the criterion is .38 with a standard error of estimate of 4.26. Of the individual tests, the Group Rorschach had the highest correlation, .24, with the Faculty Rating Scale. The Ohio Psychological Test, which is a measure of intelligence, correlated .00 with the Faculty Rating Scale.

In 1942 at the Catholic University of America, Thomas J. McCarthy did a study of personality traits of seminarians. In describing the results of his investigation, McCarthy states that he found,

... a "g" factor underlying the ten faculty-rated tests which may be termed a factor for general fitness for the continuance in seminary life. This seems reasonable in view of the fact that a seminarian scoring poorly on this scale would hardly be allowed to remain in the seminary.

McCarthy used four tests in his investigation: the Bernreuter Personality Inventory, the Bell Adjustment Inventory, the Allport-Vernon Scale of Values, the Otis Intelligence Test (with the minor seminarians in his sample), and the American Council Psychological Examination (with the major seminarians in his sample).


2Thomas J. McCarthy, Personality Traits of Seminarians (Catholic University of America, Washington D.C.), 1942, p. 33.
sample). McCarthy found that in the employment of the Bernreuter Personality Inventory three measures showed a slight correlation with the faculty ratings of candidates who showed promise for the priesthood. These three measures were neurotic tendency, introversion, and self-confidence. With the Bell Adjustment Inventory, he found a common factor which seems, he says, to underlie the measure of home, health, social, emotional, and total adjustment. This factor he identified as the schizoid factor, that is, a tendency on the part of promising seminarians to withdrawal as compared to an average sample of young men of comparable age. This factor, although differentiating promising seminarians from the average group, did not produce a very high correlation. McCarthy rightly points out that this so-called schizoid factor is related to the differing social interests of seminarians; they will obviously show less interest in socializing with the opposite sex, in dancing, etc., when compared with young men who have not the celibate life in view.

McCarthy found that the Allport-Vernon Scale of Values did not in general produce any significant correlations with the faculty ratings. However, as might be expected, the subtest on religious interests correlated .37 with promise among the minor seminarians. There was no significant correlation with a subtest on the Allport-Vernon Scale of Values and promise for the priesthood among the major seminarians. McCarthy attributed the difference in this regard between minor seminarians and major seminarians to the fact that by the time a man has entered the major seminary his interests in other fields measured by the Allport-Vernon Scale will have become sufficiently developed so that they balance out the predominant interest in religious values found in minor seminarians. It might also be suggested that the variance in religious interests
is much smaller in the highly homogeneous group of major seminarians and so this particular trait does not serve well the purpose of a correlation study.

McCarthy found that intelligence test scores show a .40 correlation with promise among minor seminarians, but he found no correlation between intelligence scores and promise for the priesthood among major seminarians. It would seem that McCarthy correctly attributed this fact to the difficulty that minor seminarians experience with their studies during the four years that precede their entrance into the major seminary.

During these four years, it would seem that intelligence operates as a selective factor, for usually only those students who are able to master the difficult academic program of the minor seminary are able to persevere. By the time the candidates have passed through the minor seminary and have become major seminarians, the function of intelligence has by and large finished its work as a discriminating factor. As McCarthy says,

... it does not operate any longer in determining promise for the priesthood. To enter and remain in a major seminary a certain amount of intelligence must have been attained. Taking this level for granted, the determination of a man's promise for the priesthood then involves definite character traits and dispositions. 3

In 1947 at the Catholic University of America in his "Personality Traits of Successful Minor Seminarians," Henry R. Burke described an unsuccessful attempt to establish a battery of thirteen tests for the purpose of predicting success in the minor seminary. Burke employed a number of different types of psychological tests including intelligence tests, personality tests, interest

3Ibid., 35.
inventories, adjustment inventories, and values studies. The only significant finding which Burke attained was that the mean IQ of minor seminarians rises from 111.8 (SD: 14.5) for students entering the freshman class of the minor seminary to a mean IQ of 117 (SD: 12) for fourth year students in the minor seminary.

From these statistics Burke infers that an intelligence test could be employed to screen less promising candidates during their freshman year and even before their actual entrance into the minor seminary, and thus the administration could avoid the undesirable loss of time and manpower expended upon students who drop out in the minor seminary. He points out, however, that it is difficult to set a minimum IQ that is useful.

... probably largely because the different academic standards and policies of the four participating institutions allow some dull students to remain even into third year high school.

Actually, however, there seems to be another reason for considering this particular screening device undesirable. In view of the large standard deviation in both measurements of intelligence in the freshman year and the senior year, it would seem that one could not eliminate very many seminarians on the basis of intelligence scores without risking the dismissal of several potentially successful candidates for the priesthood. It is very probable that more than intellectual capacity is being measured by the IQ of freshmen in the minor seminary and that such factors as academic achievement, reading ability, and general motivation in some of the grammar school grades also play a part in the

---


5Ibid., 35.
the intelligence scores of these students. The motivational factor deserves special consideration in view of Garvin's recent experiment in motivation and the TAT which shall be discussed later in the chapter (p. 29).

In a study begun in 1948 and still in progress, William C. Bier employs the MMPI to discover to what extent personality measures already developed for the MMPI can be used on seminarians. As the point of departure in his study, Bier has compared the scores of seminarians with those of college and professional students in other fields of study rather than with the normal sample upon which the original percentiles for the MMPI profiles were based. He has devised a modified version of the MMPI which eliminates "MMPI items which presumably did not apply to seminarians in their way of life." He reports that seminarians' scores on the whole show a tendency to rise about half a standard deviation on most MMPI scales and that seminarians, compared to college students and other professional students, are "the most deviant of an already deviant group." The deviation in seminarians' scores is, of course, no more surprising than the "schizoid factor" that McCarthy reported in his study of seminarians. It is to be expected that some of the questions, particularly those having to do with social life, will be answered differently by seminarians than by college students or young men in various other professions. This datum is similar to that found when scores for the normal sample upon which the original MMPI percentiles were based are compared to scores

6William C. Bier, A Comparative Study of a Seminary Group and Four Other Groups on the Minnesota Multiphasic Personality Inventory (The Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C.), 1948, p. 92.

7Ibid., 91.
achieved by college students on the MMPI; in this instance, "college means are consistently above 50 on some of the scales; in one study of 600 college students, 39 per cent received scores above 70 on one or more scales. 8

Recently Bier reported that he has completed his work of developing special norms for seminarians after having eliminated some of the questions generally used with the MMPI and that he hopes to develop norms that will be suitable for candidates to the religious Sisterhood. These new norms for seminarians are presently in the hands of the publishers and should be soon available for general use. However, Bier has not reported, as far as the present investigator knows, any attempt to predict perseverance with his modified test nor has he correlated his results with an outside criterion, such as the Faculty Rating Scale employed by Burke and McCarthy. Presently Bier's work is concerned with the problem of the difference between MMPI scores of seminarians as compared to those of the normal population. Such an investigation may well produce rather interesting results, but until the new norms are used for comparison with an outside criterion it does not have any immediate bearing on the present study.

Studies Employing the TAT in Various Vocations

Among the reports published on the TAT, there is only one clearly predictive study using it for the prediction of success in a specific vocation or occupation. This study is the very elaborate research project devised by E. Lowell Kelly and Donald W. Fiske at the University of Michigan and reported by them in 1951. The TAT, along with nine other personality tests, was

administered to seventy-five undergraduate students over a period of five years for the purpose of predicting success in clinical psychology.

. . . The Thematic Apperception Test and the Sentence Completion Test were administered as group measures. Various members of the staff analyzed them. No staff member analyzed more than one projective test for any one subject. In addition to the quantitative interpretation, the projective analyst made ratings on the basis of each projective protocol plus a few items of basic identifying data, e.g., age, education, religion, etc. Thus the four complete sets of ratings were available, each based solely on one of the four projective techniques.

For half the students in each class, the person who had interpreted the Rorschach Test subsequently studied all four projective tests and interpretations for the purpose of integrating their several findings. The "Projective Integrator" wrote up the synthesis and made another set of ratings. 9

Kelly and Fiske reported that their methods of TAT analysis did not prove to be successful in predicting academic success among the students, for they obtained a correlation of only .06 with academic performance and the ratings from the TAT. Their highest correlation of any single year was .24 with the TAT and the evaluations of diagnostic competence. 10

The difficulty in evaluating this study is that there is no clear description of the method or methods of TAT analysis employed by the psychologists. We are told simply that, "In our assessment programs, individual staff members were urged to use such personality theory or theories as they found most acceptable and were permitted to formulate the dynamics of their cases

9E. Lowell Kelly and Donald W. Fiske, The Prediction of Performance in Clinical Psychology (University of Michigan, Ann Arbor), 1951, p. 47. Italics not in the original.

10Ibid., 169.
in any manner they wished."\textsuperscript{11} It is difficult to accept without reservation the conclusions of Kelly and Fiske. What their report actually shows is that the set of scores derived from the various methods of TAT interpretation employed in their study cannot be used for the prediction of vocational success. Similarly the author's negative conclusions about the TAT hold good only for their methodology, involving evidently intuitive methods of interpretation which probably differ from interpreter to interpreter. It is a highly questionable procedure to combine various TAT scores from different examiners using different methods and then to conclude from negative results that the TAT is useless for prediction. It should also be remembered that, after all of the different tests of the battery had been rated by various psychologists, the entire battery of each individual student was re-evaluated and the results of the different tests in the battery were weighted by the "Projective Integrator" to produce a quantitative score of a student's promise as a clinical psychologist; it is easy to see how it might have happened that in this final analysis a psychologist who had little experience with the TAT would be called upon to evaluate the results of the TAT. Obviously such an arrangement is not a satisfactory one.

Studies Employing the Sequential Analysis of the TAT

The Sequential Analysis of the TAT to be employed in this study is a revision of a technique by Magda B. Arnold that was first described by her in

\textsuperscript{11}Ibid., 3.
the *Journal of Abnormal and Social Psychology* in 1949.\textsuperscript{12} This same technique was also discussed by her in Edwin S. Shneidman's *Thematic Test Analysis*.\textsuperscript{13}

Since the publication of these two articles, Arnold has revised her method and, as we have already indicated, she has placed the burden of emphasis upon the sequence of imports to be found in the stories. In her recent work, *Emotion and Personality*, she says,

\dots In the TAT sequence analysis, each story is summed up in the import, i.e., what the storyteller is saying about his life situation. This is a simple condensation of the moral of the story, without interpretation. Each import, as indicated by the story outcome, may be either constructive or not constructive. It is constructive when the story import indicates that achievement is the result of effort, initiative, virtue, or the outcome of a definite plan which accepts limitations and adapts to circumstances; when loss, harm or danger is overcome by positive action; when ill-intentioned action is punished, rejected or renounced; when others are met with good will, good fellowship or humor.\textsuperscript{14}

A brief description of the theory underlying this method of TAT analysis has already been given in Chapter I. A detailed account of the rationale and procedure employed in this method can be found in Chapters III and IV of Leo Alex. McCandlish's doctoral dissertation, done in 1958.\textsuperscript{15}

In *The Human Person*, Louis Snider described in the chapter, "A Research Method Validating Self-Determination," how he successfully distinguished between low and high academic achievers through the use of Arnold's earlier

\begin{quote}

\textsuperscript{13}Edwin S. Shneidman et al., *Thematic Test Analysis* (New York, 1951).

\textsuperscript{14}Arnold, II, 342.

\textsuperscript{15}McCandlish, pp. 14-37.
\end{quote}
version of sequential analysis.\textsuperscript{16} The difference in motivational patterns found in the analysis of the material distinguished the two groups beyond the five per cent level of confidence as a criterion of significance. A follow-up study which confirmed the findings of Snider was done by J. E. Brown at St. Louis University, St. Louis, Missouri. Unlike the present study, Snider's investigation did not attempt to use a scoring system based upon an empiric study of stories which are characteristic of positive or negative attitudes as revealed in the TAT.

Combining the data collected by Snider and Brown, Leo McCandlish, in his doctoral dissertation cited above, reported the development of a scoring system that definitely distinguished between the high and the low achievers among a group of male high school students as revealed by their grade point averages. Using an analysis of variance, he got an $F=40.38$, which is significant at the .01 level of confidence.\textsuperscript{17} Furthermore, he was able to predict blindly thirty-nine of the forty cases of high and low achievers on the basis of a scoring system derived from the TAT Sequential Analysis which gave a Chi Square of 36.11, significant at the .01 level of confidence and beyond it.

A related study was done by Sister Mary Innocentia Burkard in her doctoral dissertation at Loyola University, Chicago, in 1958. She reports a very successful system of scoring and prediction in distinguishing the extremes in a group of excellent and poor teachers as rated by pupils on the basis of


\textsuperscript{17} McCandlish, p. 58.
Sister M. Amatora's rating scale. When the TAT analysis of each test was scored according to a standard that had been empirically set up, it was possible to discriminate perfectly between the high and low groups of teachers. Differences between the two groups were found by the Sign Test to be significant far beyond the .01 level of confidence. Scorer reliability on the TAT was also shown to be extremely high with the lowest reliability being 94.3%.19

F.B. Petrauskas employed the Sequential Analysis of the TAT to score thirty matched pairs of men in the United States Navy. The pairs consisted of a man who possessed a delinquent history before enlistment and who was at the time of testing confined in the naval brig for repeated delinquency (usually AWOL) and of a man who had never been punished for delinquency before enlistment and who was never subjected to disciplinary action while in the service.20 The stories were scored on the basis of an empiric scoring criterion developed for the two groups, and each story was scored as positive (constructive) or negative (nonconstructive) and placed in one of five attitude categories. The hypothesis which stated that the individuals who were considered offenders by the Navy would give more negative and less positive attitudes in their stories than the non-offenders was confirmed at the .00003 level of confidence.21


19Ibid., 64.


21Ibid., 36.
Joseph A. Garvin in his doctoral dissertation at Loyola University, Chicago, 1960, attempted for the first time "to extend the technique of the TAT sequential analysis to a broad sample of college students, and to predict the most probable Grade Point Average of every member of the sample. This constitutes a notable departure from all the previous studies using this method, in which only the extremes of each group were studied."22 It was Garvin's purpose to assess achievement motivation among college students by means of the TAT and to predict academic achievement in terms of motivation and intelligence. He found a high positive correlation between grade point averages and scores on the TAT. The correlation between TAT scores and grade point averages of a group of male college students was .85; the correlation of similar ratings for female students was .832.23 On the other hand, he found that correlations between grade point averages and IQ's for these two groups were .626 and .498 respectively. Thus he showed that "the TAT is a more precise and sensitive indicator of a student's actual academic accomplishments than is his intellectual ability when measured by ACE examinations."24 Garvin also worked out a set of multiple regression equations, expressed in graph form, which enable one to predict the probable grade point average for a given student in terms of his IQ as measured by the ACE and his score on the TAT determined through the use of Arnold's method of sequential analysis.25

23Ibid., 40.
24Ibid., 56.
25Ibid., 50-51.
Pilot Studies for This Investigation

The present investigator completed a pilot study in preparation for this dissertation in 1959; it was called "A Discriminative Scoring System for the TAT: an Investigation."\textsuperscript{26} It reveals a successful attempt to develop a scoring system to be used with sequential analysis in a study of the motivational patterns of Junior Novices (high school students in a religious house of formation) who are studying in preparation for entrance into the religious Brotherhood. Only the extremes of the sample were actually used for this study since it is with the extremes (the very promising subjects and the least promising) that a scoring system can best be developed.

The scoring system was an improvement on those used in the past since it employed scores from 1 to 4 which could be applied to each of the imports in a protocol. Up until the development of this scoring system, all of the scoring in various studies had been done in terms of a simple plus-minus score for each import depending upon whether the import was positively or negatively toned. Garvin, in the research project cited above, employed this new type of scoring and for the first time reported its use with the full range of a sample rather than with just the extremes as was done in the pilot study for this dissertation.

Since the pilot study was done on Junior Novices and it is upon the evidence found in their stories that the scoring system was developed, it seemed advisable to make another preliminary study to determine whether any changes had to be made in the scoring system before it could be used on the present

\textsuperscript{26}Quinn, pp. 39-44.
subjects, i.e., Student Brothers who are attending college.

It was decided, therefore, that a brief study be made of the TAT stories and scores resulting from a testing of ten of the most promising and ten of the least promising Student Brothers who are now attending the college operated by the Christian Brothers in Philadelphia. Since the Brothers in Philadelphia who are of college age live under an identical Rule and follow a similar schedule, it would seem that this preliminary check on the TAT scoring, done on the stories of the Philadelphia Brothers, would serve to indicate any adjustments that need to be made in the scoring system derived from the tests of the Junior Novices.

The procedure employed in this pilot study done in Philadelphia, as well as the results from it which antedate the testing of the California Brothers, will be incorporated in succeeding chapters of this dissertation.

Summary of the Review of the Literature

Perhaps at this point in concluding the survey of the literature relative to the present study, it would be well to summarize the findings. In general it may be said that very little has been accomplished in the way of screening candidates for the religious life or of seminarians aspiring to the priesthood. With the exception of the pilot study on Junior Novices done for this investigation, none of the studies has shown that psychological tests of various kinds can be successfully employed for this purpose; and, as yet, no full scale study has been done with the TAT along this line.

Arnold's technique of sequential analysis has proven quite successful in discriminating between high and low academic achievers, between efficient and
inefficient teachers, and between men who have had delinquent records and those whose naval records show no history of delinquency during or before their years of service in the Navy. The relationship between IQ and motivation of college students to the kind of grade point averages that they earn has also been established through sequential analysis. Furthermore, it has been shown that it is also possible to establish a scoring system using a scoring criterion based upon an empiric study of TAT stories of subjects rated at the extremes in the samples of which they are a part and that this scoring system, developed numerically from the original plus-minus method to a scoring from 1 to 4, lends itself to sharper discrimination between rather homogeneous subjects and also to more refined mathematical calculation.

The pilot study with Junior Novices has already indicated that this method of analysis and scoring of the TAT is effective in discriminating candidates at the extremes of the range of promise for the Brotherhood, and therefore it is now being further tested in this investigation to see how successfully it can be used in dealing with the entire range of a group of candidates to the religious life.
CHAPTER III
DESIGN OF THE RESEARCH

The Sample

The sample of the population employed in this investigation consists of forty-five subjects who were at the time of testing Student Brothers in the Scholasticate of the Christian Brothers in California. The Christian Brothers are a lay order of male religious devoted exclusively to the profession of teaching boys and young men. They do not aspire to the priesthood. They live in a canonically constituted religious house, make five religious vows, and follow a Rule of life under the direction of a religious superior.

A Student Brother in this order is a young man who has already earned his high school diploma either in the Junior Novitiate, the preparatory school for aspirants to the Order who are of high school age, or in an ordinary high school. He has also completed the fifteen to eighteen months training in the Senior Novitiate. In the novitiate he had an opportunity to learn about the fundamental principles of the spiritual life, an opportunity to study the special characteristics of the spirit of the Christian Brothers and, no less important, an opportunity to reflect and pray in solitude about them.

At the end of the novitiate training, he was voted into the Order, was permitted to pronounce his first religious vows, and became a bona fide member. Since his vows are temporary during his entire sojourn in the Scholasticate, he is free to leave the Order at the time of their expiration. On the other hand, the Order is free to dismiss him at that time should the superiors feel that he is not suited to the religious life. The only exception to such
an action on the part of any order is that a candidate who has already taken
his first vows may not be dismissed for reasons of health, provided that he
did not conceal his condition at the time that he applied for vows.

All of the subjects of this investigation at the time of testing had
either annual vows or triennial vows, i.e., vows that expire at the end of a
year or at the end of three years.

Life in the Scholasticate consists largely of the same religious exer-
cises followed by members of the Order who have already completed their per-
iod of training and are engaged in teaching full time. Much of a Student
Brother's time is spent either in attending college classes or in a study hall
working for his college degree. Usually a Student Brother spends three and a
half years in the Scholasticate. Even during the summer he attends school for
six weeks. If he is working for a degree in science, he is granted an extra
six months to complete the necessary courses. Upon receiving his bachelor's
degree, a Student Brother is assigned to one of the schools for boys adminis-
tered by the Christian Brothers for a period of practice teaching under close
supervision, and still later he is appointed a member of the faculty in one of
their high schools.

Since all of the subjects of this investigation have pursued a similar
period of training, and since they all entered the novitiate at approximately
the same age, the difference in their ages is slight. All of the subjects
were at least eighteen years of age, and none was more than twenty-three.
Starting with an average age of nineteen for the freshmen, the average age in-
creased one year for each of the other three groups—the sophomores, juniors,
and seniors. In the sample there were thirteen freshmen and thirteen sopho-
omores, eleven juniors, and eight seniors.
Group Administration of the TAT

All of the subjects were tested at the same time in a large classroom of the college. Lindzey and Heinemann found that the differences between scores and analyses resulting from individual and group administration of the TAT are slight when various methods of interpretation are used. Similarly, previous studies have shown that results from group administration and individual administration of the TAT for this type of analysis are very similar and so it was decided to administer the test to the entire group rather than to each individual separately (see McCandlish, 1958, who used individual TAT administration and Garvin, 1960, who used group testing).

As the method of TAT Sequential Analysis used is concerned only with the import of the story as it is expressed in the sequence, it is to the advantage of the investigator to have the stories written down by the testee rather than to have them dictated by him to the tester. When a young man tells a story orally, he may ramble on and embellish the plot until it can hardly be disentangled. A similar circumstance develops when the subject is permitted to dictate his stories on a tape recorder. Methods of interpretation that use themes rather than the story import and place emphasis upon side remarks or gestures may find the various additions and embellishments that can be obtained from individual administration of genuine value, but for sequential analysis they are altogether irrelevant and only create a difficulty for the interpreter. Hence there is no objection to group administration and it

---

should present no difficulty to the tester; in fact, it is an advantage to him, provided that the necessity for a plot with a beginning, a middle, and an end is emphasized.

In previous studies employing group administration of the TAT, the twenty pictures were projected from slides onto a motion picture screen, one at a time. Although this form of presentation was adequate, it was somewhat annoying to those subjects who composed a story quickly and then had to wait until the slower subjects finished theirs. In order to overcome this difficulty and insure cooperation from everyone who was taking the test, it was decided that each subject would be given a set of the twenty pictures placed in a plastic folder. The arrangement in the folder enabled each subject to look at one picture at a time, write a story, and then turn to the next picture; since he could see only one picture at a time there was little danger that the other pictures in the set would interfere with his work on any one picture. By microfilming and printing the pictures it was possible to provide enough sets of pictures so that the entire sample could be tested in two groups of approximately twenty-two subjects each. For the sixteenth story which is written from a "blank picture" there was a note instructing the subject to tell any story that might occur to him. The test was administered to the group at one time without recess or interruption.

The following instructions were given to each group before they were permitted to write their first story:

This is a test in imagination or personality. In the folder which you have there are twenty pictures. Look at the first picture and then write as dramatic a story as you can about it. When you have finished the first story, turn to the second picture and write another story, and so on until you have written twenty stories.
Tell what has led up to the event shown in each picture, describe what is happening at the moment, what the characters are feeling and thinking and then give the outcome. You should devote about five minutes to each story. Do not worry about grammar, spelling, or punctuation, since this test is concerned with the story that you imagine and not with the mechanics of how you tell it. The story need not be too long; a story that is about five or ten sentences will be just fine.

What we are interested in here is a dramatic story. Be sure to avoid writing just a description of the scene that is shown in the picture, and do not give instructions on how things can be done nor explanations about how something works. Tell a story with a plot, that is, a story with characters who are having some kind of experience or are faced with some kind of problem. Check each story to make sure that you tell what happened to the characters in the past, what they are doing now, and how things will turn out for them in the future.

Be sure that you write a story and not a piece of conversation between two or more people. Conversation is all right, but it should be included in the story rather than be the whole story itself. If you have any doubts about how to proceed or whether or not your story is satisfactory, do not hesitate to bring it up to me so that we can check it together. Number your stories as you go along and tell them in the order of the pictures in the folder.

You need not worry about the results of the test since the method of administration makes it impossible for anyone to identify you as the author of any of your stories.

The reason for giving these rather detailed instructions to the subjects and thus departing from the usual formula suggested by Murray is that it is sometimes difficult to get young people to write stories that are suitable for interpretation by sequential analysis. An interpreter who is looking for themes in a story does not have to concern himself so much with plot construction, but for sequential analysis the plot of the story must be clear to the interpreter and it is absolutely essential that its outcome be clearly indicated. When a subject limits himself to a record of dialog between characters, it is often extremely difficult to follow the trend of the conversation and to determine the outcome intended by the writer. Difficulty of this type was found in the stories written by the Brothers in Philadelphia where no mention was made
to them of the necessity of avoiding stories consisting of straight dialog. It is for this reason that with the California Brothers great stress was laid on the necessity of a clear plot involving a beginning, a middle, and an end. Actually, even a few of the California Brothers failed at times to follow directions and told stories composed entirely of dialog, but for the most part their stories consisted of more than just dialog and so they were easier to analyze. Since, however, people sometimes do tell stories exclusively in dialog in spite of whatever directions may be given them, it is important that an interpreter learn to handle such stories and know how to interpret their imports. In the latter instance, it may be necessary to interview the author of such stories to clear up ambiguities or meanings that would have been less obscure if the story had been told as a straight narrative.

While the stories were being written, the examiner moved about the group and answered any questions that arose concerning the stories. Since they were not numerous, there was little danger that the anonymity of the subjects was violated by this procedure. He encouraged the subjects to write legibly and to write on only one side of the paper. Silence was observed throughout the testing situation, and the subjects were so seated that they did not communicate with each other nor did they have an opportunity to look at one another's stories. Altogether, a testing session took slightly more than two hours for each group, but some subjects were able to complete twenty stories in little more than an hour.

It will be recalled that the use of TAT pictures in individual folders made it possible for each subject to determine his own pace. As soon as a subject had finished the twentieth story, he was free to leave the room and
pursue some private interest. This arrangement may account for the fact that in many cases the stories told for the last five pictures were somewhat shorter than those told for the first pictures. By the time a man has written fifteen stories, he may become fatigued and anxious to be through with the test and so he tends to write shorter stories. But, as has already been pointed out, for sequential analysis the length of a story is not important so long as it clearly has a beginning, a middle, and an end.

Control for Intelligence

There was no attempt made in this investigation to control for intelligence since it has been found in past studies with Sequential Analysis of the TAT where intelligence was controlled that it is not an important factor in the test results. Burkard, McCandlish, and Snider found that there was the same range of test scores for good and poor achievers whether they had high or low intelligence. Since the earned TAT scores for highly intelligent students were not significantly higher than the scores for students of low intelligence, it was decided in the design of the pilot study for the present investigation that intelligence need not be controlled. Results of the pilot study show that this decision was justified, for a sharp distinction between very promising candidates and candidates who showed little promise for the Brotherhood was achieved in spite of the fact that the factor of intelligence did not discriminate between men of high and low promise.²

The present investigation differs on this point from a study such as that

²Quinn, p. 31.
done by Garvin, where, as he points out, "in using the method to predict college achievement, the intelligence of each student must be taken into account, because a certain minimum level of intelligence is required for success in college work. But beyond this level, the student's motivation seems to determine how well he will do."³ In the present study where promise of success of candidates to the religious Brotherhood is being considered, the intelligence factor does not have the bearing on the problem that it would have in a study such as Garvin's. Certainly it is recognized that a candidate who has an average or better than average IQ is intelligent enough to succeed in the religious life. Such a life offers opportunities to candidates who vary considerably in intelligence. In the sample for the present investigation, the mean IQ as measured by the ACE intelligence test was 118.28 for the group with a standard deviation of 11.03, a measure well above that which may reasonably be demanded of candidates to the Brotherhood. The relative uniformity of the group in regard to intelligence was additional evidence for believing that this factor need not be controlled in the experiment.

**Maintaining Anonymity**

In the particular situation in which the present investigation was conducted there was a difficulty created by the protection which Canon Law provides for religious against an invasion of conscience. This difficulty was, however, obviated by the design of the experiment. The Provincial of the Brothers (who is the highest ranking superior in the Province) insisted that either the entire project be designed so that the subjects involved remained

³Garvin, p. 36.
anonymous or that the present investigator explain in considerable detail to them before administering the test the possible kinds of information, clues, etc., that can be gotten from an analysis of the TAT. He also insisted that any Brother was free to refuse to take the test if anonymity was not maintained.

It is the conviction of the present writer that the Brothers would have felt threatened and in some cases would have resisted any attempt to get them to participate in the experiment if a description detailing possible findings from a TAT test had been given them. On the other hand, by maintaining anonymity, the Provincial felt that he could insist that every Brother attending college be required to take the test and that it would not be a source of disturbance for him. Since the present investigator was vaguely acquainted with some of the subjects who took part in this study, at least to the extent of knowing them by name, an anonymous group administration had advantages in the design of the experiment.

It should be noted that this stress on anonymity was not a part of the original pilot study in which a scoring system was developed for this dissertation. But though each test in the original pilot study was identified by the name of its author, the investigator did not know most of them and had had no contact with any of them for at least three years before testing them with the TAT. In effect, therefore, it is probable that the subjects who participated in the pilot study felt that for all practical purposes they enjoyed anonymity. This feeling was supported by the fact that they were assured by the investigator that the results of the test would not be made known to their superiors or to anyone who might be acquainted with them. Furthermore, they had little reason to be concerned about the results of the test since during
the administration of it the tester emphasized the fact that the test was a test in imagination, rather than the fact that data from it could be used for personality evaluation.

Yet this difference between the design of the pilot study and the present investigation does exist and was impossible to avoid owing to the restrictions of the Brother Provincial. However, the scoring system from the original pilot study was checked, as has already been indicated, by a second pilot study of a group of Student Brothers from Philadelphia in which anonymity was maintained.

It may be objected that the outcome of an experiment in which anonymity is a factor may not be used to predict the success of a candidate to the religious life who is given a TAT as a part of a battery of tests before being admitted to the novitiate because the candidate is not anonymous in this situation. This objection is not pertinent, however, to the design of the present investigation although it does deserve consideration should the TAT be employed in screening candidates later on. As has already been mentioned, it is not the immediate purpose of this investigation to predict success in the religious life. This study attempts merely to discover to what extent the TAT agrees with the rankings of the subjects by their peers and by their religious superiors.

The method of maintaining the complete anonymity of all the Brothers can be illustrated by an example. After a Brother had written his stories, he was given a stack of forty-nine cards that were perforated horizontally through the middle. Below the perforated line on each card there was a space indicated in which the subject could write his name; above the perforated line in the
left hand corner of the card there was an identifying number printed on each card which was concealed by a removable plastic disc. Thus one Brother received a set of forty-nine cards with #17 printed in the upper left hand corner of each card. This number was, of course, neither visible to him nor to the investigator. Since each Brother actually drew his set of cards from a box containing all the sets, there was no way in which either the investigator or the individual Brother could know which number he had drawn on his set of cards.

Each Brother was instructed, after he had drawn his set of cards, to attach one of the cards to his set of TAT stories, to put one card in his pocket, and then to write his name on each of the other forty-seven cards. When he had done this, he gave the investigator his set of TAT stories and threw the forty-seven cards on which he had written his name into a box containing the cards from all the other subjects.

Once the investigator had received all of the TAT stories, he removed the seal from the card attached to each set of stories and wrote the concealed number on the corresponding set of stories. In this way each set of stories was marked with the author's identifying number.

**Ranking by Peers**

Then the investigator took all of the cards that had been thrown into the box by the subjects and which had a subject's name written on each of them and rearranged them into forty-seven piles of forty-five cards each. Each pile contained a card bearing the name of a different Brother who had taken the test.
A few days later the forty-five subjects of the investigation were again assembled, this time in a large study hall. Each subject was given a set of forty-five cards, each bearing the name of a different Brother. He was then instructed as follows:

What we would now like to have you do is to go through the forty-five names, including your own, and to evaluate the promise that each Brother named on the cards shows for future success as a Christian Brother.

You should not spend too much time thinking about any one Brother but rather think of the evaluation that comes to you spontaneously about him. In making your evaluation, try not to be influenced unduly by charm, popularity, wit, or intelligence. Ask yourself if the Brother named on the card has character, and if you think that he is a promising candidate for the religious life. 

(a pause of two or three minutes).

Now that you have looked over the names of all the Brothers, imagine a situation in which the Order would be compelled to send home all of the candidates except nine. Pick out the nine candidates that you think the Order should keep and then place their names in a pile on your desk. Mark each card in this pile with a 5 in the upper right hand corner to indicate that it belongs to the best group. Try to be fair in judging each Brother and do not be unduly humble in trying to judge your own worth. 

(a pause for three or four minutes).

Now let us reverse the situation. Imagine that the Order has to send home nine candidates out of those whose cards remain on your desk. Pick out the nine candidates that you think should be sent home first and put them into a pile. Mark each card in this pile with the number 1 in the upper right hand corner of the card.

This procedure was repeated with the remaining twenty-seven cards, first by selection of the nine best of the twenty-seven and writing a 4 on them and then by selection of the nine worst of the twenty-seven and writing a 2 on them. There then remained only nine cards, the middle group, and each judge wrote a 3 on these cards. In this way the investigator had each subject ranked by all of the subjects who had taken the TAT, including himself, into one of five different groups from the most promising of candidates for the Brotherhood (rank of 5) to the least promising group of candidates (rank of 1).
After the judges had ranked their peers, they were instructed to tear off
the names that were written below the perforated line on the cards so that only
the concealed identifying number and the ranking of a judge remained above the
perforated line. Then each judge bound his stack of cards consisting of the
five piles with a rubber band and attached to them the one card which, it will
be remembered, he had placed in his pocket a few days previously. This card
bore no name, but it did have on it the concealed number that identified the
judge as the author of a specific set of TAT stories. It was thus possible to
identify the judges as TAT subjects without knowing their true identities. It
is also evident that each Brother was ranked by forty-five different judges,
al of whom are his peers.

Ranking by High TAT Subjects

It seems of some interest to know not only how the subjects of this inves-
tigation were ranked by their peers and how these rankings compare with the
rankings obtained from the TAT, but also to know how those men who score high
on the TAT rank their peers as compared to the peer group as a whole, the TAT,
and the religious superiors. Since the theory underlying the Sequential Anal-
ysis of the TAT implies that those subjects who get high scores on the TAT have
good prudential judgment, it would seem that the ranking done by this select
group should be more accurate than that done by the peer group.

Ranking by Superiors

There are two Brothers who are the superiors of all the Brothers who were
subjects in this investigation. These two Brothers live together with the sub-
jects and direct their activities when the latter are not in class. The two
superiors were each given a stack of cards bearing the names of the various subjects in this experiment, and they were asked to rank the subjects according to promise for the Brotherhood. They received exactly the same instructions as did the peer group for executing this procedure.

The Scoring System

In the previous chapter (pp. 30-31) mention was made of a pilot study conducted in Philadelphia to check the scoring system that had been developed with the TAT stories written by Junior Novices. Since the Philadelphia pilot study has not as yet been reported, it is actually a part of the general design of the present investigation and should be included in a description of it.

There were available for testing in Philadelphia 109 Student Brothers, all of whom correspond closely in age and IQ to the sample of Brothers being used in this investigation. Rather than employ the complicated method of ranking used with the forty-five subjects in California, the present investigator asked the superior of the Philadelphia Brothers to select ten of the most promising and ten of the least promising Brothers from the entire group of Brothers under his direction.

The religious superior had been in close contact with each of the subjects in Philadelphia and was therefore in a good position to pass judgment upon their promise as religious. He had lived with each of them for a year and had lived with some of them for over four years. Every two weeks he had interviewed them so that they might have an opportunity to discuss their problems with him and get advice from him regarding their school work and progress in religious formation.

He was not asked to predict the perseverance of his subjects, but he was
asked to judge the promise of each subject as a potential Christian Brother. Although it is likely that perhaps another superior would choose some different men as best and poorest, it is probable that superiors who know their subjects well would not disagree much in their choices and that any superior would have little difficulty in selecting ten very promising candidates and ten very unpromising candidates out of a possible 109 choices. Such a criterion is quite adequate for the purposes of this investigation to check the scoring system developed in the original pilot study. In every instance where a scoring system has been developed for Arnold's Sequential Analysis of the TAT, it has been found that ten high subjects and ten low subjects provide a sufficient- ly adequate cross section of imports to formulate a scoring system. In the case of Garvin's investigation which reported a high correlation between TAT scores and grade point averages, only six high subjects and six low subjects were used to verify the scoring system.⁴

The method of administering the TAT was exactly the same in Philadelphia as that used for the forty-five subjects in California except for the one change that has already been mentioned, i.e., that the Brothers in California were told not to write stories that consisted of dialog only since such stories are more difficult to analyze than are stories that are primarily direct narratives with or without dialog included in them. Just as in California, the subject’s identity in Philadelphia was unknown to the investigator.

After the Philadelphia subjects had written their stories, the stories were analyzed by the present investigator and a comparison of the imports found

⁴Garvin, p. 34.
in them with the imports of the stories of the pilot group was made. As has already been mentioned, discussion of the results of this comparison will be described in the next chapter (pp. 60-74).

Scoring the TAT

The scoring system developed in the original pilot study and checked by the Philadelphia pilot study was used for all the TAT's (pp. 109-113). The scoring was done by one judge, the present investigator, who had also derived the imports from the TAT stories. In earlier studies employing Arnold's TAT Sequential Analysis, such as those done by Snider, McCandlish, Burkard, and Petrauskas, three judges were employed to judge the imports. The same arrangement was used in the pilot study for this investigation. However, in all of these studies a very high correlation was found among the judges' scores and so it was decided in the design of Garvin's experiment to eliminate this procedure since it seemed unnecessary and was time consuming. Following Garvin's design, only one judge was used in the present investigation. In order to make sure that the experiment was completely free of criterion contamination, the rankings done by the peer group and the superiors were not examined until all of the TAT's had been analyzed for their imports and the imports had been scored. It should be noted that protocols were checked by an experienced and competent authority on Arnold's Sequential Analysis of the TAT in an attempt to eliminate any possible errors in analysis.

A score of 4 was given to those imports commonly found in the tests of the most promising candidates and never, or practically never, found in the tests of the least promising candidates. In a similar manner, the imports that were found in the least promising candidates' tests but hardly ever found in the
tests of the most promising candidates were given a score of 1. Scores of 3 or 2 were given to those imports which were more common to the high ranking or the low ranking subjects, as the case may be, or which seemed more closely related to the meanings of the imports rated as 4 or 1. Whenever there was doubt as to whether an import should be scored as high or low, the investigator tipped the scoring in favor of the general trend of imports in the protocol. Since this method of analysis hypothesizes a sequential relationship between imports of succeeding stories based upon the emotional attitudes of the subject, this procedure is consistent with the underlying theory of the test. In any event, it is evident that the basis for scoring the imports was not subjectively determined by the investigator but was based upon an outside criterion, i.e., the scoring system built upon the extremes of a group of candidates to the religious Brotherhood whose TAT protocols were carefully analyzed. When all twenty imports in a protocol of a California Brother had been scored, the average of his individual import scores was determined and this result became the score of the subject on his TAT.

As might be expected, the pilot study done in Philadelphia as well as the full scale study done on the Brothers in California brought to light various nuances of scoring that had not been reported in earlier investigations and also suggested possible avenues of research that as yet remain to be explored. The nature of these findings will be discussed in the next chapter which deals with the results of this investigation.
CHAPTER IV
RESULTS OF THE INVESTIGATION

It has already been pointed out that there is no attempt being made in this investigation to predict the eventual success or failure of anyone in the religious life. But this fact should be stressed once again before the results of the investigation are discussed. Sometimes circumstances or variables unrelated to a subject's motivational pattern do determine the course of his vocation which a prediction of perseverance by means of the TAT alone would not include. Especially is this a possibility for young candidates such as the subjects employed in this study.

For example, it can happen that a candidate leaves the religious life because he must provide for his parents who are in need of financial support or who require his presence at home to care for their physical well-being. The fact that the Church insists that candidates first take temporary vows indicates these occurrences are well within the realm of possibility.

Moreover, any attempt to verify a measure of perseverance would involve a great deal of time to determine which religious have persevered to the end of their lives in religion. Even then there can be only a simple dichotomy between those subjects who did persevere until death and those who did not. Rankings can not be made of the subjects in either category since those who persevere until death must all receive the same rank, and of those who do not persevere it may not be assumed that the best persons lasted the longest in the religious life. It may sometimes happen that a candidate lacks the courage to leave and so he begins to mobilize his forces against the possibility of de-
parture. It may be some time before the superiors can convince him to take the decisive step. In the meantime a candidate who has courage, who recognizes the truth about himself and is willing to do something about it, returns to secular life before his less courageous confrere. Under such circumstances it is to be expected, if the underlying theory of sequential analysis is well founded, that the latter candidate will have a higher score on the TAT test even though he did not remain in the religious life as long as his less courageous Brother (see pp. 72-80).

It is for these reasons that it was decided in the design of this experiment that instead of attempting to predict perseverance it would be better to measure the agreement between the candidates' TAT scores and their rankings by superiors and peers on the basis of promise for the religious life. But the fact that the rankings of superiors and peers are used in an attempt to establish the validity of the TAT in this particular area gives immediate rise to two questions: How meaningful are the rankings of peers, for example, and what does a correlation between these rankings and the scores on the TAT actually reveal?

The Criterion

In drawing up the directions for the judges who were to rank the subjects of this investigation, it was decided not to define "promise for the Brotherhood" in terms of specific traits. Although there was the possibility of listing such qualities as piety, punctuality, docility, or prudence for the consideration of the judges, it was finally decided that to mention them in connection with "promise for the Brotherhood" would do more harm than good.
Success or failure in the Brotherhood, just as success or failure in any sphere of life, is a highly complex affair and may be determined by many psychological factors rather than just a few. If success in a complex activity is measured by singling out as criteria one or more of its aspects and measuring them, the end result is a check on the validity of a test for predicting these chosen aspects. It would be inaccurate to identify these few aspects with the entire activity. Moreover, though an attempt is made to single out the most significant aspects of the religious life as criteria, too often inconsequential aspects might be chosen because of their ready observability or measurability.

It is true that the judges were instructed to try to avoid being influenced by personality, charm, wit, or intelligence in ranking the subjects, but beyond these examples no specific aspects were suggested (pp. 36-37). They had only to place all of the subjects in one of five groups—from the most promising group to the least promising group. Though it would have been very difficult for the judges to rank the entire group of forty-five individually, placing a candidate in one of five groups was much less difficult and apparently the judges had no problem understanding the simple directions given them.

A valid criticism of the pilot study done on the Junior Novices was that there was only one judge employed in the design and that the ranking of subjects by him was the sole criterion. Since, however, the judges of both the pilot study done with the Junior Novices and also the pilot study done in Philadelphia had only to choose ten subjects from each end of a range of subjects, it seemed that one judge for each of these pilot studies would be able
to make such a selection accurately. However, in judging the full range of a sample, the task is not so easy. To solve this problem, forty-five judges were used in the present investigation. Generally speaking, an increase in the number of judges does not necessarily mean that the judging will be more accurate. The value of the rankings depends upon the competence of the judges to evaluate the overall quality of the subjects. A few very competent judges are much more useful than many relatively incompetent ones.

In the case of this investigation it does seem that the judges possess the competence necessary for making an overall evaluation of the subjects because they have given considerable time and thought to qualities that are characteristic of good religious, i.e., of religious who "show promise for the Brotherhood." This is not to say that their judgments are perfect, as we shall see when the rankings are discussed (pp. 55-60). But they have studied the Rule and Constitutions of their Order; they have been instructed by prudent and virtuous religious; they have personal experience of what it means to lead the religious life; and they have lived with the Student Brothers whom they are ranking so that they have first hand experiential knowledge of them.

In psychological experiments such as the present one this dependence on seemingly qualified judges seems the most logical procedure to follow when a composite judgment on a variety of psychological traits embodying each subject's entire motivational pattern must be considered. That in many cases the judges did not find their task easy must be admitted, but at the same time it seems to have been the best course to follow. Anastasi, in discussing the ratings of subjects in terms of social traits, describes the rationale for a procedure not unlike the one being used here,
... Under the circumstances the ratings themselves define the criterion. Moreover, such ratings are not restricted to the evaluation of specific achievements, but involve a personal judgment by an observer regarding any of the variety of traits which psychological tests attempt to measure...

Ratings have been employed in the validation of almost every type of test. They are particularly useful in providing criteria for personality tests, since objective criteria are much more difficult to find in this area. Especially is this true of distinctly social traits, in which ratings based upon personal contact may constitute the most logically defensible criterion.  

Ratings of subjects based upon personal contacts and observations enter into the validation of many of the finest psychological tests available. Ratings by psychiatrists and clinicians are often cited in validity studies done on the Rorschach. The highly successful Stanford-Binet and the WAIS both depend in part for their claims to validity on the correlation of test scores with school grades which are ratings given by teachers. In the last analysis every measurement, even physical measurement, must depend to some extent upon human judgment.

The important point for this discussion, however, is that the validity of a test is meaningful only in terms of the human judgments involved in the criterion upon which its validity is established. In this investigation any correlation figure between the TAT scores and the rankings of judges is a measure of the agreement between the scores and the evaluations of the judges, nothing more. It is of interest to know then to what extent the judges agreed among themselves. Since this investigation is primarily concerned with the agreement of peer-TAT rankings, the relationship will be discussed in terms of the rankings given by the peer group as judges.

---

1Anastasi, p. 141.
The first step necessary for an analysis of the inter-judge reliability consists of the relatively simple procedure of determining the average rank of each subject in the sample. Then the variance of the rankings received by each candidate must be computed. Those subjects who receive rankings that show little variance are, of course, those subjects upon whom most of the judges tend to agree and, conversely, those who receive rankings that result in a large variance are those about whom the judges disagree.

An examination of the graph representing this relationship (Appendix I, Graph I, p. 105) will give the reader an over-all view of the results of this procedure. On the x-axis the average rank of each subject has been indicated; on the y-axis is the corresponding variance. In general the relationship between a subject's average rank and its variance follows a definite pattern. Perhaps this pattern becomes even clearer when the data presented in Table I (p. 56) are considered.

Table I is composed of three groups, A, B, and C. Group A consists of the five candidates whose average rank indicated that they showed the least promise for the Brotherhood. Group B consists of the five candidates who show the most promise for the Brotherhood. Group C consists of the five candidates whose average rank placed them in the middle of the distribution of averages. For each member of these three groups the average rank and the variance of the individual rankings given him are indicated. At the bottom of the table the average variance for each group has been computed.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subjects</th>
<th>Average Rank</th>
<th>Variance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Group A:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.42</td>
<td>.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.64</td>
<td>.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1.66</td>
<td>.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>1.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1.82</td>
<td>.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Group B:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>4.58</td>
<td>.60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.24</td>
<td>.48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4.24</td>
<td>1.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4.02</td>
<td>1.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.33</td>
<td>.75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Group C:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.86</td>
<td>2.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.90</td>
<td>1.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2.98</td>
<td>1.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>3.04</td>
<td>.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td>1.64</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Average variance of Group A: .75
Average variance of Group B: .89
Average variance of Group C: 1.51

For those subjects whose average rank was quite low (the least promising Brothers in the opinion of the judges), the variances are small (Group A). For those subjects whose average rank was quite high (the most promising Brothers), the variances are somewhat larger than the variances of the low ranking subjects but are still small (Group B). It is in the middle range of subjects, those whose average rank fell in the middle of the distribution of this particular sample, that the greatest variances occur (Group C). This fact is reflected in both the individual variances (Appendix I, Graph I, p.125)
and in the average variances of Groups A, B, and C (Table I).

These results are typical of those found in studies similar to the present one. It is to be expected that if a subject shows little promise for the Brotherhood that this fact will be evident to most of his confreres within a relatively short time. Evidently the judges have clearly in mind what a candidate to their life should not be. On the other hand, in judging those candidates who show considerable promise, there is not so much agreement. The judges recognize the candidate who disrupts the harmony of the community or who gives bad example, but they are not so sure about those qualities of excellence that mark a man of real promise for the religious life.

This fact is one upon which superiors in charge of the training of young religious might reflect. It may well be that instruction based on negative norms is presented in concrete terms to young religious whereas a specific and positive concept of what constitutes a valid self-ideal for a religious is not made sufficiently clear to them. The specific positive qualities are more difficult to present to a religious candidate than are rules that have a precise and negative application. This fact may also account for the pattern of variances found in the rankings of candidates at the extremes of the distribution.

Occasionally a candidate who was ranked as excellent by most of the judges received a few rankings that were altogether at variance with the others thus increasing the variance of his total rankings. If taken alone, these few rankings would indicate that such a candidate is not a promising religious. For example, it may be seen on Graph I that a candidate with an average ranking of 3.9 has a variance of 2.4. Actually he received rankings of 4 or 5
from most of the judges, but a few judges gave him the lowest possible ranking—a ranking of 1. At the same time, he received no 2’s or 3’s. Since several subjects were treated in this manner by the judges, the investigator attempted to discover the causes of some of these discrepancies in the rankings of otherwise excellent candidates.

After all of the analysis, scoring and recording of data had been completed, he asked some of the subjects (who were also judges) to identify their stories and consequently the rankings they had done. The investigator thought that they would be willing to cooperate and he found this to be so. With the understanding that their individual replies to any of the investigator’s questions would remain confidential, they explained why they ranked certain candidates as they did.

In every case where a judge gave a low rank to a candidate who was considered promising by most of the judges, it was because of some relatively unimportant trait or quality of the candidate. Such factors as a candidate’s rapid speech, his overweight, his slight lisp, or his strident voice dominated the evaluation of a judge to the exclusion of all the positive qualities that had influenced the other judges. One factor that seemed to prejudice several judges, though not about the same candidates, was whether or not a candidate measured up to their personal standards of manliness. Thus more than once a candidate who has high ideals, who acts on principle, was penalized because he was not particularly interested in sports or showed a preference for classical rather than popular music. At the same time the judges who made this kind of judgment insisted that they did not wish to imply that the candidates whom they penalized were effeminate. But they felt that they did not conform to the popular concept of the "all-American male."
As has already been mentioned, the largest variances found were in the rankings of those candidates whose average ranking fell within the middle range. A lack of uniformity among the rankings of the judges on these candidates is to be expected. The behavior of candidates who are neither very promising nor very unpromising manifests a complex of contrasting psychological factors. They may show a number of good signs while at the same time failing to measure up in other areas. It is probable that in such cases the judges emphasized one aspect--either positive or negative--of a contrasting motivational pattern. This supposition appears likely because candidates whose average ranking fell in the middle range usually did not receive an average rank, a 3, from many of the judges. Instead the array of individual rankings they received consisted mostly of 2's and 4's.

One other factor related to the work of the judges should be mentioned. The particular group with which this study is involved is a highly homogeneous one. Some of the candidates have been in a religious house of formation for six or seven years, and all of them have been in training for at least two years. During this time superiors have screened them, and the rule of life under which they live has acted as a selective factor. Many poor candidates have already left the Order. As a result, the candidates who remain are more difficult to rank than would be a sample of individuals randomly selected from a heterogeneous population. This factor must be kept in mind when an evaluation of the work done by the judges is made.

To sum up the analysis of the inter-judge reliability, it may be said that the judges agreed most frequently on the rankings of the least promising candidates, that they recognized with few exceptions the very promising
candidates as such, and that they were least consistent in their evaluations of candidates in the middle range. It also seems probable that the judges have a clearer idea of what an unpromising candidate is like and are not quite so sure about their standards for judging promising candidates. In dealing with candidates who show both good and bad signs, they tend to give a rank that emphasizes either a positive or negative aspect of the candidate's personality rather than to give a rank of 3 which would characterize the candidate as being average in their minds. However, when the positive and negative rankings are averaged, they cancel each other out, and so these candidates fall within the middle range in the distribution of average ranks.

The Philadelphia Pilot Study

Using the same scoring system that was developed in the original pilot study for this investigation, the present investigator had no difficulty in discriminating between the ten most promising and the ten least promising Brothers selected from a group of 109 Brothers in Philadelphia. The high scoring subjects had an average score of 71.7 with an SD of 6.2; the low scoring subjects had an average score of 31 with an SD of 5.62. Since the original scoring system proved to be effective with this new group of students, there were no significant revisions necessary in it.

However, the protocols from the Philadelphia pilot study did provide a few new additions to the scoring system, i.e., types of imports that are not listed in the original scoring system. Actually most of these additions are clarifications rather than additions, and they come mostly from the high

---

2Quinn, pp. 52-56.
scoring subjects. Perhaps this fact is an indication that the judges' problem mentioned in the preceding section of this chapter may also be a problem in the development of a scoring system; it would seem that it is easier to determine the various points in negative scoring categories than it is to find similar subpoints for the positive categories.

The scoring system devised in the original study may be found in Appendix II (pp. 109-113). Additions that resulted from the Philadelphia study have been marked with an asterisk. In order to give some indication of the kinds of imports that were either introduced or clarified by the Philadelphia study, they will be discussed briefly here under eight titles: (1) imagination and escape, (2) attitudes towards authority, (3) finding one's own proper milieu, (4) assistance from others, (5) love as a motive, (6) taking a gamble, (7) self-sacrifice, (8) singularity.

Imagination and escape. In stories of good candidates one finds that imagination often comes into play in the form of children's dreams, usually about what they hope to do when they grow up. Stories about escape from an imaginary situation that is frightening are told in the form of dreams by both good and poor candidates. When a good candidate tells a dream involving a threatening situation, the fear is usually resolved in the dream itself. Poor candidates describe dreams about fears which prove unfounded because the dreamer suddenly wakes up.

When the fear is not included in the dream sequence, high candidates show how the fear is overcome by positive action; poor candidates overcome the fear by showing that it was never a problem in the first place, that it was caused by a mistaken judgment on the part of the person who was frightened.
There was found in the stories of both good and poor candidates an attitude of escapism by imagination or pretense. The difference between the kinds of imports produced by good and poor candidates in this regard seems to be that the poor candidates deny reality when they can and should do something about it; the good candidates use pretense or imagination to alleviate the pain of a situation which cannot be changed. Here is an example of pretense reflected in a story told by a good candidate:

(card 11)

An old sailor with a respected reputation told me of many adventures that took place in a cave. But the adventures don’t happen any more. When I asked him why not, he answered that the great cruel dragon that once roamed the cave had been mysteriously calmed by a very beautiful girl who disappeared in the cave during an afternoon of play with her friends. Mom told me years later that Alice, his daughter, had lost her life when she dropped three hundred feet into an abyss of the cave.

Although on the surface this story seems to be a depressing one and used imagination as an escape, what the author is saying is that there are times when a man must use pretense or imagination to overcome the grief caused by a great loss. On the other hand, in the stories of poor candidates imagination is usually used as a means of avoiding positive action by creating a world that is self-satisfying. The following story is an example from the test of a poor candidate:

(card 16)

Not so long ago there was a boy who decided to criticize the way things were going. He just didn’t like it. So he decided to do something about it. He said to himself—There is no Miss Jones, our geography teacher. Little by little, she began to fade, fade, fade, until only her voice was left. Then that began to grow fainter and fainter until even that was gone. After that it was easier.

One day his father spanked him. Slowly, slowly his father began to fade. Now he was better at it. Nothing was any more, at least very little. There was Billy, just Billy, and once in a
while his boyfriend. But even he, Billy could tell, had started
to fade. He couldn't see him as clearly nor hear him as well.
And he didn't wish it that way, but he didn't mind.

To this story the author is saying that, although refusal to face reality has
some disadvantages, he prefers it that way rather than having to meet the de-
mands that reality makes upon him.

**Attitude towards authority.** In the past those stories which seem to have
as their imports successful rebellion against legitimate authority were given
a low score. In general this scoring still holds true. But in the stories of
many good candidates there are imports which show the success that comes from
rebelling against a vocation or a job that is required by parents, etc. Evi-
dently good candidates approve of such "rebellion." Two stories written by
good candidates illustrate this point:

(card 1)
Ronald was told by his parents that he must learn to play the
violin and at present he has been sent into his room by his par-
ents to practice. He would be much happier outside playing with
the others, however, he must spend his time in the room and oc-
casionally make a few sounds on the violin, while the rest of the
time he can dream about what his friends are doing or in other
words build castles in the air. Soon his mother will realize that
her boy doesn't want to learn to play the type of instrument she
has chosen for him and will permit him to spend his recreation
time with the other boys.

(card 1)
Holy smokes, everyone else is out playing ball and here I am
supposed to be practicing on this old violin. Even worse, I was
supposed to be the next batter when Mom called me. Well, if she
thinks that I am going to sit in here on a sunny afternoon and
play with this old piece of wood, I've got news for her. I'm
going right back out and play ball again.

It may be that when stories like these occur in the tests of subjects taken
from a heterogeneous population that they should receive a low score, but they
also frequently occur in the tests of promising young religious. Several other
examples such as the two given above could be cited from the tests of the Philadelphia Brothers. Perhaps a special attitude common among male religious accounts for their appearance in tests of promising candidates. Young men who enter the religious life feel that they have a right to decide the type of activity or work in which they will engage. Since many of them have had difficulty in persuading their parents to permit them to enter the religious life and had to insist upon their right to do so, this type of import among promising religious is understandable. It also reflects the fact that the Church insists on the right of a child to decide on his vocation, that this is an area in which parental authority should not rightly hold sway.

Finding one's proper milieu. There is a group of stories told by promising religious which, to an investigator unfamiliar with the religious life, might seem negative rather than positive in tone. These are the stories which concern the necessity of a man's living in an environment which is proper to him. Special mention is made of these stories here because it is necessary, if an investigator is to understand their imports, that he be conscious of values that are proper to the religious state but are contrary to those held by most men in secular society.

Religious have chosen a life apart from the world, and, in a sense, they are a contradiction to it. For example, the religious state embraces a life of poverty, and, although poverty is not an end in itself, it is looked upon as a means by which a religious can attain his end. It should not be surprising then that religious tell stories in which a man prefers poverty to riches and affluence. Here is an example of a story told by a promising Philadelphia candidate which does not at first glance seem to be positive in tone but which
has as its import an attitude that is desirable in the religious life:

(card 1)

Little Billie grew up in an atmosphere of degradation and human misery and, having been adopted by a fairly wealthy couple, he has to accustom himself to a new life. He is seen contemplating a violin which his foster father plays very well. He is puzzled by this new life which seems so strange beside his former existence. He grows up wondering about the difference and finally goes back to a sordid life, still wondering about his adoption situation but unable to understand the milieu in which he was exiled.

What the author is saying is that a man must be in his proper environment and it is necessary for some men to embrace a life of poverty (misery) because for them it makes the most sense. That this is the meaning intended by the author of the story is made clear from the sequence which becomes evident when an analyst considers the story that the author told immediately after it.

Two sisters who have known little but the farm and the village school begin to think on some of the facts that they had learned while in school. We see one looking into the distance towards the new world while her Polish sister dreams of Vienna. Both have ideas about the hustle of city life—one in the New World and one in Italy. Both are equally aware that they can find success. Both, however, are unaware of the simple and beautiful life of the Polish peasant with his charming customs set to a background of rugged but beautiful farmland and mountains. Both are successful in their lives—one married to an opera house owner, the other to a factory worker. In spite of their loves, they both feel that they have changed their attitudes towards life and wonder which one was the better life, since their new life lacks the charm and simplicity which they knew in Poland.

The imports for story 1 and for story 2 are:

1. Somebody used to misery (poverty) finds it hard to understand (adjust to) a life of affluence and finally prefers to return to what he is used to.

2. for in trying to escape from poverty, people often miss its beauty and find out when it is too late that it had a charm and simplicity that sumptuousness lacks.

These two imports clearly illustrate the importance of considering the sequence of imports when working out the import of a single story, especially
when the import is somewhat obscure and the story is difficult to analyze. Taken alone, the first story could be misleading because it might give the impression that the author wants to settle for a disorganized or relatively meaningless existence, i.e., that he has no ambition. On the other hand, it might be that some interpreters might seize upon the "misery theme" and imagine that the author is being masochistic. Occasionally it happens that an author may use a word in a peculiar sense or perhaps misuse it altogether; anyone who would successfully interpret TAT stories must be on his guard for such eventualities when determining the imports of stories. These two stories offer a good example. By working out the connection between "misery" in the first story and "simplicity" in the second, it is possible for an analyst to see what is meant by the word misery as it is used in the first story. Evidently the word misery means for the author something akin to mortification, or denial or depriving himself of luxury and affluence. In the same way, the word degradation probably means something like humility which is closely related to the key word in the second story, simplicity. It is impossible for an analyst to have this kind of insight into the meaning of the words misery and degradation and therefore into the meaning of the first story taken as a whole until he sees the relationship between the two stories and recognizes the single attitude expressed in them. On the other hand, it should not be thought that an analyst tries to interpret or find unconscious meaning in the words of an author; he simply wants to get at the conscious meaning a word has for the man who is using it. In the case of young subjects or uneducated subjects this is always a problem which must be taken into consideration.

These two stories also illustrate a point that is not generally recognized.
that is, that the investigator must take into consideration significant circumstances regarding an author's background which cause him to have attitudes that are at variance with those commonly held. On the other hand, when an investigator attempts to analyze the TAT of a subject who was born into a family and religion that recognize the legitimacy of divorce, he will score stories dealing with the various aspects of divorce differently than he would if the same stories had been written by a Catholic. And when he analyzes stories written by a religious, he must keep in mind that he probably places great value upon living in a milieu (the religious community) proper to his goal in life even though it is not the kind of environment that most men desire.

Help from others. In the original pilot study a score of 3 was given to an import in which a man seeks help to solve his problems, and a score of 2 was given to an import in which a person had to be offered help. There seems to be reasonable doubt that this scoring is adequate since stories in which characters seek help from others were often told by promising candidates from the Philadelphia group. Since this is so, it would seem that a further distinction must be made regarding their imports, because imports that frequently occur in the protocols of high candidates should receive a score of 4.

The crucial point seems to concern the type of help that is sought in the stories. The difference between the imports of very promising candidates and those that should receive a 3 is that the former stress professional help. This positive attitude towards professional help should not be surprising since, from the beginning of their novitiate training, religious learn to seek help for their problems from competent persons—-from confessors, superiors, doctors, psychologists, etc. Perhaps a score of 4 suits imports in which
professional help is sought for the solution to a problem which requires
specialized training or knowledge. Imports that stress seeking help about a
problem that is not beyond the understanding or ability of most people can
still be scored with a 3. And when an attitude of waiting for others to come
to one's assistance is expressed in an import, then such an import should re­
ceive a 2.

There is one further observation concerning imports involving help from
others that should be noted. It is illustrated by the import from the follow­
ing story (a story which also illustrates the difficulty presented by a story
that consists entirely of dialogue). This story was written by a promising
candidate from the Philadelphia group.

(card 18)
Wife's sick, kids need shoes, and I'm broke. A hell of a predicament. And just because I'm a Jew those damn bluebloods won't even
give me an interview, much less a job. I've had enough. I'm sick
of living. Just one step out, a six hundred foot fall into icy
water, and then my troubles are over. Here goes.

    Get your hands off of me. Who do you think you are anyway?
Oh, hell, why don't you let me jump?

In this story the author seems to be saying that there are times when a man who
is at his wit's end must be cared for by others. Apparently the emphasis here
is not on the despair of the individual, his failure to get help, or his fail­
ure to help himself, but rather on what others must do when they encounter such
an individual. If the story had not been written in dialogue form, if the out­
come had been clearly stated instead of merely being implied, then the attitude
of the author would have been much clearer. That this story does not deserve
a negative score may become clearer if the following story written by a
promising candidate is compared to it:

(card 18)
Leggo, leggo. What's de idea. Leggo. Der ain't nothin' wrong
wit a guy drinkin' a little.
There is when that somebody is a danger on the highway. Leggo. I pay what I'm supposed to pay. You guys don't got no right doin nottin like dis. Into the wagon, Jack. A night in a nice warm cell is going to do great things for you.

Fundamentally this story is the same as the one told about the despairing man. In each case an individual is acting on impulse and has become the pawn of his disordered emotions. In both stories the emphasis is upon what must be done for the individual who is helpless and cannot care for himself, that is, upon the practice of charity. Such stories result in imports that are scored 4. They can be distinguished from imports that deserve a score of 2 because in the latter imports the individuals can help themselves and will not. They simply do nothing and wait for help to come to them. In the former stories, the character portrayed cannot help himself and so must be helped by another.

Love as a motive. Although, as we have seen in the two stories presented above, an import that stresses charity towards one's neighbor should usually receive a 4; there is a kind of story that places great stress on love of another which must be scored as a 2. Since in a later section of this chapter there will be illustrations and discussion of what are called pollyanna stories and since love is frequently mentioned in such tests, the problem of love as a motive will be only briefly discussed here. But it should be mentioned because an investigator may be tempted to score a certain kind of nebulous love story high when it deserves a low score. An illustration of such a story is the following:

(card 16)
John was a top rank pianist. He played concerts all over the country. His life was one journey through city after city with his wife, Helen, but they both enjoyed it. They both laboured for the sake of music. One day during a rehearsal, John noticed that his
fingers weren't as flexible as usual. He went to a doctor and the doctor told him that he had a disease which would hinder him from continuing his career. John talked with Helen and decided that he would end his career at that moment. "But still," he said, "we have each other."

The trouble with this story is that there is no evidence of a positive, realistic approach to a practical problem. It is as though the author were saying that, no matter what happens, love is enough for the rest of a man's life. The love of which he speaks is perilously close to the pathetic posturing of many modern fictional creations who stand amid the ruins to protest that, although all else fail, love lasts and saves. This is not enough, and those imports that suggest such attitudes should not receive a score of more than 2.

Taking a gamble. Often in the tests of low ranking candidates there are stories in which the central character takes "a long shot" and succeeds. The following story illustrates this kind of situation:

(card 7)
These two men are doctors in consultation. The patient committed to their care has had several heart attacks. Their opinion is that this time the condition of the patient is very serious and they must take drastic action. They decide to perform a rare operation which proved very successful both for the patient and for them.

Another example of the same type of story is the following:

(card 8)
Doctor Guillespe had given many emergency operations before during his thirty years as an M.D., but he felt sure that this was the worst case he had ever attended. Blood gushed forth from the bullet riddled body of the enemy soldier and ran in every direction. The patient was in shock so that Doc couldn't operate. But if he didn't, the patient would surely die. He injected a new drug which was not completely approved into the man's side. This brought him out of shock and a successful operation ensued.

Superficially both of these stories seem positive for success is the result of positive action in both of them. But the frequency with which this type of story occurs in tests of poor candidates suggests that the attitude behind it
is not a good one. It would seem that the author of such a story takes the view that life in general is capricious and irrational and that its outcome depends upon magic (an untested drug, a rare operation) that provides success. Although it is true that the central character acts on his own, the course of action that he takes results in an outcome that is too pat. The scoring system already developed indicates that such imports deserve a score of 1 when success comes through magic or very unlikely means. It needs only to be added here that the investigator should be aware that dependence for success upon a "long shot" is dependence upon magic under another name.

**Self-sacrifice.** It is not surprising that stories about self-sacrifice occur in tests of promising religious from the Philadelphia group. But perhaps it should also be pointed out that self-sacrifice may involve the loss of life which might be interpreted as a sign of pessimism by an investigator who places emphasis on the success-failure pattern in the stories. The following example was written by a promising candidate:

*(card 19)*
The radio had been sounding storm warnings all afternoon. Captain Martin's ship received all the warnings and headed directly into the storm with full knowledge of what was in store for it. There was little else that he could do. The Commander of the ocean fleet ordered the ship to enemy islands. They were to pick up survivors from a downed plane. The islands were in the path of the storm. Captain Martin and his crew made a determined effort to overcome the storm but to no avail. The waves hammered the sides of the ship and the water leaked through the not-yet-repaired deck. The sides began to crack under the pounding of the seas. The lower decks began to take in water. To abandon the ship now would mean to jump into a sea of certain death. To remain on the ship would mean to sink with it into a sea of certain death.

The crew never reported back.

In this story the essential attitude being conveyed is that a man must do his duty even though he may lose his life in doing so. Obviously this is not a
pleasant story, and an investigator might be tempted to give it a low score if he evaluates it from the standpoint of achievement or success. The captain and his crew do not succeed; they do not rescue those who need help and actually meet disaster themselves. But the underlying import, that a man must do his duty even in the face of death, is a positive attitude and quite appropriate to the self-denial of a promising young religious. Such an import rightly receives a score of 4.

**Singularity.** To speak of a man as being singular means that he does not share in the common life of his peers, that he sets himself apart from them. This is a defect that religious, who live a community life, must strive in charity to avoid and so it is not unusual to find stories written by good candidates that stress this point. It is not an attitude commonly found in the stories of secular people and so special mention is made of it here. The following story written by a promising candidate from Philadelphia illustrates how this attitude may be conveyed:

(card 20)

Here we see a former classmate who, having graduated with honors, whiles away his time on a street corner. He could not get nor hold any employment since people were deterred by his strange behavior. This is one of his favorite occupations: watching the street urchins and the swells. Come morning, he goes to his room to sleep and prepare for the next night. But people talk and someone complains of his presence as a menace to passersby. The police question him, help, and suggest. Soon he realizes that he must do something with his life. He takes a degree in sociology and returns to his former haunts with a new purpose but the same exterior.

What the writer is saying is that a man must do something with his life and that he must make a contribution to the common good. If, on the other hand, he tends to stand apart from those about him, he only becomes an object of suspicion and distrust. For those who live the common life in a religious
community this is an important attitude to have. A Brother whose conduct is out of joint with that of his confreres, even though it may be harmless in itself, disrupts the rhythm of community life. Only when he gives himself for the sake of others by making a contribution to the community and shares in their activities and interests can he be accepted even though he may differ from the others in unimportant ways. This is a concept repeatedly suggested by the imports of stories written by promising candidates from Philadelphia and so such imports are given a score of 4.

Before concluding this section on insights that have been gained from a study of the tests of both Philadelphia candidates who were considered quite promising and those who were thought to be quite unpromising by their superior, it should be stated that the above illustrations and suggestions are not meant to imply that every promising candidate always tells stories that produce imports deserving of a score of 4 or that poor candidates always tell stories that deserve a 1. But, on the other hand, it is true that the above illustrations and suggested scorings are based upon many stories found in the tests of promising religious or those who show little promise, as the case may be.

Perhaps by following the above suggestions and employing the scoring system that has already been worked out in the pilot study, an investigator can avoid some of the pitfalls that he faces when he attempts to analyze the stories of male religious. There is no simple formula for determining the correct import of a story. If the investigator becomes too literal and summarizes the story or if he becomes too general and interprets the story on the basis of theoretical presuppositions, his analyses are doomed to failure. Even the stories used to illustrate the above points might be scored differently, as has
already been suggested in Chapter I (pp. 9-14), if they were found in the context of different TAT protocols. It is up to the investigator, using a light touch, to catch the underlying import of a story while following the sequence in which the story is found to avoid placing emphasis upon an element of a story that has no real meaning for the author. Unless he succeeds in doing this, all attempts at scoring are useless; a successful scoring system has no value if it is used on a protocol of imports that do not accurately reflect the attitudes of the subject.

Relationships between TAT Scores and Judges' Ratings

On Graphs 2, 3, and 4 in Appendix I (pp. 106-108) the scores which the California Student Teachers received on the TAT, expressed as an average of the scores for the individual imports, have been plotted against the average rankings given, respectively, by their peers, their superiors, and the ten highest scoring subjects who took the TAT in California. Even a cursory examination of these graphs shows that there is a definite relationship between the TAT scores and the rankings done by the judges. To determine these relationships more accurately, the Pearson Product Coefficient of Correlation was employed. As can be seen from Table II, the correlation between subjects' TAT scores and their average rankings by the peer-judges was .59 with an SE = .098. The correlation between the TAT scores and the averages of rankings done by superiors was .61 with an SE = .095. The correlation between the TAT scores and the rankings done by the ten highest scoring subjects was .57 with an SE = .103.

A final correlation is indicated in Table II, that between the ratings of the peer-judges and their superiors. This correlation provides a measure of agreement between them on their rankings of the California candidates.
It was thought that if the peer group and the superiors were in close agreement in their opinions of the candidates' promise for the Brotherhood that it would enhance the value of both the rankings of the peer group and the rankings of the superiors as criteria for this investigation. The correlation between the two rankings amounted to .65 with an SE = .087.

All of the r's listed in the table indicate a moderate correlation between subjects' TAT scores and the average of rankings by the various groups of judges, showing that there exists a substantial relationship between them and the TAT scores. The null hypothesis that there is no relationship between TAT scores and the rankings of religious candidates by their peers and their superiors may be rejected.

### TABLE II
**CORRELATIONS BETWEEN TAT SCORES AND RANKINGS OF PEER-JUDGES, SUPERIORS, AND HIGH TAT SCORERS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>TAT Scores</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>r</td>
<td>SE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer-judges' rankings</td>
<td>.59</td>
<td>.098</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Superiors' rankings</td>
<td>.61</td>
<td>.095</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High TAT scorers' rankings</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.103</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>TAT Scores</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>r</td>
<td>SE</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer-judges' rankings</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td>.087</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In a description of the design of the experiment in Chapter III (pp. 45-46), it was suggested that perhaps high scorers on the TAT would be in greater
agreement with each other when acting as judges than would a more heterogeneous group of judges and that perhaps the rankings of the candidates would correspond more closely to the rankings done in terms of the TAT scores. This seemed possible in view of the theory of the Sequential Analysis of the TAT, i.e., that those subjects who score high on the TAT have good prudential judgment. As can be seen from Table II, this hypothesis was not verified in this experiment for the correlation between the TAT and the rankings done by the high scorers is slightly below that of the peer group and an examination of the rankings done by the high scorers shows that they also disagreed to about the same extent with one another as did the peer group. Apparently, their prudence is expressed in their attitudes and their conduct; whereas, their judgments of others may be directed by charity.

Of greater interest in this study, however, is the fact that the correlation between peers and superiors, .65, is not much higher than that attained by correlating the rankings of either group with the scores on the TAT. The expectation that they would be in close agreement when ranking subjects was not verified, in spite of the fact that both superiors and peers had lived with the subjects of this investigation for a considerable length of time and had ample opportunity to observe them under various conditions. Earlier in this chapter it was mentioned that the peer-judges had difficulty in ranking the candidates who fell in the middle range; this same difficulty is reflected in the rankings of the superiors and the high scorers and accounts for much of the disagreement between the peers and the superiors.

In view of this difficulty, it is a moot point whether the rankings provided by the peers, the superiors, and the high scorers give a more accurate
measure of the promise for the Brotherhood of the subjects of this investigation than do the scores on the TAT. It would be rash to assume that the peer-judges or the superiors more accurately evaluated the subjects of this investigation than did the TAT analysis because the correlation between the superiors and the peer-judges is slightly higher than the correlations between either the superiors or the peer-judges and the TAT scores. Especially is this so when the measures of standard error listed in Table II are considered. Past studies using sequential analysis have resulted in some remarkably high correlations with various criteria as has been pointed out in the review of the literature in Chapter II. Garvin’s study (p. 29), which resembles the present investigation insofar as it is a full range study, is a notable example. Certainly it may be said that the validity of the TAT as a measure of motivational patterns in various types of subjects has been more thoroughly put to the test than the value of the rankings done by the various judges of this investigation. Furthermore, it should be noted that, even if only the results of this investigation are considered, the use of the TAT has resulted in correlations that are notably higher than any correlations mentioned in the various studies on candidates to the religious life or the priesthood that were reviewed in Chapter II. The highest correlation cited is .40, reported by Thomas J. McCarthy (pp. 19–20), between a faculty rating of minor seminarians and their IQ’s. But he goes on to mention that he found no correlation in a similar investigation involving major seminarians, a group of subjects who closely resemble the subjects of the present investigation. Perhaps future studies involving greater refinements of the scoring system for Arnold’s Sequential Analysis of the TAT and the use of more satisfactory criteria will enhance the value of the TAT as a measure of potential for living the life of a priest or religious.
False Positives (High TAT score but low rating)

As has already been indicated, a good number of the subjects in this investigation indicated their willingness to identify their tests after all the analyses and scoring had been completed and the data had been tabulated. Fortunately among those who offered this kind of cooperation were those subjects whose individual tests were, for one reason or another, of special interest to the present investigator. As can be seen from Graphs 2 and 3 in Appendix I (pp. 10-11), there are three subjects whose rankings according to the TAT scores are much higher than their rankings by either the peer-judges or the superiors; in each case the TAT scores indicate that they (Subjects A, B, and C) belong in the second highest group whereas the rankings by the peer-judges and the superiors place them in the lowest group. The present investigator made an attempt to account for these discrepancies by re-examining their protocols and stories, which may be found in Appendix III (pp. 12-13), and also by inquiring about them from various individuals who judged them.

The inquiry regarding Subject A revealed that he left the Order six months after he had taken the TAT for this investigation and that he had been considering the possibility of leaving at the time that he took the test. Earlier in this chapter it was mentioned that a person who later leaves an order may get a higher score on the TAT than does a candidate who remains in an order. It takes courage to leave an order after having been in it for five years, as was Subject A, and his willingness to make a difficult change may be reflected in the score he received on the test. Frequently it is not possible for an investigator to determine the problems that beset a subject; he may be able to tell only the kind of action that the subject is willing to take to solve his
problems. In the case of Subject A, an examination of his protocol shows clearly that he had come to the conclusion that the life he was leading was not the right kind of life for him and that he felt that he must do something about it. Repeatedly he refers to the necessity of making a change, its effect upon his loved ones, and the recognition that he must face his limitations regardless of the consequences. The latter part of the protocol, in light of the facts in the case, speaks for itself:

14. When a man is lonely and misses old friends, he can try to rejoin them and thus relieve his loneliness.

15. and, though the confinement of his surroundings may tempt him to black despair, unexpected help may enable him to achieve his freedom again.

16. A man who is out of his element is not happy, but he will find happiness doing what he enjoys with those who are his own kind.

17. and, though he may not be able to solve a problem immediately, his imagination can suggest a clue to its solution and so he works it out.

18. and, if he is true to his own inner feelings and pursues the vocation of his choice, success eventually is his regardless of the conditions under which he works.

19. but a man must not allow himself to be misled by others and must make his own decision to do what is right.

20. It is with mixed feelings (which beginners would not understand) that a man who is older will look upon his work for he knows that past achievements are perishable—all is passing.

Once the facts in the case are known it can be seen that the above imports give a picture of the subject's predicament and accurately describe his attitudes towards it. It is probable that his conferees and his superiors recognized that he was not right for the religious life and consequently ranked him low; the TAT seems to give a picture of his self-ideal in action which, in this case, is at variance with the pursuit of the religious life. Actually these two
views of the subject are consistent although a comparison of the rankings by the judges and his score on the TAT would seem to indicate otherwise.

Subject B illustrates another kind of problem that besets any investigator as he analyzes TAT stories. In this case the problem is that of ambiguity. This ambiguity arises out of the fact that the stories which Subject B tells are not clear. They either do not have an ending or the manner in which they are told does not make it clear to the analyst exactly what attitude is being expressed in the stories. Most of the stories reflect this ambiguity, but the following two stories will illustrate the point:

(card 4)
Mary Charbine had lived a varied life since graduating from high school. After several jobs, she moved east where the stage was more popular. It was an enjoyable experience in a way. She managed to get along although she was never in a play for more than a few months at a time. At last it was going to change. She was engaged.

Bob Klatchy needed a job. Mary had met him a year ago. They had bit parts in a play together. They had had a few dates. That was all. Now he was desperately in need of a new job. He started drinking and tonight was the worst night of his life. He had come to Mary's apartment for help. She would take care of him, but he died before that night was over.

(card 8)
Nothing like war to show the kind of heroism that people like. Bill was wanting to go to war, but his teachers, his parents, and the armed forces people wanted him to stay in school until he had gotten an education. Then he could work in the intelligence division. But he wanted to fight. There was nothing noble in office work. Yet he did not have the rebellious spirit enough to go into the service against everyone's advice. So he did wait and did go into paper work in the service during the war.

In story #4 there are two possible imports to be derived from it:

4. But he himself has to make something of his life instead of depending on the influence of others to do it for him.

4. Just when a man thinks that things are taking a turn for the better, fate steps in and ruins everything for him.
What is not clear in the story is what the author thinks is wrong with Mary Charbine's situation. Is she at fault or is she a victim of fate?

For story #8 there are also two possible imports:

8. A man may attempt to follow his first enthusiasm, but when friends and reason counsel patience he is willing to take a humble rather than a glamorous job.

8. Though a man may have ambitions to do something worthwhile and work hard to attain his goal, in the end he doesn't amount to much.

In this story it is not clear to the reader what the author's attitude is towards the "paper work" which he has the central character performing during the war.

Ordinarily in analyzing such stories, the sequence of imports would determine which of the two possible imports would be used for the protocol; but the difficulty in this particular case is that there are so many stories that are ambiguous or lacking in a clear outcome that the investigator cannot rely on most of the stories to clarify a few that are not explicit. Assuming that the judges' evaluations of Subject B are correct, the proper imports for stories #4 and #8 are the second imports indicated above, those that reflect a fatalistic or a passive attitude. In a clinical situation, the solution to the problem that these stories present to the investigator would be relatively simple: he would ask the subject a non-directive question, such as, "What do you think of the decision that the man in the story finally made (story #8)?)"

The subject would then reveal the kind of action he thought appropriate and also his attitude towards "paper work"; the import could be corrected according to his reply. Unfortunately in this investigation, since the subjects were anonymous, such an inquiry was not possible.
Subject C presents still a different problem for the investigator. This particular subject has been tested with the TAT several times by the present investigator, beginning with the pilot study for this investigation. In each case his TAT score has indicated that he is a much better candidate than the judges have thought him to be. In the original pilot study he received a high score although his superiors thought he was not very promising. There is no way in which his stories can be analyzed in the present investigation that will not result in a similar high score for him. It is the opinion of the present investigator that the TAT probably gives a much better reflection of the subject's character than do the rankings of the judges in this investigation. When the rankings done by superiors four years ago were checked, it was found that a good number of the subjects who received a higher rank than Subject C were later dismissed by their superiors. One of these superiors stated recently while looking over the rankings of subjects he did four years ago that he has certainly changed his mind about several of them since then, including Subject C. Admittedly, this does not prove the evaluation of Subject C by the TAT is accurate, but it is nevertheless an interesting piece of evidence. The investigator recently questioned several of the peer-judges and the superiors about him and they each pointed out that his appearance is against him; he talks too fast, he is flippant, he tends to be fat, and he lisps slightly with a Southern accent. But when they were asked whether it might not be true that in spite of these "defects" that he still might be a fundamentally good person with high ideals and the courage to act upon them, they agreed that this could be true, that in judging him they were impressed by his appearance and had not given a great deal of thought to the kind of person he really is.
False Negatives (Low TAT score but high rating)

A fourth set of stories with its protocol included in Appendix III is the test of Subject D. Unlike the previous three subjects, he received a low score on the TAT but was placed in the second highest group of nine candidates by both his peers and his superiors. In this instance, there is no way in which his test can be considered a test of a promising candidate if the method of sequential analysis is followed. Repeatedly in this protocol we see a feeling of dependence, of conformity to what others expect, a determination to escape his problems, an expression of platitudes. It is probable that this candidate is the type of person who conducts himself in a manner that is not annoying to anyone and who does what he thinks is required of him although he has no real convictions. He seems to be concerned mainly with the impression that he makes on others rather than following his own principles. The investigator questioned his superiors about him, and they stressed his obedience, his humility, and his docility. They said that it was easy to work with him and that he never gave any trouble nor cause for anxiety. When asked if they thought he had initiative, if he would act on principle without having to lean on them for direction in relatively simple activities, they agreed that he probably would not.

It must be remembered that the religious life offers excellent opportunities for perfection of personality through the vows and common life, but it also can be a kind of hothouse where immature individuals find refuge, are protected, and are not required to make the kind of mature decisions characteristic

3 Six months after this chapter of the dissertation was written, Subject D left the religious life.
of an adult. It is at least a possibility that Subject D is an example of a man who lives this kind of existence.

Before continuing the discussion of the results of this investigation, it might be well to summarize here the findings concerning the three tests that have been described as "false positives" and the one test that has been used as an example of a "false negative". In general it would seem that the correlation between the scores on the TAT and the various criteria is not as high as one might expect in view of the results reported from past investigations involving Arnold's method of TAT analysis because the validity of the criteria used here is uncertain. Clues to the reason for this uncertainty may be found in false positive and false negative TAT scores.

In some cases a Student Brother may have a positive motivation, i.e., good working principles by which he governs his daily life, but at the same time he may realize that he has no vocation, that the religious life is not for him, (Subject A); thus he may manifest a lack of interest or enthusiasm for activities that are particularly relevant to the religious life and this lack of interest may be detected by his confreres and superiors and so they rightly judge him as a poor prospect for their Order. In other cases, the stories written by a subject tend to be ambiguous. If in a given test there are a considerable number of these, it becomes difficult for the investigator to analyze the test as a whole without interviewing the subject to clarify the meaning of some of his stories (Subject B). It was, of course, impossible to do so in this experiment. It may be that ambiguity itself should be penalized. Only an extensive study of tests containing several ambiguous stories each can show how a refinement of this kind should be introduced into the scoring system.
There is the further possibility, suggested by the inquiry concerning Subjects C and D, that the superficial impressions that a man makes on others by his physical appearance, his manner of speech, or his compliance, for example, tend to overshadow more basic considerations relevant to his personality. In contrast, it would seem that the TAT assesses positive motivation without being influenced by personal impressions based on factors that are obviously on the periphery of motivational patterns but are made the focal point of evaluation by a judge who finds them either personally pleasing or displeasing. It is true that more than the underlying attitude expressed in a story may influence the investigator who analyzes the story, that the style in which a story is written, its subject matter, etc., may bias him; but at least the biasing factors are more closely related to personality and tend to resolve themselves into intellectual aspects which are more germane to the judgment of the candidate than is his physique or his deceptively pleasing compliance. When a judge ranks a candidate low on the basis of physical characteristics or high because his vapid personality is not abrasive, then it is to be hoped that the TAT scores and the judge's rankings do not show a high correlation. Furthermore, although the discussion of bias on the part of the judges has been limited to the rankings given to Subjects A, B, C, and D, it is quite reasonable to suppose that similar bias influenced to some degree the judge's rankings of all the subjects in this investigation and therefore is an important, though underdetermined factor in the results of the experiment.

Pollyanna Stories

The study done by Burkard with the TAT (pp. 27-28) on women who are members of a religious community brought to light the importance of recognizing
"pollyanna stories." These stories are characterized by unrealistic views on life and result in platitudinous imports. They are told by persons who tend to see only the bright side of every situation without really evaluating the problem and trying to take realistic action about it. There is the danger that an investigator, particularly one who is working with members of a religious order, will give high scores to these imports because they seem to reflect positive attitudes. Mention is made of this type of story here in order to substantiate the findings of Burkard and also to reiterate her warning about them. Several of the poor subjects from the Philadelphia group produced "pollyanna stories." Because of Burkard's findings in this area, there was no difficulty in recognizing them for what they were when they appeared in the tests for this investigation and each of them was scored properly. An example of this kind of story, told by a male religious, is given in Appendix IV (pp. 139-144).

Areas for Future Investigation

Although recent studies in sequential analysis have greatly refined the scoring categories and made the arithmetic scoring of the imports more accurate, there still remains much to be done along this line. As more samples of tests by various groups of individuals are collected, it becomes easier to classify different kinds of imports and also to analyze the stories themselves more accurately. But as Arnold has remarked,

... We are but at the beginning of a research program in this area which we hope will prove of interest to many others. Perhaps combined effort will yield a measure of personality and its motivation that is similarly useful, even though similarly restricted, as are our present tests in intelligence. 4

---

4Arnold, II, 363.
What Arnold evidently has in mind when she speaks of personality tests, and specifically the TAT, as being restricted is that, although the theory of TAT sequential analysis should hold good for various groups of individuals, there are refinements that are required for dealing with special groups. A group of convicts will receive higher scores on imports than should be given for the same imports obtained from stories by members of a religious community if the same score (2 and below) is to indicate non-constructive motivation for both groups. Until many more studies, such as the present one and the investigation done by Burkard, have been completed, there will be questions about the stories told by religious, for example, that will remain unanswered—questions about "dream stories," humorous stories, cynical stories, stories that end in a pun, and the like.

Two areas of investigation that have as yet gone unexplored involve longitudinal studies of religious candidates and comparative studies of religious from various age groups. The latter could reveal differences, for example, between the imports of stories told by the youngsters who are just beginning their religious life in the Junior Novitiate and the imports of stories told by veterans who have completed long years of service and are now retired.

As for the former, the longitudinal studies, if the potentialities of the TAT are to be explored, it is necessary that testing not only be done on candidates who are in various stages of formation but also on aspirants who have not yet been admitted to the houses of formation. Groups of candidates should be tested at the time they make application for admittance to the religious life and then periodically until, for example, they are graduated from college, take their perpetual vows, or leave the order. The evidence supplied by this investigation
is sufficiently strong to support the recommendation of further exploration in these areas. By using the TAT in longitudinal studies, two objectives could eventually be achieved. First of all, the scoring of imports from stories by incoming candidates would result either in the development of a cut-off point for the TAT as a screening device or the use of the TAT, in conjunction with other sources of information, as an important tool in the hands of those who are charged with deciding who should be admitted to formation and who should be refused. Secondly, the TAT could supply information on the kind of character growth that takes place in the houses of formation and yield valuable hints to those charged with spiritual direction on how various factors contributing to formation might be improved. A discussion of some of the kinds of information that comes from such a study is to be found at the end of this chapter (pp. 90-94).

Another possibility that may be explored is to score sequences as well as individual imports. Although it is true that presently the meaning of an import is derived in part from the sequence in which it is found, it is likely that the richness of meaning that is in the sequence is sometimes lost by scoring imports individually as though they were not related to one another. Actually in this case the whole is greater than the sum of its parts. Two sequences from protocols of good candidates will illustrate this point. The first example is based upon four stories written for pictures 8 through 11; the individual scores for each of the imports have been indicated in brackets.

6. Life is meant to be lived and not wasted in dissipation (4).

9. but there are men who avoid the strain of living lest it lead to a nervous breakdown; they prefer to do nothing at all (1).
10. for there are citizens of totalitarian states who want only to live a life of peace themselves and so they serve, but they live for only a brief time and die while the state goes on (2),

11. and in a democracy there are also problems: blatant imitation of what was once acceptable, soulless repetition and individual imagination that falls short of wholeness and completion (4).

In this sequence the author is exploring various aspects of a problem. Unless it is assumed that he is contradicting himself, all of these imports should have a unifying idea behind them. If imports 9 and 10 are taken individually, they receive relatively low scores; furthermore, they contradict the ideas contained in the eighth import and implied in the eleventh. If, however, they are considered in the context of the sequence of the four imports, it can be seen that they illustrate what is meant by "wasting" one's life (ninth import) and falling "short of wholeness and completion" (eleventh import). When the ninth and tenth imports in this particular sequence are scored without reference to the eighth and eleventh imports, the total score does not adequately reflect the author's real attitude and therefore is misleading.

The second example illustrates a similar predicament. These imports were derived from stories told to pictures 7 through 10:

7. Those who are mean, spiteful, and calculating sometimes manage to rise to power by devious means (1).

8. and only diabolic possession can explain the shockingly evil deeds and callousness of some people (3).

9. while others can take advantage of those who are young and thus make a fast buck (1);

10. but, if a man goes on exploiting others, he eventually is done in by his victim (4).

The burden of these imports is that the author does not approve of the exploitation of others; that this is so is verified by the tone of the eighth import
and explicitly in the tenth import as well as almost all the other imports in the protocol. But the scoring of the individual imports in this case tends to lower the total score because of import 7 and import 9. It would be possible to give all of these imports a positive score to reflect the author's real attitude, i.e., the overall import of this sequence of four imports. However, the danger involved in such scoring is that most test scores in a sample would tend to be at the extremes and would not discriminate sufficiently between the various subjects. An alternate method might be to score each import as has been done in the past and then also give a score of 1 to each import in a negative sequence and a score of 2 to each import in the positive section of a sequence. In this way both the imports taken individually and the sequence of imports would enter into the final score. Whether this method or another method will work best remains to be seen, but it is this kind of theorizing supported by scientific investigation that will "yield a measure of personality and its motivation."

Implications of This Investigation for Religious Formation

Although mention has been made throughout this study, and particularly in Chapter I (pp. 2-3) and the present chapter, of evidence that is pertinent to the formation of personality in the religious life, it seems well at this point to summarize this material. The effect of the religious vows on the development of personality integration, on the one hand, and the ease with which these same vows can be used by a candidate to support his poor motivation, on the other, is a problem that deserves serious consideration. An attempt will be made here to illustrate this problem in a concrete manner with evidence gleaned from the tests of young religious involved in this investigation.
In the imports of their tests these candidates revealed in general how they thought about and reacted emotionally to various situations. No doubt the conduct and the motives of these candidates are by all normal standards quite good. They would never have gotten as far in the religious life as they have if they were not. But their attitudes, though they result in acceptable conduct, sometimes do not measure up to the high ideals of the religious life. Some of the candidates lack the emotional drive to achieve fully goals that are implicit in the religious life.

There is a tendency on the part of some of the subjects in this investigation to prefer passivity and dependence in a given situation rather than to take the initiative to do something constructive about it. They hold back, they prefer to wait for direction in situations they are capable of handling themselves; they accept adverse fate with patience; they meditate on the futility of this world instead of making a positive contribution to it. It may be that in some cases the years they have spent in trying to learn to be obedient and detached from this world's attractions have resulted in this kind of mentality. But it is difficult to see how a person with this mentality will be able to assume the responsibilities which fall to religious superiors or even the leadership that is called for in the field of education, the profession to which the candidates in this study have vowed themselves.

In a similar way the spirit of poverty that is essential to the religious life may result in some instances in a candidate's not developing a proper sense of responsibility and value towards material things. Little mention is made of the value of work in the imports found in this investigation. The subjects seem to have little awareness of the satisfaction that can be gained from
a creative effort. Not infrequently this appreciation of the value of work is found in the tests of secular subjects. Work brings money, and money has its dangers for the religious; but it is one thing for a religious not to want to have money for himself and quite another thing not to appreciate how much things can cost. Practically none of the sixty-five candidates in this investigation reflected an attitude of thrift or economy in the thirteen hundred stories that were written. Can it be that training in poverty, detachment, and living the common life—where no one has anything that is really his own—has resulted in a lack of awareness or appreciation for these virtues?

Similarly, the observance of the virtue and the vow of chastity has its own peculiar dangers in the formation of personality. Often the imports concerning human relations reflect unrealistic attitudes that go to either of two extremes. Some candidates tend to romanticize human love and make it part of their dream world instead of coming to grips with the practice of charity in their everyday lives. Others tend to distrust their confreres and themselves; they feel as though they could never love anyone and they could never be loved. As a consequence, they fear any kind of personal relationship with others and prefer to live alongside others rather than with them. In this way they deprive themselves of the security and happiness that human friendship can provide and the motivation for helping others in their work as teachers.

Attitudes that reflect dependence, passivity, lack of responsibility, escapism, and withdrawal are indications that some of the subjects have never learned to approach their goals positively and without fear. Where this is so, religious formation has not been successful. In the worst instances it is not formation, however, that is at fault; the problem is that the screening of
candidates for the religious life has not been effective. Thus there are religious candidates who lack the emotional stability and the positive goals to make their lives meaningful and allow the grace of God a reasonable chance to operate in them effectively.

The evidence in this investigation also points to the fact that superiors and peers sometimes tend to judge religious candidates in terms of superficial qualities and are rather severe with an individual who may be a good character but who has some minor defect that mars his general appearance. This evidence makes us question the kind of practical ideal or standards that some religious use for judging their own worth in terms of positive qualities or, in the case of superiors, for measuring the promise of others in the religious life. Some judges penalized subjects because the latter were fat, had a peculiar way of speaking, or did not share the general enthusiasm of most men for certain forms of sports or popular recreation. Obviously for these judges the distinction between what is essential in a good candidate in the religious life and what is non-essential is rather confused. It is disconcerting to find that some judges, including superiors, give a candidate the highest possible rank while others, including superiors, give the same candidate the lowest possible rank. What are the standards of comparison?

At least in general terms the concept of what an excellent religious ought to be must be clear to both religious candidates and their superiors before they can determine the success they are achieving in striving for the religious ideal. The emphasis must be on positive and preferably specific attitudes and patterns of action. Neither the religious superiors nor the candidates involved in this investigation had any difficulty in recognizing or agreeing upon
what a religious should not be and what he should not do. But positive norms are needed. Superiors and subjects alike must reflect upon positive goals and make plans for action that will lead to these goals in their everyday life.

As this investigation with the TAT has shown, good candidates have positive attitudes that will make striving for their goals easier. These attitudes are of the calibre of those that receive a score of 4 in the scoring system presented in Appendix II (pp. 109-113). If religious superiors and candidates were to examine the attitudes listed there, they would find a practical measure for examining their own attitudes and the attitudes they are encouraging in others. This is a practical device that the TAT can contribute to religious formation. Coupled with an individual's protocol from sequential analysis, it will make a real contribution towards his effort in the religious life to achieve spiritual perfection.
CHAPTER V
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

For the good of the religious order and those who want to enter it, it is desirable that unsuitable candidates not be admitted to the first phase of training, the novitiate. Though various screening devices have been employed in the past, more and more superiors are turning to psychologists for additional help. But they are interested not only in excluding undesirable candidates; they also want tests that will enable them to evaluate the potential of those candidates who are admitted.

To date there have not been many scientific investigations in this area, and the few that have been conducted have not been notably successful. About the only psychological test that has shown any relevance is the intelligence test. Its power to discriminate among adolescent candidates does not seem to be sufficiently sharp, however, to eliminate those who are undesirable without running the risk of losing several promising candidates too, and it seems to have little pertinence to post adolescents who apply for admission to the major seminary or senior novitiate. At best, intelligence tests make it possible to gauge only one aspect, though an important one, of the qualities required of a candidate for a teaching order. The complementary motivational aspect is not covered.

The present investigation has been devoted to a study of the use of Arnold's Sequential Analysis of the TAT as a possible means of achieving an adequate measure of motivational patterns in young religious. This method of analysis has proven quite successful in discriminating between high and low
academic achievers, between efficient and inefficient teachers, between men who have had delinquent records and those whose records show no history of delinquency during or before their years of service in the Navy, and between college students who earn high and low grade point averages.

From stories written by a subject, an investigator derives imports, which are expressions of the moral judgments or attitudes which the subject feels about the kinds of actions he has portrayed in the stories. Such analysis enables the investigator to get a cross section of the kinds of prudential or moral judgments a subject makes in his everyday life. With the TAT he can determine the subject's self-ideal in action, predict whether he will act constructively or not, and determine whether he is psychologically normal or abnormal. It is obvious how such a test would lend itself to an assessment of motivational patterns of candidates to the religious life by both screening out undesirable candidates and helping those who enter the religious life to get a better estimate of their self-ideals and attitudes.

A pilot study done for the present investigation showed that it is possible to establish a scoring system using a scoring criterion based upon an empiric study of TAT stories written by religious candidates who were rated by their superiors at the extremes of a sample, that is, as very promising candidates or as candidates showing little promise. This scoring system, employing a range of scores from 1 to 4, provides a discrimination between the rather homogeneous subjects found in religious houses of formation and enables the investigator to make more refined mathematical calculations than a mere scoring of positive and negative imports as plus or minus.

The pilot study used only the extremes of a range of subjects in the
Junior Novitiate to develop the scoring system; the present investigation involves the full range of a group of Student Brothers, presently studying in college in California. Since the pilot study had as its subjects candidates who were much younger than the subjects of this investigation, a second pilot study was conducted with the extremes of a sample of 109 Student Brothers in Philadelphia to determine if any modifications were needed in the scoring system before it was used in this full range investigation. The results of this second pilot study indicated that no important changes were necessary, but it did offer some additional data for the scoring criterion. Much of this involved the scoring of imports that dealt with imagination and escape, singularity, authority figures, one's proper milieu, help from others, love as a motive, taking a gamble or depending on magic, and self-sacrifice.

The present investigation attempts to measure the agreement between the TAT scores of forty-five Student Brothers and their rankings as to promise for the Brotherhood by three groups of judges: a peer-group, their superiors, and ten high scorers on the TAT. All of the judges had lived with the subjects for a considerable length of time and so it seemed that they should be able to judge their potential as religious. All of the testing of subjects and rankings by judges were done anonymously so that neither the subjects nor the judges would feel constrained while participating in the experiment.

A subsequent examination of the rankings done by the judges showed that they had little difficulty in recognizing candidates who showed little promise, that they were substantially in agreement about the promising candidates, and that they had the most difficulty in agreeing on the candidates whose average rank fell within the middle range. In view of the homogeneous character of
this sample of candidates with which they had to work, homogeneity that has been brought about both by the screening of superiors and the selective factor imposed by the very nature of the religious life, the rankings of the judges offered criteria that were not as effective as, e.g., school achievement, but were still adequate.

The scores on the TAT correlated .59 (SE = .098) with the peer-judges' rankings; they correlated .61 (SE = .095) with the superiors' rankings; and they correlated .57 (SE = .103) with the high scorers' rankings. An additional correlation was done between the rankings of the peer-judges and those of the superiors; this correlation amounted to .65 (SE = .087). These correlations are much higher than those previously reported in studies of candidates to the religious life or seminarians. They reflect, however, the difficulty previously mentioned in ranking subjects in such a select group as those found in religious communities. Though each correlation indicates a substantial relationship between TAT scores and judges' rankings, there is not enough evidence to show that the judges' rankings were superior to those of the TAT scores. In view of the past successes reported with sequential analysis it is not improbable that the TAT is a better device for measuring promise for the Brotherhood, which is fundamentally a measure of motivation, than the rankings of the various groups of judges.

An examination of individual protocols shows that there are certain inherent difficulties in attempting to correlate TAT scores with rankings of religious candidates. A candidate who has the courage to leave the order may receive a score on the TAT that is higher than a less courageous confrere who remains in the order; a candidate who writes ambiguous stories poses a problem
for the investigator when the subjects for testing are anonymous; and a candidate who is fundamentally a man of sound character but who has certain minor exterior defects may receive a rank that is lower than the rank of some of the candidates whose attitudes are less positive but whose manner is more attractive.

The results of this investigation show also that the use of the Sequential Analysis of the TAT is still in its beginning stages and that much remains to be done before it will give the kind of satisfactory evaluation of motivational patterns that is desired. Though the general theory of the Sequential Analysis has been substantiated, certain modifications are necessary in formulating a scoring system, depending upon the type of candidates that compose a given sample; for example, the severity with which an import is scored may depend on whether the subjects involved in testing are convicts, delinquents, or members of a religious community.

Research must also be done on the TAT in the areas of longitudinal studies and comparative studies relevant to the ages of different groups of subjects. Another problem that might be studied is scoring in terms of the sequence of imports as well as the individual imports in a protocol.

The story imports of the candidates included in this investigation and the rankings done by some of the judges indicate that there is the danger of mistaking passivity, escapism, dependence, and withdrawal for those virtues that are desirable in the religious life such as obedience, humility, and docility. The vows of religion make for personality development, but they can also act as a crutch for immature candidates who are lacking the positive attitudes necessary to act constructively and with initiative in the situations which they
meet in their everyday life. It also seems that religious superiors and their subjects have not a clear idea of what a candidate who shows high promise for the religious life should be like but they have little difficulty in recognizing what a man should not be or what he should not do in the religious life. Until religious have an adequate notion of what an excellent religious is like, they will have great difficulty in determining their own success or that of others who are striving for the religious ideal. There is need for greater emphasis upon positive attitudes and preferably specific patterns of action.

The TAT can make its contribution to this need in two ways. If religious were to examine the kinds of attitudes that receive the highest score in the scoring system for the TAT, they would get an idea of the calibre of mind that is revealed in the tests written by the best members of a religious community and is expressed in their daily actions. If these same religious were to take the TAT themselves, and have its results explained to them, they would have an invaluable aid for measuring their own attitudes and ideals against the high ideals that are implicit in the life they have chosen.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

I. BOOKS


II. ARTICLES AND MONOGRAPHS


MacFarlane, J.W. "Problems of Validation Inherent in Projective Methods." 
*American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, XII (1942), 405-411.


Sanford, R.N. *The Thematic Apperception Test: Directions for Administration and Scoring.* Cambridge, Massachusetts, 1939 (mimeographed).


III. UNPUBLISHED MATERIAL

Brown, Joseph Eugene. "Personality Dynamics of High and Low Academic Achievers in High School, a Modeled Thematic Apperception Test Reliability Study," Unpublished Master's Thesis (St. Louis University, St. Louis, 1953).


APPENDIX I

GRAPH I

AVERAGE RANKINGS AND CORRESPONDING VARIANCES
OF FORTY-FIVE SUBJECTS DONE BY THEIR PEERS
GRAPH II

TAT SCORES OF FORTY-FIVE SUBJECTS
COMPAOLED WITH THEIR RANKINGS BY FORTY-FIVE PEERS

Average Rankings by Peers

Average TAT Scores
GRAPH III

TAT SCORES OF FORTY-FIVE SUBJECTS
COMPAEED WITH THEIR RANKINGS BY TWO SUPERIORS
GRAPH IV

TAT SCORES OF FORTY-FIVE SUBJECTS
COMPARED WITH THEIR RANKINGS BY TEN HIGH TAT SCORERS

Average TAT Scores
APPENDIX II

SCORING FOR THE SEQUENTIAL ANALYSIS OF THE TAT

Instructions: When you are in doubt about the meaning of an import, check the sequence in which the import is found. When it is possible to score for different aspects of an import, score for achievement first. If achievement is not mentioned, then score for another aspect.

Infrequently a story may not be complete and the outcome is indicated in the following story. In such cases the use of parentheses has been employed in which case both imports receive the same score which is determined by the outcome of the second import in the series.

Scoring 4 on an Import: Outgoing, well-intentioned, prudent action.

Achievement because of supernatural or ethical motives, own effort, initiative, virtue, definite goal or definite means, accepting one's own limitations, realistic adaptation, positive action with the help of others when one has done all that he can do himself, *by finding one's own proper milieu, *by insisting upon one's right to determine one's own work in life, *by seeking professional help for problems that require it, *(when the foregoing imports are derived from a dream sequence, all the action must take place in the dream).

Work brings enjoyment.

Failure in achievement or work because of a lack of the above (under achievement), because of impulsive or imprudent action, or because of ill-intentioned action.

Loss, harm, danger, threat overcome by positive action (see Achievement above) or suffered in a positive way, avoided if it cannot possibly be overcome. In the face of great misfortune which cannot be overcome (e.g., the death of a loved one), one prays but also indicates he will carry on. *In case of such misfortune, one uses pretense to alleviate pain in a situation which must be endured and cannot be changed.

Good relationships by outgoing action, by good will, good fellowship, avoiding singularity, accepting one's own limitations, resisting temptation, avoiding or escaping bad influences or bad companions, *through self-sacrifice that may involve the losing of one's life.

Failure by the reverse of the above (under Good Relationships).
Revenge is rejected or repented accompanied by positive action (by doing something about it).
It is necessary to distinguish between revenge which seems to imply getting even or paying a person back in kind and punishing for wrong doing. Revenge usually seems to imply taking the law into one's own hands. Note the following examples:
A man shoots another man for killing his wife instead of going to the police and allowing justice to take its course.
A boy harms his teacher because she has given him low grades.

Legitimate punishment:
A young wife refuses to permit her slightly intoxicated husband to kiss her.
A mother spanks her son for tinkering with the sewing machine.
A woman hits her husband in the nose because he has been unfaithful to her.

Legitimate enjoyment is earned

Excessive enjoyment or making it the primary goal results in failure, punishment by fate, by the law, or by another.

Wrong doing is punished (even though the doer may not know that what he has done is wrong).

Excessive fear leads to destruction.

Fears prove groundless through the positive action of the one who is afraid.

Scoring 3 on an Import: Well-intentioned, prudent, positive but more passive.

Achievement by taking thought rather than acting, seeking advice (by doing something active) rather than doing one's own thinking, eternal reward in spite of one's present failures, by acting after seeking help from others. Success that is eventually enjoyed because one was forced to do something which he finally learned to like.

Failure in achievement by the reverse of the above. Failure in achievement through carelessness, disproportionate punishment or loss for action involved.

Loss, harm, danger, threat accepted with resignation and hope (no depression), countered by forced action, avoided rather than overcome with positive action when the problem is relatively unimportant and does not involve responsibility.
Worry about future loss or harm despite present success.

Good relationships because others cooperate, depending upon another to take the initiative or even maneuvering the person to get him to take the initiative because of one’s own shyness. Refusing to do something unimportant (not involving responsibility) out of fear of what others might think.

Revenge is frustrated or punished or succeeds first and is later punished.

Legitimate enjoyment is too intense under the circumstances but is not thought of as a primary goal; enjoyed freely though not evidently earned.

Ill-intentioned action is simply repented (without intense remorse or guilt, without punishment, without restitution).

Scoring 2 on an Import: Motivated from outside, motivated by negative emotion.

Achievement because of wanting to please others, helped or advised by others, waiting for another’s approval or permission for doing something one has the right to do, wanting fame or recognition, in spite of vague goals or means, by wishing, by passive virtue (e.g. patience), promising to do better in the future, by prayer alone, by fate, by chance, *by playing a long shot. Last minute repentence gives eternal reward. Feeling self-satisfied because one belongs to an achieving group although no effort on one’s own part is indicated. One shows approval of another’s achievements without indicating positive action for himself.

Failure in achievement because others do not help, advise, cooperate, due to unavoidable circumstances, by accident.

Success in spite of vague goals or means, by wishing, by passive virtue (e.g., patience) when action is called for, by promising to do better, by prayer, by fate, by chance.

Good relationships with others from negative motives, fear of punishment, fear of danger, fear of losing love, fear of losing the esteem of others.

Loss, harm, danger, threat accepted passively where positive action is possible, overcome through the efforts of others alone without the person himself doing anything, solved by fate without any positive action, faced with sadness, with resignation, solved by the passage of time or just cleared up without any evident cause, compensated for by others without one’s doing anything positive.
Ill-intentioned action has indecisive outcome. One is still hesitant as to whether he should yield to temptation or not.

Ill-intentioned action goes practically unpunished or is treated platitudinously or in a routine manner involving "eternal damnation" as a cliche. Ill-intentioned action is punished in an extreme manner that is all out of proportion to the offense.

Platitudes, unfeeling observations, "philosophic thoughts" concerning, e.g., God and His beauty, etc., without any positive action indicated, inspiration that leads to action without genuine emotional tone. (The emotional tone may be judged by the other imports in the series and the general manner in which the story or stories have been written.)

Scoring 1 on an import: Constructive action prevented by negative emotion, is avoided, or is frustrated.

Success or achievement through magic or highly unlikely means (distinguish between magic or highly unlikely means and rare but perfectly possible means, e.g., prayers in 2 above. Also, though a "long shot" in gambling is scored with a 2, when the long shot involves great risk, employs very unlikely means, and could well result in very unfortunate consequences, then the long shot should be considered a form of magic); *by pretending reality is not so in order not to have to meet its demands.

Active effort results in failure, giving up, frustrated by others, by God, by fate, avoided because of laziness, difficulty, ends in despair, good people suffer along with the bad people when the emphasis of the story is on the good people.

*Love solves everything or is romanticized as an escape.

Bad relationships lead to no real problems, harmless results, even success. One refuses to take any responsibility because of what others might think of him even though he has a serious obligation. Refusal to betray evil companions who have done serious harm.

Escape from responsibilities, difficulties, or legitimate punishment is successful.

Harm, loss, danger, threat lead to impulsive or desperate action, prevent action altogether, end in despair, result in destruction, result in altogether unlikely means that overcomes them, *are part of a dream from which a person awakes to find himself safe, just aren't so because of a mistaken judgment (no positive action is necessary to correct the judgment), are the result of harmless
action, caused by supernatural motivation, result from virtuous action, result from legitimate pleasure or recreation.

Legitimate pleasure brings harm.

Ill-intentioned action is approved or goes scot free, successful escape from legitimate authority or other consequent difficulties. Not carried out because fate or other accidental circumstances or actions of others make it unnecessary, is fixed up by a deathbed repentance. Evil doing remains a mystery and thus no punishment comes to the evil doer.
APPENDIX III

PROTOCOLS AND STORIES OF
THREE FALSE POSITIVES AND ONE FALSE NEGATIVE

Subject A's Protocol (False Positive):

Score: (3)

1. If a man with a handicap is lonely and bored, he may be forced to do something and eventually learn to like it and be happy.

2. and, if a man sets his heart on a good thing, he can persuade others to let him pursue it.

3. and, even if he is disappointed in not winning out over everyone, he can look at the good side of the experience—the excitement and fun of it.

4. Love for someone who is good can bring a man to his senses and so he overcomes his temptation to revenge.

5. but, if he tries to hang on to a love he has lost, he will mystify others and even shock them.

6. A man must be willing to hurt a loved one rather than betray his conscience.

7. but he must also listen to good advice from a loved one and thus learn to value self-control and respect for authority.

8. A man can learn from another to disregard his limitations and concentrate on his abilities and be happy.

9. but when a man who works hard has no opportunity for recreation, he will yield to bouts of self-indulgence.

10. Loved ones will accept the changes that come in a man's life even if it means giving up cherished plans.

11. and he can come to realize that, though a person may have been taught to be gentle, that person can be courageous when the situation calls for it.

12. If a man yields to passion, he will try to free himself of the guilt by destroying his partner in evil.

13. or he can work hard to escape his present environment and achieve his heart's desire.
14. When a man is lonely and misses old friends, he can try to rejoin them and thus relieve his loneliness.

15. and though feelings of confinement may tempt him to black despair, another will help him to achieve his freedom again.

16. A man who is out of his element is not happy, but he will find happiness doing what he enjoys with those who are his own kind.

17. and, though he may not be able to solve a problem immediately, his imagination can suggest a clue to its solution and so he works it out.

18. and, if he is true to his own inner feelings and pursues the vocation of his choice, success eventually is his regardless of the conditions under which he works.

19. but a man must not allow himself to be misled by others and must make his own decision to do what is right.

20. It is with mixed feelings (which beginners would not understand) that a man who is older will look back upon his work for he knows that past achievements are perishable—all is passing.
1. Gilbert is not like most boys his age because at ten years old he is blind. When he was just old enough to start school, five years old, he had been playing with a friend next door who was several years his senior. In the course of their play a firecracker had exploded unexpectedly costing his eye. The next two years that followed were exceedingly gloomy and lonesome as he was unable to play with his friends and had nothing to do which interested him. Then his father had brought him home a violin which he didn't want to play. Being forced by his parents to take lessons, he soon discovered that he could produce something beautiful and interesting enough to captivate all of his attention. For the past couple of years now he had been happy and almost completely forgot his blindness for he could now do something which he really loved doing.

2. Margaret, then sixteen years old, thought that surely she could make her own decisions, but her father thought differently. He was determined. Like all fathers of that period, he was determined that she should remain in the home. He thought that the place for a girl was home helping her mother and, when old enough, she was to be married and still remain in the home. Margaret had argued with him for many months but to no avail. However, after a year and a half of discussion, her father began to weaken. He saw that her heart was not in what she was doing at home, but it was in the school far away. Therefore, because of her own determination, and because she had in some way convinced him of the good of an education, he let her go to school just as she had always desired.

3. That morning of July twenty-ninth had been a happy one for Jim. He had awakened all excited for today was the day of the big race. Since school had let out in May, he had anticipated and practiced for this race. He desired only one thing—to win that race. He lost! He had tried so hard as he could, but one boy was just faster. He had come home tired and discouraged. He told his father about the race and how disappointed he was in merely coming in second for he wanted to win. But his father explained that there were many things better than winning. Jim now realized that he had left the fact that he had not won completely ruin everything.

"After all," he thought, "I did have a lot of fun practicing with the guys and the race had been exciting."

4. Now he knew for sure. His best friend had betrayed him. He had suspected just a little for the last couple of months that something was phoney about that business deal. Now Thomas knew that he had been cheated of five thousand dollars, almost his entire savings. Hurt and mad he drove with one thought in his mind. There was a gun from the dresser drawer. He wanted to kill that person who once had been his friend. As he was taking out the gun, he met his wife. He had to explain to her what he was doing, not because he wanted to but because he loved her. While explaining to her and looking into her eyes, Tom knew that he would not commit murder. The goodness of his wife
and his love for her completely conquered all hurt, all the hate that he had just experienced.

5. That cool gray morning of December tenth she had finally gotten a job. Mary did not mind being a maid, but soon she discovered that her employer was extremely nervous and irritable and was completely obsessed with one idea which she was not able yet to understand. Besides having her clean the house in which he said he and his wife, now dead three months, had lived, he made her close all of the windows in the kitchen, set up a bed in there, and put all his books from the library on the table. He explained that he would remain there a couple of days. Mystified she did all that he had asked. He entered the kitchen and she went about the house cleaning. Later that day, smelling a strange odor that appeared to come from the kitchen, she went to investigate and what she found solved all her unspoken questions. Her strange acting employer had committed suicide by gas.

6. There are times when we must hurt even those whom we love the most, like our own mother. This Alex realized extremely well right at the moment. He had led a life of dissipation and had been extremely unhappy until about six months ago. It was at that time that he had met Father O'Connor, who just yesterday had baptized him. All this was unknown to his mother who disliked, even hated, any mention of anything Catholic. Now as he explained the situation to his mother, he realized how much he hurt her, but even more he realized that he had to do what he had done because it was the only right thing.

7. At college William had been away from home. Being away from home had given him a feeling of independence. In fact he became so strongly attached to his own freedom that he completely disregarded authority. Now at home again, having been asked to leave college because he had disobeyed almost all existing rules, he found himself speaking with his father. Strangely he found that he even hated the authority of his own father. But as they discussed what type of life he would now have to lead he came to respect the wisdom and experience of his father and found that his dislike for authority, even his own father's, was mitigated. More and more he came to see things with the same logical sense of his father, and he agreed to his mistakes, which he hadn't admitted before and decided to write again to the Dean asking if possible a second chance explaining that now he felt himself capable of acting properly and realized his faults.

8. Nathaniel could not play ball. In fact he did not enjoy games as much as the other boys, yet he wanted to be one of a group. After having tried to the utmost of his ability and having failed, he ran to his teacher crying. He asked his teacher why he could not do what the other children were doing, why when he explained what he felt to them that they never understood. His teacher explained to him that he was not like the other boys, but that he had a most unusual tendency to study and to beauty. He, his teacher explained, was more imaginative, thought like an artist, and in this way was a little different than many boys. His teacher gave him some books to read and said that was
where his talent lay. Nathaniel, no longer thinking of his failures but of his capacities, gradually became very happy.

9. It had been a hard job, one of extreme monotony and little compensation. All week long, day and night, they had been working hard for it is a real job pulling a boat upstream. After long hours of labor and no relaxation they finally received their pay. The only facilities for rest at these times were the many bars. So in they dragged themselves. They got drunk, forgot their jobs, and finally dropped all in a pile in a field near the bars until someone else came to pick them up. This was the life that Bill had been living for the past six months.

10. He had received his notice. He was in the army. With this news Joe drove home to his young wife. He had to tell her that he was going and yet he hated to. He knew that she had been planning so much that they could do and now that he would be gone it would be impossible. He dreaded getting out of the car and he did so slowly. When he met her, he did not even have to explain, she understood, she read it in his face and in the way he walked. Relieved, he hugged her and didn't even say a word. He marveled how she could give up all she wanted for the love of him.

11. Andrew at the age of eighteen had not yet been in a real fight before. Several times he had been angry, but never had he actually hit anyone. His mother had always told him that this was wrong, and he had avoided it. But now he was in a circle of boys who were shouting as another boy continued to pound his hands and arms as he crouched double. Hurt, Andrew suddenly started to fight back and forgot to remember what his mother had always told him. He realized that there are times when even that which appears wrong will be right.

12. It was back in May that Abernathy had first started to go with Abilene, unknown to his wife. He hadn't meant much at first, but later Abilene had grown upon him and he spent several nights in hotels with her explaining to his wife that he was on business trips. But after the first few months he had become tired of Abilene and his conscience reproached him for his infidelity to his wife. His self reproach he even came to place upon Abilene so that more and more he came to hate her till finally he murdered her in her bed thus hoping to rid himself of all the trouble, reproaches, and anxiety he had entered back in May.

13. Joe had long desired to go to Paris, having heard and read long stories about the wonderful city. Yet much to his discouragement he did not have the money. He worked long tedious hours in a bank as a teller till he finally saved up enough money to go. Now in Paris as he looked out into the night his desire was fulfilled. Spread out before him was the beautiful city of Paris.

14. He was up to this time sad and restless. All his friends which he had made and kept for so long were dead, the last of them J.P. Smith had
just recently died. Julian spent much time doing nothing till one day he decided to visit the cemetery where most of his friends were buried. There, unexplainedly, he came to understand that he could no longer come to know them physically, but yet in a way in prayer he could still be with them. With this realization the lonesomeness he had experienced was gone.

15. It was a frame, but still he had been thrown in prison. And the Bastille Prison is horrible, dark, damp. After many months of nothing to do, sitting in darkness and hardly any sight of human life, he finally despaired. Then he received a note saying that he would soon be set free. He dared not hope, yet he did and slowly it began to capture more and more of him. Then, Jean Carlson, victim of a frame, was led into the light. It blinded his eyes, yet he did not mind for it meant freedom.

16. Pete had no parents, they were dead. He lived with his aunt, but he gradually was getting tired of his life there. Too much school, too much dressing up for "high class" friends. When the circus was in town he went to see it and revealed in its freedom and the many sights and wonders of this new world. He made friends with the caretaker of the huge elephants and when the circus left town Pete went with it.

17. Ike sat at his desk and shifted positions many times. He didn’t know the answer to that question. The last question of the test and he had no idea how to answer it. Large and bold it read: "Explain the main meaning of the 'Hound of Heaven'". He didn’t know; couldn’t remember. Slowly he began to dream of a movie he had seen last night of a person who had been chased by the cops for a year after committing murder. The murderer had finally been caught. That’s it! He remembered now the poem about God seeking after the soul of a man. Quickly he began writing.

18. He had given up his business and he spent all of his money on paints. His friends called him crazy, yet he still wanted to paint. Nothing mattered; he had to paint. Year after year he found that his paintings were disregarded and he had lived in poverty. Yet it was worth it all for Michael could now view one of his paintings on the wall of the museum.

19. Raphael joined the gang but he never thought that it would be this bad. Yet here he stood in the dark waiting to kill a man who would soon walk along. The boss had ordered it. Yet should he? When he was told to do it, he was horrified and still he had to do it or be thrown from the gang. He walked up and down muttering. Then he walked away—he had made his decision.

20. When he was twenty Ralph had put all his energy into building the dam. He had spent many hours studying to become an engineer and this had been his first chance to show the profit of his studies. Now thirty years later as he looked at this broken wall which had been his dream, he suffered from mixed feelings. He realized that no matter how hard he worked to do something it was always passing and didn’t last long. As a younger man he would not have understood it; now he was older.
Subject B's Protocol (False Positive):

Score: 1. Despite his efforts and desires, a man's ambition may suddenly be crushed by fate.

2. and despite a man's efforts to get around obstacles to his happiness, he sees that there is no solution for new ones keep rising up.

3. Rumors can greatly exaggerate the facts and so a man's fears can prove to be without foundation.

4. but he himself has to make something of his life instead of depending on the influence of others to do it for him,

5. though sometimes people surprise you by being on hand unexpectedly.

6. A man not confident in his ability to care for himself should provide for help from others should it be needed.

7. Affection for another is placed above material gain.

8. A man may want to follow his first enthusiasm, but when friends and reason counsel patience he is willing to take a humble rather than a glamorous job.

9. for a humble job has its own compensations and will not detract from a man's dignity.

10. so long as he does not defy the moral code--which might seem attractive at first but actually brings unhappiness in the end.

11. A man's sensitivity may be so acute that he hesitates to harm the slightest thing, but eventually he must realize that he must do so to get what he needs for his well being.

12. for when a man is overly sensitive to a minor problem, he cannot weather the storm of a major misfortune when it comes.

13. Once a man flirts with temptation and sin, he will become so involved that he does very great evil to extricate himself from the consequences of his weakness,

14. and so he solves his problem by taking the easy way out.

15. but a man who yields to evil impulses will be completely frustrated in the end.

16. and so a man should accept his responsibilities though they may involve great sacrifice for him.
17. If a man is overly confident and fails to take precautions—-is a loner,—he may be destroyed by a situation that is beyond his control.

18. or, if a man acts foolishly just to amuse himself, he will have to pay for the consequences of his foolishness.

19. A man must do his job out of a sense of duty and despite the hardships involved.

20. but when he has no friends and no attachments, he will find no fun in his hours off.
Subject B's TAT Stories:

1. Jim is a ten year old boy twenty years ago. He thought that he would like to play the violin, but it is hard. He didn't realize it at first so he asked his father to buy one. Now he had a violin. Here it was. Could he play it? Well, not at first. He tarried but nothing good came of it. He needed to be taught. Would he practice and go through the hard discipline to play it well? He hoped so. He would have to earn the money for the lessons himself.

He had now gotten a paper route and a promise of a job at a grocery store for the summer when his folks' house caught fire and the violin was destroyed.

2. The school teacher was looking for a husband. Taking care of the children in the school was nice and a noble job, that she knew; but they were not her children. She wanted her own children, and now that she was away from her mother she counted on getting a husband. It wasn't easy getting away from mother. There were good teaching jobs in California, but mother promised that she would be out there within a year or two. It wasn't until she told her mother that Oak Ridge, Vermont, was offering a very suitable job that mother backed out.

Now she was up in these hills. There weren't many people there. They were suspicious of strangers so she had to thaw things out the first year. Now she was being accepted, and she had her eye on Pete Nathaniel. He was nearly the same age, blond, and had a good smart head. But she found that he had a mother like hers and so she would never be able to get him.

3. Ralph was surely lost. The earthquake twenty minutes ago which she felt the tremmors from in her own home sent a side of a mountain hurtling down on the Union Pacific tracks as the streamliner was going by. The radio report that she had heard said that all were believed to be lost.

A neighbor, Mrs. Conford, came over curious if that was the train that Ralph was coming home on. Much to Mrs. Conford's surprise, it was. Well, she was a good neighbor, and she would try to cheer her up and catch any more news. But the poor wife would not stand to hear the broadcaster's voice. So after three, Mrs. Conford went back home. It was about the time that the train was supposed to have come in.

She went into the house and threw herself down on the sofa. Mr. Conford has just gotten in. He had been listening to the radio's report as he drove home. Now the accurate story had been received. The slide had covered the front part of the train to the luggage car, but the passenger section was safe.

4. Mary Charbine had lived a varied life since graduating from high school. After several jobs, she moved east where the stage was more popular. It was an enjoyable experience in a way. She had managed to get along although she was never in a play more than a few months at a time. At last it was going to change. She was engaged.

Bob Klatchy needed a job. Mary had met him a year ago. They had bit
parts in a play together. They had had a few dates together. That was all. Now he was desperately in need of a new job. He started drinking and tonight was the worst night of his life. He had come to Mary's apartment for help. She would take care of him, but he died before that night was over.

5. What's that noise? I thought that I heard something. Such were the thoughts of Miss Appleton. There was nothing there. There was no noise. At least so it appeared. But she did check. She went into the living room, the dining room, the hall, back to the living room to the front entrance. Now she heard giggles. It was in the closet. Well, it was her sister's family. Surprise!

6. Mrs. Johnson thought things were going fine. Her son who was married and had three children of his own was worried about his mother. This apartment she lived in was nice and had plenty of rooms. She could still cook her own meals, take care of the apartment, and keep occupied. But her son was worried. What if she should suddenly get sick. Who would know it. Not him. He lived fifty miles away. No one else in the family was any closer. Well, she would think about it.

Two weeks later she got a slight case of the flu. In the morning when she woke up she felt too horrible to get up. It wasn't until noon that she could get anything to eat. Yes, she would move to the retired peoples' apartment that was being built across town.

7. Not many people get along with their boss as Mr. Thompson did. Mr. Bull was like a father to him. Maybe because he hadn't had a father since he was two that it was like this. Now his wife demanded that he get a better job or a raise. Mr. Bull would not give a raise unless he wanted to and it was his own idea. Well, maybe Mr. Thompson could work it since he was like a son to Mr. Bull. No was the answer from Mr. Bull. Mrs. Thompson demanded that he get another job. He liked his job and put her off for nearly a year. Then Mr. Bull died. It was a tragedy to Mr. Thompson, but the new boss gave him a raise immediately.

8. Nothing like war to show the heroism that people like. Bill was wanting to go to war, but his teachers, his parents, and the armed forces people wanted him to stay in school until he graduated from high school. He would be of little help to them until he had gotten an education. Then he could work in the intelligence division. But he wanted to fight. There was nothing noble in office work. Yet he did not have the rebellious spirit enough to go into the service against everyone's advice. So he did wait and did go into paper work in the service during the war.

9. Picking isn't much of a job. Sam knew it, but then it did let you get out in the open during the best months. It called for some physical activity which he was looking for. And he met people, a kind of people that he had never really known. He did take this summer to work in the fields although everyone thought him nuts to do it. His reputation, his dignity, people had argued.

Now he wondered if he wasn't a little bit nuts. Well, he didn't care
if he was. He would pick. News came to him that he would lose his job if he continued to waste his time. But when fall came he went back to the school and they let him take his office as dean of education.

10. "I love you." The children were shocked. The woman was Mrs. Emily Frank and he was Mr. John White. They each had their spouse living. The children were having a birthday party at the Franks. Little Bill Frank, whose birthday it was, told the children that it was nice to see Mommy so happy since Daddy made her sad.

But a year later Bill was still living with Mommy, but Daddy was now Mr. White and he made Mommy happy, but Bill didn't think that it was so nice any more. He didn't like Mr. White. He didn't like Mr. Frank. He didn't think that anybody liked him since Mommy liked Mr. White so he ran away from home.

11. One bright-sunny day in the deep forests a deer was wandering through the forests as usual. He came upon a tree that had leaves on it. Most of them were evergreen of one sort or another. Here was an oak tree with a caterpillar on it. Here was something interesting to the deer. He looked at it for a while. He wanted to eat the leaf, but that would disrupt the caterpillar. So he waited for some time more and finally he took the leaf and ate it and the butterfly and all.

12. John went home from the dance mad. He went to it happy thinking that a girl would be there who wasn't. He tried to make the most of the dance even though she wasn't there, but everything failed. He came home dejected.

He came into the house crying, "Mom, help." He found his mother and said again, "Mom, help." She did nothing. He put his hand on her and found her unconscious. He started to shake her; more and more he shakes her. She does nothing. He recovers his senses and calls a doctor. He comes and examines her. She is dead. An autopsy is performed and it is found that he killed her. It was due accidentally to his shaking her to death. John from this time lives a half existence as in a dream from then on. Just sorta dopey.

13. Bob was a student working part time. It was his final year but one when he would have his dental degree. But he had gotten married this year with the understanding that they would practice birth control for their first year since he would not be able to support a kid until he finished school. Tonight he slipped. They had gotten excited and gone farther than they had thought they would. What if she does get pregnant? Should they have an abortion done? Bob doesn't know what to do. He can't afford a child now and yet he doesn't think that an abortion is right. But he does decide that an abortion should be done if she does become pregnant.

14. Bill was seventeen and just finishing high school. What should he do after graduation. His mother went to college, and she would like him to do the same. He is an only son. His father is dead. He left enough money so that they can get along all right although the mother works. Bill could work his way through school easy enough. He could go into the service and get that over with right away. He doesn't know what he wants to become. If he went to
college, it would be hard since studies only come about average to him. So the
easiest thing to do would be to join the service which he does.

15. The happy hunting ground or whatever the name of the graveyard in
L.A. that is the supreme of "dolled up" cemeteries has lots of things. But
Lochin Panschle didn't think that it had everything. It was missing a monster.
Death is horrible. The corrupting body stinks, and that is what he thought of
death. When he dies, Lochin thinks that the best thing to do with his body is
to throw it in a ditch. But all the bodies in the cemetery were missing that.
So he would provide stinking bodies for the graveyard. First he dug up buried
bodies. Then he robbed them from the rooms that they were in before the blood
was drained and finally he started killing people and leaving them there. He
just went on doing these things until he died. But he didn't get the indecent
burial he thought he deserved. The state buried him in a country cemetery.

16. The buses between Sacramento and San Francisco go fast and regu­
lar, nor are they ever delayed by "acts of God" unless the Sacramento River
overflows. Thus one night the express was in for trouble. The driver was
speeding along the freeway in the construction zones. It was night and there
was no work being done so the traffic was going at a good speed. The car in
front of him began to slow down, so the bus pulled into the next lane to pass.
The car started to go to the right to turn off the freeway, but it hit a tem­
porary support which gave way and sent the beams above down on the car and the
tail end of the bus. It crushed the rear end and a fire broke out. It seemed
certain that it would hit the gas tank and explode any second, but the driver
held his stand and got everything set with every living passenger out before he
left. It exploded as he left and the flying parts killed him.

17. Mike Norbert lived by the ocean by himself. Daily he went down
the cliff by means of a rope to swim. It was not the safest thing, since there
was no one around if he got into trouble. But he thought that he could survive.
He had a couple of scaring incidents during one year, but that only increased
his confidence. He saved himself those times and thought that he could do it
the next time. One day three juvenile thugs were beach combing and they came
by. They were looking for some excitement so they jumped in the water and took
out after him. He hadn't noticed that they meant trouble, but when they jumped
on him he knew then. So he started fighting them and tried to work towards the
shore. The kids tried to drown him. Mike fought back and drowned one of the
youths, but he was pretty well exhausted after that. The other two noticed
this so they jumped Mike both at once and managed to down Mike.

18. Flemming was a fool around. Anything for a joke. He one night
dressed up like one of his buddies' buddies, Pete, and showed up at Jean's
house. Pete had made a date with Jean that night, but he hadn't gotten there.
Jean had only once before gone with Pete on a triple date so Flemming took her
out. His friends thought that that was a great joke. So he did a repeat per­
formance a month or so later and this time they both had such a high time with
the aid of liquor that they decided to elope. They ran over to the next state
and got a quick marriage. The next morning he knew that it was a mistake, but
he was stuck.
19. A fierce and miserable night it was, but a job is a job. Nick would have to go out there in the cold and walk a half a mile to the bus line and then wait for the bus, no telling how long. He couldn't drive because only the thoroughfares were cleared enough to drive on. So he knew that he wouldn't get through the drifts on his street with the car. But he had to go to work. He was an armored truck driver and so the company expected him to be dependable. But this morning was worse than usual. He was supposed to be at work at four-thirty. He had better go out and brave the weather. He doubted that his job depended upon it this once. But still out of a sense of duty he got out there and went to work.

20. Mike McCormick was looking for some excitement. All day he worked on an assembly line as an auto worker. He wasn't married and he didn't know what to do with his nights. So here he stood on a street corner. He thought that there might happen something nearby, a fire, an accident, or something. He stood there and watched the people go by. He studied the characters. He was asked for a light. Maybe he figured somebody a little shady might approach him with some kind of offer. Nothing happened. A bum came by and asked a passing couple for a quarter but he passed Mike by. He stood around some more and nothing happened. So he finally went home.
1. When a man is neglected by one who should love him, he will have to take action that will make that person realize what is happening.

2. whereas, if a man neglects one whom he should love, he will not be happy until he comes to his senses and realizes the happiness love can bring.

3. Though a man may have his limitations, he can through hard work prove his value and dedicate himself to what is worth-while.

4. whereas, if he seeks revenge when his pride is hurt, he will lose everything in the bargain.

5. for a man who yields to impulse will lose out,

6. so he must face his limitations and find his freedom in doing what he has the talent to do.

7. A man cannot determine his own principles subjectively but must reconcile them with his objective duty.

8. and, if he tries to have his own way unrealistically, he must be stopped.

9. There are men who are insensitive to the rights of others,

10. and who place the blame for their own problems on others,

11. but when a man gives in to his feelings he brings about his own downfall.

12. If a man is lacking in faith, no one can help him and he is a victim of his own blindness,

13. so a man should be true to himself and do what he knows is right.

14. Only a man who has been spoiled and is mentally sick will go after what he wants imprudently and bring on his own destruction,

15. and, if a man who does not get what he wants seeks revenge, he will suffer the same fate as that which he inflicted on his victims.

16. Life has its pleasures that lighten a man's work and so he is thankful for them.

17. and, if misfortune comes, a man should not blame others and harm them without reason or his life will be darkened by feelings of guilt.
18. Though a man has been a fake all of his life, if he has the courage to try he can succeed,

19. but if a man lacks courage and devises schemes to avoid doing what he should, he will perish in his scheming.

20. for when a man lacks faith in himself and blames external circumstances for his evil ways, he will come to a bad end.
1. Tony sat staring at the thing on the table. "What is this thing? This piece of wood? What meaning does it contain? Why was my father so involved with this funny shaped wooden box? Why? Why? Why does not my father play with me any more? Why?"

For six months Tony's father did not pay any attention to him. This was strange for since Tony was a child, his father cuddled him. Tony was now nine years, and this strange turn of events puzzled him. Why his father, all of a sudden, annoyed him?

"Mother, what is this thing on the table?" Tony cried.

"Why, it's the violin that your father has been working on for months. It plays sweet music."

Music, Tony thought, does music mean more to him than I do? Music? For hours Tony stares at the violin. His Dad came into the room, and Tony stares at him. His Dad had a strange look in his eyes. His Dad reached for the violin. Tony grabbed it first, and he smashed it over the chair.

Tony's Dad stood, gazing at the pieces as if he were in a trance. Then after minutes that seemed like hours to both Tony and his Dad, they embraced. Tears covered their faces which only a few moments ago had been covered with anger and confusion.

2. The clouds were black as Ann came back from the school house. Ann was twenty years old having been married by her father, a cotton farmer in Virginia, to Tom a hard working boy. Ann detested the marriage violently for she wanted to be an actress. Though she had been married two years, she never slept with her husband; and she kept going to school so that some day she might realize her dream.

She thought that she despised her husband until two months ago when Jean and her husband, two Negro slaves, came to work on Tom's farm. Jean was an educated woman; she had had her chance while working as the servant of a school teacher in the north. She married her husband, and she became a slave because he was one. Jean always seemed so happy and especially in the evening. Ann would see her standing on the porch looking at Tom and her husband working side by side in the field.

Today Jean looked much happier because she was to give birth to a baby in a month. Ann looked long at Jean and then at the little school house. Oh, how she wished that those two years had been different. Now she knew that Jean and her simple life brought more happiness than New York. Today she knew that Tom had always loved her, and she always him. Today a producer offered her a part in a show, a leading role, if only she would lie with him. Now she knew that the world of New York, the lights, were a sham. Tom and the soil were life and happiness. She flung her books away and for the first time flung herself into Tom's arms. She tasted the salt, and she felt the tenderness of his brow and she knew the love of her for him and of his heart.

3. Donald threw himself on the couch and wept and laughed to his heart's content. Donald was an average American boy, except that he had a hair lip. His parents tried to have it corrected, but the doctors said it was of no use. He would have it all his life.
Always Donald was haunted by the fact that his face was not normal. Donald knew his parents loved him, and he had three good friends--his dog, a blind girl next door, and his coach.

But today, his sixteenth birthday, he was going to prove to the world that the face is not the only beautiful part of a man. Today at three, Donald would prove to the world that the human body and spirit are just as beautiful and even more so than the face. Donald ran the mile at a record breaking pace. And as he ran, he knew his body and his spirit were racing to be dedicated to his fellow man. And now all worn out, Donald cast himself down and swore his fidelity to God and men.

4. Tim knew that Samuel had married another woman, and yet he had taken it upon himself to mar the virginity of Tim's wife. He knew that he would kill Sam. He wanted to, and he had to. Joan knew the light click of the apartment door; she knew that Samuel's key had clicked. She grabbed Tim's arm and she swore that if he killed Samuel that she would leave him. Tim looked shocked at Joan. No, Joan couldn't mean it. She was his only meaning in life. But he had to kill Sam for he had hurt Tim's pride by attacking his most precious possession.

Tim grabbed the knife tight and started down the hall. Sally, Sam's wife, flew from the room after Tim. She tried overtly to seduce Tim, but she failed. Tim entered Sam's room, and after a struggle he killed him. He then rushed back to the apartment only to find his pride conquered--Joan was gone. His life was gone. He slashed his wrists and waited for death.

5. Bill was a man of fifty-five who had once been a race driver. He had many medals and quite a large sum put away. Anne, his wife, always hated racing and wanted him to stop. So he stopped for three years, and he never did over fifty miles an hour. Today he had a little more wine than usual. He kissed Anne and left home.

Driving down Central Street was like the old race track. Pass one car in the middle lane, around the turn, Bill raced, weaving in and out of cars down Central. Then everything went black. When Anne opened the door, she saw Bill all bloody as she had known she would see him some day.

"Honey," he said, "I finally lost."

6. Ronald hated to admit it, but he always knew it. His mother always knew it too, but kept driving him on. She wanted him to be a doctor. He knew that he didn't have the brains nor the liking for that profession. He wanted to be a professional football player. Sally, his girl, wanted him as he was. But he would never marry her because he knew she knew that he was trying to kid himself and his mother in his attempt to be a doctor.

Today Ronald flunked his medical test, went home and married Sally. Then he told his mother. When he broke the news to his mother, she turned, slapped him, and disinherited him. He didn't mind. He had Sally, and above all he had his freedom.

7. Ed and Tim never were far apart. They knew each other a long time. Ed coached Tim when he played ball at the University of Iowa. Ed was
still at Iowa when Tim was working for a big company in Chicago. Tim always wanted to fight for the U.S. in the Second World War, but his religion kept him from fighting. Here it was 1944. All his old buddies were fighting or were already dead or wounded. He knew that he had to fight, but once he tried and in Japan he couldn't kill his enemy and so four of his friends died. Now he flew out to Iowa to see Ed. Ed had said that he had a coaching job for him. Ed met Tim at the airport and went into a huddle with him. "Tim," he said, "you're wrong. You must fight. You must defend your country." Tim entered the war and went to the front. The news came to his wife a month later, that her husband died in combat.

8. Jack always wished to be a doctor. He could never make the grade because he only had one arm. He was obsessed with the idea. One day while hunting, his close friend, Paul, met with an accident and was shot in the back. Jack knew that no doctor was around and that Paul might die before he could get to one. So he started to operate by himself. His dream had finally come true. But before he could completely finish killing Paul (as he had planned from the beginning when he shot him), Bob, an old friend and once an army nurse, shook Jack's shoulder, took the knife, and said to him, "You don't have to finish the job after shooting Paul."

Bob saved Paul's life. Jack moved to another town.

9. It was a long and trying day in the fields for the cotton pickers. So they lay down to rest. These cotton pickers were hated by the farmers because they were Ocakes. As they lay upon the grass, a farmer drove his crop duster low over the ground. No one, but the immediate family, missed the cotton pickers when they didn't show up for dinner in the evening.

10. Ray knew that he never should have married Jackie. It was said that she had laid with his best teen-age buddy. But he loved her, and no one could prove that she had been unfaithful.

But as the years rolled on, Jackie didn't have any children, and Ray blamed God and cursed Him for letting him do such a foolish thing as to marry Jackie. But Jackie stayed faithful to him even though he beat her and hated her. On Ray's sixtieth birthday, Jackie whispered in his ear, "I am going to have a baby, dear."

11. Jerry, who was nine, wandered into the old mine behind his house. He was missing for well over three days. His mother and father were frantic. The cave was dark. As the time passed, Jerry saw images. First he saw his dog. Then he saw his friend, Jerry. Then he saw a monster, a giant lizard. Then passed his father and mother who seemed about to kill him. No one loves Jerry, he thought. Everyone hates Jerry. So Jerry threw himself off of an overhanging rock. Later they found Jerry's bloody, mangled body.

12. Rod was an odd person. He never believed in anything. He didn't believe in doctors, lawyers, or politicians. One day Mary told him of a doctor who had cured her of her disease by hypnotism. Rod didn't believe her. So he agreed to be hypnotized by the doctor. He lay on the couch. The doctor
waved his hand in his face a few times, and then all went black. Five days later Rod sat in a prison cell awaiting the death sentence—for killing Mary, the doctor, and his own wife.

13. Ted knew that he wanted to be a priest; he knew that he had a vocation. He knew that Anne had a nice body. One summer he was home on vacation. He had made up his mind the last winter that he was going to see what the married life had to offer before he became a priest. So he persuaded Anne to live with him for three weeks as his wife in a small town. Really, he only wanted Anne's body for a while. The first night in the town Anne agreed to go to bed with him. There she lay on the bed, her body gleaming white. He pulled the sheet up to her breasts and then began to undress. All of a sudden he jerked his head away and ran. He ended up in a car headed for a Trappist monastery. He had to give his body only to God.

14. Dick was a strange boy. His parents treated him with the greatest ease. They spoiled him. Dick was mentally sick. He knew it. He knew he wasn't normal. But he hated his parents and their continual attention. He wanted to be normal.

Why, just today, he was told by his mother that he could not go to college because he would not know how to behave once he was away from home. Dick hated her. Ah, but the stars were so beautiful and understanding. Dick climbed into the window and then leaped for the stars.

15. Joseph was once a priest. He hated God. He hated all mankind because he had wanted to become a bishop and was not able. Joseph would show God and the world who he was. Joseph lived in a town, a small town. But he didn't stay home much. He roamed through the cemeteries. He had put seventy people into the graveyards. Every night he loved to gloat over the great harm that he had done to the world and to God. But one night he did not walk to the cemetery to gloat over his victory over God and mankind. He was carried there.

16. Peter lay upon his marriage bed looking up at the white gleaming wall. He and his newly married wife had just savored love and tasted of heaven. Now as he lay there, his thoughts went back to his childhood. He remembered another white wall in his father's basement. A white gleaming wall also, but not of dead plaster but of living, cleanly washed potatoes. The spuds that made the vodka that sweetens and makes lighter man's hard labor. Then he could still savor the taste of that white liquid which came from the white gleaming wall of potatoes.

Peter in his old age as he waited for the coming of the Lord again saw the wall of white potatoes and knew life was good to him. He appreciated it and praised the Lord for it.

17. Ted and John were circus performers; they had been all their lives. Their fathers were performers too. When their fathers died, they took over the act. Ted always hated John because one night John's father lost control of the trapeze and caused Ted's father's death. This night was Ted's night. He had it all planned. The trumpet blew. Ted swung one, two, and then
instead of flinging John to the trapeze he let him drop. John died the next day. Ted lived the rest of his life under the gloomy cloud of guilt.

18. Doctor Taylor rushed into the room, and a pair of hands removed his overcoat. He then dropped into a chair. Never could Taylor operate by himself. He always assisted, but he never operated. He had always wanted to be a doctor, but he never had the nerve to cut and to take the responsibility. He had fooled the medical authorities and had passed his exams. He had never operated in twenty years. Then today his son shot himself while hunting, and he had to operate or let his son die. He took three hours, and every drop of blood hurt him. But he was successful and so now he could relax.

19. Mike knew that his friends were in danger by the blizzard. He knew that if he wouldn't help them they would die. He wouldn't leave the house because he feared that he might die in helping them. He tore down the telephone wire so that he would not have to hear their pleas for help. So with the wire cut, he never heard the warning that a hurricane was to strike Mississippi.

20. Robert could never amount to anything. He knew it. His father was a drunk; his mother died at his birth. He lived in the slums. All Robert wanted was a good time. He stood there that night in the shadows waiting for the bank clerks to go home. He would, with five others, blow up the bank, and he would have a good time with the money until he no longer had any. Then he would rob again. The safe began to yield its loot as he had planned, but then an alarm went off. They hurried out of the bank with the money. But the cops were waiting and Robert slumped to the pavement.
1. If a man is required to do something for which he is unprepared and is given no help, he can do nothing.

2. and a man can be the victim of another's imprudence and so the innocent and the guilty suffer alike.

3. but if one tries to live alone and to amuse himself by playing with fire, others will have to stop him.

4. so he can only take what he can get in the way of companionship since he has no other choice, but if he gets the chance to improve conditions he will betray the person he originally turned to.

5. but if he finds life tough and enters upon a life of crime, his own weakness will be his undoing.

6. Despite the difficulty, one can be determined to follow his vocation and he can get the approval of a loved one.

7. but a man will work hard to be independent while striving for his goal.

8. but a man may little suspect the tragic end that lies in store for him,

9. and, if he tries to reform his life, others will reject him.

10. and even love, though splendid for a while, will not hold up in the long run.

11. Though one may be afraid, he will conceal his fear to win the esteem of another,

12. and, though one may not believe in magic, if he tries it it can bring him success,

13. and thus a man, who has enjoyed unbridled passion and escaped the consequences, can later (magically) be converted by the grace of God,

14. but when a man is handicapped, he cannot enjoy life to the full,

15. and even after a miserable, mean man has died, those who remain will see to it that his meanness is not forgotten.

16. A man does not begin to practice genuine virtue until he meets temptation from within and without.
17. but, if a man is not bright, he barely manages to get along.

18. and a man's life may be sacrificed by evil doers who want to protect themselves.

19. so, though a man tries to do his job, it gets the better of him in the end.

20. and despite his desires, when he cannot help himself and others will not, he can only be a spectacle to those who refuse him help.
Subject D's TAT Stories:

1. One day Jim's father took him into the parlor and told him to learn to play this violin. Jim was puzzled by his father's command as well as by the instrument which he had never seen before. Before he could say anything Jim's father had left the room and closed the door. At the same time Jim heard the key turn in the lock. He walked over to the table and sat down perplexed. How could he be expected to play without lessons. He sat there toying with the violin and finally fell asleep with his head on the table.

2. Jenny goes to school by herself now. She used to go with her sister, Mary, but this is no longer possible. Mary was raped by the neighbor six months ago and she's big with child now. Mary loved the boy and had wanted to marry him. That's no longer possible. Raymond, Mary's hard working brother, when he learned of the affair, drove the tractor over to the boy's house and beat him to death with his fists. All, especially Mary, are sad. Ray will be hanged next week.

3. Helen was a most secretive child. She guarded her food at the table; she hid her money in the out of the way places; she always played by herself. One Christmas when her father got a lighter she stole in to the corner, curled up by the sofa, and lit the lighter over and over again just to watch the flame dance. The flame was hidden by her back, but after a while her father wondered what was going on and he went to investigate. He saw what she was doing and snatched the lighter from her.

4. While Joe was working in Africa, he fell in love with the chief's daughter, Lola. Before when he lived in Georgia he had never wanted a black woman, but now after living in Africa for three years and not seeing a white woman for all that time he fell in love with Lola. He fought this inclination, but it seemed no use. After six months of inner conflict, he told her of his love and soon after he married her. When his chance came, he left her and returned to the States, where he became a leading segregationalist.

5. Molly had a strange occupation. Her neighborhood on the East Side has long ago directed her to a life of crime. She was ugly as sin, and therefore prostitution was out of the question. She became a house thief. In two years time she had become quite an expert and never once had she been caught. One night she broke her custom and had a few beers before going to work. She was booked later that evening as a thief.

6. Bob was the eldest of the six children. Even before his father died he had been looked upon as the one to take over his father's dry cleaning business. Now he had to tell his mother differently. He was going to be a Christian Brother. She was at first grieved and began to sob quietly. Then she turned to her son and told him to follow his vocation. Bob took her into his arms and they both cried.

7. Bill had just turned twenty. His father had completely directed
his life to that point. Now all his pent up desires for independence were breaking forth. He moved to a cheap apartment near the local college he attended. To support himself and pay for school expenses, he worked in a service station at night.

8. In 1940 Peter was just a happy-go-lucky kid of fourteen years. Little did he know what would happen to him a short eight years later. He was to be hit by a stray bullet on the army practice range and to die later on the operating table.

9. After high school Ed Walston fulfilled his boyhood ambition to become a hobo. The life was great and Ed didn't find the inconveniences too much. He traveled the country and nearly had to work for food, but he managed usually to escape this problem. He was happy, but the time came when he wanted to leave the rails and return to a normal life. It was too late. Not even his family would accept him back.

10. Love is a many splendoured thing. Roby and Betty experienced this like no one ever had—or so they thought. They were madly and painfully in love. Fortunately they married in a short time and consummated their long desired union. Life was heaven and separation hell for some months. Then it wore off and they found themselves out of love.

11. Mike liked adventure, but only to a point. When he found himself faced with crossing a one man bridge, haphazardly spanning a drop into a sheer precipice he was overcome with fear. But he did not want to fail in the eyes of his girl friend so he pretended to greatly enjoy the incident.

12. Most people don't believe in black magic now days. John Hardwood who was in his fifties and a bachelor, didn't either until he tried it. Because of the marvels which he worked, he became a great success, a man of financial importance and standing. He was called almost as frequently as the doctor.

13. Felix had led a wild youth. One time he had even been so bold as to have an affair with his little brother's teen-age baby sitter. When she was found to be pregnant, he ran away from home and crossed the border into Mexico. There he was converted by the grace of God and he became a Trappist monk.

14. The room was dark as night. Manuel walked hesitantly to the window and opened it. He breathed deeply of the fresh spring air. To him, it was black outside too. Manuel had been blind from his birth.

15. Of all the monuments in Green Grass Cemetery, the weirdest one is to Albert Seibert. He was a mean, stingy, ugly, shabbily dressed person all his miserable life. So even when he died his neighbors could not forget him. So they all chipped in and bought this life sized statue of Albert which would perpetuate his unpleasant memory.

16. Brother Beans was an outstanding novice. His virtues, especially
his generous way, were admired by all his conferees. When he got down to the scholasticate, he was surprised to have so much freedom. Unlike the novitiate, the college was "in the midst of the world." Wine (occasionally), women (from a distance) and song (in hot beats) were a new experience for Brother Beans. Tempted, but not conquered, by these new pleasures, Brother Beans began to practice genuine virtue, i.e., meeting opposition from both within and without.

17. It takes muscles to climb a rope and Harold had plenty to spare. In school he was the outstanding athlete in every sport. Not only that, but he was likeable and friendly. He had one major drawback, namely, no brains. Although in the E. section, the highest grade in his whole school career was a D-plus. After he flunked out of school he joined a trapeze act for which he earned his board and room and a little spending money—again a lack of brains.

18. Art was innocently walking along the street one day when suddenly someone grabbed him from behind and twisted him to a position facing the curb. Before he could move or speak, a car sped past and a machine gun blast burst from the side window. Art felt the bullets burn into him as he lost consciousness, and fell to the ground. He had been a good shield for a worthless warrior.

19. The Canadian woods are beautiful except during the winter. Tony and Bill had been hired to stay at the Hillside resort for the winter. The snow came and piled up outside the cabin. After a month, they became so bored with games, books, and with each other, that their formerly good natured dispositions soured and made animals out of them both. When they were found in their changed state, they were quickly hauled off to the sanatorium.

20. A man in a hat and upturned overcoat leaning against a lamp post is a rather romantic sight. That is, usually. Jeff didn't want to be there, but where could he go. No money, no friends, nothing to offer. So he stayed under the lamp post and made himself an interesting character to those who passed by and yet would not help.
## APPENDIX IV

**SAMPLE POLLYANNA STORIES**
**AND THE RESULTING PROTOCOL**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Protocol</th>
<th>Resulting from Pollyanna Stories</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>1. A man may be so interested in something that he takes illegitimate means to get it, but when discovered he is punished, straightened out and becomes a good citizen,</strong> (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>2. but sometimes a man can break away from hard masters and attain a better life, though not for too long.</strong> (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>3. In helping others, a man can suffer much and it is all unnecessary.</strong> (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>4. Sometimes a man has difficulties because others won't accept him or his family; but by sticking it out he will finally be recognized as being equal and wanted,</strong> (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>5. and when others try to force him to do what they do he can always break away and go home.</strong> (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>6. A chance encounter (being marooned together) may develop into a lifelong friendship.</strong> (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>7. Bad news may permanently harm a person, though it turns out later to be wrong.</strong> (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>8. but when it can go either way, good or bad, it will turn out good,</strong> (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>9. but sometimes when a man thinks he is clever, it turns out that he is caught.</strong> (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>10. On the other hand, a small joy may easily turn into a big one.</strong> (2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>11. A big undertaking has many dangers to overcome and not everybody will make it,</strong> (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>12. but a man who in the past has been rejected sometimes manages to do what others cannot do; then he is recognized and rewarded,</strong> (3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>13. but a terrible experience can haunt a man and drive him to desperation.</strong> (1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Score:</strong></td>
<td><strong>14. Still, he may have talent that wins him recognition.</strong> (2)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
15. and when he thinks somebody really has evil intentions it may turn out that this is a friend.

16. A man may dream of heaven, but he is rudely brought back to reality, (and does he resent it!)

17. and for a bad man there is no escape.

18. If a man refuses to use the advantages of civilization, he will have to pay double the price; still, in the end, everything will turn out all right.

19. Sometimes a man is a bad prophet—but no harm is done;

20. he may even become a savior and love those he saves.
Pollyanna Stories:

1. Johnny, an English school boy at the age of twelve, stole a violin from a pawn shop because he was very interested in the musical instrument. An old lady who ran the shop caught Johnny as he was in the process of stealing the violin. Johnny broke away from this lady's grasp, but was accosted by a bobby. Johnny was sent away to a reform school for two years, after which he was straightened out and became a good English citizen now living in London.

2. Nellie Brown, a negro slave girl from Africa now on a cotton plantation in West Virginia, broke away from her master on the fifteenth of August. She is running across the cotton field when she hears noises behind her. When she turns around, she notices that three of the master's guards are chasing after her. She speeds up her running pace and outruns them. She escapes to the North and a Scottish family takes her in and Nellie remains faithful to them until she dies at the age of forty-five from pneumonia.

3. Sambo Johnson, a negro shoe shine boy in the Bronx where he was born fourteen years ago, lays on the side of the pavement in the Bronx. Sambo's dog, Ronzart, made a dash for the street, and Sambo dashed after him. Ronzart made it, but Sambo was knocked to the sidewalk by an oncoming car. When the ambulance arrived a half hour later, Sambo was taken to Mercy Hospital. After a stay of two months in the hospital, Sambo returned to his old job of shoe shining minus the use of his right leg.

4. May and John Linucker were married five years ago in a small church in a town in Nebraska at St. Anthony's Roman Catholic Church. They now have three children; two white and one is a colored boy. This colored child came along three weeks ago, and a big stir has arisen in the neighborhood which they just moved into. Mary is born of a colored family, and her and John with their children moved into a white neighborhood and the neighbors don't like having them there. Both John and Mary are very depressed, but they decide to stick it out. Eventually they win out and are recognized by their neighbors as being equal to and wanted by them.

5. When Mrs. Funk, a thirty-five year old housewife living on Selzter Street in Chicago, went into her son's room one morning to wake Steve up she found the room in shambles and Steve not there. Right away she ran for her husband and told him what she had found. Her husband notified the police and an all out search was started. After a weeks time and no word or clue to Steve's whereabouts, they received a phone call from Steve. He said two men had taken him from his room and took him to a shack outside town. He broke away from them and ran to the police. The two men were later apprehended and Steve was once again united with his family.

6. One Sunday evening, August 12th, a man and a woman were waiting in a train station for quite some time when finally they decided to introduce themselves. Henry Castano and Olivia Stuart got to know one another very well during their two hour wait for the delayed train. When the train did come,
they sat next to each other until their stop. They gave one another their addresses and soon they began to go out together. Finally, they were married and are now the happy parents of a family of six.

7. Ma and Pa Kettle, retired farmers in Kentucky, sat back one night and talked for hours about their long life together and their sixteen chillin. When, all of a sudden, a knock came to the door when Pa answered it he heard bad news. One of his sons' families were just all burnt to death. Pa came and broke the news to Ma; the shock was too much for her and she fell over dead. The son who died was closer to Ma than any of her other children. It was later found out that the family didn't perish in the fire, but they actually came out with only second degree burns.

8. The doctors were getting prepared for the operation on Jack Ramsey. He was a twenty-one year old American soldier who was brought in with a serious gunshot wound. This operation was a matter of life or death. The bullet was lodged close to Jack's heart and one slip either way with the knife would end Jack's days. Jack was given anaesthetic and the doctors began to work. After three hours of labor over the body of Jack Ramsey, the doctors closed up Jack's throbbing chest and hoped for the best. He could go either way, the doctors didn't have much hope for recovery for him. After three days Jack came to his own and finally recovered completely from this ordeal.

9. A group of tramps were tired of being on the go all day so they decided to camp down for the night. Zeek, Sctmo and Perry, all of English ancestry, saw this big farm with a field full of corn and with plenty of protection in case of rain, so they made themselves at home. When the cock crowed the next morning the three awoke to find themselves in the hands of the police. They didn't find out until later that they fell asleep on a prison farm. After being sentenced for vagrancy, trespassing on private property and a few other minor charges, the three found themselves spending some time on this farm, not as trespassers but as inmates.

10. Jim and Martha Worthington were a middle classed family living in Detroit during the time of the Second World War. They had both just reached their forty-fifth birthday. They had three boys in the service and they were in the Pacific fighting. The two had a little celebration for their birthday when a knock came on the door. Jim answered it and much to their surprise their three sons came home and the war was over. What a joyous birthday celebration the whole family had. Jim and Martha embraced one another, and then thanked God for what he had sent them.

11. The expedition started out in September, 1904, with the intention of going into the deepest parts of Africa to locate a radium supply supposed to be located within the deepest regions of Africa. It was now March of 1905, and they still hadn't found their goal. All of a sudden a huge dragon came upon them as they were passing between two mountains. They began to run as they saw the dragon, and the dragon came after them. They realized that they couldn't outrun the dragon. Then the dragon began to devour them one or two at
a time. Finally the leader of the company stopped and started to use the flame throwers that they brought along with them. Eventually the beast was destroyed and the expedition could move on after losing five members of the party.

12. During the cholera plague in France many people were dying as a result of the disease. One famous person, King Louis' son, was a victim of the disease. The doctor was called in to minister to the boy with no results. None of the King's physicians could do anything for the boy. There was only one resort left, a man whom the king had exiled some ten years ago. If only he could be found. The king sent out messengers all over. Finally this man was found and he came and healed the boy. The king apologized to the man for what he had done, and he restored him to his practice and gave him many other rewards.

13. Bill Hartley, a steel worker in Pittsburgh forty years ago and a father of four children, came out of a blazing fire in the steel mines. One of the lamps which they used for light in the mines fell to the ground and onto some gasoline. The place went up in no time. There were twenty men working in the section where the fire started, and Bill was the only one to survive the blaze. Bill was badly burnt himself, but he was treated immediately and recovered from the shock, but he never forgot this awful experience. This thought haunted Bill so much that within a couple of months after the blaze he committed suicide by jumping in front of a train.

14. It was a beautiful day on the ninth of July when Alley, a sixteen year old student at St. Patrick's High School in Milwaukee, awoke and ran to the window to look out. This was the day he was to go and have his tryout with the Milwaukee Braves farm team at two o'clock. Two scouts had been watching Alley pitch for his high school team and were very impressed with his style and ability to throw that ball. When Alley went for his tryout he made it and was assigned to their class D farm club. He came home and told his parents, and they were very pleased with Alley.

15. Billy Morris, a five year old boy who lives in Pittsburgh and goes to St. Michael's kindergarten, got lost on his way home from school on one Friday afternoon. He walked and walked and walked his way into a cemetery. By this time it was dark and, boy, was Billy scared. He couldn't find his way out of the cemetery and all of a sudden this gruesome looking old man came up to Billy and asked him if he was lost. Billy screamed and started to run, but the old man grabbed Billy and told him he was the caretaker and he would take Billy to his home. The man did take Billy home and every day after that Billy went to visit the caretaker and they became the best of friends.

16. Jimmy Acker stared into space one night and began to dream of what he thought heaven would be like. Jimmy Acker is eleven years old and one of seven children whose father is a policeman. Jimmy goes to Good Shepherd Parish School. Getting back to Jimmy's dream of heaven, he thought of all the things the Sisters had told him in reference to heaven. God sitting on a big gold throne with a long beard surrounded by angels, and Jimmy hoped to be one of
these angels one day. Just when he was in the middle of his dream, Jimmy's mother woke him up for school and boy, how he could have crowned his mother for waking him up at this point.

17. Long Jack Gulliver, a notorious English criminal of the eighteen hundreds was captured and locked in the Tower of London for the rest of his life for the many murders and robberies that he had committed. After being locked up for a couple of weeks, he decided on a plan to escape. He got all the covers and cloth that he could find in his cell or get off other inmates. He threw this out of the window during the night after he has saved a saw and sawed away a few bars on the window. He started to go down the wall when one of the guards spotted him and had the big lights put on him. When Long Jack reached the bottom of the wall, he was captured and again locked up and soon died in a fight with another convict.

18. It was pay day for the mine workers and Mr. James, the boss of the mine workers in Pittsburgh, was on his way from the bank to the mines with the payroll. Mr. James would never ride in a car or streetcar. He preferred to walk. As he was passing this used car lot two men accosted him and took him between the cars. These men beat Mr. James and relieved him of the payroll. A police officer saw the two men running away and called for them to stop, but they jumped into a waiting car and escaped. Mr. James had to dig up more money to pay the miners and later on the money was returned.

19. It was the beginning of April and the clouds were beginning to gather preparing for an approaching storm. The Neifer family were out in the park enjoying their picnic when the clouds began to gather. Mr. Neifer said it would pass over and not to worry about it but to keep on enjoying themselves. Within the next ten minutes, the rains came and the picnic was ruined. When they eventually got to cover they all had a big laugh despite the fact that they were drenched to the skin.

20. The old lamplighter, Samuel Brown, eighty-five years old and a retired coal miner who took up this job after he retired from the mines, was making his rounds this one dreary night in January. When he came to his last lamp to light, he found this little boy huddled in the doorway of a store. The little boy was homeless without any family and very cold. Sam Brown took the boy home with him, fed him, clothed him, and gave him a house for as long as he wanted it. Sam became very fond of this little boy and he later adopted him.
APPROVAL SHEET

The dissertation submitted by Thomas Leo Quinn has been read and approved by five members of the Department of Psychology.

The final copies have been examined by the director of the dissertation and the signature which appears below verifies the fact that any necessary changes have been incorporated, and that the dissertation is now given final approval with reference to content, form, and mechanical accuracy.

The dissertation is therefore accepted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Doctor of Philosophy.

[Date]

Signature of Adviser